

**U.S. District Court  
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:96-cv-02307-PLF**

VOINCHE v. FBI  
Assigned to: Judge Paul L. Friedman  
Demand: \$0  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 10/04/1996  
Date Terminated: 10/11/2001  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**WOODY VOINCHE**

V.

**Defendant**

**FEDERAL BUREAU OF  
INVESTIGATION**

represented by **Alexander Daniel Shoaibi**  
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE  
Judiciary Center Building  
555 Fourth Street, NW  
E-4218  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-7236  
Email: [alexander.d.shoaibi@usdoj.gov](mailto:alexander.d.shoaibi@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Beverly Maria Russell**  
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE FOR D.C.  
Civil Division  
555 4th Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 307-0492  
Fax: (202) 514-8780  
Email: [beverly.russell@usdoj.gov](mailto:beverly.russell@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Fred Elmore Haynes**  
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE  
555 4th Street, NW  
Room E - 4110  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-7201  
Fax: (202) 514-8780  
Email: [fred.haynes@usdoj.gov](mailto:fred.haynes@usdoj.gov)  
**TERMINATED: 01/05/1998**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Jonathan L. Kaplan**  
DEPARTMENT OF  
TRANSPORTATION  
Federal Railroad Administration  
400 Seventh Street, SW  
Mail Stop 10  
Mail Stop 10/RCC-12  
Washington, DC 20590  
(202) 632-3196  
**TERMINATED: 01/05/1998**

*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/04/1996	1	COMPLAINT filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE (JMF) (Entered: 10/08/1996)
10/04/1996		SUMMONS (3) issued to federal party(s) federal defendant FBI , and non-parties: U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (JMF) (Entered: 10/08/1996)
10/08/1996	2	ORDER by Judge Charles R. Richey : status hearing set for 10:00 10/16/96 (N) (dbw) (Entered: 10/08/1996)
10/09/1996	3	ORDER by Judge Charles R. Richey : amending order [2-2]; directing parties to appear before this Court at 10:00 a.m., not 10 p.m., on October 16, 1996 (N) (dbw) (Entered: 10/09/1996)
10/16/1996		Tele-conference before Judge Charles R. Richey: defendant's answer or dispositive motion due by 4:00 11/13/96; opposition due by 4:00 11/25/96 Reporter: Laura Beasley (dbw) (Entered: 10/16/1996)
10/18/1996	4	ORDER by Judge Charles R. Richey : answer and/or dispositive motions due 4:00 11/13/96; oppositions to dispositive motions due 11/25/96 (N) (dbw) (Entered: 10/18/1996)
11/13/1996	5	ANSWER TO COMPLAINT [1-1] by federal defendant FBI . (JMF) (Entered: 11/15/1996)
11/25/1996	6	RESPONSE by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE to answer [5-1] by FBI (JMF) (Entered: 11/26/1996)
11/25/1996	7	MOTION filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE for vaughn index (JMF) (Entered: 11/26/1996)
12/06/1996	8	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI to extend time to 12/13/96 within which to file the parties report under LR 206 and within which to respond to plaintiff's motion for a Vaughn Index. (adc) (Entered: 12/09/1996)
12/09/1996	9	ORDER by Judge Charles R. Richey : granting motion to extend time to 12/13/96 within which to file the parties report under LR 206 and within which to respond to plaintiff's motion for a Vaughn Index. [8-1] by FBI (N) (bjl) (Entered: 12/10/1996)
12/13/1996	10	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI to extend time to 12/19/96 to file the parties report under local rule 206 and within to respond to plaintiff's motion for a Vaughn Index (JMF) (Entered: 12/16/1996)
12/19/1996	11	ORDER by Judge Charles R. Richey : extending time to 12/19/96 to file the parties report under local rule 206 and within to respond to plaintiff's motion for a Vaughn Index [10-1] by FBI (N) (dbw) (Entered: 12/20/1996)
12/26/1996	12	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI for leave to file lodged Rule 206 Report ; EXHIBIT (Rule 206 Report) (JMF) (Entered: 12/30/1996)
12/26/1996	14	MEET AND CONFER STATEMENT/REPORT PURSUANT TO L.R. 206(d) filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE, federal defendant FBI. (dbw) (Entered: 01/07/1997)
01/07/1997	13	ORDER by Judge Charles R. Richey : enlarging time for leave to file Rule 206 Report [12-1] by FBI to 12/26/96 NUNC PRO TUNC TO 12/26/96 (N) (dbw) (Entered: 01/07/1997)
01/07/1997	15	ORDER by Judge Charles R. Richey : motion for summary judgment accompanied by Vaughn declaration due 5/16/97; denying as moot, motion for Vaughn index by WOODY VOINCHE [7-1]; Case assigned to the Fast track (track one) ; initial disclosures under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26 are dispensed; no pretrial conference or trial will be set at this time (N) (dbw) (Entered: 01/07/1997)
04/03/1997		CASE REASSIGNED to Judge Paul L. Friedman (JMF) (Entered: 04/04/1997)

05/16/1997	16	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI to extend time to 6/6/97 to file their motion for summary judgment. (ks) (Entered: 05/19/1997)
05/20/1997	17	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman: granting motion to extend time to 6/6/97 to file their motion for summary judgment. [16-1] by FBI (N) (bm) (Entered: 05/20/1997)
05/29/1997	18	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for federal defendant FBI by Jonathan L. Kaplan (blj) (Entered: 05/30/1997)
06/06/1997	19	MOTION (CONSENT) filed by federal defendant FBI to extend time to 9/6/97 to file its motion for summary judgment ; Exhibits (8); declaration (1) (blj) (Entered: 06/09/1997)
06/10/1997	20	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to 9/6/97 to file its motion for summary judgment [19-1] by FBI (N) (bm) (Entered: 06/10/1997)
09/05/1997	21	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI to dismiss complaint [1-1] , or in the alternative, for summary judgment ; Declarations (2); exhibits (2) (bulky) (blj) (Entered: 09/08/1997)
09/09/1997	22	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman: plaintiff shall respond to defendant's motion to dismiss or, in the alternative for summary judgment due 10/6/97 ; if plaintiff does not respond by that date, the Court will treat the motion as conceded and enter judgment in favor of defendants (N) (bm) (Entered: 09/09/1997)
10/01/1997	23	RESPONSE by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in opposition to motion to dismiss complaint [1-1] [21-1], or in the alternative, for summary judgment [21-2] by FBI; attachments (4) (blj) (Entered: 10/02/1997)
12/17/1997		*** ALL DOCKET ENTRIES WILL BE FILED AND DOCKETED TO CA 96-2307 PURSUANT TO ORDER OF 12/17/97 *** (ks) (Entered: 12/17/1997)
12/17/1997	24	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : consolidating cases CA 96-2307 with CA 97-2788 , The Court will stay its decision on the government's motion to dismiss in CA 96-2307 until dispositive motions are ripe for decision in CA 97-2788; Attorneys shall meet and confer pursuant to Local Rule 206 and file a Joint report by 1/23/98 in 1:96-cv-02307, in 1:97-cv-02788 . (N) (ks) (Entered: 12/17/1997)
01/05/1998	25	NOTICE by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE of Compliance. (ks) (Entered: 01/06/1998)
01/05/1998	26	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for federal defendant FBI by Alexander Daniel Shoaibi (ks) (Entered: 01/07/1998)
01/23/1998	27	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to extend time to 3/12/98 to answer complaint [1-1] (ks) (Entered: 01/26/1998)
01/23/1998	28	MEET AND CONFER STATEMENT/REPORT PURSUANT TO L.R. 206(d) filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE, federal defendant FBI . (ks) (Entered: 01/26/1998)
02/03/1998	29	MOTION filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE for vaughn index ; Exhibits. (ks) (Entered: 02/04/1998)
02/11/1998	30	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to extend time to respond to plaintiff's motion for a vaughn index. (ks) (Entered: 02/12/1998)
02/18/1998	31	SCHEDULING ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman Case assigned to the Fast track (track one) ; staying all discovery pending a decision on the summary judgment motion that has been filed in 9a6-2307 and the dispositive motion that will be filed in 97-2788 ; the government shall respond to plaintiff's motion for a Vaughn Index by 2/27/98; dispositive motions due 3/12/98 in 1:97-cv-02788; response to dispositive motions due 4/13/98 1:97-cv-02788; reply to dispositive motions due 4/27/98 in in 1:97-cv-02788 ; setting forth instructions to counsel. (N) (bm) (Entered: 02/18/1998)

02/27/1998	32	RESPONSE by federal defendant FBI in opposition to motion for vaughn index [29-1] by WOODY VOINCHE . (ks) (Entered: 03/02/1998)
03/06/1998	33	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman: denying plaintiff's motion to compel preparation of a Vaughn Index. (N) (bm) (Entered: 03/06/1998)
03/06/1998	34	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI to extend time to 4/30/98 to file their dispositive motion ; Declaration (1); Exhibits (4). (ks) (Entered: 03/09/1998)
03/10/1998	35	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to 4/30/98 to file their dispositive motion [34-1] by FBI; dispositive motions due by 4/30/98 in in 1:97-cv-02788 (N) (bm) (Entered: 03/10/1998)
03/12/1998	36	REPLY by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE to response to motion to compel preparation of a vaughn index. (ks) (Entered: 03/16/1998)
04/30/1998	37	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to extend time to 8/31/98 to answer complaint [1-1] (ks) (Entered: 05/01/1998)
05/04/1998	38	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to 8/31/98 to answer complaint by filing a dispositive motion [1-1] [37-1] by FBI; dispositive motions due 8/31/98 in 1:96-cv-02307, in 1:97-cv-02788 (N) (bm) (Entered: 05/04/1998)
08/28/1998	39	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI to extend time to 11/30/98 to file its dispositive motion ; Exhibits (2). (ks) (Entered: 08/31/1998)
08/31/1998	40	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to 11/30/98 to file its dispositive motion [39-1] by FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 1:97-cv-02788. (N) (bm) (Entered: 08/31/1998)
10/29/1998	41	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to stay discovery (tth) (Entered: 10/30/1998)
11/03/1998	45	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 for summary judgment pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56 on the ground that there is no genuine issue as to any material fact and defendants are entitled to judgment as a matter of law ; attachments (5) (tw) (Entered: 12/01/1998)
11/04/1998	42	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : denying motion to stay discovery [41-1] by FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 (N) (bm) (Entered: 11/04/1998)
11/05/1998	43	MOTION filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 to compel the answering of interrogatories ; Attachments. (lkn) (Entered: 11/06/1998)
11/09/1998	44	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : denying motion to compel the answering of interrogatories [43-1] by WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 (N) (bm) (Entered: 11/09/1998)
12/03/1998	46	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman: plaintiff shall respond to defendant's motion for summary judgment due 1/8/99 in 1:97-cv-02788 (N) (bm) (Entered: 12/03/1998)
12/17/1998	47	ERRATA by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 correcting a typographical error on page 2 of the opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment. (tw) (Entered: 12/18/1998)
12/17/1998	48	RESPONSE by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 in opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment [45-1] exhibits (6) (tw) Modified on 12/18/1998 (Entered: 12/18/1998)
12/17/1998	49	MOTION filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 to compel the answering of interrogatories. (tw) (Entered: 12/18/1998)
12/24/1998	50	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307, federal defendant FBI in 1:97-cv-02788 to extend time to 1/7/99 to file a reply (bjsp) (Entered: 12/29/1998)
12/30/1998	51	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to 1/7/99 to file a reply [50-1] by FBI, FBI reply to dispositive motions due by 1/7/99 in

		1:96-cv-02307, in 1:97-cv-02788 ; in 1:96-cv-02307, 1:97-cv-02788 (N) (jwd) (Entered: 12/30/1998)
01/07/1999	52	REPLY by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307, federal defendant FBI in 1:97-cv-02788 to plaintiffs' oppositon to motion for summary judgment pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56 on the ground that there is no genuine issue as to any material fact and defendants are entitled to judgment as a matter of law [45-1] by FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 (bjsp) (Entered: 01/08/1999)
04/08/1999	53	OPINION by Judge Paul L. Friedman (N) (bm) (Entered: 04/08/1999)
04/08/1999	54	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting in part, denying in part motion for summary judgment [45-1] in 1:96-cv-02307 and in 1:97-cv-2788 without prejudice to its renewal; setting forth instuctions to defendant in both cases.(N) (bm) (Entered: 04/08/1999)
04/27/1999	55	MOTION (consent) filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to extend time to in which to comply with the Court's opinion and order of April 8, 1999 granting defendant's motion for summary judgment in part and denying it in part. (tw) (Entered: 04/29/1999)
04/30/1999	56	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : denying motion to compel the answering of interrogatories [43-1] by WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 (N) (bm) (Entered: 04/30/1999)
04/30/1999	57	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman: granting motion to extend time to comply with the Court's opinion and order of April 8, 1999 to 6/1/99 within which the defendant shall provide the supplemental declarations and documents [55-1] by FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 (N) (bm) (Entered: 04/30/1999)
05/28/1999	58	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307, pursuant to Court's order of April 8, 1999, of Second declaration of Scott A. Hodes. (tw) (Entered: 06/01/1999)
08/07/2000	59	MOTION filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 for Vaughn Index ; exhibits (5) (td) (Entered: 08/08/2000)
08/16/2000	60	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to extend time to file response to plaintiff's motion for a vaughn index (cjp) (Entered: 08/17/2000)
08/18/2000	61	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to file response to plaintiff's motion for a vaughn index [60-1] by FBI; response to motion due by 8/30/00 in 1:96-cv-02307, in 1:97-cv-02788 ; in 1:96-cv-02307; no further extensions will be granted. (N) (bm) (Entered: 08/18/2000)
08/30/2000	62	RESPONSE by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 in opposition to motion for Vaughn Index [59-1] by WOODY VOINCHE . (bm) (Entered: 08/31/2000)
09/15/2000	63	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : denying with prejudice motion for Vaughn Index [59-1] by WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 (N) (bm) (Entered: 09/15/2000)
05/22/2001	<u>64</u>	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : defendant shall file its renewed motion for summary judgment due 6/15/01 with respect to its withholding of documents in 1:96-cv-02307 ; defendant shall also provide any additional affidavits or declarations it deems necessary to address the concerns raised by the Court in its 4/8/99 opinion and in this order. (N) (bm) (Entered: 05/22/2001)
06/27/2001	65	MOTION filed by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307, plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:97-cv-02788 for summary judgment , or for default judgment against FBI in 1:96-cv-02307, FBI in 1:97-cv-02788 (aet) (Entered: 07/02/2001)
07/06/2001	66	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to extend time to 7/13/01 to respond to the Court's May 22, 2001 order. (td) (Entered: 07/09/2001)
07/06/2001	67	RESPONSE by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 in opposition to motion for summary judgment [65-1] by WOODY VOINCHE, WOODY VOINCHE, motion for default judgment against FBI in 1:96-cv-02307, FBI in

		1:97-cv-02788 [65-2] by WOODY VOINCHE, WOODY VOINCHE . (td) (Entered: 07/09/2001)
07/10/2001	<u>68</u>	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to 7/13/01 to respond to the Court's 5/22/01 Order [66-1] by FBI; defendant's renewed motion for summary judgment and other documents pursuant to the Court's 5/22/01 Order due 7/13/01 in 1:96-cv-02307, in 1:97-cv-02788; denying motion for summary judgment [65-1] by WOODY VOINCHE, WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307, denying motion for default judgment against FBI in 1:96-cv-02307, FBI in 1:97-cv-02788 [65-2] by WOODY VOINCHE, WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 (N) (bm) (Entered: 07/10/2001)
07/31/2001	69	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to dismiss complaint [1-1] , or alternatively, for summary judgment ; exhibits (2) (cjp) (Entered: 08/02/2001)
08/09/2001	<u>70</u>	ORDER by Judge Henry H. Kennedy for Judge Paul L. Friedman plaintiff shall respond to defendant's motion to dismiss or, alternatively for summary judgment due 9/14/01 in 1:96-cv-02307, in 1:97-cv-02788 ; if plaintiff does not respond by that date, the Court will treat the motion as conceded and enter judgment in favor of defendant. (N) (bm) (Entered: 08/09/2001)
08/13/2001	71	RESPONSE by plaintiff WOODY VOINCHE in 1:96-cv-02307 in opposition to motion for summary judgment [69-2]; exhibits (6) (td) (Entered: 08/14/2001)
08/17/2001	72	MOTION filed by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to extend time to 8/31/01 to file reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment. (td) (Entered: 08/21/2001)
08/21/2001	<u>73</u>	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion to extend time to 8/31/01 to file reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment. [72-1] by FBI reply to dispositive motions due by 8/31/01 in 1:96-cv-02307, in 1:97-cv-02788 ; in 1:96-cv-02307 (N) (jwd) (Entered: 08/22/2001)
08/31/2001	74	REPLY by federal defendant FBI in 1:96-cv-02307 to plaintiff's opposition to motion for summary judgment [69-2] by FBI (td) (Entered: 09/04/2001)
10/11/2001	<u>75</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION by Judge Paul L. Friedman (N) (bm) (Entered: 10/11/2001)
10/11/2001	<u>76</u>	ORDER by Judge Paul L. Friedman : granting motion for summary judgment [69-2] by FBI in 1:96-cv-02307; entering judgment for the defendant ; dismissing CA 96-2307 and CA 97-2788 from the docket of this Court ; all claims now having been resolved in defendant's favor in CA 96-2307 and CA 97-2788, this Order and Judgment shall constitute a Final Judgment in these consolidated cases; this is a final appealable order (N) (bm) (Entered: 10/11/2001)