

**U.S. District Court  
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:00-cv-01755-CKK**

LIVSHITS v. DOJ, et al  
Assigned to: Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly  
Demand: \$0  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 07/25/2000  
Date Terminated: 03/07/2002  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of  
Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**INNA LIVSHITS**

represented by **INNA LIVSHITS**  
Apartment 3-C  
60 Gouverneur Street  
New York City, NY 10002  
PRO SE

V.

**Defendant**

**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE**

represented by **Edith Margeurita Shine**  
UNITED STATES ATTORNEY'S  
OFFICE  
555 Fourth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
(202) 307-1249  
Fax: (202) 514-8780  
Email: [edith.shine@usss.dhs.gov](mailto:edith.shine@usss.dhs.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**DRUG ENFORCEMENT  
ADMINISTRATION**

represented by **Edith Margeurita Shine**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**NYCHA**  
*TERMINATED: 09/20/2001*

**Defendant**

**MIAS**

represented by **Arnold H. Leibowitz**  
1875 I Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20006-5409  
(202) 824-8183  
Fax: (202) 296-9246  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**CONEY ISLAND HOSPITAL**  
*TERMINATED: 09/20/2001*

**Defendant**

**HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID  
SOCIETY**

represented by **Arnold H. Leibowitz**  
(See above for address)

*TERMINATED: 09/05/2001*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Carolyn Elefant**  
 THE LAW OFFICES OF CAROLYN  
 ELEFANT  
 2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
 4th Floor East  
 Washington, DC 20037  
 (202) 297-6100  
 Email: [carolyn.elefant@gmail.com](mailto:carolyn.elefant@gmail.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**IMMIGRATION  
& NATURALIZATION SERVICE**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/25/2000	1	COMPLAINT filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS; attachments (16) (bm) (Entered: 07/28/2000)
07/25/2000		SUMMONS (4) issued to federal party(s) federal defendants DOJ, DEA , and non-parties: U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (bm) (Entered: 07/28/2000)
07/25/2000		SUMMONS (3) issued for defendants NYCHA, MIAS, and CONEY ISLAND HOSP (bm) (Entered: 07/28/2000)
07/25/2000	2	NOTIFICATION OF RELATED CASE: Case related to Case No(s): 00-1561 (bm) (Entered: 07/28/2000)
07/25/2000	3	APPLICATION by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to proceed in forma pauperis (bm) (Entered: 07/28/2000)
07/25/2000		ORDER by Judge Thomas F. Hogan granting motion to proceed in forma pauperis [3-1] by INNA LIVSHITS (fiat) (N) (bm) (Entered: 07/28/2000)
08/28/2000	4	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for federal defendant DOJ, federal defendant DEA by Edith M. Shine (bjsp) (Entered: 08/29/2000)
08/31/2000	5	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney General on 8/15/00 (dam) Modified on 09/09/2000 (Entered: 09/05/2000)
08/31/2000	6	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 8/15/00 upon federal defendant DOJ (dam) Modified on 09/09/2000 (Entered: 09/05/2000)
09/01/2000	7	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney on 8/21/00 (bjsp) (Entered: 09/06/2000)
09/07/2000	17	MOTION filed by defendant HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID to dismiss complaint [1-1] ; affidavit (1); attachments (bjsp) (Entered: 10/06/2000)
09/20/2000	8	MOTION filed by federal defendant DOJ to extend time to 9/25/00 to answer complaint [1-1] or file a dispositive motion (bm) (Entered: 09/22/2000)
09/20/2000	10	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 8/29/00 upon defendant MIAS (ab) (Entered: 09/26/2000)
09/20/2000	15	MOTION filed by defendant MIAS to dismiss complaint [1-1] ; attachments (bjsp) (Entered: 10/06/2000)
09/25/2000	9	MOTION filed by federal defendant DOJ, federal defendant DEA for summary judgment ; declaration (1) (ag) (Entered: 09/26/2000)

09/28/2000	11	MOTION filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for order granting release from certain obligations ; attachments (bjsp) (Entered: 09/29/2000)
09/28/2000	12	RESPONSE by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS in opposition to motion for summary judgment [9-1] by DEA, DOJ . (bjsp) (Entered: 09/29/2000)
10/03/2000	13	RESPONSE by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS in opposition to motion for summary judgment [9-1] by DEA, DOJ . (jf) (Entered: 10/04/2000)
10/03/2000	14	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 9/18/00 upon defendant NYCHA (jf) (Entered: 10/04/2000)
10/05/2000	16	REPLY by defendant HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID to motion to dismiss complaint [1-1] [15-1] by HIAS (bjsp) (Entered: 10/06/2000)
10/13/2000	18	REPLY by federal defendant DOJ to plaintiff's opposition to motion for summary judgment [9-1] (jf) (Entered: 10/18/2000)
10/16/2000	19	MOTION filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for leave to file amended complaint exhibit (amended complaint) (bjsp) (Entered: 10/18/2000)
10/18/2000	20	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 10/4/00 upon federal defendant DEA (bjsp) (Entered: 10/19/2000)
10/20/2000	21	MOTION filed by defendant HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID to dismiss amended complaint [1-1] Attachments (cas) (Entered: 10/23/2000)
10/25/2000	22	RESPONSE by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS in opposition to motion for summary judgment [9-1] by DEA, DOJ; plaintiff also requests a status report; Exhibit (1) (ag) (Entered: 11/01/2000)
12/26/2000	23	CASE ASSIGNED from Judge Richard W. Roberts to Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly (dot) (Entered: 01/03/2001)
01/17/2001	24	MOTION (copy) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to extend time to 1/26/01 to file dispositive motions against defendants US Department of Justice and US Drug Enforcement (cdw) (Entered: 01/19/2001)
01/17/2001	26	MOTION filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to extend time to 2/26/01 to file an opposition to defendants DOJ and HIAS motion to dismiss amended complaint (cdw) Modified on 01/24/2001 (Entered: 01/24/2001)
01/23/2001	<u>25</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : dispositive motions due 2/26/01 (N) (dot) (Entered: 01/23/2001)
03/12/2001	27	RESPONSE by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to motion to dismiss amended complaint [1-1] [21-1] by HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID; exhibits (4) (cdw) (Entered: 03/19/2001)
03/19/2001	28	MOTION (COPY) (DISPOSITIVE) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for litigation against US Department of Justice on the part of DEA ; exhibits (13) (cjp) Modified on 03/23/2001 (Entered: 03/23/2001)
03/19/2001	29	MOTION (COPY) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for leave to supplement evidence in her existing case (cjp) (Entered: 03/23/2001)
03/27/2001	30	MOTION (copy) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for declaratory relief on the part of Coney Island Hospital ; exhibits (2) (cdw) (Entered: 03/28/2001)
07/12/2001	<u>31</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly: denying motion for declaratory relief on the part of Coney Island Hospital [30-1] by INNA LIVSHITS, granting motion for leave to supplement evidence in her existing case [29-1] by INNA LIVSHITS, granting motion to extend time to 2/26/01 to file an opposition to defendants DOJ and HIAS motion to dismiss amended complaint [26-1] by INNA LIVSHITS, granting motion for leave to file amended complaint [19-1] by INNA LIVSHITS, denying motion for order granting release from certain obligations [11-1] by INNA LIVSHITS, granting nunc pro tunc motion to extend time to 9/25/00 to answer complaint [1-1] or file a dispositive motion [8-1] by DOJ (N) (dam) (Entered: 07/12/2001)

07/12/2001	<u>32</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly: that plaintiff may file additional oppositions to the defendants' motions no later than 8/2/01. If plaintiff does not file additional oppositions by that date, the Court will consider the motions on the moving papers, the oppositions already filed, and all other documents submitted by the parties to this case. response to motion due 8/2/01 ; (N) (dam) (Entered: 07/13/2001)
07/12/2001	33	AMENDED COMPLAINT by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS adding defendant INS, and amending complaint [1-1]; attachments (cdw) (Entered: 07/25/2001)
07/12/2001	34	MOTION (COPY) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to extend time to 12/31/00 to oppose defendant HIAS's motion to dismiss the amended complaint ; exhibits (2); "LET THIS BE FILED", J. Kollar-Kotelly (cdw) Modified on 07/25/2001 (Entered: 07/25/2001)
07/12/2001	35	MOTION (COPY) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to extend time for 40 days in which to file a dispositive motion against defendant DOJ ; exhibits (3); "LET THIS BE FILED", J. Kollar-Kotelly (cdw) Modified on 07/25/2001 (Entered: 07/25/2001)
07/31/2001	36	MOTION filed by federal defendant DOJ to dismiss amended complaint [33-1] (cdw) (Entered: 08/02/2001)
08/01/2001	37	RESPONSE (ADDITIONAL OPPOSITIONS) by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to as advised by Court's order response to motion due 8/2/01 [32-1] of 5/12/01; exhibits (4) (cdw) (Entered: 08/03/2001)
08/03/2001	39	RESPONSE by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS additional opposition to defendants motions as advised by Court's order of 7/12/01 [32-1]; exhibits (5) (cdw) (Entered: 08/07/2001)
08/06/2001	40	MOTION filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for clarification and justification of the case ; exhibits (2) (cdw) (Entered: 08/08/2001)
08/07/2001	<u>38</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : that plaintiff may file an opposition to the defendants' motion no later than 9/4/01. If plaintiff does not file an opposition by that date, the Court will consider the motions on the moving papers, the oppositions already filed, and all other documents submitted by the parties to this case. (N) (dot) (Entered: 08/07/2001)
08/08/2001		SUMMONS issued to federal party(s) defendant INS , and non-parties: U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (cdw) (Entered: 08/09/2001)
08/09/2001	41	RESPONSE (COPY) by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS in opposition to motion to dismiss amended complaint [33-1] [36-1] by DOJ; exhibits (4) (cdw) (Entered: 08/10/2001)
08/10/2001	42	MOTION filed by federal defendant DOJ, federal defendant DEA to extend time to 9/24/01 to reply to its motion to dismiss amended complaint (cdw) (Entered: 08/14/2001)
08/10/2001	43	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney General on 8/9/01 (cdw) (Entered: 08/15/2001)
08/17/2001	44	MOTION (copy) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to amend response in opposition to motion to dismiss plaintiff's amended complaint [41-1] by INNA LIVSHITS (cdw) (Entered: 08/21/2001)
08/27/2001	<u>45</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : granting motion to amend response in opposition to motion to dismiss plaintiff's amended complaint [41-1] by INNA LIVSHITS [44-1] by INNA LIVSHITS no later than 9/4/01. If plaintiff does not file an opposition by that date, the Court will consider the motions on the moving papers, the oppositions already filed, and all other documents submitted by the parties to this case. Granting motion to extend time to 9/24/01 to reply to its motion to dismiss amended complaint [42-1] by DEA, DOJ. No further extensions will be granted to either party except for extraordinary cause shown. (N) (dot) (Entered: 08/27/2001)

08/30/2001	46	RESPONSE by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS in opposition to motion to dismiss amended complaint [33-1] [36-1] by DOJ; exhibits (25) (cdw) (Entered: 08/31/2001)
08/31/2001	47	NOTICE OF FILING by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS corrected page 2 of addition oppositions filed pursuant to Court's order [37-1], [39-1] (cdw) (Entered: 09/07/2001)
09/05/2001	48	SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL for defendant HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID, substituting Carolyn Elefant for attorney Arnold H. Leibowitz for HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID (cdw) (Entered: 09/07/2001)
09/05/2001	49	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney on 8/10/01 (cdw) (Entered: 09/07/2001)
09/05/2001	50	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 8/15/01 upon defendant INS (cdw) (Entered: 09/07/2001)
09/20/2001	<u>51</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : granting motion for clarification and justification of the case [40-1] by INNA LIVSHITS. Granting motion to dismiss complaint [1-1] [15-1] by MIAS. Granting motion to dismiss complaint [1-1] [17-1] by HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID. Granting motion to dismiss amended complaint [1-1] [21-1] by HEBREW IMMIGRANT AID. Dismissing as to defendant NYCHA, defendant CONEY ISLAND HOSP., and the complaint is dismissed with prejudice as to defendant HIAS for failure to state a claim on which relief can be granted. (N) (dot) (Entered: 09/20/2001)
09/20/2001	<u>52</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : denying without prejudice motion for summary judgment [9-1] by DEA, DOJ. Denying as moot motion to extend time to 12/31/00 to oppose defendant HIAS's motion to dismiss the amended complaint [34-1] by INNA LIVSHITS Denying as moot motion to extend time for 40 days in which to file dispositive motion against defendant DOJ [35-1] by INNA LIVSHITS (N) (dot) (Entered: 09/20/2001)
09/24/2001	53	REPLY by federal defendant DOJ to response in opposition to motion to dismiss amended complaint [33-1] [36-1] by DOJ; declarations (3) (cdw) (Entered: 09/26/2001)
09/25/2001	54	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant DOJ of corrected reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion to dismiss amended complaint; exhibits (9) (cdw) (Entered: 09/27/2001)
11/08/2001	55	RESPONSE by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS in opposition to motion to dismiss amended complaint [33-1] [36-1] by DOJ; exhibits (1); c/m 10/30/01 (cdw) (Entered: 11/16/2001)
11/13/2001	56	MOTION (copy) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS to dismiss one component of DOJ, INS from the amended complaint [33-1] exhibits (2); c/m 11/2/01 (cdw) Modified on 11/16/2001 (Entered: 11/16/2001)
11/20/2001	57	STATEMENT filed by federal defendant DOJ, federal defendant DEA, defendant INS, regarding: mail service at U.S. Attorney's Office. (tth) (Entered: 11/21/2001)
01/15/2002	58	MOTION (copy) filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS F.R. 28 U.S.C. 2250 and of various character ; exhibits (1) (cdw) (Entered: 01/24/2002)
02/25/2002	59	MOTION filed by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for copy of docket sheet (cdw) (Entered: 03/01/2002)
02/25/2002	60	REQUEST by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS for the Court to transfer a copy of entire case to the US Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia (cdw) (Entered: 03/01/2002)
03/07/2002	<u>61</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly (N) (dot) (Entered: 03/07/2002)
03/07/2002	<u>62</u>	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : granting plaintiff's motion to dismiss her claim against the IMMIGRATION and NATURALIZATION SERVICE under the FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT, 5 USC 552 [56-1]. Denying plaintiff's

		<p>motion for litigation against the U.S. Department of Justice [28-1] and the portion of plaintiff's complaint that seeks monetary damages from defendants for alleged felonies is dismissed with prejudice as frivolous. Granting plaintiff's motions for a copy of the court file [58-1] and a copy of the docket sheet [59-1]. Denying plaintiff's motion for recusal of the undersigned judge [58-1]. Granting defendant's motion to dismiss as to the Drug Enforcement Administration, considered as a motion for summary judgment [36-1] and this case is dismissed with prejudice as to the Drug Enforcement Administration. Judgment shall be entered for defendant. This is a final appealable order. Rule 4(a), Fed.R.App.P. (N) (dot) (Entered: 03/07/2002)</p>
03/19/2002	63	<p>NOTICE OF APPEAL by plaintiff INNA LIVSHITS from order [62-1], entered on: 3/7/02. no fees paid-IFP. copies mailed to counsel. (cdw) (Entered: 03/19/2002)</p>
03/19/2002		<p>TRANSMITTED PRELIMINARY RECORD on appeal [63-1] by INNA LIVSHITS to U.S. Court of Appeals (cdw) (Entered: 03/19/2002)</p>
03/22/2002		<p>USCA # 02-5087 assigned for appeal [63-1] by INNA LIVSHITS (ks) (Entered: 03/25/2002)</p>
01/13/2003	64	<p>CERTIFIED COPY of order filed in USCA dated 11/13/02, on appeal [63-1] , affirming the judgment of USDC . , and the motion for summary reversal be denied USCA # 02-5087 (cp) (Entered: 01/14/2003)</p>