# U.S. District Court Northern District of Georgia (Atlanta) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-04763-LMM

Southern Environmental Law Center v. Federal Aviation Administration Assigned to: Judge Leigh Martin May Cause: 05:0552 Freedom of Information Act

# <u>Plaintiff</u>

Southern Environmental Law Center

Date Filed: 10/15/2018 Date Terminated: 03/16/2020 Jury Demand: None Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

## represented by Brian Lawrence Gist

Southern Environmental Law Center Suite 1050 Ten 10th St., N.W. Atlanta, GA 30309 404–521–9900 Fax: 404–521–9909 Email: <u>bgist@selcga.org</u> *LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

# **Robert D. Sherrier**

Southern Environmental Law Center Suite 1050 Ten 10th St., N.W. Atlanta, GA 30309 404–521–9900 Email: <u>bsherrier@selcga.org</u> *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED* 

V.

## <u>Defendant</u>

## **Federal Aviation Administration**

# represented by Samuel Williams

Office of the United States Attorney–ATL600 Northern District of Georgia 600 United States Courthouse 75 Ted Turner Dr., S.W. Atlanta, GA 30303 404–581–6228 Email: <u>samuel.williams2@usdoj.gov</u> ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/15/2018	1	COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF filed by Southern Environmental Law Center. (Filing fee \$400, receipt number 113E–8206568) (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 3, # 5 Exhibit 5, # 6 Exhibit 6, # 7 Civil Cover Sheet)(bdb) Please visit our website at http://www.gand.uscourts.gov/commonly–used–forms to obtain Pretrial Instructions and Pretrial Associated Forms which includes the Consent To Proceed Before U.S. Magistrate form. (Entered: 10/16/2018)
10/15/2018	2	Electronic Summons Issued as to Federal Aviation Administration. (bdb) (Entered: 10/16/2018)

10/16/2018	<u>3</u>	Certificate of Interested Persons by Southern Environmental Law Center. (Gist, Brian) (Entered: 10/16/2018)
10/22/2018	<u>4</u>	ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned to Judge Leigh Martin May for all further proceedings. Judge Charles A. Pannell, Jr. no longer assigned to case. <b>NOTICE TO ALL COUNSEL OF RECORD: The Judge designation in the civil action number assigned to this case has been changed to 1:18–cv–04763–LMM.</b> Please make note of this change in order to facilitate the docketing of pleadings in this case. Signed by Judge Charles A. Pannell, Jr. on 10/22/2018. (tcc) (Entered: 10/22/2018)
10/25/2018	<u>5</u>	STANDING ORDER REGARDING CIVIL LITIGATION. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 10/25/2018. (btql) (Entered: 10/25/2018)
11/19/2018	<u>6</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer with Brief In Support by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Brief, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 11/19/2018)
11/19/2018	7	ORDER GRANTING <u>6</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Answer re <u>1</u> Complaint. Federal Aviation Administration's Answer due 12/21/2018. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 11/19/2018. (btql) (Entered: 11/19/2018)
12/10/2018	<u>8</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Complaint and Summons, as to Defendant Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, FAA Packet Tracking, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, Pak Packet Tracking, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, Sessions Packet Tracking)(Gist, Brian) (Entered: 12/10/2018)
12/21/2018	2	<i>Defendant's</i> ANSWER to <u>1</u> COMPLAINT by Federal Aviation Administration. Discovery ends on 5/20/2019.(Williams, Samuel) Please visit our website at http://www.gand.uscourts.gov to obtain Pretrial Instructions. (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/26/2018	<u>10</u>	Administrative Order Staying Civil Proceedings in Light of Lapse Appropriations. Signed by Chief Judge Thomas W. Thrash, Jr. on 12/26/18. (btql) (Entered: 12/27/2018)
01/28/2019		MINUTE ORDER LIFTING STAY due to appropriations. Approved by Judge Leigh Martin May on 1/28/2019.(rvb) (Entered: 01/28/2019)
03/08/2019	<u>11</u>	ORDER: Counsel are hereby ORDERED to file the Joint Preliminary Report andDiscovery Plan required by Local Rule 16.2 within 14 days of entry of this Order, or SHOW CAUSE why this case should not be dismissed pursuant to LR 41.3. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 3/8/2019. (btql) (Entered: 03/08/2019)
03/08/2019	<u>12</u>	Joint MOTION for scheduling order by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 03/08/2019)
03/11/2019	<u>13</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>12</u> Motion for Scheduling Order. See Order for more details. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 3/8/2019. (btql) (Entered: 03/11/2019)
05/14/2019	<u>14</u>	NOTICE by Federal Aviation Administration (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Certified Administrative Record Index)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 05/14/2019)
06/17/2019	<u>15</u>	Joint MOTION for Modification of <u>13</u> Scheduling Order by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) Modified on 6/18/2019 to edit text (tmf). (Entered: 06/17/2019)
06/19/2019	<u>16</u>	ORDER granting <u>15</u> Motion for Modification of <u>13</u> Scheduling Order: No later than July 19, 2019, SELC shall file and serve a motion for summary judgment and memorandum of law in support. No later than August 9, 2019, FAA shall file and serve a combined cross-motion for summary judgment and responsive memorandum of law. No later than August 26, 2019, SELC may file a combined reply brief in support of its motion for summary judgment and memorandum in response to FAA cross-motion for summary judgment. FAA may file a reply brief in support of its cross-motion for summary judgment no later than September 9, 2019. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 6/18/2019. (tmf) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
07/17/2019	<u>17</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Robert D. Sherrier on behalf of Southern Environmental Law Center (Sherrier, Robert) (Entered: 07/17/2019)

07/19/2019	<u>18</u>	First MOTION for Summary Judgment with Brief In Support by Southern Environmental Law Center. (Attachments: # 1 Brief Brief in Support of Summary Judgment, # 2 Statement of Material Facts Statement of Undisputed Facts, # 3 Appendix Appendix, # 4 Exhibit Ex. A – Draft Environmental Impact Statement: Executive Summary, # 5 Exhibit Ex. B – No Responsive Documents Letter, # 6 Exhibit Ex. C – First Declaration of Michael J. McElligott, # 7 Exhibit Ex. D – First FAA Vaughn Index, # 8 Exhibit Ex. E – Notice of Disputes Letter to FAA, # 9 Exhibit Ex. F – 20161221_DL_SCC Final DOPAA, # 10 Exhibit Ex. G Waiver Emails, # 11 Exhibit Ex. H National Parks Service Comments on DEIS, # 12 Exhibit Ex. I Search Emails, # 13 Exhibit Ex. J Authorized Personnel Provided by Applicant, # 14 Exhibit Ex. K June 2019 Letter from FAA to Camden County)(Gist, Brian) ––Please refer to http://www.gand.uscourts.gov to obtain the Notice to Respond to Summary Judgment Motion form contained on the Court's website.–– (Entered: 07/19/2019)
08/08/2019	<u>19</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment with Brief In Support by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Brief, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 08/08/2019)
08/08/2019	<u>20</u>	ORDER on <u>19</u> Motion for Extension of Time. A. No later than August 30, 2019, Defendant shall file and serve a combined cross-motion for summary judgment and responsive memorandum of law. B. No later than September 19, 2019, Plaintiff may file a combined reply brief in support of its motion for summary judgment and memorandum in response to Defendants cross-motion for summary judgment. C. No later than October 3, 2019, Defendant may file a reply brief in support of its cross-motion for summary judgment. See order for other specifics. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 8/8/2019. (tmf) (Entered: 08/08/2019)
08/29/2019	<u>21</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File its Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment with Brief In Support by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Brief, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 08/29/2019)
09/03/2019	<u>22</u>	ORDER granting <u>21</u> Motion for Extension of Time. Having read and considered Defendants Motion for Extension of Time to file a Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment and for good cause shown, it is hereby ORDERED that Defendant shall be granted an extension of time through and including September 4, 2019. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 9/3/2019. (tmf) (Entered: 09/03/2019)
09/04/2019	<u>23</u>	Combined MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment <i>and RESPONSE IN</i> <i>OPPOSITION to Plaintiff's <u>18</u> Motion for Summary Judgment with Brief In Support by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: #<u>1</u> Brief Memorandum of Law in Support of Defendant's Cross–Motion for Partial Summary Judgment and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment, #<u>2</u> Statement of Material Facts, #<u>3</u> Exhibit A to Statement of Material Facts Not in Dispute, #<u>4</u> Exhibit B to Statement of Material Facts Not in Dispute, #<u>5</u> Statement of Material Facts Defendant's Response to Plaintiff's Statement of Material Facts)(Williams, Samuel) ––Please refer to http://www.gand.uscourts.gov to obtain the Notice to Respond to Summary Judgment Motion form contained on the Court's website.–– Modified on 9/6/2019 to add document links and edit text(tmf). (Entered: 09/04/2019)</i>
09/19/2019	<u>24</u>	RESPONSE re <u>23</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment and REPLY IN SUPPORT of Plaintiff's <u>18</u> Motion filed by Southern Environmental Law Center. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix – Supplemental, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A – Hazard Analysis Excerpts from Search Emails, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B – Dec 2017 Nelson to Branham Email & Schedule, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C – Excerpts from May 2019 Vaughn Index, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D – Specific Improper Withholdings, # <u>6</u> Statement of Material Facts Plaintiff's Response to DSOF)(Gist, Brian) Modified on 9/23/2019 to edit text and add links(tmf). (Entered: 09/19/2019)
10/04/2019		Submission of <u>18</u> First MOTION for Summary Judgment, <u>23</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment</i> , to District Judge Leigh Martin May. (tmf) (Entered: 10/04/2019)
10/30/2019	<u>25</u>	NOTICE by Federal Aviation Administration re <u>14</u> Notice (Other) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1; FAA No Responsive Documents Letter in regards to FOIA Request No. 2018–5241, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2; FAA First Batch of Documents Responsive to FOIA Request No. 2018–5147, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, Pt. 1; FAA Second Batch of Documents Responsive to FOIA Request No. 2018–5147, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 3, Pt. 2; FAA Second Batch of Documents Responsive to FOIA Request No. 2018–5147, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 3, Pt. 3; FAA

i		
		Second Batch of Documents Responsive to FOIA Request No. 2018–5147, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 3, Pt. 4; FAA Second Batch of Documents Responsive to FOIA Request No. 2018–5147, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 3, Pt. 5; FAA Second Batch of Documents Responsive to FOIA Request No. 2018–5147, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 4; First Declaration of Michael J. McElligott, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 5; First FAA Vaughn Index, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 6; Communication between FAA and SELC)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 10/30/2019)
11/26/2019	<u>26</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Leigh Martin May: Telephone Conference held on 11/26/2019. A Telephone Conference was held at the request of the parties to discuss the status of this case. The Court heard from Plaintiff's and Defendant's counsel and DENIED as moot without prejudice with the right to re–file Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment <u>18</u> and Defendant's Cross– Motion for Partial Summary Judgment <u>23</u> . The parties shall file a proposed consent order regarding the production schedule no later then Friday, December 6, 2019. (Court Reporter Andy Ashley)(tmf) (Entered: 11/26/2019)
12/06/2019	<u>27</u>	CONSENT MOTION for Production Order <i>and Status Report</i> by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) Modified on 12/6/2019 to edit event to match PDF(tmf). (Entered: 12/06/2019)
12/06/2019		Notification of Docket Correction re <u>27</u> CONSENT MOTION for Production Order (and Status Report) by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # 1 Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) Modified on 12/6/2019 to edit event to match PDF(tmf). (tmf) (Entered: 12/06/2019)
12/09/2019	<u>28</u>	ORDER: Having read and considered the Parties' Joint Motion for Scheduling Order and for good cause shown, it is hereby ORDERED as follows: No later than December 18, 2019, SELC shall identify to the FAA any remaining email attachments that are to be produced to SELC. No later than January 15, 2020, the FAA shall produce all email attachments identified by SELC or provide a Vaughn Index justifying any documents that have been withheld or redacted. No later than January 24, 2020, the Parties shall provide a status update to the Court. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 12/9/2019. (tmf) (Entered: 12/09/2019)
01/24/2020	<u>29</u>	STATUS REPORT by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 01/24/2020)
01/27/2020	<u>30</u>	ORDER: Having read and considered the Parties' Status Update and Joint Motion for Extension of the Production Order and for good cause shown, it is hereby ORDERED as follows: No later than February 14, 2020, the parties shall provide a status update to the Court as to any remaining disputes related to the production of documents pursuant to the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA). On that date/ the parties shall also update the Court as to the fee recovery discussions and any other remaining disputes in this case. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 1/27/2020. (tmf) (Entered: 01/27/2020)
02/14/2020	<u>31</u>	STATUS REPORT by Federal Aviation Administration. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 02/14/2020)
02/19/2020	<u>32</u>	ORDER: Having read and considered the Parties' Status Update and Joint Motion for Extension of the Production Order and for good cause shown, it is hereby ORDERED as follows: No later than March 15, 2020, the parties shall provide a status update to the Court as to the fee recovery discussions. If necessary, the parties should provide a proposed briefing schedule for any necessary motions or fee petitions. The clerk is instructed to submit this to the undersigned if no status upsate is filed by March, 15, 2020. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 2/19/2020. (tmf) Modified on 2/19/2020 to edit text(tmf). (Entered: 02/19/2020)
03/16/2020		Submission of $\underline{32}$ Order, to District Judge Leigh Martin May. (tmf) (Entered: $\underline{03}/\underline{16}/\underline{2020}$ )
03/16/2020	<u>33</u>	STATUS REPORT by Federal Aviation Administration. (Williams, Samuel) (Entered: 03/16/2020)
03/16/2020	<u>34</u>	ORDER: On March 16, 2020, the parties in this matter notified the Court that they have reached a settlement. See Dkt. No. <u>33</u> . Accordingly, this case is ADMINISTRATIVELY CLOSED pending the parties' filing of the dismissal with prejudice. The parties are DIRECTED to file within 60 days of this Order either (1) the

	necessary documents to dismiss this case or (2) a joint status update notifying the Court why they are unable to file such documents. Signed by Judge Leigh Martin May on 3/16/2020. (tmf) (Entered: 03/16/2020)
03/16/2020	Civil Case Terminated. (tmf) (Entered: 03/16/2020)