

EXHIBIT B



Benjamin Seel <bseel@democracyforward.org>

Re: Democracy Forward FOIA Request (OMB Tracking No. 19-184)

Benjamin Seel <bseel@democracyforward.org>
 To: MBX.OMB.FOIA@omb.eop.gov
 Cc: FOIA Requests <foia@democracyforward.org>

Fri, Mar 29, 2019 at 5:05 PM

Dear Ms. Hardy,

I'm writing in response to your March 25, 2019 letter inquiring whether Democracy Forward could narrow the FOIA request it submitted to OMB on February 19, 2019 (OMB Tracking No. 19-184). Specifically, you requested that we suggest possible custodians for the separate requests, and provide a time frame for the searches. To that end, I would propose adding the bolded red text below to hopefully clarify the request, and enable OMB to begin processing it.

1. Any and all records: (1) Sent to or from Joseph.J.Grogan@omb.eop.gov, Sophia_M._Wright@omb.eop.gov, or Thomas_M._Reilly@omb.eop.gov; and (2) That contain any of the following terms: CAR-T, value-based, outcomes-based, indications-based, Michael Cohen, Essential Consultants, Novartis, @novartis.com, Jimenez, Narasimhan, Alston & Bird, @alston.com, Brownstein Hyatt, @bhfs.com, Capitol Counsel, @capitolcounsel.com, Capitol Hill Consulting Group, @caphillgrp.com, East End Group, @eastendgrp.com, McManus, @mcmanusgrp.com, Monument Policy Group, @monumentpolicy.com, Scully, Roskey & Missmar, @wileyrein.com, Thorn Run Partners, @thornrun.com, Tiber Creek Health Strategies, @pmj-dc.com, Williams & Jensen, @wms-jen.com, Madigan Jones, @pmj-dc.com, Trimpa Group, @trimpagroup.com, Daniel Casserly, dan.casserly@novartis.com, O'Neal, Farber, Haller, Sussman, Phipps, McGowan, or Mui-Lipnik. **Please search for records created between January 20, 2017 and the date on which the search is conducted.**
2. Any and all records: **(1) sent to or from Joseph J. Grogan, Sophia M. Wright, or Thomas M. Reilly; and (2) that** contain any of the following key terms: Michael Cohen, Essential Consultants, Novartis, @novartis.com, Jimenez, Narasimhan, Alston & Bird, @alston.com, Brownstein Hyatt, @bhfs.com, Capitol Counsel, @capitolcounsel.com, Capitol Hill Consulting Group, @caphillgrp.com, East End Group, @eastendgrp.com, McManus, @mcmanusgrp.com, Monument Policy Group, @monumentpolicy.com, Scully, Roskey & Missmar, @wileyrein.com, Thorn Run Partners, @thornrun.com, Tiber Creek Health Strategies, @pmj-dc.com, Williams & Jensen, @wms-jen.com, Peck Madigan Jones, @pmj-dc.com, Trimpa Group, @trimpagroup.com, Daniel Casserly, dan.casserly@novartis.com, Shawn O'Neail, Leo Farber, Sarah Haller, Wendy Sussman, Candie Phipps, Joseph McGowan, or Shelly Mui-Lipnik. **Please search for records created between January 20, 2017 and the date on which the search is conducted.**
2. Any and all records relating to a January 2018 meeting between President Donald Trump and Novartis CEO Vas Narasimhan. **Please search for records within the Office of Health Programs that were created between January 1, 2018 and the date on which the search is completed.**
4. Any and all records relating to any January 2017 meeting between President Donald Trump and Pharmaceutical executives, including Novartis CEO Joe Jimenez. This includes communications following up on discussions that occurred at the meeting. **Please search for records within the Office of Health Programs created between January 20, 2017 and the date on which the search is completed.**
5. Any and all records relating to any May 2017 meeting between Novartis representatives and administration officials, as reported by Novartis executive Joe Jimenez. This includes communications following up on discussions that occurred at the meeting. **Please search for records within the Office of Health Programs created between April 1, 2017 and the date on which the search is completed.**

For your reference, I'm attaching our initial request, and your March 25 letter. Please let me know if the proposed additional text above resolves the issue such that OMB can begin processing the request. I'm also happy to discuss further by phone at any point.

Best,
 Ben

On Mon, Mar 25, 2019 at 12:10 PM FOIA Requests <foia@democracyforward.org> wrote:

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **MBX OMB FOIA** <MBX.OMB.FOIA@omb.eop.gov>
Date: Mon, Mar 25, 2019 at 11:00 AM
Subject: RE: [EXTERNAL] FOIA Request
To: FOIA Requests <foia@democracyforward.org>

Good Morning: See Attached.

Thanks.

From: FOIA Requests <foia@democracyforward.org>
Sent: Tuesday, February 19, 2019 2:38 PM
To: MBX OMB FOIA <MBX.OMB.FOIA@OMB.eop.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] FOIA Request

Dear FOIA Officer,

Please find attached a FOIA request regarding CMS, OMB, and Novartis. Please note the attached PDF includes hyperlinks for additional context.

If you have any questions, please respond to this email.

Thank you!

Democracy Forward

--
Benjamin Seel

Democracy Forward
Counsel and Legal Analyst
Direct: (202) 701-1793
Cell: (207) 907-6631
bseel@democracyforward.org

NOTICE: This communication and any attachments may contain privileged or other confidential information and is intended only for use by the individual or entity named above. If you have received this communication in error, please immediately advise the sender by reply email and immediately delete the message and any attachments without copying or disclosing the contents.

2 attachments

 **FINAL_OMB Novartis FOIA 2.19.2019.pdf**
145K

 **OMB Ltr - Request 19-184 Overly Broad.pdf**
640K