

**U.S. District Court  
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:87-cv-02028-TPJ**

GOLDSTEIN v. OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL, et al  
Assigned to: Judge Thomas Penfield Jackson  
Demand: \$0  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 07/22/1987  
Date Terminated: 08/31/2004  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**PAUL GOLDSTEIN**

represented by **PAUL GOLDSTEIN**  
115 Nottoway Street  
Leesburg, VA 22075  
PRO SE

**Bernard Fensterwald , III**  
1611 North Kent Street  
Suite 800  
Arlington, VA 22209  
(703) 599-4791  
Fax: 703-421-6141  
*TERMINATED: 10/18/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**OFFICE OF INDEPENDENT  
COUNSEL**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Office of Information & Privacy  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Room 3501  
Washington, DC 20530-0001  
(202) 633-4770  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Civil Division  
10th & Constitution Avenue, NW  
Room 1062  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-3178  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Guy Miller Struve**  
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP  
450 Lexington Avenue  
Suite 3030  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 450-4192  
Fax: (212) 701-5192  
Email: [struve@dpw.com](mailto:struve@dpw.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Civil Division  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Room 7108  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-4960  
Fax: (202) 616-8470  
Email: [marcia.sowles@usdoj.gov](mailto:marcia.sowles@usdoj.gov)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
US Department of Justice  
Civil Division- Federal Programs Branch  
P.O. Box 883  
Washington, DC 20044-0883  
(202) 514-3449  
Fax: (202) 616-8470  
Email: [vincent.garvey@usdoj.gov](mailto:vincent.garvey@usdoj.gov)

**Defendant**

**FEDERAL BUREAU OF  
INVESTIGATION**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Karen Kathleen Richardson**  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
(202) 514-3374  
Fax: (202)616-8460  
Email: [karen.richardson@usdoj.gov](mailto:karen.richardson@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Patricia Arzuaga**  
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Civil Division  
10th & Constitution Avenue, NW  
907  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-2395  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE  
AGENCY**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**BUREAU OF ALCOHOL, TOBACCO,  
FIREARMS, AND EXPLOSIVES**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**FEDERAL EMERGENCY  
MANAGEMENT AGENCY**

represented by **Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**DEFENSE INTELLIGENCE  
AGENCY**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**

(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**DEPARTMENT OF THE AIR FORCE**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 05/21/1991*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

**Defendant**

**NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY**

represented by **Alan L. Ferber**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 02/21/1990*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Elizabeth Ann Pugh**

(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Marcia Kay Sowles**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Vincent M. Garvey**  
(See above for address)

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/22/1987	1	COMPLAINT filed, exhibits (12), summons issued (yep) (Entered: 07/23/1987)
07/31/1987	2	PETITION by PAUL GOLDSTEIN for preliminary injunction , and for expedited treatment ; exhibits (2), declaration (1). (yep) (Entered: 08/04/1987)
08/12/1987	3	RESPONSE by defendant in opposition to plaintiff's petition for a preliminary injunction and for expedited treatment, exhibits (3). (yep) (Entered: 08/13/1987)
08/12/1987	4	MOTION by defendant OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL to dismiss the complaint as to OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL , or in the alternative, for summary judgment , and opposition to petition for preliminary injunction and expedited treatment; affidavit (1), exhibits (2). (yep) (Entered: 08/13/1987)
08/20/1987	5	ANSWER for defendants DEPT. AIR FORCE, DON, ARMY, DIA, FEMA, DOE, BATAF, NATL. SEC. AGENCY, CIA, NATL. SEC. COUNCIL, FBI, and OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL, by counsel (yep) Modified on 09/29/1987 (Entered: 08/21/1987)
08/25/1987	6	REPLY by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant's opposition to petition for preliminary injunction [2-1], and expedited treatment [2-2] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN; attachments. (yep) (Entered: 08/26/1987)
08/25/1987	7	REPLY by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant OFFICE OF INDEPENDENT COUNSEL'S motion to dismiss the complaint as to OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL [4-1], and motion for summary judgment [4-2] by OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL, and opposition to plaintiff's petition for preliminary injunction and expedited treatment; attachment (1). (yep) (Entered: 08/26/1987)
09/01/1987	8	REPLY by defendant OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL to response by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN in opposition to motion for summary judgment [4-2], or in the alternative, to dismiss the complaint as to OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL [4-1] by OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL (yep) (Entered: 09/02/1987)
09/02/1987		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : heard and denied petition for preliminary injunction [2-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN, scheduled further status hearing for 10:00 10/2/87 reporter M. Colchico (yep) (Entered: 09/04/1987)
09/02/1987	9	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson denying plaintiff's petition for preliminary injunction [2-1], and scheduling a status hearing for 10:00 10/2/87 (N) (yep) (Entered: 09/04/1987)
09/10/1987	10	NOTICE OF INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN, from order entered 9/4/87, \$5.00 filing fee and \$100.00 docketing fee paid. Mailed copies to: A. Ferber, J. McCollum, Jr. USCA/N USCA NO. 87-5289 (yep) Modified on 10/27/1987 (Entered: 09/14/1987)
10/02/1987		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : status hearing for 9:30 1/4/88 reporter P. Merana (cjp) (Entered: 10/05/1987)
10/02/1987	11	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson granting oral motion for leave to file amended complaint and allowing all parties leave to file supplemental memoranda and setting further status hearing for 9:30 1/4/88 (N) (cjp) (Entered: 10/05/1987)

11/05/1987	12	Transcript filed for dates of 9/2/87 reporter M. Colchico (hls) (Entered: 11/06/1987)
11/10/1987	13	CERTIFIED COPY OF ORDER filed in USCA 11/10/87 Granting appellant's motion to dismiss appeal pursuant to Rule 42(b), FRAP (USCA#87-5289) (ela) (Entered: 11/17/1987)
12/21/1987	14	MEMORANDUM by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN in opposition to motion to dismiss the complaint as to OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL; attachment (hls) (Entered: 12/21/1987)
12/31/1987	15	MOTION (second) by defendant OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL for summary judgment (kc) (Entered: 01/04/1988)
01/04/1988		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : further status hearing and motions for 9:30 2/5/88 reporter P.Merana (hls) (Entered: 01/11/1988)
02/10/1988	16	STIPULATION AND ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson of counsel dismissing complaint with prejudice and without costs as to defendants Office of Independent Counsel Lawrence E. Walsh (N) (cjp) (Entered: 02/12/1988)
02/10/1988	17	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson granting motion to dismiss the complaint as to OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL [4-1] (N) (cjp) (Entered: 02/12/1988)
02/11/1988		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : status hearing for 9:30 4/7/88 reporter P. Merana (hls) (Entered: 02/16/1988)
03/24/1988	18	INTERROGATORIES filed by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant CIA (hls) (Entered: 03/25/1988)
03/24/1988	19	INTERROGATORIES filed by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant NATL. SEC. AGENCY (hls) (Entered: 03/25/1988)
03/24/1988	20	REQUEST by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant NATL. SEC. AGENCY for production of documents (hls) (Entered: 03/25/1988)
04/01/1988	21	MOTION by defendant for protective order attachment (hls) (Entered: 04/04/1988)
04/05/1988	22	REPLY by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to response to motion for protective order [21-1] by defendant; declaration (cjp) (Entered: 04/05/1988)
04/07/1988		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granted motion for protective order [21-1]; defendant to file dispositive motions within 30 days reporter P Merana (cjp) (Entered: 04/08/1988)
04/08/1988	23	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion for protective order [21-1] with all discovery stayed pending further order of the Court; defendants Department of the Air Force and National Security Agency shall file dispositive motions within 30 days; defendants FBI and National Security Council file "due diligence" affidavits within 30 days (N) (cjp) (Entered: 04/12/1988)
05/09/1988	24	NOTICE OF FILING by defendants of "due diligence" affidavit of FBI agent David R Lieberman (cjp) (Entered: 05/10/1988)
05/09/1988	25	MOTION by defendant for partial summary judgment exhibits (8) (cjp) (Entered: 05/10/1988)
05/20/1988	26	MOTION by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to extend time to 6/8/88 to file response to defts' motion for partial summary judgment (je) (Entered: 05/24/1988)
05/26/1988	27	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to extend time to 6/8/88 to file response to defts' motion for partial summary judgment [26-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (N) (mf) (Entered: 06/02/1988)
05/27/1988	28	ENTERED IN ERROR AMENDED COMPLAINT by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN adding amending complaint [1-1] (mf) Modified on 06/02/1988 (Entered: 06/02/1988)
06/07/1988	29	MEMORANDUM by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN in opposition to motion for partial summary judgment [25-1] by defendant; exhibits (5) (kc) (Entered: 06/07/1988)

		06/13/1988)
06/17/1988	30	REPLY by defendant to response to motion for partial summary judgment [25-1] by defendant; exhibits (3) (je) (Entered: 06/23/1988)
06/17/1988	31	TRANSCRIPT filed for dates of 2/11/88; pp. 1-10; reporter Phyllis Merana (je) (Entered: 06/23/1988)
07/21/1988	32	MOTION by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to allow the taking of discovery (gld) (Entered: 07/25/1988)
07/21/1988	33	MEMORANDUM by defendants in opposition to motion to allow the taking of discovery [32-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (ajr) (Entered: 07/26/1988)
07/25/1988	34	MEMORANDUM by defendant in opposition to motion to allow the taking of discovery [32-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (kc) (Entered: 07/27/1988)
07/26/1988	35	RESPONSE (FURTHER) by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN in opposition to motion for partial summary judgment [25-1] by defendant, and in support of motion to allow the taking of discovery [32-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (fiat) (cjp) (Entered: 07/29/1988)
07/28/1988	36	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion for partial summary judgment [25-1] by defendant, denying motion to allow the taking of discovery [32-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN dismissing as to defendant NATL. SEC. COUNCIL, defendant CIA, defendant NATL. SEC. AGENCY, defendant BATF, defendant DOE, defendant FEMA, defendant DIA, defendant ARMY, defendant DON, defendant DEPT. OF AIR FORCE , and setting a status hearing for 9:30 9/28/88 as to defendant FBI (N) (cjp) (Entered: 08/03/1988)
09/27/1988	37	STATUS REPORT by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN; attachments (cjp) (Entered: 09/29/1988)
09/28/1988		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : status hearing for 9:30 1/30/89 reporter P Merana (cjp) (Entered: 10/02/1988)
01/30/1989		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : status hearing set for 9:30 3/1/89 ; reporter P. Merana (rew) (Entered: 01/30/1989)
03/01/1989		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson ; deft to file Vaughn Index and motion for summary judgment by 7/3/89 and Pltff to respond in 30 days. reporter P. Merana (rew) (Entered: 03/01/1989)
03/01/1989	38	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson directing deft to file Vaughn Index and mo for summary judgment by 7/3/89 and Pltff to respond by 8/3/89. (N) (rew) (Entered: 03/01/1989)
06/30/1989	39	STIPULATION filed and fiated by Judge Thomas P. Jackson that defts time to file Vaughn Index and motion for summary judgment is extended to 7/17/89 and Pltffs response is due on 8/17/89. (N) (rew) (Entered: 06/30/1989)
07/17/1989	40	MOTION by defendant DEPT. OF AIR FORCE, defendant DON, defendant U.S. DEPT. OF ARMY, defendant DIA, defendant FEMA, defendant DOE, defendant BATF, defendant NSA, defendant CIA, defendant NATL. SEC. COUNCIL, defendant FBI, defendant OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL for summary judgment ; exhibits (31) (cjp) (Entered: 07/17/1989)
08/17/1989	41	STIPULATION by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : extending time to 9/1/89 for plaintiff to file his response to defendant's Vaughn index and motion for summary judgment (N) (cjp) (Entered: 08/18/1989)
09/01/1989	42	MOTION by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to extend time , for discovery , or in the alternative for a supplemental Vaughn Index ; exhibits (4) (clv) (Entered: 09/01/1989)
09/15/1989	43	STIPULATION filed and fiated by Judge Thomas P. Jackson that defts time is extended to 9-25-89 to file response to pltffs motion for extension of time or for supplemental Vaughn Index . (N) (rew) (Entered: 09/19/1989)



09/25/1989	44	MEMORANDUM by defendant in support of motion to extend time [42-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (mf) (Entered: 09/26/1989)
10/16/1989	45	REPLY by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to opposition of FBI to plaintiff's motion for summary judgment [40-1]; attachments (2) (fiat) JACKSON, J. (cjp) (Entered: 10/17/1989)
02/21/1990	46	SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL for defendants substituting Marcia Sowles for attorney Alan L. Ferber for OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL, FBI, NATL. SEC. COUNCIL, CIA, NSA, BATF, DOE (ker) (Entered: 02/22/1990)
05/22/1990	47	NOTICE OF FILING by defendants of change of phone number for counsel Marcia Sowles to 202-514-4960 (ker) (Entered: 05/23/1990)
09/21/1990	48	MOTION by Bernard Fensterwald to withdraw as attorney for PAUL GOLDSTEIN ; Exhibit (1) (ker) Modified on 09/26/1990 (Entered: 09/26/1990)
10/04/1990	49	RESPONSE by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN motion to withdraw as attorney for PAUL GOLDSTEIN [48-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (cjp) (Entered: 10/05/1990)
10/18/1990	50	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion of Bernard Fensterwald to withdraw as attorney for PAUL GOLDSTEIN [48-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN and directing plaintiff to notify the court within 15 days whether he intends to retain new counsel. (N) (rew) (Entered: 10/18/1990)
05/21/1991	51	SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL for defendant OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL, defendant FBI, defendant NATL. SEC. COUNCIL, defendant CIA, defendant NSA, defendant BATF, defendant FEMA, defendant DIA, defendant U.S. DEPT. OF ARMY, defendant DON, defendant DEPT. OF AIR FORCE substituting for attorney Marcia Kay Sowles for DEPT. OF AIR FORCE, attorney Marcia Kay Sowles for DON, attorney Marcia Kay Sowles for U.S. DEPT. OF ARMY, attorney Marcia Kay Sowles for DIA, attorney Marcia Kay Sowles for FEMA, attorney Marcia Kay Sowles for DOE, attorney Marcia Kay Sowles for BATF (cjp) (Entered: 05/23/1991)
06/14/1991		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : status hearing set for 9:30 9/20/91 ; reporter: P. Merana (rew) (Entered: 06/14/1991)
08/09/1991	52	TRANSCRIPT filed of status call for date(s) of 6/14/91 reporter: Phyllis Merana (cjp) (Entered: 08/12/1991)
09/20/1991		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson ,defendant granted leave to file amended motion for summary judgment and Vaughn index within 90 days, plaintiff has 10 days to reply and defendant has 10 days to respond. reporter: P. Merana (rew) Modified on 11/22/1999 (Entered: 09/20/1991)
09/23/1991	53	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : defendant's amended motion for summary judgement due 12/19/91 ; plaintiff's response to motion for summary judgement due 1/21/92; defendant's reply motion for summary judgement due 1/31/92 ; plaintiff's surreply to motion due 2/10/92 ; (N) (cjp) (Entered: 09/24/1991)
12/19/1991	54	MOTION by defendants for summary judgment ; attachments (clv) (Entered: 12/20/1991)
12/20/1991	55	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for defendant DEPT. OF AIR FORCE, defendant DON, defendant U.S. DEPT. OF ARMY, defendant DIA, defendant FEMA, defendant DOE, defendant BATF, defendant NSA, defendant CIA, defendant NATL. SEC. COUNCIL, defendant FBI, defendant OFFICE OF INDEP.CNSL by Elizabeth Ann Pugh (cjp) (Entered: 12/23/1991)
01/13/1992	56	MOTION filed by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to modify the schedule to extend the due dates for responses to defendant's amended summary judgment motion (cjp) (Entered: 01/15/1992)
01/16/1992	57	RESPONSE by defendant FBI motion to modify the schedule to extend the due dates for responses to defendant's amended summary judgment motion [56-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN; attachments (kmk) (Entered: 01/17/1992)

01/28/1992	58	REPLY by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to motion to modify the schedule to extend the due dates for responses to defendant's amended summary judgment motion [56-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (cjp) (Entered: 01/29/1992)
02/10/1992	59	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to modify the schedule to extend the due dates for responses to defendant's amended summary judgment motion [56-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN plaintiff's response to motion for summary judgement due 2/27/92 and defendant's reply motion for summary judgement due 3/9/92 ; plaintiff's surreply due 3/19/92 ; (N) (cjp) (Entered: 02/11/1992)
03/02/1992	60	CROSS MOTIONS by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN for summary judgment ; attachments and exhibits (kmk) (Entered: 03/03/1992)
03/02/1992	61	MOTION filed by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to compel a further search (kmk) (Entered: 03/03/1992)
03/09/1992	62	MOTION filed by defendants to extend time to 4/8/92 to respond to plaintiff's opposition to defendant FBI's amended motion for summary judgment and plaintiff's cross motion for summary judgment and motion to compel a further search (cjp) (Entered: 03/10/1992)
03/12/1992	63	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to extend time to 4/8/92 to respond to plaintiff's opposition to defendant FBI's amended motion for summary judgment and plaintiff's cross motion for summary judgment and motion to compel a further search [62-1] by defendant response to motion for summary judgement due 4/8/92 (N) (cjp) (Entered: 03/13/1992)
04/08/1992	64	REPLY by defendant FBI to plaintiff's opposition to amended to motion for summary judgment [40-1] by defendants; declarations (2); attachments (cjp) (Entered: 04/13/1992)
04/08/1992	65	RESPONSE by defendant FBI in opposition to cross motion for summary judgment [60-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (cjp) (Entered: 04/13/1992)
04/15/1992	66	NOTICE OF FILING by defendant FBI of ex parte, in camera for submission (cjp) (Entered: 04/16/1992)
04/22/1992	67	MOTION (unopposed) filed by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to extend time to 4/27/92 to file his response to defendant's response to plaintiff's cross motion for summary judgment (cjp) (Entered: 04/23/1992)
04/23/1992	68	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to extend time to 4/27/92 to file his response to defendant's response to plaintiff's cross motion for summary judgment [67-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN brief due 4/27/92 ; (N) (cjp) (Entered: 04/24/1992)
04/28/1992	69	REPLY by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant FBI'S opposition to cross motion for summary judgment [60-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN; attachments (3) (kmk) (Entered: 04/30/1992)
04/29/1992	70	RESPONSE (OPPOSITIONS) by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to notice of ex parte in camera submission [66-1] by FBI; attachments (cjp) (Entered: 04/30/1992)
05/07/1992	71	MOTION (unopposed) filed by defendant to extend time to 5/11/92 to respond to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's notice of ex parte, in camera submission (kmk) (Entered: 05/07/1992)
05/11/1992	72	REPLY by defendant FBI to plaintiff's opposition to notice of ex parte, in camera declaration for submission [66-1] by FBI (cjp) (Entered: 05/12/1992)
05/18/1992	73	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to extend time to 5/11/92 to respond to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's notice of ex parte, in camera submission [71-1] by defendant; nunc pro tunc (N) (cjp) (Entered: 05/19/1992)
06/22/1992	74	MEMORANDUM by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN RE: request to conduct an in camera inspection of 3/31/88 FBI letter to the Joint Chief of Staff; exhibits (19) (cjp) (Entered: 06/23/1992)

07/22/1992	75	RESPONSE (OPPOSITIONS) by defendant FBI to supplemental reply [74-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (kmk) (Entered: 07/23/1992)
08/11/1992	76	REPLY by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant FBI's response to supplemental reply [74-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (fiat) Jackson, J. (kmk) (Entered: 08/12/1992)
02/16/1993	77	NOTICE OF FILING by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN copies of three documents released to another FOIA requestor by the Dept. of Defense (kmk) (Entered: 02/17/1993)
02/16/1993	78	MOTION filed by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN for further search of other related documents (kmk) (Entered: 02/17/1993)
02/25/1993	79	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for defendant FBI by Patricia Arzuaga (clv) (Entered: 02/26/1993)
02/25/1993	80	MOTION filed by defendant FBI to extend time to 3/11/93 to file a responsive pleading to plaintiff's notice of filing and motion for further search (clv) (Entered: 02/26/1993)
02/26/1993	81	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to extend time to 3/11/93 to file a responsive pleading to plaintiff's notice of filing and motion for further search [80-1] by FBI (N) (rew) (Entered: 03/01/1993)
03/12/1993	82	RESPONSE (OPPOSITIONS) by defendant FBI to copies of three documents relating to another FOIA request by the Department of Defense [77-1] and Request for further search by PAUL GOLDSTEIN; declaration (1) (cjp) (Entered: 03/15/1993)
03/29/1993	83	MOTION filed by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN for leave to file reply to defendant's opposition out of time EXHIBIT (reply) (cjp) (Entered: 03/30/1993)
04/01/1993	84	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion for leave to file reply to defendant's opposition out of time [83-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (N) (cjp) (Entered: 04/02/1993)
04/01/1993	85	REPLY by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to defendant's opposition to plaintiff's notice of filing and motion for further search of other related documents [78-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (cjp) (Entered: 04/02/1993)
06/10/1993	86	NOTICE OF FILING by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN of recent Supreme Court decision; attachment. (pao) (Entered: 06/11/1993)
06/10/1993	87	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM to motion to compel a further search [61-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN and cross motion for summary judgment [60-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN. (pao) (Entered: 06/11/1993)
06/18/1993	88	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson: denying motion for further search of other related documents [78-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (N) (pob) (Entered: 06/18/1993)
06/21/1993	89	MOTION (unopposed) filed by defendant to extend time to 10/20/93 to respond to plaintiff's notice of filing and supplemental memorandum in support of plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment and motion to compel a further search (kmk) (Entered: 06/22/1993)
06/29/1993	90	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : denying motion as moot to extend time to 10/20/93 to respond to plaintiff's notice of filing and supplemental memorandum in support of plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment and motion to compel a further search [89-1] by defendants (N) (rew) (Entered: 06/29/1993)
07/12/1993	91	MOTION filed by plaintiff(s) PAUL GOLDSTEIN to clarify Court's recent order filed 06/29/93 (kmk) (Entered: 07/13/1993)
07/20/1993	92	RESPONSE by defendant FBI to motion to clarify Court's recent order filed 06/29/93 [91-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN (pob) (Entered: 07/21/1993)
07/21/1993	93	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson considering motion to clarify Court's recent order filed 06/29/93 [91-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN the Orders of 6/18/93 and 6/29/93 are vacated, denying plaintiffs motion for further search,granting

		defendants unopposed motion for extension of time filed 6/21/93, and extending defendants time to 10/20/93 to respond to plaintiffs supplemental memorandum in support of plaintiffs motion to compel a further search. (N) (rew) (Entered: 07/23/1993)
10/20/1993	94	NOTICE OF FILING by defendant FBI; First Declaration of Michael D. Turner; Exhibit (1) (ew) (Entered: 10/21/1993)
09/27/1995		SCHEDULING NOTICE: status hearing set for 9:30 11/1/95 ; before Judge Thomas P. Jackson . (rew) (Entered: 09/27/1995)
11/27/1995		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson: in camera review of 96 documents in the courtroom on 1/31/96 at 10:00 a.m. and to continue to 2/2/96. Reporter: Phyllis Merana (kmk) (Entered: 11/27/1995)
11/27/1995	95	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for defendant FBI by Karen Richardson. (kmk) (Entered: 11/29/1995)
12/18/1995	96	STATUS REPORT by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN. Report to the Court concerning the IN CAMERA REVIEW. Plaintiff submits his list of contested documents which are to be reviewed by the Court IN CAMERA.; exhibits (1) (dam) (Entered: 12/19/1995)
01/11/1996	97	NOTICE OF FILING by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN, filing a slip opinion in Lesar v. CIA., cv no. 93-2598.; attachments (1) (dam) (Entered: 01/16/1996)
01/31/1996		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson: case referral to Special Master for review of non B1 documents; Defendants' motion for summary judgment; granted in reference to B1 documents. Reporter: Phyllis Merana (kmk) (Entered: 01/31/1996)
01/31/1996	98	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson ;granting in part defendant's motion for summary judgment and denying in part plaintiff's motion for summary judgment with respect to 5 USC 552(b)(1) exemptions; and referring remaining disputed exemptions to a Special Master; and staying all other proceedings pending receipt of the report of the Special Master and further order of this court. (N) (rew) (Entered: 02/01/1996)
02/23/1996	99	ORDER of reference to Special Master by Judge Thomas P. Jackson, and appointing Curtis E. von Kann as Special Master, directing Special Master to make an in camera examination of certain documents and report to the Court by 4-30-96, and with other instructions to the Special Master and on compensation. (N) (rew) (Entered: 02/26/1996)
03/18/1996	100	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings before Thomas P. Jackson filed for date(s) of 01/31/96. Reporter: Phyllis Merana. (kmk) (Entered: 03/19/1996)
03/22/1996		SCHEDULING NOTICE: status hearing set for 9:30 4/2/96 ; before Judge Thomas P. Jackson . (rew) (Entered: 03/22/1996)
04/01/1996	101	RESPONSE by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to order [99-1]; attachments (2) (dam) (Entered: 04/02/1996)
04/01/1996	102	MOTION filed by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to vacate Order of 2/23/96 (dam) (Entered: 04/02/1996)
04/02/1996		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson ; a Special Master will not be appointed. Reporter: P. Merana (rew) (Entered: 04/02/1996)
04/02/1996	103	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson ,vacating order of 2-23-96 referring case to a special master. (N) (rew) (Entered: 04/04/1996)
04/11/1996	104	MOTION filed by defendants to extend time to 4/25/96 to file a response to plaintiff's reply to the Court's 2/23/96 Order (dam) (Entered: 04/12/1996)
04/12/1996	105	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to extend time to 4/25/96 to file a response to plaintiff's reply to the Court's 2/23/96 Order [104-1] by defendants (N) (rew) (Entered: 04/15/1996)

04/25/1996	106	RESPONSE by defendant FBI to plaintiff's response to the Court's order of 2/23/96 [101-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN; exhibits (5) (dam) (Entered: 04/26/1996)
09/03/1996		SCHEDULING NOTICE: status hearing set for 9:30 11/1/96 ; before Judge Thomas P. Jackson . (rew) (Entered: 09/03/1996)
05/15/1997	107	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : referring for in camera inspection of documents and findings of fact and recommend the conclusions of law to Magistrate Judge (N) (pao) (Entered: 05/15/1997)
05/15/1997		CASE REFERRED to Mag. Judge Patrick J. Attridge for report and recommendation (mmh) (Entered: 05/16/1997)
05/21/1997		SCHEDULING NOTICE: status hearing set for 10:30 6/24/97 ; before Mag. Judge Patrick J. Attridge . (pao) (Entered: 05/21/1997)
05/22/1997		SCHEDULING NOTICE: status hearing reset to 2:00 6/24/97 before Mag. Judge Patrick J. Attridge . (pao) (Entered: 05/22/1997)
06/24/1997	108	STATUS REPORT by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN, as of June 24, 1997; exhibit (1). (tth) (Entered: 06/25/1997)
06/24/1997		STATUS HEARING before Mag. Judge Patrick J. Attridge: defendant to produce documents by 7/1/97. Reporter: Tape AS 32-97; Lines 4710-5248 (pao) (Entered: 06/25/1997)
07/01/1997	109	NOTICE OF FILING by defendant FBI of the declaration of Bobbie S. Olivarri; declaration (1); attachments (3) (blj) (Entered: 07/03/1997)
06/08/1998		CASE referral ended Mag. Judge Patrick J. Attridge (ldc) (Entered: 06/10/1998)
06/08/1998		CASE REFERRED to Magistrate Judge John M. Facciola for report and recommendation This case is reassigned from Magistrate Judge Attridge (ldc) (Entered: 06/10/1998)
07/29/1999	110	REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION of Magistrate Judge John M. Facciola (pao) (Entered: 07/29/1999)
07/29/1999		CASE referral ended Magistrate Judge John M. Facciola (ldc) (Entered: 09/07/2000)
08/12/1999	111	OBJECTIONS by defendant FBI to report & recommendation [110-1] (tth) (Entered: 08/13/1999)
08/30/1999		SCHEDULING NOTICE: status hearing set for 9:30 9/30/99 ; before Judge Thomas P. Jackson . (rew) (Entered: 08/30/1999)
10/14/1999	112	MOTION filed by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to continuance of the status conference scheduled for October 20, 1999. (tw) (Entered: 10/15/1999)
10/15/1999	113	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to continuance of the status conference scheduled for October 20, 1999. [112-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN status hearing set for 9:30 11/22/99 ; (N) (rew) (Entered: 10/19/1999)
11/22/1999		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson : status hearing set for 9:30 2/9/00 ; motion for summary judgment due 1/12/00 ; response to motion for summary judgment due 1/26/00 Reporter: P. Merana (rew) (Entered: 11/22/1999)
11/22/1999	114	STATUS REPORT by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN (tth) (Entered: 11/23/1999)
11/22/1999	115	NOTICE OF FILING DECLARATION of Scott A. Hodes by defendant FBI; Exhibits (2) (tth) (Entered: 11/23/1999)
11/23/1999	116	MOTION filed by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to compel the FBI to process an undisclosed FBI Headquarters File ; Exhibits (2) (tth) (Entered: 11/24/1999)
12/02/1999	117	MOTION (unopposed) filed by defendant FBI to extend time to 12/8/99 to file an opposition to plaintiffs' motion to compel the FBI to process an undisclosed FBI Headquarters File. (kmk) Modified on 12/03/1999 (Entered: 12/03/1999)

12/07/1999	<u>119</u>	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson : granting motion to extend time to 12/8/99 to file an opposition to plaintiffs' motion to compel the FBI to process an undisclosed FBI Headquarters File. [117-1] by FBI reply to motion(s) due by 12/8/99 . (N) (rew) (Entered: 12/09/1999)
12/08/1999	118	MOTION (SECOND UNOPPOSED) filed by defendant FBI to extend time to 12/17/99 to file an opposition to plaintiff's motion to compel the FBI to process an undisclosed FBI Headquarters File (cjp) (Entered: 12/09/1999)
12/10/1999	120	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson: granting motion to extend time to 12/17/99 to file an opposition to plaintiff's motion to compel the FBI to process an undisclosed FBI Headquarters File [118-1] by FBI; response to motion due by 12/17/99; (N) (kmk) (Entered: 12/14/1999)
12/17/1999	121	RESPONSE by defendant FBI in opposition to motion to compel the FBI to process an undisclosed FBI Headquarters File [116-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN; exhibits (1) (tb) (Entered: 12/20/1999)
01/03/2000	122	REPLY by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to motion to compel the FBI to process an undisclosed FBI Headquarters File [116-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN; declaration (1); exhibit (1) (tb) (Entered: 01/04/2000)
01/13/2000	123	MOTION filed by defendant FBI for summary judgment as to documents withheld under exemption (b)(7)(D) ; attachments (2); exhibits (2) (tw) (Entered: 01/14/2000)
01/27/2000	124	MOTION filed by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN to extend time to 1/31/00 to file opposition (bjsp) (Entered: 02/02/2000)
02/02/2000	125	MEMORANDUM by plaintiff PAUL GOLDSTEIN in opposition to motion for summary judgment as to documents withheld under exemption (b)(7)(D) [123-1] by FBI; exhibits (6); declarations (1) (jf) (Entered: 02/03/2000)
02/02/2000	126	ORDER by Judge Thomas P. Jackson: granting motion nunc pro tunc to extend time to 1/31/00 to file opposition [124-1] by PAUL GOLDSTEIN response to motion for summary judgment due 1/31/00 ; (N) (kmk) (Entered: 02/08/2000)
02/09/2000		STATUS HEARING before Judge Thomas P. Jackson: Held. Reporter: Phyllis Merana (kmk) Modified on 02/11/2000 (Entered: 02/09/2000)
02/10/2000	127	REPLY by defendants in support of FBI's renewed motion for summary judgment as to documents withheld under exemption (b)(7)(D) [123-1] by FBI (bjsp) (Entered: 02/11/2000)
08/31/2004	<u>128</u>	ORDER denying 116 Plaintiff's Motion to Compel, granting 123 Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment. Signed by Judge Thomas Penfield Jackson on 8/30/2004. (lctpj1, ) (Entered: 08/31/2004)