1

SWORN STATEMENT

OF

CHARLES RICE

Recorded on Monday, the 15th day of October, 2018, at the Law Offices of Sher, Garner, Cahill, Richter, Klein & Hilbert, 909 Poydras Street, 28th Floor, New Orleans, Louisiana 70112.

REPORTED BY:

LESLIE L. NICOSIA
CERTIFIED COURT REPORTER

1 APPEARANCES 2. 3 REPRESENTING THE NEW ORLEANS CITY COUNCIL: 4 THE LAW OFFICES OF SHER, GARNER, CAHILL, RICHTER, KLEIN & HILBERT 5 BY: MATTHEW M. COMAN, ESQUIRE 909 Poydras Street 6 28th Floor New Orleans, Louisiana 70112 7 THE LAW OFFICES OF LAWRENCE & ASSOCIATES BY: J.C. LAWRENCE, ESQUIRE 8 ANTHONY J. IBERT, ESQUIRE 9 303 South Broad Street New Orleans, Louisiana 70119 10 JUDGE CALVIN JOHNSON 5025 Willow Street 11 New Orleans, Louisiana 70115 12 13 REPRESENTING ENTERGY SERVICES, INC.: 14 CORY R. CAHN, ESQUIRE LEGAL SERVICES 15 639 Loyola Avenue New Orleans, Louisiana 70113 16 THE LAW OFFICES OF CHAFFE MCCALL 17 WALTER F. BECKER, JR., ESQUIRE TERRY Q. ALARCON, ESQUIRE 18 1100 Poydras Street Suite 2300 New Orleans, Louisiana 70163 19 20 21 22 23 24

JOHNS, PENDLETON, FAIRBANKS AND FREESE

25

1	INDEX
2	PAGE
3	Title 1
4	Appearances 2
5	Index 3
6	EXAMINATION BY:
7	MR. COMAN 7
8	
9	MR. IBERT135
10	MR. LAWRENCE145
11	JUDGE JOHNSON167
12	EXHIBITS
13	Exhibit 4 ENO-NOPS 6353-6360
13	E-mail Chain Subject: Thursday's
14	Council Utility Meeting Stakeholder Remarks 23
15	
16	Exhibit 5 ENO-NOPS 6659 E-mail Subject: Dec. 12th Meeting. 26
17	Exhibit 6 HAWTHORN 1003-1006
18	E-mail Chain Subject: Shall we Talk
19	Exhibit 8 ENO-NOPS 6314-6318
20	E-mail Subject: Just FYI Tweets from Last Night's Meeting 36
21	Exhibit 9 ENO-NOPS 3
22	Outlook Entry NOPS Update 40
23	Exhibit 11 ENO-NOPS 8-11 Memo Re: Follow-Up Proposal 45
24	
25	

1	Exhibit 12 ENO-NOPS 756-759 E-mail Chain Subject: TCNA
2	Intervention re UD-17-04 Investigation and Remediation of
3	Service Disruptions
4	Exhibit 13 ENO-NOPS 5-6 Outlook Entry Campaign/Strategy
5	Discussion 56
6 7	Exhibit 14 ENO-NOPS 7/HAWTHORN 13-26 E-mail Subject: Hawthorn Follow-Up Proposal
-	
8 9	Exhibit 15 ENO-NOPS 12 E-mail Chain Subject: Hawthorn's Latest Proposal
10	Exhibit 16 HAWTHORN 32-33
_ •	E-mail Subject: Oct. Hearing 61
11	- 1 11 1 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10
12	Exhibit 19 NO BATES 10/3/17 Text Message Communication. 67
13	Exhibit 20 HAWTHORN 1 E-mail Chain Subject: Yesterday's
14	New Orleans Flooding - Reference to106
15	T. b.'b.'. OF NO DATED
16	Exhibit 25 NO BATES Color Photographs (3)
17	Exhibit 26 NO BATES 10/16/17 Text Message
18	Communication
19	Exhibit 28 NO BATES 10/20/17 Text Message
20	Communication
21	Exhibit 29 ENO-NOPS 6311-6312 E-mail Chain Subject: The Lens 81
22	E-Mair Chain Subject. The Lens 81
	Exhibit 30 HAWTHORN 58
23	E-mail Subject: Second Tweet, See Comments83
24	
25	

1	Exhibit 31 ENO-NOPS 6573-6575 E-mail Chain Subject: Sprinklr
2	Message Assigned85
3	Exhibit 34A NO BATES 1/11/18 Text Message Communication 89
4	_ 1.11.1. 05
5	Exhibit 35 HAWTHORN 5-6 E-mail Chain Subject: Feb 21 Hearing Options
6	
7	Exhibit 37 HAWTHORN 16 E-mail Chain Subject: Room Opens at 8:30 a.m
8	_ 1 11 1
9	Exhibit 45 ENO-NOPS 133 E-mail Subject: Please Process Hawthorn Group Invoice109
10	
11	Exhibit 46 ENO-NOPS 319-322 E-mail Chain Subject: Confirm Status Bright Moments Invoice110
12	
13	Exhibit 47 ENO-NOPS 249-252 E-mail Chain Subject: Hawthorn Entergy Contract111
14	
15	Exhibit 48 ENO-NOPS 492-493 Contract Change Order111
16	Exhibit 49 ENO-NOPS 496-497 Contract Change Order112
17	
18	Exhibit 50 ENO-NOPS 6009-6014 Hawthorn Management Fees113
19	Exhibit 52 ENO-NOPS 5763-5764 E-mail Chain Subject: Media
20	Request The Lens116
21	Exhibit 57 ENO-NOPS 5923-5924 E-mail Chain Subject: Statement to
22	Lens and WWL-TV118
23	Exhibit 58 ENO-NOPS 5737-5738 E-mail Chain Subject: Statement to
24	Lens and WWL-TV122
25	

1	Exhibit 58 ENO-NOPS 5807-5808 E-mail Subject: C. Rice Statement
2	re Lens123
3	Exhibit 63 ENO-NOPS 1007 E-mail Chain Subject: Hawthorn
4	List 28
5	Exhibit 64 ENO-NOPS 1135-1139 Contract Change Order
6	Exhibit 65 NO BATES
7	Color Photograph
8	Exhibit 66 ENO-NOPS 6435-6443 E-mail Chain Subject: NOPS Feb. 21
9	Meeting Remarks and Letter to Editor94
10	
11	Exhibit 67 NO BATES 5/15/18 City Council Letter to Charles Rice
12	
13	Exhibit 68 NO BATES Color Photographs (9)132
14	Exhibit 69 NO BATES 9/17/18 Text Message Communication132
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	CHARLES RICE	
	639 Lovola Avenue	

- New Orleans, Louisiana 70113 2.
- after having first been duly sworn, was examined 3
- 4 and testified as follows:
- EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN: 5
- Mr. Rice, good morning. My name is 6 Q.
- 7 Matt Coman. I'm here with Judge Johnson,
- Mr. Lawrence, and Mr. Ibert. We, as you likely 8
- 9 know, have been retained by the New Orleans City
- Council to conduct an investigation on their 10
- 11 behalf into various allegations concerning
- 12 Entergy that arose in May of 2018. Is that your
- understanding, Mr. Rice? 13
- 14 Α. Yes.
- 15 This is a sworn statement. If you Ο.
- 16 want to go off the record, if you need to take a
- 17 bathroom break or take a phone call, please feel
- free to let us know. We will certainly 18
- 19 accommodate that. This is not a marathon or a
- 20 test.
- 2.1 How long have you worked for Entergy,
- 2.2 Mr. Rice?
- 2.3 This is actually my second stint with Α.
- 24 the company. The first time, I think I joined
- 25 in 2000, probably that summer. I left in 2002.

- The second time I joined, I believe, in June of 1
- 2. '09. I'm still presently employed by Entergy.
- During your first stint in that time 3 Ο.
- frame, 2000 to 2002, what roles did you fulfill? 4
- I started in the legal department. I 5
- think my title was Senior Counsel in litigation. 6
- 7 Then I moved into human resources. My title was
- Manager, Labor Relations Litigation Support. 8
- Your second stint starting in 2009, 9
- 10 what roles have you fulfilled in that particular
- 11 time?
- My first position was Director of 12 Α.
- Utility Strategy. Then I moved to Director of 13
- Regulatory Affairs for Entergy New Orleans. 14
- 15 Then I was named -- It might have been August or
- July of '10, I believe. I was named CEO of 16
- Entergy New Orleans, President and CEO of 17
- 18 Entergy New Orleans.
- 19 Your first stint in that time frame, Ο.
- 20 2000 to 2002, was that specifically for Entergy
- 21 New Orleans or some other corporation?
- 22 Α. That was Entergy Services, Inc.
- 23 What is your current job title? Ο.
- Assistant General Counsel. I believe 24 Α.
- that's the correct title. 25

- 1 Q. For which company?
- 2. Α. Entergy Services.
- How long have you been in that role? 3 Q.
- 4 Α. September.
- 5 In your role as CEO and President of Q.
- Entergy New Orleans, who did you report to? 6
- 7 Α. When I first took the position, it was
- Gary Taylor, then Theo Bunting, B-u-n-t-i-n-g, 8
- 9 Rod West.
- 10 Ο. In your role as President and CEO of
- 11 Entergy New Orleans, did you supervise in a way
- 12 everyone either directly or indirectly at
- 13 Entergy New Orleans?
- 14 Α. I was responsible for the day-to-day
- 15 operations of Entergy New Orleans, both the
- 16 electrical system and the gas system.
- 17 Physically, where was your office? Q.
- 18 Α. 1600 Perdido Street, Building 505.
- 19 How close was your office to Yolanda Ο.
- 20 Pollard's office at that time?
- 21 I don't know the exact measurement. Α.
- 22 We were in the same suite area, I guess you
- 23 could call it.
- Same floor? 24 Q.
- 25 Yeah. It was only -- the Entergy New Α.

1 Orleans office on the first floor. They're all

- 2 on the first floor of that building.
- 3 Q. Did you work with Ms. Pollard on a
- 4 consistent basis over the last couple of years?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 O. Do you still work with her?
- 7 A. No, not directly.
- 8 Q. Who made the decision to change your
- 9 assignments to remove whatever you want to call
- 10 it?
- 11 A. That was probably a joint decision.
- 12 Rod West probably has the ultimate authority on
- 13 making that decision.
- 14 O. Why did he make that decision?
- 15 A. I mean, he and I had a discussion that
- 16 maybe it was time for me to move into a
- 17 different role. We probably had that discussion
- 18 maybe two, three months before it actually
- 19 happened.
- 20 Q. In any way, was that decision related
- 21 to or connected with the allegations that
- 22 surfaced in May of this year, 2018?
- 23 A. You would have to ask him that
- 24 question. I would say no, I don't think so.
- 25 Q. Did you ever -- Did Mr. West ever

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 discuss in relation to your reassignment these

- 2. particular allegations and the political, slash,
- media fallout, my words? 3
- 4 Α. No.
- Have you ever had that discussion with 5 Q.
- any superior besides Mr. West? 6
- 7 Α. When you say, "fallout," I'm not quite
- sure what you are talking about. If you are 8
- asking me was there a discussion about what was 9
- 10 going on, I would say yes. Was there a
- 11 discussion about what occurred? I would say
- 12 yes. I don't know what you mean by actual
- 13 "fallout."
- Q. Media coverage, negative media 14
- 15 coverage.
- 16 Yeah, there were discussions about Α.
- 17 that.
- 18 Ο. Ballpark, how many discussions you
- 19 think you've had with Mr. West concerning
- 20 negative media coverage concerning the
- 21 allegations we are here for today? Several?
- I'm thinking maybe three or four. 22 Α.
- 23 could have been more.
- Earlier, you testified it was somewhat 24 Q.
- of a joint decision, I think were the words you 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 Was this something that -- Was this used.
- 2. decision that you be removed and reassigned, was
- it something you were in support of or was it 3
- really not presented to you in a way for you to 4
- weigh in on? 5
- 6 Α. Let me say this. Serving in a role
- 7 such as which I served in I would say has a
- shelf life. I think studies show the average 8
- CEO serves between five to seven years. I was 9
- 10 -- I think beginning year '09, at some point,
- one, I think somebody else deserves an 11
- opportunity; and two, there could come a time 12
- where you are not as effective as you were 13
- 14 previously.
- 15 So, was it presented to me in a way
- where I didn't have a choice? I would say no. 16
- As I stated before, it was something he and I 17
- 18 had discussed before it actually occurred.
- 19 Did the negative media coverage in Ο.
- 20 your mind decrease your effectiveness?
- I don't know if it necessarily 21 Α.
- 22 decreased my effectiveness. I still have gotten
- 23 things accomplished in the role, sure. But
- could I have been seen as a distraction? 24
- 25 Possibly.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Have you received any documents Q.

- 2. evidencing your change in role from an HR, human
- resources --3
- 4 Α. No.
- -- standpoint? 5 Q.
- 6 Α. No.
- 7 Q. This was just all verbal?
- Pretty much. 8 Α.
- 9 And what type of activities are you Q.
- 10 undertaking at this point?
- BY MR. CAHN: 11
- 12 Let me caution you against
- 13 disclosing non-public information
- 14 regarding --
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- I will tell you, what I am 16
- 17 working on is not public information.
- 18 It's not anything that the company has
- revealed. So, I don't think it would 19
- 20 be appropriate for me to have that
- 21 discussion until the company files the
- appropriate documents with the SCC. 22
- 23 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 24 Q. Did you receive a reduction in pay?
- 25 BY MR. CAHN:

MANUEL RICE OCCUBET 13, 2010

- 1 Mr. Rice is not going to
- 2 discuss his compensation during this
- 3 proceeding.
- 4 BY MR. COMAN:
- 5 Are you instructing him not to
- 6 answer that question?
- 7 BY MR. CAHN:
- 8 I am.
- 9 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 10 Q. What do you believe are your long-term
- 11 prospects at Entergy?
- 12 A. Long-term prospects?
- 13 O. Yes, sir.
- 14 A. If I want to continue to work there, I
- 15 can continue to work there. I've had no reason
- 16 to believe, nor has anyone communicated to me,
- 17 that I have a so-called "certain shelf life." I
- 18 think as long as I would desire to be there, I
- 19 could probably continue there.
- 20 O. You may have mentioned this earlier.
- 21 Your office is now in a different building; is
- 22 that correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Which building is that?
- 25 A. 639 Loyola Avenue. I'm on the 22nd

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 floor.
- 2. Ο. Currently, are you supervising anyone?
- 3 I don't have any direct reports. Α. No.
- 4 Before your removal and reassignment, Ο.
- did you work with Ms. Toni Green-Brown? 5
- 6 Α. Yes.
- 7 Q. Demetric Mercadel?
- 8 Α. Yes.
- Chanel Lagarde? 9 Q.
- 10 Α. Yes. I mean, not on a daily basis,
- 11 but yes, Chanel and I worked together.
- 12 Charlotte Cavell? Q.
- 13 Α. Yes.
- 14 Gary Huntley? Q.
- 15 Α. Yes.
- 16 According to Entergy's response to the Q.
- 17 City Council's report back in May of 2018,
- Entergy stated, "Mr. Rice attended weekly 18
- strategy meetings regarding the NOPS project and 19
- 20 was responsible for attending and speaking at
- public community meetings. He also led public 21
- outreach efforts in the community seeking 22
- 23 support for the project." Is that statement
- 24 accurate?
- 25 Α. Yes.

CHARLES RICE

1 It's a fair statement that you were Q.

- 2. the ultimate authority for the NOPS campaign
- from Entergy's standpoint? 3
- 4 I would say I made decisions when it
- 5 came to strategy, yes.
- 6 Was there anyone above you in the Ο.
- 7 chain of command that made decisions regarding
- the NOPS campaign? 8
- 9 Α. No.
- 10 Ο. What did that campaign involve
- somewhat in broad strokes? I know the 11
- application was filed in 2016. From that time 12
- frame forward, what type of community outreach 13
- and governmental activity did you-all undertake? 14
- 15 I don't know if you call it
- necessarily "a campaign." We filed an 16
- 17 application for approval of the building of a
- 18 power plant at our existing Michoud location.
- As a result of that, we made a filing with the 19
- 20 New Orleans City Council, where they dictated to
- us they wanted us to hold a certain number of 21
- 22 public meetings, which we did hold.
- 23 Outside of that, I thought it was
- 24 important for us to also engage in other
- meetings and engage people in the community as 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 to the importance of the project. That would

- 2. have included citizens. That would include
- 3 business groups.
- 4 That would include any organization
- 5 that we thought may have considered it important
- that the city have reliable, safe power, and 6
- 7 that the city -- or we do everything within our
- ability to make sure we had a safe, reliable 8
- electric grid to serve the citizens of New 9
- 10 Orleans.
- 11 As part of that campaign, was the --Ο.
- 12 did Entergy utilize both its communications
- 13 department as well as its public affairs
- department, if those are the correct titles? 14
- 15 I don't know exactly what you mean by
- 16 "campaign." As part of our strategy to have the
- plant approved, sure, we engaged our public 17
- 18 affairs team, engaged numerous people around the
- 19 community in order to obtain support.
- 2.0 And the names that I read off Ο.
- 21 beforehand, were all those individuals, at least
- from the records we see, were involved in that 22
- 23 effort, correct?
- 24 Α. They were part of the team, yes.
- As well as others we didn't mention, 25 Q.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 correct?
- 2. Α. Yes.
- In addition to Entergy employees, did 3 Ο.
- 4 Entergy contract with other vendors to help with
- that effort? 5
- 6 Sure. We engaged Bright Moments, who Α.
- 7 had worked with us on previous projects. I
- believe Bright Moments brought the Ehrhardt 8
- Group to the table. I think I worked with 9
- 10 Malcolm on other projects. We worked with DMM.
- I engaged Bob Tucker. I'm trying to recall. If 11
- I missed someone, please let me know. 12
- 13 Sure. Hawthorn Group? Ο.
- 14 Α. The Hawthorn Group was engaged.
- 15 Ο. Generating public support and the show
- of public support was a critical component of 16
- Entergy's efforts, correct? 17
- I wouldn't necessarily say generating 18 Α.
- 19 public support was critical. I would say
- 20 ensuring that the public was informed and that
- 21 they had accurate and correct information was
- 22 extremely important. I think you may have the
- 23 documents. I've done surveys to gauge public
- support for the project. 24
- 25 I did a 500 survey of the entire city

CHARLES RICE

1 of New Orleans, I believe 300 statistically

- 2. relevant. In that 500 survey, I think it showed
- 79 percent of the citizens in the city of New 3
- 4 Orleans supported the project. I did a 500
- survey of just New Orleans East, just New 5
- Orleans East. So, I would say we really 6
- 7 oversampled that.
- I believe that one showed 78 percent 8
- 9 of the citizens that lived in New Orleans East
- 10 supported the project and thought it was
- important for economic development purposes, 11
- 12 thought it was important that we have a safe,
- 13 reliable electric grid.
- 14 I think to me it was very important
- 15 that the public get accurate, correct
- information because our so-called "opponents" 16
- 17 were engaging in a tremendous amount of
- 18 misinformation, disinformation, whatever the
- 19 appropriate word was.
- 20 I wanted to make sure the public had
- the accurate information, which is why out of 21
- the scores of meetings we conducted, I probably 22
- 23 did the presentation in all of them, with the
- 24 exception of maybe two or three. The two or
- three that I didn't do, I think I may have been 25

CHARLES RICE

- 1 out of town for at least two of them.
- 2. Ο. Those were -- Based on that, those
- 3 were important meetings, correct?
- 4 Each meeting is important.
- 5 In the surveys that you referenced Ο.
- 6 earlier, just in that last part there, did you-
- 7 all publish those at any point?
- There was no need for us to 8 Α. No.
- That was for our own edification. 9 publish that.
- 10 Did I share that information with members of the
- City Council? Yeah, I did. I didn't give them 11
- copies. 12
- 13 O. You just did that verbally?
- Yeah. 14 Α.
- 15 Ο. You had the surveys and the sampling?
- Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE). 16 Α.
- 17 Those -- Entergy chose not to publish Q.
- 18 those in a public forum or on your website?
- 19 Α. I will tell you that throughout the
- 20 process, I did share that information when I did
- public meetings. I shared -- If I did a 21
- 22 presentation and -- sometimes I may have just
- 23 said we surveyed, or it may have been in
- 24 response to a question from a community member.
- I did share that information with members of the 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 public when I did presentations.
- 2. I didn't necessarily release it to the
- news media or the public because I didn't really 3
- 4 think that was necessary.
- 5 Actually showing the support beyond Ο.
- just mentioning the survey numbers to the 6
- 7 council members here and there verbally,
- actually showing support, would you agree that 8
- Entergy considered that to be a critical 9
- 10 component of the NOPS effort?
- 11 Α. If your question is was it important
- that the City Council people knew there were 12
- 13 people that were supportive of the plant, I
- would say my answer is it was important for City 14
- 15 Council members to know there was a large
- 16 segment of the population that was supportive of
- 17 the plant.
- 18 In a situation such as this, the
- 19 people that typically would support a situation
- 20 like this or the building of this plant,
- 21 business people, a lot of professional people,
- they don't have time to sit in the City Council 22
- 23 meeting all day in order to get their two
- 24 minutes or speak on their two minutes of
- 25 support.

CHARLES RICE

1 From our aspect, it was important that

- 2. we figure out who are other people that also
- support that that had time to come down to the 3
- 4 City Council chambers and show their support.
- You mentioned Bright Moments as a 5
- Entergy vendor. Did Entergy ever hire them to 6
- 7 draft scripts for unknown individuals?
- If your question is, did Bright 8 Α.
- Moments draft talking points, I believe they may 9
- 10 have; so did the Ehrhardt Group. We had
- individuals who were asking us for talking 11
- points. Often times, people may think they know 12
- why something is important, but they may not 13
- necessarily be able to articulate it in a 14
- 15 precise manner that people can understand.
- I believe there was a gentleman that 16
- owned a restaurant in New Orleans East who 17
- 18 actually came to the meeting -- one of the
- meetings to speak on our behalf. Even though he 19
- 20 supported the plant, his factual basis for
- 21 support was not totally accurate.
- 22 We wanted to make sure that people
- actually understood why the plant was important 23
- for the city, for the grid, for economic 24
- development here in the city of New Orleans. 25

1 Q. What was his factual basis and how was

- 2 it --
- 3 A. I can't --
- 4 BY MR. CAHN:
- 5 Let him finish his question.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 I'm sorry. I can't remember
- 8 everything he said. I just remember
- 9 it wasn't necessarily accurate. I
- just wanted to make sure -- I think we
- 11 -- I think I may have reached out to
- 12 Bright Moments and asked them could
- they contact him and kind of -- I may
- have asked somebody on my team to talk
- 15 to the gentleman to kind of tell him
- 16 what the important points were.
- 17 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 18 Q. From Entergy's perspective?
- 19 A. I would say from the community's
- 20 perspective as well as Entergy's perspective.
- 21 Q. Let me show you what has already been
- 22 marked as Exhibit 4. I do not believe you're
- 23 listed on that e-mail. Take a moment to review
- 24 those pages. I have a couple of questions.
- 25 A. (WITNESS COMPLIED). Sassafras

Restaurant, that's the guy I was talking about 1

- 2 before.
- 3 Read the entirety, and let me know Ο.
- 4 when you are done.
- 5 Α. (WITNESS COMPLIED). Okay.
- 6 So, I believe I'm correct in that you Ο.
- 7 were not specifically copied on this e-mail
- thread; is that right? 8
- 9 I don't see my name in any of the
- 10 "To," "From," or "cc's."
- 11 It appears to be an exchange between
- Ms. Pollard, who you referenced earlier, Ms. 12
- Toni Green-Brown, and vendors such as Bright 13
- Moments, Bill Rousselle, as well as the Ehrhardt 14
- Group; is that correct? 15
- 16 That's correct. Α.
- For the record, this is Bates labeled 17 Ο.
- 18 ENO-NOPS 6353 through and including 6360. If
- you could, turn to the last page of Exhibit 4. 19
- 20 (WITNESS COMPLIED). Α.
- 21 It's Bates labeled 6360. This is a Ο.
- 22 typed script for someone to be filled in later
- 23 as in support of the power station; is that
- 24 correct?
- It seems to be written from a 25 Α.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 homeowner in New Orleans.

- 2. Ο. In fact, it actually -- at the top, it
- states, "I am," then a blank line, and address, 3
- 4 correct?
- 5 Α. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- It further states, "I'm a homeowner 6 Ο.
- 7 and life-long resident of New Orleans." Did I
- read that correctly? 8
- 9 Α. Yes.
- 10 Ο. This is a script made for someone to
- 11 be provided with, and they can fill in their
- 12 name down the road; is that correct?
- 13 Α. Correct.
- 14 Did you direct that this activity take Q.
- 15 place?
- I don't have any recollection of 16 Α.
- 17 specifically asking anyone to do that. This is
- 18 a discussion Yolanda and I could have possibly
- 19 had, sure.
- 2.0 BY MR. CAHN:
- 21 For the record, this document
- 22 is dated 7/27/16. I just want to be
- 23 clear. I don't want to leave the
- insinuation that this was used at the 24
- October and February meetings. 25

was for the July 28, 2016 City Council

- 2 meeting.
- 3 BY MR. COMAN:
- 4 On the NOPS project, correct?
- 5 Same project, different date?
- 6 BY MR. CAHN:
- 7 Correct.
- 8 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 9 Q. Take a look at Exhibit 5, if you
- 10 could. As a follow-up on Exhibit 4, Bright
- 11 Moments and the Ehrhardt Group continued on as
- 12 vendors for Entergy throughout the NOPS process,
- 13 correct?
- 14 A. They were vendors throughout the
- 15 approval process.
- 16 Q. Switching to Exhibit 5, which is
- 17 ENO-NOPS 6659, then a two-page -- which should
- 18 have been a native Excel spreadsheet that does
- 19 not have Bates numbers on it, if you could, take
- 20 a moment to review that three-page document,
- 21 please.
- A. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 23 Q. Mr. Rice, correct me if I'm wrong.
- 24 This is a list of potential speakers that
- 25 Entergy employees had identified for a December

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 12th meeting on the NOPS project back in 2016;

- 2. is that right?
- 3 This is a list of potential speakers. Α.
- I believe it has -- If you look on the 4 Ο.
- 5 last page, it references you on the last few
- items, 43 and 44? 6
- Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE). 7 Α.
- 8 Q. You have to say yes or no.
- 9 Α. Yes.
- 10 Ο. How many of these potential speakers
- 11 ever spoke at a public hearing on Entergy's
- 12 behalf?
- 13 I couldn't answer that question with Α.
- any type of certainty. I couldn't tell you how 14
- 15 many showed up and how many didn't show up.
- couldn't tell you. There may be some people on 16
- 17 here that I recall showing up. I couldn't give
- 18 you an exact number on who showed up and who
- didn't. 19
- 20 If I told you that other Entergy Ο.
- 21 employees have identified so far six of these 44
- 22 potential speakers as having eventually spoken,
- 23 would that seem accurate to you or would you
- 24 know one way or the other?
- 25 I wouldn't have any reason to dispute Α.

- 1 it.
- 2 Q. Let me show you what I will mark as
- 3 Exhibit 63. It is ENO-NOPS 1007. Take a look
- 4 at that.
- 5 A. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 6 Q. Are you a party to this e-mail
- 7 communication, Mr. Rice?
- 8 A. My name appears on it.
- 9 Q. Is this an e-mail -- Starting at the
- 10 bottom in time order, it's dated February 1,
- 11 2017; is that right?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 O. You send this e-mail to Ms. Cavell.
- 14 The subject line reads "Hawthorn List." You
- 15 wrote, "Did we get a cost?" What were you
- 16 referencing there?
- 17 A. I have no specific recollection.
- 18 O. Ms. Cavell writes back, "Not yet. I
- 19 will ping them again and keep you posted." In
- 20 response, you wrote, "Need it ASAP. I want the
- 21 note out by Friday." What does that reference?
- 22 A. I have no recollection of this e-mail.
- 23 What I can tell you is we were sending out
- 24 customer communications. It could have
- 25 referenced that. That would be pure speculation

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 on my part.
- 2. Let me show you what is marked as
- Exhibit 6. If you could, take a look at that, 3
- 4 with a copy for your counsel.
- 5 (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 6 It is Bates labeled HAWTHORN 1003 Ο.
- through and including 1006. Let us know when 7
- you've had a chance to review it. 8
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 Can I write on this?
- 11 BY MR. CAHN:
- 12 No.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 Okay.
- 15 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- This e-mail thread, I don't believe 16
- 17 you are on it as well, correct?
- 18 Α. I do not see my name on this e-mail.
- 19 Q. You recognize the name Chanel Lagarde,
- 2.0 correct?
- 21 A. Yes.
- That's an individual that worked on 22 Q.
- 23 the NOPS effort, correct?
- Α. Assisted. 24
- Q. What's his role? 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Α. I don't know Chanel's exact title. Не

- 2. works with communications issues for the
- 3 utility.
- 4 It's our understanding that he had a
- relationship with individuals at the Hawthorn 5
- Group in Virginia; is that correct? 6
- 7 Α. I think he's probably in the best
- position to answer that question. I'm assuming 8
- 9 he had familiarity with them.
- 10 Did you know the Hawthorn Group prior
- to their engagement on the NOPS project? 11
- I wouldn't say I knew them. I had 12 Α.
- seen Mr. Ashford for a presentation before. I 13
- had never had a conversation with him. 14
- 15 Did you ask Mr. Lagarde to set up a
- meeting between yourself, Ms. Pollard, and 16
- people from the Hawthorn Group? 17
- 18 Α. No, I didn't.
- 19 If Mr. Lagarde had testified -- Strike Ο.
- 20 that. Mr. Lagarde had told us that was a
- 21 direction you gave him. Would he be incorrect
- in that assertion? 22
- 23 Α. That's not my recollection.
- 24 Ο. What is your recollection?
- My recollection is that Chanel reached 25 Α.

- out to me and basically said, "You should 1
- 2. consider using the Hawthorn Group because they
- worked with us" -- not us; worked with Entergy 3
- 4 Louisiana on a previous project, and they could
- 5 probably be of help in this situation.
- 6 At that stage in the beginning of the Ο.
- 7 engagement or potential engagement with the
- Hawthorn Group on this particular project, what 8
- role were they going to fulfill? 9
- 10 Α. Who is "they"?
- 11 O. The Hawthorn Group.
- 12 It was my understanding that the Α.
- 13 Hawthorn Group specialized in finding people who
- would be supportive of our efforts and that they 14
- 15 could identify people based upon whatever
- database they had who would be supportive of the 16
- 17 New Orleans power station and the things that we
- 18 were trying to achieve.
- 19 I think somewhere in here I thought I
- 20 read -- It says right here, "logical leaders
- 21 might be and how they are best recruited."
- 22 Q. Is that referencing the, quote, grass
- 23 tops community stakeholder-type profiles?
- 24 Α. I can read the e-mail to you.
- BY JUDGE JOHNSON: 25

1	${\tt Mr.}$	Rice,	Ι'm	sorry.	My ears
---	-------------	-------	-----	--------	---------

- 2 are old. You need to speak up.
- 3 BY THE WITNESS:
- I'm sorry, Judge. I will speak
- 5 up. I would have to assume, based
- 6 upon this e-mail, that they would
- 7 assist in identifying people, and they
- 8 wanted us to help them in their
- 9 identification of people who could --
- 10 who would be supportive.
- 11 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 12 Q. What type of people?
- 13 A. Citizens, people that may be involved
- in the industry that we don't know; people who
- 15 may think this is important for environmental
- 16 reasons; people who may think it's important for
- 17 economic development; people who may think it's
- 18 important for a safe, reliable electric grid;
- 19 people who may think it's important for economic
- 20 development reasons.
- 21 They -- I think it's even mentioned in
- 22 this e-mail that they had actually helped us.
- 23 We did an announcement on our solar project.
- 24 They actually helped us with the outreach for
- 25 that particular project, getting people to show

1 up. I guess it was the ribbon cutting.

- 2 O. Now --
- 3 A. It says -- Yolanda wrote her a note.
- 4 It says, "I look forward to connecting with you
- 5 again. Yes, we worked together on the New
- 6 Orleans solar communications, which actually has
- 7 become a key point of reference as we talk with
- 8 key stakeholders about the proposed power
- 9 station."
- 10 Q. In the top portion, the last e-mail
- 11 from Mr. Lagarde --
- 12 A. Which page?
- 0. First page. Mr. Lagarde stated --
- 14 referred to Ms. Pollard and said, "She's running
- 15 the campaign for Entergy. She would be the best
- 16 for the in-depth briefing you will need." You
- 17 agree with that statement?
- 18 A. I don't know if she's necessarily
- 19 running the campaign. She was serving in the
- 20 role, for lack of a better term, as a project
- 21 manager on this effort.
- Q. Mr. Lagarde is an Entergy employee?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- Q. He used the word "campaign," correct?
- 25 A. That's what he wrote here.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 At this time, August of 2017 -- you Q.
- 2. let me know if you agree or disagree with this
- -- the records seem to indicate that -- they 3
- don't seem -- to indicate, at this point, 4
- 5 Entergy had hired Bright Moments, correct?
- This is dated August 2017. I'm fairly 6 Α.
- certain we had already engaged Bright Moments
- before then. 8
- 9 As well as other vendors, either
- 10 directly or indirectly, such as the ones you
- mentioned earlier, Ehrhardt Group, DMM & 11
- Associates, and others, correct? 12
- 13 Α. Yes.
- 14 All with a local presence, correct, Ο.
- 15 those vendors?
- 16 Α. Correct.
- 17 Ο. Hawthorn Group is a company out of
- 18 Arlington, Virginia?
- 19 I'm not sure where they are located. Α.
- 20 I do know they are not located in New Orleans.
- 21 Do you know an individual by the name
- 22 of Suzanne Hammelman?
- 23 Α. I've never met Ms. Hammelman.
- 24 Have you ever spoken to her by Q.
- telephone? 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 I don't recall me having a specific Α.

- conversation with her. Is it possible I could 2.
- have walked in while she was having a 3
- 4 conversation with Yolanda? Sure. I didn't
- speak with her directly. 5
- At the bottom of this page, there's a 6 Ο.
- 7 discussion between Mr. Lagarde and Mr. Ashford.
- It seems to have been following maybe some phone 8
- 9 calls. It is what it is. The word "cutouts" is
- 10 used.
- 11 I'm assuming you are still on the
- 12 first page?
- 13 First page, middle of the first 0.
- 14 paragraph.
- 15 Α. Okay.
- 16 Do you see the word "cutouts"? 0.
- 17 Α. Yes.
- 18 0. Do you know what that's referencing?
- I have no idea. 19 Α.
- 20 Ms. Pollard is copied on that e-mail Ο.
- 21 where Mr. Lagarde sends this conversation he had
- with Mr. Ashford on to Ms. Pollard, correct? 22
- 23 Α. At the top of this page, Yolanda
- appears to be cc'd at 1:26 p.m. on Sunday, 24
- August 13, 2017. Chanel e-mailed with John 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Ashford at 10:32 a.m. on August 13th.

- 2. Ο. Who is Dan Faust?
- I know Mr. Faust has run for office 3 Α.
- 4 previously and would show up at City Council
- 5 meetings or utility meetings from time to time.
- Let me show you what's been marked as 6 Ο.
- Exhibit 8. For the record, this is ENO-NOPS 7
- 6314 through and including 6318. 8
- 9 Α. Okay.
- 10 Ο. This is an e-mail dated August 16,
- 11 2017 that you and others received from Ms.
- Cavell, correct? 12
- I'm on the "To" line of this e-mail, 13 Α.
- 14 yes.
- 15 Ο. What is this e-mail thread? Does this
- discuss Mr. Faust and his opposition to the 16
- power station? 17
- 18 Α. It states -- I can read it to you.
- 19 "Entergy Louisiana power plant informational
- 20 meeting regarding Michoud natural gas plant";
- again, incorrect information. It was a Entergy 21
- 22 New Orleans power plant information meeting.
- 23 Ο. My question is really this. Was
- Entergy monitoring opposition to the power 24
- 25 station?

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 We were looking at -- I get Entergy Α.

- 2. alerts myself. For us to find out what was
- being said about the company out in the 3
- 4 community, sure, we did that on a regular basis.
- Again, this is Mr. Faust. Some of the 5
- information espousing on this is inaccurate. 6
- 7 Q. Why did Entergy monitor opposition
- 8 groups?
- 9 I wouldn't say we necessarily Α.
- 10 monitored opposition groups. We monitored
- 11 comments about the company on a regular basis.
- 12 I don't think there's any Fortune 500 company
- 13 that I'm aware of that doesn't monitor what is
- being said about them in the news, social media, 14
- 15 whatever the case may be. For us to do this
- 16 would not be unusual.
- 17 I can tell you right now, I had
- 18 communications set up on my -- I don't know how
- 19 they do it, that if Entergy New Orleans showed
- 20 up in a news story, I would get a Google alert.
- 21 If my name showed up in a news story, I would
- 22 get a Google alert.
- 23 For us to want to know what was being
- 24 said about the company is not unusual. Again, I
- don't think there is any company out there that 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 functions in today's world where social media is

- 2. prevalent that does not want to know what is
- being said about the company for a lot of 3
- 4 different reasons.
- 5 This wasn't a Google alert, Ο.
- This was a specific e-mail containing 6 correct?
- 7 screen shots and other things from the aftermath
- of a public meeting on the NOPS power station; 8
- is that correct? 9
- 10 Α. I don't know if this is necessarily
- 11 aftermath, whatever that word may mean to you.
- This is basically -- We were made aware of 12
- someone commenting about the informational 13
- meeting on Twitter. And someone went and took a 14
- 15 look at it to see what was being said.
- Have you ever spoken to anyone else at 16
- 17 Entergy about Mr. Faust?
- I'm sure I had conversations about 18 Α.
- Mr. Faust. 19
- 20 With whom? Ο.
- 21 People within Entergy New Orleans. Α.
- could have been some linemen. It could have 22
- 23 been in the headquarters, the Magnolia Building.
- 24 Employees of the company pay attention to what's
- being said about the company. It probably would 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 be disingenuous on my part to say I never had a

- 2 conversation about Mr. Faust.
- 3 Q. Did you and others -- When I mean
- 4 "others," others involved in the effort, those
- 5 listed on that e-mail thread. Did you-all
- 6 discuss other individuals and opposition groups
- 7 to the power station?
- 8 A. Sure.
- 9 O. Like whom?
- 10 A. I'm sure there were discussions about
- 11 the Alliance for Affordable Energy. There were
- 12 discussions about 360.org. There were
- 13 discussions about VAYLA.
- 14 There were discussions about people
- 15 who -- organizations that may have shown up at a
- 16 community meeting. If we had never heard of the
- 17 organization before, I'm sure we -- somebody
- 18 went out and probably did a search to see who
- 19 was a part of the organization and what was
- 20 their purpose.
- 21 O. You mentioned the Alliance. Is that
- 22 the Alliance for Affordable Energy?
- 23 A. That's what they call themselves.
- Q. Do they have an executive director?
- 25 A. When I first got to this role -- my

- 1 former role, Casey DeMoss Roberts was the
- 2 executive director of the Alliance. I think
- 3 Logan was her deputy then. Casey stepped down,
- 4 and Logan became the executive director.
- 5 Q. Is that Logan Burke?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. How about Justice and Beyond, have you
- 8 ever heard of that organization?
- 9 A. Yeah.
- 10 O. Who is that? Is that Mr. Bryant?
- 11 A. I believe that is Pat Bryant.
- 12 BY MR. CAHN:
- 13 Can we take a break?
- 14 BY MR. COMAN:
- 15 Sure.
- 16 (BREAK TAKEN)
- 17 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 18 Q. Mr. Rice, let's -- going back on the
- 19 record here, did you meet Mr. Ashford in person
- 20 down here in New Orleans on August 24th of 2017?
- 21 If you could, look at Exhibit 9.
- 22 A. I don't recall the exact date. If
- 23 that's what the calendar says, I have no reason
- 24 to dispute it. I did meet with him once.
- 25 Q. This is an Outlook entry that

references yourself, Mr. Lagarde, Ms. Pollard, 1

- Mr. Ashford, correct? 2.
- 3 Α. Yes.
- 4 It's dated August 24, 2017 for a Ο.
- meeting to take place in Chanel's office on the 5
- 6th floor; is that correct? 6
- 7 Α. Yes.
- Is Chanel officed in your building, 8 Q.
- 9 the ENO building?
- 10 Α. No. He is at 639 Loyola.
- 11 Where did this meeting take place at 0.
- 12 Entergy New Orleans?
- 13 I think it was in Chanel's office, 6th Α.
- 14 floor.
- 15 Ο. Who else was present, if anyone else,
- besides those listed here on this sheet of 16
- 17 paper?
- 18 Α. To the best of my recollection, these
- were the only people that were present. 19
- 20 Approximately how long did this Ο.
- 21 meeting last?
- I don't think it lasted an hour. I 22 Α.
- 23 couldn't put an exact number on it. I don't
- know if it lasted an hour. 24
- What did you-all discuss in basic 25 Q.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 form?
- A. As best I recall, there was discussion
- 3 of what the Hawthorn Group's capabilities were;
- 4 a discussion regarding their capability to
- 5 identify people who would be supportive; as well
- 6 as them having a database of potential
- 7 supporters; discussion of how they could go
- 8 about helping building a grassroots
- 9 organization. That's probably the gist of it.
- 10 Q. The database and/or the Hawthorn list,
- 11 so to speak, that's been referenced in Entergy
- 12 records that lists, correct me if I'm wrong,
- when I reviewed that were a listing of elected,
- 14 appointed officials, business leaders, that type
- 15 of profile, correct?
- 16 A. I have no idea. I don't think I ever
- 17 saw a list provided by Hawthorn of people that
- 18 they knew.
- 19 O. What capabilities, though, did the
- 20 Hawthorn Group have that the preexisting vendors
- 21 such as Bright Moments, DMM, and Ehrhardt Group
- 22 have?
- 23 A. First of all, the people we retained
- 24 don't know everyone in the entire city. They
- 25 don't know necessarily people who operate in the

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

space we were operating in. They couldn't know 1

- 2 everybody in the city that could have
- potentially been supportive of this project. 3
- 4 For us to be able to identify others
- 5 that we didn't know that they didn't know, I
- think that was probably important. 6
- 7 Q. At the December of 2016 meeting, were
- you satisfied -- Strike that. In December of 8
- '16, there was a meeting in City Council 9
- 10 chambers, correct?
- 11 I apologize. It all kind of runs Α.
- together. If you told me there was a meeting in 12
- December, there was a meeting in December. If 13
- you are going to ask me specifics around that 14
- 15 meeting, I will probably need to know what the
- 16
- 17 If you could show me the agenda for
- 18 the meeting, that might help. I'm just being
- 19 perfectly frank with you. It all kind of runs
- 20 together. You can ask me a question. I don't
- 21 know if I would necessarily be able to give you
- 22 a specific answer.
- 23 I don't have too many specifics. My Ο.
- general question would be that prior to this 24
- time frame, prior to the engagement with the 25

MARCHES RICE OCCUDET 15, 2010

1 Hawthorn Group, we understand there were public

- 2 hearings. In fact, one of them was in December
- 3 of '16 where a large number of opposition groups
- 4 and/or individuals appeared at that meeting.
- 5 Does that jog your recollection?
- 6 A. Not really. I don't have any reason
- 7 to dispute what you are saying. I'm sure there
- 8 were supporters for us at that meeting too.
- 9 Q. Was there ever a meeting in December
- 10 of '16, without the specific data, a meeting
- 11 prior to this time frame, prior to the summer of
- 12 2017 where opposition groups and individuals
- 13 within those opposition groups or affiliated
- 14 with those opposition groups outnumbered Entergy
- 15 supporters?
- 16 A. I don't have any recollection of that.
- 17 I mean, is it possible? Sure. You got to
- 18 realize, I had probably participated in 40 or
- 19 almost 40 so-called "public meetings" at
- 20 locations all around the city. There were
- 21 people for and against at each one of those
- 22 meetings.
- 23 Q. Are you sure it's 40, not 22?
- 24 A. It depends on what you consider a
- 25 meeting. It may not have -- meetings that I

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 held with the Black Chamber. That 22 number may

- 2. be me going into like council districts.
- 3 were one-on-one meetings I had, small group
- 4 meetings I had.
- Following the August 24, 2017 meeting, 5 0.
- there was -- there were multiple proposals 6
- 7 generated by the Hawthorn Group and forwarded to
- Entergy for you-all's consideration, correct? 8
- 9 I don't know about multiple. I know
- 10 there was at least one.
- 11 If I told you it was more than one, 0.
- would you have any cause to disbelieve my 12
- 13 assertion?
- 14 Α. No.
- 15 Ο. This is -- Exhibit 11 is a memorandum
- from Ms. Hammelman and another individual at the 16
- 17 Hawthorn Group to Ms. Pollard. Did you ever see
- 18 this particular document?
- I don't recall seeing it. If someone 19
- 20 said I did, I have no reason to dispute it.
- 21 It reads in the beginning -- it
- 22 references John.
- 23 Where are you at? Α.
- 24 Q. First paragraph. It references John
- Ashford and Charles. We assume that would be 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 you, correct?
- 2 A. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 3 Q. It goes on to -- over the next few
- 4 pages, ENO-NOPS 8 through and including 11. It
- 5 lays out a laundry list of activity with pricing
- 6 and timing that the Hawthorn Group was proposing
- 7 to Entergy; is that correct?
- 8 A. Okay.
- 9 O. If we could start at the second
- 10 sentence of this memorandum, it reads, "The
- 11 following is a summarized and slightly revised
- 12 version of the proposal and plan that John
- outlined for you and Charles the other day."
- 14 Did I read that correctly?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. This is -- The first page at the
- 17 bottom, last paragraph, the Hawthorn Group
- 18 recommended starting the group as a Facebook
- 19 community. Do you see that in bold at the
- 20 bottom?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. Did Entergy approve and engage the
- 23 Hawthorn Group to start a Facebook community?
- 24 A. Not that I recall.
- 25 Q. If you could, turn, Mr. Rice, to Page

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 3, ENO-NOPS 10.
- 2. Α. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- Under the heading "September of 2017," 3 Ο.
- 4 there's various bullet points. The first one
- 5 says, "Identify and recruit one or more grass
- top champions." It continues on. Did Entergy 6
- 7 engage the Hawthorn Group to do that task?
- No, we did not. 8 Α.
- How about the second bullet point, 9 Ο.
- 10 settle on an organization name? Did you-all
- ever engage them to -- for them to create an 11
- 12 organization, or no?
- 13 I don't recall if we had a specific --Α.
- 14 I mean, we probably had a conversation about
- 15 that. Did we settle on a name?
- 16 You know, I've got to point out, if we
- 17 look at the first paragraph, it says, "Our goal
- 18 is to build an independent organization that can
- 19 support, starting immediately, upon your program
- 20 and budget authorization to provide high-level
- 21 grass tops and real, organic grassroots support
- 22 for the projects designed to make New Orleans
- 23 whole." That's what we were actually looking
- for. 24
- This was in anticipation of that 25 Q.

CHARLES RICE

1 October 16, 2017 meeting before the City

- Council; is that correct? 2.
- I don't recall it specifically, no. I 3 Α.
- mean, this laid out a plan all the way through 4
- February of 2018. I don't know if it was 5
- 6 necessarily just for October.
- 7 Q. I'm actually just looking at the first
- heading on Page 10. That activity, the bullet 8
- points we are discussing right now is under 9
- 10 "September of 2017," correct?
- 11 Α. If you look at this, they talk about
- 12 activities in September. It talks about
- activities from October to November. Then you 13
- have activities from December to February. What 14
- 15 is laid out in September may have just been --
- I'm speculating here. I don't want to 16
- 17 speculate. I can't read somebody's mind.
- 18 Ο. There's also a bullet point towards
- the bottom of Page 10 that says, "Recruit 3,000 19
- 20 to 5,000 members online." Did Entergy engage
- 21 the Hawthorn Group to accomplish that task?
- Not that I recall. 22 Α.
- 23 In all of those recommendations that Ο.
- 24 are contained in this memorandum and/or any
- other proposal, what did Entergy select the 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 Hawthorn Group to accomplish for Entergy?

- 2. Α. Turn out supporters.
- At some point in that same time, did 3 Ο.
- 4 you become concerned or alarmed with the
- Alliance? 5
- I don't know if "concerned or alarmed" 6 Α.
- 7 is a correct statement. I would say my concern
- really revolved around the voluminous news, and 8
- I say voluminous false and inaccurate 9
- 10 information that they were putting out to this
- 11 community specifically about the company and,
- 12 more importantly, about me.
- 13 They were saying I was attempting to
- harm the community in which I live, the 14
- 15 community in which I chose to raise my family,
- the community in which my parents and the 16
- 17 majority of my immediate family still lives.
- 18 For them to make a statement that I
- 19 and the company I work for, which was the only
- 20 Fortune 500 company in this community, which
- provides millions of dollars to this community, 21
- which has about a billion-dollar economic impact 22
- 23 on this community, that we were attempting to
- 24 harm this community, yeah, that concerned me.
- Did you believe or did you perceive 25 Q.

CHARLES RICE

they were attacking you personally in addition 1

- to the information you discussed? 2.
- I don't know if it was personal 3 Α.
- If you want to talk about the fact in 4 attacks.
- a community meeting Ms. Burke's husband got in 5
- my face, face to face in a threatening manner, 6
- 7 that happened.
- When was that? 8 Ο.
- That was at one of the Council 9 Α.
- 10 meetings. I can't recall which one. Were they
- putting out different false information about 11
- I'm sure they were. It was of concern to 12
- 13 me that they were putting out false information,
- that they were not necessarily putting out the 14
- 15 truth about me and my intentions.
- 16 I live in this community. I was a
- 17 very public person in this community. I was
- 18 known as being a person of integrity in this
- 19 community, and they questioned that. That was a
- 20 serious issue for me.
- 21 Let me explain something to you.
- 22 a junior. There's a third. My father worked
- 23 all his life to build a good name. For somebody
- 24 to say I was going to do something to ruin that,
- to jeopardize that, total BS. I go through life 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 -- There's a Charles L. Rice, III. That name

- 2. could be a help or hindrance to me.
- The only way it could be help is for 3
- 4 me to be a person of integrity, a person of my
- 5 word, and to do what's right by this community,
- by me, and everybody else. For somebody to 6
- 7 question that, I have an issue with that.
- That's not the only Rice out there. 8
- 9 Let me show you what's marked as
- 10 Exhibit 12, ENO-NOPS 756 through and including
- 11 759. Let me know when you have a moment to
- 12 review.
- 13 Α. Okay.
- 14 My question is regarding the e-mail Q.
- 15 maybe three-quarters of the way down on the
- 16 first page, an e-mail you wrote on August 31,
- 17 2017. It reads, "We have to get a strategy
- 18 around this. I'm going to work with Chanel to
- 19 get an outside consultant, the Hawthorn Group,
- 20 to begin some kind of campaign/strategy against
- the Alliance." Did I read that correctly? 21
- 22 Α. You did.
- 23 The Alliance is the Alliance for Ο.
- 24 Affordable Energy we already discussed; is that
- 25 correct?

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Α. That's correct. I need to point out

- 2. for you the subject of this e-mail was TCNA
- intervention Re UD-17-04 Investigation and 3
- 4 Remediation of Service Disruptions.
- 5 probably revolved around the docket that the
- Council opened up with regard to reliability of 6
- 7 our system.
- Is that somewhat related in some 8 Ο.
- 9 fashion to the power station application in any
- 10 way?
- 11 Α. No.
- 12 What was the Alliance's role in that Ο.
- particular item then? 13
- Again, I don't know if TCNA 14 Α.
- 15 intervened, which I think was maybe some
- community organization. I believe one of the --16
- or a neighborhood association -- That's probably 17
- 18 what the NA is.
- 19 If I recall correctly, one of the
- 20 Alliance board members actually was on the
- 21 Tulane Canal NA. That was probably of concern
- 22 and probably them putting out false information
- 23 to the members of that organization around the
- 24 reliability of our system.
- It caused you again to ask Mr. Lagarde 25 Q.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

or discuss engaging the Hawthorn Group in that 1

- effort, correct? 2.
- 3 I don't think Chanel and I ever had Α.
- 4 that discussion about engaging in a round of
- reliability. That may have been an emotional 5
- response at the time. 6
- 7 Q. Reliability is an issue that some of
- the opposition groups have raised in regards to 8
- the power station, is that correct, in general 9
- 10 terms?
- 11 Α. The information they were putting out
- was patently false. What they were putting out 12
- was that this power station would not assist or 13
- 14 help improve the reliability of our system;
- 15 meaning, that we had a more safe and reliable
- 16 system. What they were putting out was that we
- 17 could solve whatever issues we had through some
- 18 other means and methods.
- 19 Basically, what they were doing was
- 20 questioning the expertise and experience of
- 21 engineers who had worked on this system for a
- 22 number of years. There was a reason that that
- 23 power station was originally located in the
- Michoud location. It was located there because 24
- at that time and still today, it was needed to 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

make sure there was a safe, reliable electric 1

- 2. grid in the city of New Orleans.
- They were basically putting out 3
- 4 information that this power station wasn't
- necessary and that reliability could be solved 5
- or the reliability be improved by some other 6
- 7 method, which was not [sic] false, as they had
- never retained an engineer, never had anybody 8
- study the system. Basically, they were putting 9
- 10 out false information not based on science.
- Okay. The power station itself, when 11 Ο.
- it does come online, however that's going to 12
- 13 work, will that feed power or generate power,
- whatever the correct technical term is, to 14
- 15 parishes outside of Orleans Parish?
- 16 Let me begin my response to this
- 17 question by saying I'm not an engineer. I can't
- 18 tell you technically how the electrons move
- around the Entergy system. What I can tell you 19
- 20 is it is a system that -- Our system is
- 21 connected. Our system is connected because it
- operates for the benefit of all of our 22
- 23 customers.
- This power station will be used at 24
- times to ensure the entire reliability of that 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

system. We have power plants in Westwego that 1

- 2. help to provide power and grid stability for the
- city of New Orleans. If one of those units go 3
- 4 down, this unit could be run to make sure we
- 5 have a reliable system.
- This unit, if it is built, hopefully, 6
- 7 when it is built, will be used to provide
- reliability at some point for the entire metro 8
- area on occasion. It could be used for that. 9
- 10 Ο. On a day-to-day, non-emergency basis,
- 11 if I'm a resident of Jefferson Parish, will this
- 12 NOPS power station affect me one way or the
- 13 other?
- 14 Α. It depends on what's going on that day
- 15 on the entire system. It could be a day where
- it's 100 degrees and 9 Mile 4 could go down. 16
- 17 This unit could run to make sure there's
- 18 stability across the entire system, to make sure
- 19 the people in Jefferson Parish have a reliable
- 20 system, to ensure the people in New Orleans have
- 21 a reliable system.
- 22 I have a number of politicians in
- 23 Jefferson Parish that reached out to me and
- 24 asked me if they could assist in any way, shape,
- or form because they realized how important this 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

plant was for the greater reliability of the 1

- 2. entire system.
- Who is that? 3 Ο.
- There were a number of people. Conrad 4 Α.
- Appel comes to mind, for one. That's the one I 5
- recall off the top of my head. 6
- 7 Q. Do you know why Toni Green-Brown would
- have told us it would not affect persons in 8
- 9 Jefferson Parish?
- 10 Α. That may be based on her knowledge.
- 11 She's not in every single meeting. She's not an
- engineer. She didn't meet with the transmission 12
- guys like I did. She didn't meet with the 13
- PowerGen guys like I did. She may have been in 14
- 15 some of those meetings. That's her
- understanding of the system, which may not be to 16
- the level of mine. 17
- 18 Ο. She's someone that you respect and
- have confidence in, correct? 19
- 20 I have all the confidence and respect Δ
- 21 in the world for Toni Green.
- 22 0. Let me show you Exhibit 14. I will
- 23 show you 14 and 13 at the same time. I think
- they are related to one another. Take a moment 24
- to review those two exhibits, and let us know 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

when you are ready to answer a few questions on 1

- 2. those.
- (WITNESS COMPLIED). Okay. 3 Α.
- 4 Exhibit 13 is Bates labeled ENO-NOPS 5 Ο.
- 5 and 6, and ENO-NOPS 7 through and including
- ENO-NOPS 26. Did you receive -- If you look at 6
- 7 14, did you receive this Hawthorn follow-up
- proposal from Ms. Pollard on August 31, 2017? 8
- 9 I don't recall specifically getting
- 10 it, but I'm on the "To" line.
- 11 Then if you juxtapose Exhibit 13 with Ο.
- that, it's an Outlook entry which shows 12
- attendees as yourself, Ms. Pollard, Mr. Ashford, 13
- Mr. Lagarde, and a couple of others; is that 14
- 15 correct?
- 16 Legal counsel, Mr. Cragin, yes. Α.
- 17 Q. This is for same date, August 31,
- 18 2017, correct?
- 19 Α. Yes.
- 20 Is this what was discussed at that Ο.
- 21 Webex conference call?
- 22 Α. I don't have a specific recollection
- 23 of this meeting. I apologize. I have no reason
- to believe it wasn't -- I just don't have a 24
- specific recollection of it. 25

- Q. Was that just a auto call, or was that
- 2 like a video link as well?
- 3 A. I'm sure it was just audio.
- 4 Q. In that follow-up proposal that's part
- of Exhibit 14, what, if any, specific tasks did
- 6 Entergy select from and engage the Hawthorn
- 7 Group to perform?
- 8 A. We retained them to recruit grassroots
- 9 support.
- 10 Q. Why?
- 11 A. As I stated previously, we don't know
- 12 everybody in the community. We can't know
- 13 everybody in the community. If there were
- 14 people that they knew that we didn't know, if
- 15 they had people in their database that we
- 16 weren't aware of, we would like to know who
- 17 those people were. Like they say right here,
- 18 "We know the issues and the players."
- 19 O. Certainly, Entergy knew the issues,
- 20 correct, better than anyone; fair statement?
- 21 A. Of course we knew the issues.
- 22 Q. As you referenced earlier, you are
- 23 from here, and Entergy New Orleans is obviously
- 24 a New Orleans company, correct?
- 25 A. That is correct.

CHARLES RICE

1 Q. The Hawthorn Group is a Virginia

- 2. company, correct?
- 3 Like I said, I don't know exactly
- 4 their base. If you say they are based out of
- 5 Virginia, I have no reason to dispute that.
- 6 Mr. Ashford didn't have a New Orleans Ο.
- 7 office? He had to fly down from Virginia?
- I'm not sure if he came from Virginia. 8 Α.
- 9 He doesn't live here. I know that for sure.
- 10 Ο. I will show you what's marked as
- 11 Exhibit 15.
- 12 Α. Okay.
- For the record, this is ENO-NOPS 12. 13 Ο.
- 14 This starts at the e-mail thread originally from
- 15 Ms. Hammelman to Ms. Pollard on September 5th in
- which Ms. Pollard forwarded to you later that 16
- 17 day; is that correct?
- 18 Α. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 19 I'm sorry. Ο.
- 20 Α. Yes.
- 21 In the bottom, Ms. Hammelman writes, Ο.
- "I've revised the attached slightly to respond 22
- 23 to what we heard Charles say last week. So, our
- 24 immediate goal has changed a bit, and the
- urgency for crowd building and response is 25

- 1 reflected. The September budget has been
- 2 revised up a bit to reflect trying to do a LOT,"
- 3 all caps, "of stuff immediately." Did I read
- 4 that correctly?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. What was the urgency for the crowd
- 7 building?
- 8 A. I don't know what "crowd building"
- 9 means. I'm sure that's some term of art in the
- 10 space in which the Hawthorn Group operates.
- 11 What I probably was asking them to do was to
- 12 identify supporters, identify people who would
- 13 be supportive of what we were trying to do,
- identify people who would support the power
- 15 plant, and help us also identify people that we
- 16 could have a conversation with and hopefully get
- 17 them to turn out at the meeting.
- 18 Q. Did you ever have any conversations
- 19 with anybody that the Hawthorn Group recruited
- 20 to attend and/or speak on Entergy's behalf?
- 21 A. Not me specifically.
- Q. Do you know of any Entergy employee
- 23 that has had any such particular conversation?
- A. I wouldn't be able to answer that
- 25 question. I've never asked anybody if they ever

spoke directly with anyone identified by 1

- 2. Hawthorn.
- 3 Was this -- Strike that. This was in Ο.
- 4 anticipation of the October 16, 2017 meeting
- before the Council, correct? 5
- 6 Α. Like I told you before, they all kind
- 7 of ran together. Possibly.
- In the -- Strike that. When you saw 8 Ο.
- this e-mail from Ms. Pollard, did you respond to 9
- her either in an additional e-mail or a call on 10
- 11 the telephone and say, "I don't know what 'crowd
- 12 building' means. What is Ms. Hammelman talking
- 13 about"?
- 14 If you have a copy of one that I did
- 15 -- You've got to realize, I probably got on
- average 200 e-mails a day, maybe more, probably 16
- 17 more. I don't know I necessarily responded to
- 18 -- I can tell you I didn't respond to every
- 19 single e-mail I received.
- 20 Q. Let me show you what is marked as
- 21 Exhibit 16.
- 22 BY MR. CAHN:
- For the record, this is HAWTHORN 23
- 24 32.
- 25 BY MR. COMAN:

- 1 32 and 33.
- 2 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 3 O. Take a moment to review that back to
- 4 front, Mr. Rice, and let us know when you are
- 5 ready to answer a couple of questions.
- 6 A. (WITNESS COMPLIED). Okay.
- 7 Q. Originally, Ms. Hammelman writes an
- 8 e-mail to Ms. Pollard. The first line is,
- 9 "Thanks for calling. The answer is yes, we can
- 10 help turn people out for the Monday, October
- 11 16th hearing, "period. She then goes on in the
- 12 next paragraph to state, "I would caution you
- 13 that we generally do not recommend this type of
- 14 standalone effort." What effort was she
- 15 referencing?
- 16 A. Let's read it in context. "We have a
- 17 very good grassroots organizer on the ground in
- 18 New Orleans who can work on this for us, and we
- 19 are confident we can turn out NOLA citizens 18
- 20 and older who support the issue and will tell
- 21 people if asked.
- 22 "These citizens would compliment the
- 23 company's efforts to recruit grass tops or
- 24 leadership types, business and community
- 25 leaders. These people would turn out and care

CHARLES RICE

1 about jobs, economic development, reliable and

- affordable power, and would be highly focused on 2
- preventing the kinds of issues the city just 3
- 4 went through."
- 5 So, again, exactly what I told you
- before, to help identify people -- grassroots 6
- 7 people who are supportive of these issues.
- The next paragraph -- That was my 8 Q.
- question. What is the -- Why is Ms. Hammelman 9
- 10 recommending not doing this standalone effort or
- that they generally do not recommend, whatever 11
- 12 her words are?
- I can't read her mind. She states in 13 Α.
- 14 this e-mail, "Questions will be asked. 'Who are
- 15 these people and why did they turn out?'
- 16 future efforts, you most certainly should have
- an organization behind it with faces, a website" 17
- 18 -- we did have a website -- "where people can go
- 19 for information and to join and an active social
- 20 media conversation." We had that also.
- 21 Did the Hawthorn Group undertake that
- 22 particular activity, meaning, the website, or
- 23 was that something Entergy had already done?
- We already had a website. We had an 24 Α.
- individual who was also helping us with social 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 media.
- 2. Ο. Later on, Ms. Hammelman uses the term
- "pricing menu." She's got a list of bullet 3
- 4 points there. Do you see those?
- 5 Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- It's got various prices. One of those 6 Ο.
- 7 prices is optional, dash, supporters to sign in
- and speak, parens, 10, colon, \$6,500; is that 8
- 9 correct?
- 10 Α. Yeah. That's on here.
- 11 Right above it, she also has Q.
- supporters for the hearing, parens, 50 to 100, 12
- parens, \$8,500 to \$14,000; is that correct? 13
- Α. 14 Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 15 Ο. If you flip to the first page when
- Ms. Pollard responds, she writes, "I reviewed 16
- 17 this approach to Charles. We would like to move
- 18 forward with the plan. Other tactics will be
- 19 placed and running in the background, so you
- 20 will have the benefit of general local awareness
- 21 of October 16th hearing."
- 22 How did she review this with you? Did
- Ms. Pollard show you the e-mail? Did she send 23
- 24 it to you? Did she discuss it with you
- 25 verbally?

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 Look. Obviously, she didn't send me Α.

- the e-mail. If she had, I'm sure you would have 2.
- it. Second --3
- 4 Ο. Let me stop you.
- Hold it. Second, I'm an attorney, 5
- officer of the court. I know what my 6
- 7 obligations are. I would never, ever delete a
- e-mail and jeopardize my law license. If there 8
- was one out there, you would have it. 9
- 10 Ο. How is that?
- 11 Because they would have produced it. Α.
- We had no reason to hide anything. They would 12
- 13 have produced it. If there was an e-mail she
- sent me about this issue, if you have it, show 14
- 15 it to me.
- 16 I'm asking about this particular 0.
- 17 e-mail.
- 18 Α. You asked me how did she discuss it
- 19 with me, did she forward it to me. I'm letting
- 20 you know, obviously, she didn't because there's
- 21 not a copy of it.
- 22 Q. Do y'all keep all e-mails?
- 23 I don't know what the company's policy Α.
- 24 -- Whatever the company's policy is, that's what
- we complied with. 25

- 1 BY JUDGE JOHNSON:
- 2 Hold up. Go off the record.
- 3 BY MR. COMAN:
- 4 Okay.
- 5 (BREAK TAKEN)
- 6 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 7 Q. You have before you Exhibit 16; is
- 8 that correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. In this two-page e-mail, HAWTHORN 32
- 11 and 33, as you can tell from the Bates label as
- 12 well as the header in the upper left-hand
- 13 corner, it was produced by Hawthorn, not
- 14 produced by Entergy. Do you know why Entergy
- 15 would not have produced this?
- 16 A. It must have fell out of the document
- 17 retention policy.
- 18 Q. What is Entergy's document retention
- 19 policy?
- 20 A. I don't know the particulars of the
- 21 policy. I do know that at a certain point,
- 22 because of the size of the system, e-mails are
- 23 deleted. I don't know. Unless you actually
- 24 save it, it probably just rolled off the system.
- Q. Getting back to when Ms. Pollard

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 responds to Ms. Hammelman and references she

- 2. reviewed this approach with you, how did she do
- it, to your recollection? How did Ms. Pollard 3
- 4 review it with you?
- 5 Α. Typically, she would have come in my
- office and tell me about the discussion. 6
- 7 Q. What specific directives did you give
- her regarding this particular pricing menu? 8
- 9 I never saw the pricing menu.
- 10 have given what was a total number. I probably
- 11 would have said I was okay with that number.
- 12 The date of that e-mail is -- What's Ο.
- 13 the date on that?
- 14 Α. September 19, 2017.
- 15 Ο. Let me show you what was marked as
- Exhibit 19. Take a moment to review that 16
- 17 document, please.
- 18 Α. (WITNESS COMPLIED). Okay.
- This is -- The title is "October 3, 19 Ο.
- 20 2017 Text Message Communications." It's a text
- 21 message exchange between yourself and Ms.
- 22 Pollard, and Ms. Pollard has already identified
- this exhibit and confirmed its accuracy. 23
- 24 Do you have any cause to disbelieve
- that this document represents the communication 25

- 1 you had with Ms. Pollard on October 3rd of 2017?
- 2 A. No reason to doubt it.
- 3 Q. This text message thread, you refer to
- 4 this effort, this campaign as war; is that
- 5 correct?
- 6 A. I did. I'm a former Army officer. I
- 7 spent three years with the 101st Airborne. I
- 8 spent my most formative and professional years
- 9 in the military. Most former military officers,
- 10 it would not be unusual for them to speak in
- 11 that vernacular.
- 12 Q. You also stated, "We need all the foot
- 13 soldiers we can muster"; is that correct?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 O. Take a look at Exhibit 64.
- 16 A. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 17 Q. This is ENO-NOPS 1135 through and
- 18 including 1139.
- 19 A. Okay.
- Q. The title of this document appears as
- 21 "Contract Change Order Pursuant to Contract
- 22 No., and it's listed there. I believe in the
- 23 bottom of Page 1, you're listed as a point of
- 24 contact for Entergy, is that correct, or one of
- 25 the two; is that correct?

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 Where are you referring to? Α.

- 2. Ο. Bottom of the page.
- 3 Α. Yes.
- 4 And this is between Entergy and Bright Ο.
- Moments, LLC, correct? 5
- 6 Α. Yes.
- 7 Q. This is dated October 3rd of 2017; is
- that correct? 8
- 9 Α. Yes.
- 10 Ο. If you could, turn to ENO-NOPS 1137,
- 11 which is the third page of this particular
- 12 document, under Exhibit A.
- 13 Okay. Α.
- 14 Was one of the activities Entergy Ο.
- 15 engaged Bright Moments to perform is described
- 16 as monitoring of opposition groups? Is that an
- 17 accurate representation?
- 18 Α. Where are you at?
- 19 First paragraph, Exhibit A. Ο.
- 20 It's the first time I'm seeing this Α.
- 21 document. That's what it states.
- 22 Q. Moving forward to October 16, 2017,
- 23 that particular meeting, I will show you Exhibit
- 24 65, with a copy for Mr. Cahn. You recognize the
- scene depicted in that photograph? 25

CHARLES RICE

1 I have no -- I couldn't tell you which Α.

- 2. meeting it was. I can tell you who is sitting
- on the left. 3
- 4 Is Ms. Mercadel pictured there as Ο.
- 5 well?
- 6 As well as my wife. Α.
- 7 Q. In that particular photograph, you
- don't have an orange T-shirt on. Some of the 8
- 9 people depicted in that scene are wearing orange
- 10 T-shirts, correct?
- 11 Α. They are.
- You've seen those T-shirts before? 12 Ο.
- 13 A. First time I saw was at that meeting.
- 14 They had some writing on the front. I Ο.
- 15 think it was "Clean energy. Good jobs.
- Reliable power." Does that ring a bell? 16
- Α. 17 You have to show me a picture of the
- 18 shirt.
- 19 Did you attend that meeting on October Ο.
- 20 16, 2017 at the City Council chambers?
- If this is a picture of me at the 21 Α.
- 22 meeting, obviously, I was there.
- 23 Did you speak at that meeting? Ο.
- No, I don't think so. 24 Α.
- 25 Q. Why not?

CHARLES RICE

- 1 There's no need for me to speak. Α.
- What was -- Strike that. Was there --2. Ο.
- Strike that. Was the October 16, 2017 meeting 3
- 4 viewed from Entergy's perspective as important
- in winning approval for the NOPS power station? 5
- 6 I don't know where that meeting fell Α.
- 7 in the sequence of events. Each one of those
- 8 meetings was very important. It was important
- for the community to get accurate information. 9
- 10 It was important to make sure that things were
- 11 presented in a accurate and fair manner.
- 12 would tell you, whenever there's a meeting such
- 13 as that, they are all important.
- 14 Let me show you what's marked as Ο.
- 15 Exhibit 25. It's three color photographs with
- Take a moment to review those 16 no Bates numbers.
- 17 three photos.
- 18 Α. (WITNESS COMPLIED). Okay.
- 19 The first photograph there on Exhibit Ο.
- 20 25, the individuals wearing those orange
- 21 T-shirts, do you know any of those people?
- 22 Α. I'm not familiar with any of them that
- 23 I can recall. I do know at least one person in
- 24 here.
- 25 Q. Mr. Rogers?

CHARLES RICE

- 1 Α. Yeah.
- 2. Ο. He's pictured wearing a suit?
- Yeah. 3 Α.
- 4 He's a representative of Council on Ο.
- Aging, correct? 5
- 6 Α. Correct.
- 7 Q. Council on Aging is a community
- partner with Entergy; is that right? 8
- 9 We are supporters of Council on Aging. Α.
- 10 I guess they would be considered a community
- 11 partner.
- 12 Could you turn to Page 2. Ο.
- 13 (WITNESS COMPLIED). Α.
- Just another vantage point, for the 14 Ο.
- 15 people in the orange T-shirts, if you know any
- of those individuals. 16
- 17 I don't know any of them personally. Α.
- 18 I do know these were union guys.
- 19 Sitting in the front row with a sign Ο.
- 20 that says, "We need power in the city"; is that
- 21 right?
- 22 Α. Yeah.
- 23 The front row individuals, you do know
- -- Is that Mr. Hammond? 24
- 25 That's not Tiger. That could be Α.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 Tiger, but I don't think that's him.
- 2. Ο. Individuals in the front row, you
- recognize a few of those? 3
- 4 Α. First two rows.
- 5 Ο. The individuals in the back wearing
- the orange T-shirts, you don't recognize those, 6
- 7 correct?
- That's kind of fuzzy. There's nobody 8 Α.
- I recognize personally. 9
- 10 Ο. Could you turn to the last page.
- 11 (WITNESS COMPLIED). Α.
- 12 Those two Caucasian individuals with Ο.
- 13 beards, do you know either of those individuals?
- 14 Α. No. I know this lady wearing an
- 15 orange shirt, I do know her.
- Who is that? 16 Ο.
- That's Chris. I can't remember 17 Α.
- 18 Chris's last name.
- 19 Where do you know her for? Ο.
- 20 Chris actually works for Entergy. Α.
- If you could, turn to the front of 21 Ο.
- 22 that, the first page of 25.
- 23 Α. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 24 Q. Besides Chris -- I'm not sure if
- 25 she's --

CHARLES RICE

- 1 Α. She may have shown up later.
- 2. Ο. Were you pleased with the show of
- support on Entergy's behalf that night? 3
- 4 Α. I thought we had a pretty good
- 5 turnout.
- I will show you Exhibit 26. This is a 6 0.
- document with no Bates label, but it reads at 7
- the header "October 16, 2017 Text Message 8
- Communication." It has the names Pollard and 9
- 10 Rice as well as some timing.
- 11 After reviewing this particular
- document here, do you agree that this is an 12
- accurate depiction of text message communication 13
- you had with Ms. Pollard that night? 14
- 15 Α. I have no specific recollection of
- If it came off her phone and my phone, 16
- then sure. 17
- 18 Ο. If I told you she testified a couple
- 19 days ago that this was an accurate depiction,
- 20 would you have any cause to disbelieve her
- 21 assertion?
- 22 Α. Not at all.
- It reads at 5:30 that same night that 23 Ο.
- 24 Ms. Pollard states in a text message, quote,
- what do you think, end quote. What was your 25

CHARLES RICE

- 1 response?
- "Looks fabulous." 2. Α.
- Did you also have an additional 3 O.
- 4 response following that?
- 5 "Hawthorn came through. Let's figure
- out how we can further engage. They turned out 6
- 7 grassroots support. They could probably help us
- out even more. 8
- 9 That show of support was moving on Ο.
- 10 even past this particular meeting, was something
- 11 that continued to be important in your mind; is
- 12 that correct?
- 13 The show of support? Α.
- 14 Q. Yes.
- 15 I would say, as I told you before, we
- 16 had run a number of surveys. The surveys showed
- 17 that there was significant support in the
- 18 community. That was a very small minority that
- was against the plant. I thought it would be 19
- 20 important that the crowd actually reflect what
- 21 we knew was the actual support of -- for the
- 22 plant, for the project.
- 23 Ο. Prior to the October 16th meeting,
- 2017, how successful had Entergy been, along 24
- with Entergy vendors, in showing support from 25

- 1 individuals that were not linked to either a
- 2 community partnership or a trade association or
- 3 a union affiliation?
- 4 A. There were a number of individuals
- 5 that showed up that we recruited. As far as the
- 6 union goes, the union guys never did work for
- 7 Entergy New Orleans, at least while I was there.
- 8 They were there at their own accord. There were
- 9 a number of individuals that showed up on their
- 10 own that didn't have any real relationship with
- 11 the company other than they were interested in
- 12 seeing this project move forward. They thought
- 13 it was important.
- 14 O. Like who?
- 15 A. Noah Lewis comes to find.
- 16 BY JUDGE JOHNSON:
- 17 Who is that?
- 18 BY THE WITNESS:
- 19 Noah Lewis.
- 20 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- O. Who is Mr. Lewis?
- 22 A. A resident of New Orleans East.
- 23 Mr. Bickham comes to mind. He's also a resident
- 24 of New Orleans East. There were a number of
- 25 other individuals that showed up -- I can't

- 1 recall the names at this particular time -- that
- 2 based upon discussions with members of my team,
- 3 myself, they saw the necessity for the project
- 4 and they were supportive.
- 5 Q. Do you agree or disagree with the
- 6 following statement Ms. Hammelman made to us?
- 7 "It is difficult to obtain individuals to show
- 8 up to support a particular cause that they are
- 9 not linked to."
- 10 BY MR. CAHN:
- 11 Do you have that statement?
- 12 BY MR. COMAN:
- That's a statement I made.
- 14 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 15 Q. I'm just asking, do you agree or
- 16 disagree?
- 17 A. That they are not linked to? I don't
- 18 know. People show up for various reasons.
- 19 People -- I can't comment one way or the other.
- 20 I'm not in everybody's mind. People support
- 21 issues for a variety of reasons. They don't
- 22 necessarily have to have any type of particular
- 23 interest or partnership.
- Q. You mentioned Mr. Lewis and
- 25 Mr. Bickham. Those names were on the previous

CHARLES RICE

list that we were going over. How was -- How 1

- 2. were those individuals identified as potential
- 3 speakers?
- 4 They showed up at a community meeting
- we held in New Orleans East. 5
- 6 Did they show up the night of October Ο.
- 16, 2017?
- I have no idea. 8 Α.
- 9 Ο. Do you recall seeing them one way or
- 10 the other?
- 11 Α. I have -- I know Mr. Lewis showed up
- at meetings. I know Mr. Bickham showed up. I 12
- can't recall particularly if they were at the 13
- October meeting. 14
- 15 I'm going to show you Exhibit 28, a
- 16 short text message.
- 17 Α. Okay.
- 18 Ο. This document reads that this is a
- 19 text message communication between yourself and
- 20 Ms. Pollard, October 20th of 2017; is that
- 21 correct?
- 22 Α. That's what it purports to show.
- 23 If I told you Ms. Pollard identified 0.
- 24 this particular document or the statements made
- herein as being an accurate depiction of a 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 communication she had with you on that

- particular date, would you have any cause to 2.
- disbelieve that? 3
- 4 Α. No.
- What did you write to her on October 5 Q.
- 20, 2017? 6
- 7 Α. According to this, it says, "Let's
- discuss Hawthorn getting people there for 8
- 9 December 13th."
- 10 Ο. Her response was "Okay"?
- That's what it says. 11 Α.
- 12 What was December 13th? Ο.
- 13 I have no idea. I'm assuming it must Α.
- have been another council meeting. 14
- 15 Ο. I'm not sure 100 percent if there was
- a council meeting. We have seen records that 16
- 17 reference an evidentiary hearing in the Pan Am
- 18 Building in that same time frame. Does that
- ring a bell one way or another? 19
- 2.0 I don't know the dates. There was a Α.
- hearing. I would be shocked if I would have 21
- 22 asked her to get people there for that
- 23 evidentiary hearing.
- 24 Q. Why is that?
- Because that's exactly what it was. 25 Α.

- 1 It was like a trial. The only people that were
- 2 allowed to speak were whoever was on the witness
- 3 stand.
- Q. Meaning, the parties to the dispute;
- 5 is that correct?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 BY MR. COMAN:
- 8 Go off the record.
- 9 (WHEREUPON MR. TERRY ALARCON
- 10 ARRIVED TO THE DEPOSITION)
- 11 (BREAK TAKEN)
- 12 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 13 Q. We understand that evidentiary hearing
- 14 to be mainly technical. Is that a fair
- 15 statement?
- 16 A. I don't know what you mean by
- 17 "technical." Basically --
- 18 O. What was it?
- 19 A. It was a presentation of evidence.
- 20 O. Any particular focus of that evidence?
- 21 A. It was a presentation of scientific
- 22 information about the plant. It was a
- 23 presentation of -- There were engineers that
- 24 spoke. There were environmental experts that
- 25 spoke. There were geologists that testified.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 It was basically an evidentiary hearing where

- 2. evidence was placed into the record.
- 3 Did you testify at that particular Q.
- 4 hearing?
- 5 Α. T did.
- 6 At any point in that testimony, did Ο.
- 7 you ever reference Entergy's belief in the
- amount of support you-all had for the power 8
- 9 station, or was it not that type of testimony?
- 10 Α. I have no recollection that that
- question was asked. I doubt -- I don't know. 11
- 12 It's possible it was asked. I would have to see
- 13 the record.
- 14 Let me show you Exhibit 29, with a Ο.
- 15 copy for your counsel. Take a moment to read
- that two-page e-mail, ENO-NOPS 6311 and 6312. 16
- 17 (WITNESS COMPLIED). Α.
- 18 Ο. This e-mail thread, I believe this
- 19 starts with an e-mail that -- I'm sorry.
- 20 Ms. Cavell referenced a quotation that was
- attributed to you, is that correct, by someone 21
- at The Lens NOLA; is that right? 22
- 23 Α. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 24 Q. You have to say yes or no.
- 25 Α. Yes.

CHARLES RICE

- 1 That particular quotation that was Q.
- 2. referenced in the article and I think repeated
- here by Ms. Cavell is, quote, I think we've got 3
- them outnumbered, end quote, "chuckled Charles 4
- Rice, Junior." Did I read that correctly? 5
- 6 Α. Yes, you did.
- Q. Did you say that at that meeting?
- I have no recollection of saying that. 8 Α.
- One way or the other? 9 Ο.
- 10 Α. I just don't recall saying that. I
- know I definitely didn't talk to whoever that 11
- 12 reporter was.
- 13 Mr. Stein? Ο.
- 14 Α. Yes. I would not have given an
- 15 interview to anybody.
- 16 Ο. Okay.
- 17 Α. If you notice I say, "I don't even
- 18 remember saying that."
- 19 Ο. Who is "them"? Is that opposition
- 20 groups, or what?
- It says, "I don't ever [sic] remember 21
- 22 saying that it was a hit piece and he was
- 23 clearly on the other team." I don't know where
- you are referring to "them." 24
- 25 In the quotation. Q.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 I don't recall saying it. I can't Α.

- really say. If I did say it, it must have been 2.
- referring to the opposition. 3
- 4 Does that quotation -- is that
- 5 consistent with your belief from that night?
- 6 Like I said, all these meetings ran Α.
- together, so I'm not sure which one was the 7
- October meeting versus the February meeting. I 8
- can say we had representation there. 9
- 10 Ο. The October meeting is the meeting you
- 11 can see on video represented in the orange
- 12 T-shirt, photograph Exhibit 25 in council
- 13 chambers. At that meeting, is that -- Whether
- 14 you remember saying the quote, is that quote
- 15 consistent with your belief from that particular
- 16 night?
- 17 They had a significant amount of Α.
- 18 representation there also. So, I would say
- throughout this process, I think at the meeting, 19
- 20 it was somewhat evenly split.
- 21 The text message communication you had Ο.
- 22 from that night, you were pleased with the
- 23 Hawthorn Group's efforts, correct?
- 24 Α. I was pleased that they turned out
- 25 grassroots support, yes.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 Take a look at Exhibit 30, which is Q.
- 2. ENO-NOPS -- Scratch that. For the record, it's
- HAWTHORN 58 and 59. 3
- 4 BY MR. CAHN:
- 5 It's two separate e-mails. One
- is HAWTHORN 58. Appended to that is 6
- ENO 6573.
- BY THE WITNESS: 8
- 9 I have the same thing.
- 10 BY MR. COMAN:
- 11 That's the next exhibit. Tear
- 12 that apart.
- EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN: 13
- 14 Mr. Rice, you are not copied on this Ο.
- e-mail. 15 It's an e-mail from Ms. Pollard to
- Ms. Hammelman six days following the October 16
- 16th meeting, specifically, on October 23rd. It 17
- 18 says here, "The second tweet by same individual
- we discussed, with comments." 19
- 20 Although you can't see it on the next page, it
- seems to be -- it is -- depicts part of a screen 21
- 22 shot from Mr. Faust's social media activity.
- 23 that particular activity -- I'm sorry. Did
- Ms. Pollard at all discuss Mr. Faust with you 24
- following the October 16th meeting in reference 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- to this time frame, if you recall? 1
- Did we have a discussion about 2.
- Mr. Faust? I don't recall if we discussed him 3
- 4 particularly. I'm sure if -- I don't know
- what's in this tweet. If it was a tweet she 5
- considered significant, I'm sure she came into 6
- 7 my office and shared whatever was in it.
- This may be it. Exhibit 31, you 8 Q.
- should have that other copy. For the record, 9
- 10 this is ENO-NOPS 6573 through and including
- 11 6575. Take a moment to read that.
- 12 Α. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 13 If you can see at the beginning of the Ο.
- first -- at the bottom of the first page, which 14
- 15 this is an internal communication between
- Ms. Cavell, Ms. Pollard, and Ms. Brown, at the 16
- 17 bottom the words are, "So I got the verbal
- 18 confirmation I needed. There were paid
- 19 protestors for Entergy at City Council. \$60
- 20 paid; two hours later at Dave & Buster's," and
- 21 some type of hyperlink.
- BY MR. CAHN: 22
- 23 The e-mail you are referring to
- 24 is from Sprinklr to Charlotte.
- pickup from the social media. 25 It's

1 not an e-mail from Charlotte to

- Yolanda containing it.
- 3 BY MR. COMAN:
- I think -- Not that it makes a
- 5 difference, the Sprinklr sends it to
- 6 Ms. Cavell. Then Ms. Cavell forwards
- 7 it.
- 8 BY MR. CAHN:
- 9 Correct.
- 10 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 11 Q. This is on October 23, 2017. Did
- 12 Ms. Pollard ever advise you that individuals
- 13 were claiming they had been paid as described in
- 14 that statement I just read?
- 15 A. We had that discussion. I didn't
- 16 really think anything of it. To me, this was
- 17 more false information put out by the opponents.
- 18 They had done it throughout the process. I
- 19 really didn't have any cause for concern because
- 20 it was just part of their normal mode of
- 21 operation, put out false information.
- 22 Q. As you sit here now, do you believe or
- 23 disbelieve that statement?
- 24 A. That they were paid?
- 25 Q. Yes.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 Based upon what has been subsequently Α.

- 2. revealed, they were people that were paid.
- How did Ms. Pollard communicate this 3 Q.
- 4 to you?
- I don't recall the specific 5 Α.
- conversation. I'm sure she came to my office. 6
- 7 And I don't know if it was in response to this
- particular one and said there were allegations 8
- that people were paid to show up. 9
- 10 Following this event, so to speak, on
- 11 October 23, 2017, did Entergy cancel the
- 12 Hawthorn Group's contract?
- 13 I can't tell you when the contract was Α.
- specifically cancelled. It goes back to, like I 14
- 15 just said earlier, as far as I was concerned
- this was just another attempt to put out 16
- 17 misinformation about the company and the
- 18 project.
- 19 Did Entergy stop payment on any
- 20 invoices from the Hawthorn Group following this
- 21 particular accusation?
- 22 Α. At some point, we did put a stop-
- 23 payment out.
- 24 Q. That was in May of 2018, correct?
- You'd have to show me the document for 25 Α.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 me to give you the exact date.
- 2. Ο. The document we just looked at was
- from October 23, 2017. Following Ms. Pollard's 3
- 4 relay of this particular accusation and
- information, did you, as Entergy CEO and/or 5
- President, take -- make any efforts to stop 6
- 7 payment on Hawthorn's contract at that point?
- Not as of October 23, 2017 because I 8 Α.
- had absolutely no reason to believe that those 9
- 10 assertions were true.
- 11 In anticipation of the February 21, Ο.
- 2018 public hearing before the utility committee 12
- that took place in the Pan Am Building, that 13
- auditorium, did Entergy undertake the same 14
- 15 efforts to produce a show of support for the
- 16 NOPS power station?
- 17 Α. We were engaging the people throughout
- 18 the process. So, if you are asking me did we
- 19 continue to seek out supporters, did we continue
- 20 to meet with people who were potentially
- 21 supportive, did we continue to educate people on
- 22 the process, did we continue to educate people
- 23 about the project, yes, we did continue to do
- that. 24
- Did you continue -- Did Entergy 25 Ο.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 continue its efforts to put bodies in those

- 2. seats, so to speak?
- 3 I will tell you that we continued our
- 4 efforts to turn out supporters at the meeting.
- 5 I will show you what has already been Ο.
- marked as Exhibit 34A. 6
- 7 Α. Okay.
- This document does not have a Bates 8 Q.
- 9 label. It has a header that reads "January 11,
- 10 2018 Text Message Communication." It contains
- 11 your name as well as Ms. Pollard; is that
- 12 correct?
- 13 Yes, it does. Α.
- 14 After reviewing this document, do you 0.
- 15 have any cause to disbelieve this is a text
- 16 message communication that you had with
- 17 Ms. Pollard on this particular date?
- 18 Α. None at all.
- 19 If you could, read what you wrote at Ο.
- 20 11:25.
- 21 Α. "Think we can get Hawthorn to get us
- 22 20 people."
- Ms. Pollard responds, "Will check." 23 Ο.
- 24 Then what did you write?
- 25 "Make it 30." Α.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 Ms. Pollard said, "Got it," and later Q.
- 2. sent you another text message that says, "Talked
- to Hawthorn. They will send us cost estimates." 3
- 4 Did I read that correctly?
- 5 Α. You did. Can I add something?
- 6 Ο. Sure.
- 7 Α. One thing that hasn't been said was, I
- will say it again, we engaged Hawthorn to 8
- identify people in the community who would be 9
- 10 supportive. Nobody sat up there and counted how
- 11 many people showed up at the meeting.
- If Hawthorn would have got one person 12
- to show up, they would have been paid the exact 13
- same thing. This was about identifying people 14
- 15 who were supportive, identifying people who
- thought this was important, and hopefully having 16
- 17 them show up at the meeting.
- Was there a price menu based on ranges 18 Ο.
- of people? 19
- 20 I never saw a price menu. Α.
- 21 We saw one earlier that Ms. Pollard Ο.
- 22 discussed with Ms. Hammelman, correct?
- 23 Α. Do you remember the exhibit number?
- I can find it. It should be 16. 24 Q.
- On this e-mail dated September 19, 25 Α.

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 2017, there was a price menu.
- 2 Q. That's not a word I came up with. In
- 3 the paragraph written there starting with
- 4 "Below," you see that?
- 5 A. Yeah.
- 6 Q. It says, "Below is," a what?
- 7 A. Pricing menu.
- 8 Q. In that particular menu, it does
- 9 contain parenthetically for supporters, 50 to
- 10 100; for speakers, 10, correct?
- 11 A. It says, "Below is a pricing menu,
- 12 including turning supporters out."
- 0. It contains --
- 14 A. "Getting a few of them to sign in and
- 15 to speak and have them deliver a message."
- 16 Q. The next part, they have the
- 17 particular numbers that we already discussed,
- 18 correct?
- 19 A. It also says, "It is important to note
- 20 that this price is based on having three and a
- 21 half weeks to complete the recruiting process."
- 22 Q. Let me show you again. In
- 23 anticipation of that 2/21/18 hearing, this is an
- 24 e-mail, page HAWTHORN 5 and 6. Let me know when
- 25 you've had a chance to review it, please.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 Α. Okay.
- 2. Ο. If we could start on the second page
- there, the first e-mail from Ms. Hammelman to 3
- 4 Ms. Pollard on January 12, 2018. She says,
- 5 "Yolanda, hope your dad is getting better.
- Thinking of you and your family. Following are 6
- 7 some options for you for February 21." It's got
- under "Hawthorn fee," a description for 8
- supporters, 30 supporters at the hearings with 9
- 10 handmade signs, five speakers, ten speakers,
- another pricing menu, correct? 11
- BY MR. CAHN: 12
- It says, "recruiting expenses." 13
- EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN: 14
- 15 Is this another -- This pricing menu
- is similar to the one you looked at on the 16
- Exhibit 16; is that correct? 17
- 18 Α. I don't know if it's necessarily
- 19 similar.
- 20 It's got bullet points with prices, 0.
- 21 correct?
- 22 Α. It's got bullet points, yeah, with
- 23 prices.
- 24 Ο. And for 15 supporters, it's \$6,125;
- and for 30, it's \$7,725, correct? 25

CHARLES RICE

- 1 Α. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 2. Then there's a price for five Ο.
- speakers, 4,600; and ten is 6,700, correct? 3
- 4 Α. Yeah. That seemed to be in proportion
- to it, because the price between 15 and 30 5
- people is not double. 6
- 7 Q. It's more, though, correct?
- 8 Α. Slightly.
- 9 It's more for the -- same thing, Ο.
- 10 difference between five speakers and ten
- 11 speakers, right?
- 12 Slight difference. Α.
- 13 If you flip to the first page in Ο.
- 14 Ms. Pollard's response e-mail, Friday, January
- 15 19, 2018, she writes in that paragraph, "I
- discussed with Charles. Let's go with 30 16
- 17 supporters and ten speakers for the February 21
- 18 utility committee meeting."
- Where is that? 19 Α.
- 20 Third line. Did I read that Ο.
- 21 correctly?
- 22 Α. Yeah.
- 23 How did Ms. Pollard discuss this Ο.
- 24 particular pricing menu and what Entergy wanted?
- 25 I don't have a recollection of us Α.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 having a specific conversation about this.
- 2. I will show you what is marked as
- Exhibit 66. For the record, it's ENO-NOPS 6435 3
- 4 through and including 6443. It's a multipage
- 5 document. Let us know when you've had a chance
- to review it. 6
- 7 Α. Okay.
- In Exhibit 66, this is an e-mail 8 Ο.
- thread with attachments that you received from 9
- 10 Ms. Pollard on January 29, 2018; is that
- 11 correct?
- 12 Α. It appears that way, yes.
- The subject line is "Review today: 13 Ο.
- NOPS February 21 meeting remarks and letters to 14
- 15 the editor, " correct?
- 16 Α. Correct.
- Correct me if I'm wrong. This seems 17 Ο.
- 18 to reference the event of you maybe writing an
- op-ed piece in the newspaper; is that right? 19
- 20 I probably had written one. Α.
- 21 fairly certain I wrote one.
- 22 Q. Then Ms. Pollard is circulating to you
- 23 and others, at least that I counted, three
- 24 letters that were kind of ghostwritten; meaning,
- a letter that is written from the firsthand 25

1 standpoint of some unknown individual, correct?

- 2. Α. It's actually four.
- There's a couple of things that may be 3 Ο.
- 4 for Mr. LaGrange or Ms. Milling, correct?
- It appears to be remarks for them. 5 Α.
- My question is really about these 6 Ο.
- 7 letters. Who in the last page, 6443, when it
- says, "Sincerely, Business Owner," and it has a 8
- 9 signatory, and this person is saying, "I own a
- 10 small business," and it provides a living for
- 11 his family, who is this person?
- 12 A business owner we have been -- that Α.
- 13 was supportive of the plant. I don't think it's
- for anyone in particular. We had met with the 14
- 15 Chamber. We had met with the Black Chamber. We
- had met with the New Orleans East Business 16
- 17 Association. We had met with the Hotel/Motel
- 18 Association.
- 19 Through that process, if there were
- 20 people identified and were willing to submit a
- 21 letter, that was the form we were giving them to
- 22 use, not necessarily we were expecting them to
- 23 use it in that exact form, but that was a model
- for them to use. 24
- My question is this: It appears from 25 Q.

- the timing and the way the documents lay out is 1
- 2. that the letters are written first, and then
- 3 later, Bright Moments or somebody else tries to
- find a person to fill the role; is that 4
- 5 accurate?
- 6 I can't agree with that statement. Α.
- 7 I stated before, throughout that two-year
- process, I met with a number of business 8
- 9 organizations. There were people that came up
- 10 to me throughout those meetings that said they
- were supportive. I can't say this was done 11
- after a certain point in time. There were 12
- people that we met with during the first year of 13
- 14 the process.
- 15 We met with the Chamber. I'm sure it
- was more than once. We met with the Black 16
- Chamber more than once. We met with New Orleans 17
- 18 East Business Association, their leadership as
- probably well as their membership. I think I 19
- 20 met with the hotel/motel guys more than once. Т
- probably made a trip over to the CVD too. I 21
- 22 can't say this was done, and then we went out
- and tried to identify people. 23
- 24 0. What did Ms. Pollard tell you in the
- last sentence of her e-mail? 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 Which one? Α.
- 2. Ο. The e-mail, the last sentence, read
- that out loud. 3
- 4 "TEG/Bright Moments are working to
- 5 secure names or contacts that could sign or
- submit these letters early this week." That was 6
- 7 probably based upon people we had probably
- already talked to and identified. 8
- 9 I will say it again. I participated
- 10 in probably over 40 meetings, maybe more than
- that, individual meetings, small group meetings, 11
- business meetings. I think I did a presentation 12
- to the Business Council. Again, through those 13
- 14 presentations, we probably were trying to
- 15 identify people who were willing to sign
- 16 something to that effect.
- 17 Q. To your point in this exact e-mail,
- 18 there are two individuals that are identified,
- 19 Mr. LaGrange and Ms. Milling, correct?
- 20 I met with both of them one on one. Α.
- 21 Besides those two names, there's no
- names attached to the other letters to the 22
- 23 editor, correct?
- That doesn't mean we didn't identify 24 Α.
- people who could potentially do it. 25

CHARLES RICE

1 Do you have any information that we Q.

- can rely on or look to to let us know whether 2.
- these were ever used; and if so, which persons 3
- 4 were assigned to sign them?
- I don't have that. I would have 5
- probably not been involved in that level of 6
- 7 detail to who they would probably have gone out
- and talked to. I may have given them a name of 8
- 9 someone I may have spoken with. For example, I
- 10 met with Gary and Anne one on one.
- 11 As far as the business owner and the Ο.
- boil water advisory, can you tell us whether or 12
- 13 not there was some person assigned that task, or
- who knows? 14
- 15 I'm sure -- I can't tell you that.
- 16 don't know.
- BY MR. COMAN: 17
- 18 Go off the record.
- 19 (BREAK TAKEN)
- 20 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- Let me show you, kind of moving on the 21
- 22 timeline here, what is marked as Exhibit 37,
- with a copy for your counsel. Take a moment to 23
- review that document, and let us know when 24
- you've had a chance to do so. 25

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 (WITNESS COMPLIED). Α.
- 2. Ο. And for the record, this is HAWTHORN
- 3 16.
- 4 Α. Okay.
- 5 All right. And at least in the middle Q.
- 6 part of one of the first two e-mails, you were a
- 7 party to that conversation, is that correct,
- meaning, you received the e-mail? 8
- 9 Α. Yes.
- And it first starts with an e-mail at 10 Ο.
- 11 the bottom, February 20, 2018, 6:04 p.m. from
- 12 Mr. Huntley. Who is Mr. Huntley?
- 13 Gary was the Vice President of Α.
- Regulatory and Governmental Affairs. 14
- 15 And he wrote, "I received confirmation
- 16 that the room will be open at 8:30 a.m. Let's
- 17 get as many of our folks there ahead of the bus
- from New Orleans East." Did I read that 18
- 19 correctly?
- 2.0 Α. Yes.
- 21 And what is this e-mail in reference Ο.
- 22 to? Is this the 2/21 meeting?
- 23 Α. Must have been. It's dated February
- 20, 2018. 24
- Q. You received this e-mail, I think, 25

1 forwarded from Ms. Mercadel; is that correct?

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Did Entergy intentionally -- I'm
- 4 sorry. Strike that. Did Entergy intend to
- 5 populate the 2/21 meeting at that Pan Am
- 6 auditorium with as many supporters as possible?
- 7 A. We would have wanted to get as many
- 8 people there as possible. I mean, basically --
- 9 I mean, a lot of the people that support us are
- 10 professional people. We wanted them to get
- 11 there early so they could get their cards in
- 12 early so they could speak and get back to work.
- I mean, there was no nefarious intent.
- 14 It was just making sure that people who wanted
- 15 to speak got an opportunity to get in early and
- 16 speak and then go back to work.
- 17 Q. And who is Mr. Huntley referencing the
- 18 bus from the East?
- 19 A. Pure speculation on my part. But I
- 20 mean, I do know that they did have buses come
- 21 from -- I think it was Mary of Vietnam Church --
- 22 Queen of Vietnam Church.
- 23 Q. Opponents of the power station?
- A. I know it was people who were members
- 25 of the church that were bused there.

1 Q. And from your impression, were they in

- 2 favor of, or were they against the power
- 3 station?
- 4 A. To be perfectly frank, it was a bunch
- of senior citizens. And I really don't remember
- 6 any of them speaking one way or the other, but
- 7 they were there. But I would anticipate that
- 8 they were probably against the plant.
- 9 Q. Did you attend that meeting, the 2/21
- 10 meeting at the Pan Am Building?
- 11 A. Oh, I'm sure I was there. Yeah.
- 12 O. In fact, this would have been the
- 13 meeting -- correct me if I'm wrong -- that at
- 14 the -- towards the end, you would have briefly
- 15 made comments, or the advisors would have made
- 16 comments?
- 17 A. I didn't make any comments that I
- 18 recall.
- 19 O. All right. Would anyone have made
- 20 comments on Entergy's behalf? The Entergy
- 21 employees, I meant.
- A. I mean, if it's the meeting I'm
- 23 thinking about, I don't recall any Entergy
- 24 employees speaking. I think this was a meeting
- 25 where the council took comments from the

- 1 community. There may have been some retirees
- 2 that spoke. But I don't recall, at least
- 3 anybody that worked for me, specifically
- 4 talking.
- 5 Q. And at the end of the meeting or
- 6 towards the end of the meeting was when one of
- 7 the council advisors -- I believe he was a
- 8 council advisor -- gave a fairly long
- 9 presentation, slash, Q and A with the utility
- 10 committee over the differences in the two
- 11 proposals?
- 12 A. I don't have a specific recollection
- 13 of that. The part I remember about that meeting
- 14 at the end was Jason Williams asking a question
- of everyone in the crowd, "Is there anyone here
- 16 who wants to speak or wanted to speak that did
- 17 not get an opportunity to speak?" And that's
- 18 what I remember about the end of that meeting.
- 19 And I don't recall anyone.
- Well, there might have been one or two
- 21 people. I think we had some retirees that
- 22 showed up that didn't get a chance to speak.
- 23 And I think as a result of that, they probably
- 24 got an opportunity to speak.
- Q. Were you able to come and go freely in

CHARLES RICE

1 and out of the room as it progressed -- as the

- 2. meeting progressed?
- 3 Probably toward -- after a couple of
- 4 hours. I think in the beginning of the meeting,
- the -- I think the security guard from the Pan 5
- Am Building restricted access because he thought 6
- the room was too packed. But then as people 7
- 8 left, they allowed people to come in.
- 9 Did you at any point observe a line of Ο.
- 10 people attempting to gain entry into the room?
- 11 I observed a bunch of people Α. No.
- sitting outside chanting. And I do recall at 12
- 13 one point I may have left to go to the bathroom.
- And the guard was asking people if they wanted 14
- 15 to go in, and those people chose not to go in.
- 16 Who were those people? 0.
- 17 They were a bunch of people out there Α.
- 18 with Pat Bryant.
- 19 What were they chanting? Ο.
- 20 I don't recall the exact chants. Α. Ι
- 21 just know whenever the door cracked, when
- 22 somebody was leaving or going, they would start
- 23 chanting.
- 24 Q. At some point during this meeting, and
- I think on the video, it shows like six hours 25

OCCODET 13, 2010

- 1 and 29 minutes, so a pretty lengthy meeting.
- 2 Does that ring a bell?
- 3 A. That it was a lengthy meeting?
- 4 O. Yes.
- 5 A. It was lengthy.
- 6 Q. Right. And at some point during that
- 7 meeting, Mr. Faust that you referenced and we
- 8 discussed earlier in your testimony stood up and
- 9 on the video and the audio that you can hear
- 10 claim that Entergy had paid people at the 10/16
- 11 meeting.
- 12 A. I don't remember the exact date where
- 13 he said that. But if you tell me that's on the
- 14 tape, I have no reason to dispute it.
- 15 Q. Did you observe that? Were you in the
- 16 room at the time?
- 17 A. I think I was.
- 18 O. And I quess he had two to three
- 19 minutes like everybody had. But in that time
- 20 frame that you can watch on video, he makes that
- 21 statement, I believe, at the beginning of his
- 22 comment. When you heard that, what reaction did
- 23 you have to his comments?
- 24 A. I didn't believe him. If you had had
- 25 any experience watching Mr. Faust at any of the

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 previous meetings where he showed up, his

- 2. behavior was always somewhat erratic. And he
- also was part of the group that put out a lot of 3
- 4 misinformation and disinformation. So, I had no
- 5 reason to believe anything he said was accurate.
- I thought he was just doing what he normally 6
- 7 does.
- As you sit here today, do you believe 8 Ο.
- his statement? Do you believe it's true or 9
- 10 false at this stage?
- 11 Α. I mean, based upon what has been
- revealed subsequently, there were some people 12
- that were paid by Crowds on Demand. 13
- 14 Q. Working for the Hawthorn Group?
- 15 Α. I don't know who they work for.
- You don't know one way or the other? 16 Ο.
- 17 I know that Hawthorn retained Crowds Α.
- 18 on Demand without our authorization.
- 19 Were you aware that Ms. Pollard Ο.
- 2.0 received an e-mail from the Hawthorn Group that
- 21 referenced Crowds on Demand?
- 22 BY MR. CAHN:
- 23 Hold on. That's not accurate.
- EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN: 24
- You understand my question? 25 0.

- 1 A. I have no idea if -- I mean, if
- 2 there's a e-mail, I would like for you to show
- 3 it to me. But I'm not aware of her getting a
- 4 e-mail from Crowds on Demand.
- 5 Q. Have you reviewed documents in this
- 6 case -- in this matter?
- 7 A. I've looked at some documents.
- 8 O. When was that?
- 9 A. At a meeting with Mr. Cahn and
- 10 Mr. Becker. I think the judge was at the
- 11 meeting.
- 12 Q. Which documents did you review?
- 13 A. It was e-mails, some of the documents
- 14 which you shared with us today.
- 15 O. And when was that? Not what was
- 16 discussed, but when did you do that?
- 17 A. I don't recall specific dates. I
- 18 think we may have met last Wednesday or
- 19 Thursday.
- 20 Q. Following Ms. Pollard's testimony?
- 21 A. I don't know when she testified.
- 22 Q. Did you review her deposition
- 23 transcript or a rough draft?
- A. Nope.
- 25 Q. I will show you what was marked last

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

week as Exhibit 20. I just have one copy. 1 Ιf

- 2. you'll excuse me, I'll reach here.
- 3 Α. Okay.
- 4 And for the record, I believe Exhibit Ο.
- 20 is HAWTHORN 1 Bates label. Now, you're not a 5
- 6 party to this conversation, correct, this
- communication? 7
- I'm not on the e-mail. But from what 8
- 9 I see, it appears that Steven Cohen on October
- 10 3, 2017 at 1:04 p.m. e-mailed Suzanne Hammelman,
- 11 Adam Stewart or Swart, and that it looks like at
- 12 some point this e-mail -- Let's see.
- 13 The original e-mail between Mr. Cohen,
- Ms. Hammelman, and Mr. Swart happened at 1:04. 14
- 15 And then at 1:27 on October 3rd, an e-mail was
- 16 forwarded to Yolanda by Suzanne. And neither
- 17 Mr. Swart nor Mr. Cohen were on that e-mail.
- 18 Ο. What's Mr. Swart's e-mail address
- listed there? 19
- 20 It says "Adam@crowdsondemand.com." Α.
- 21 So, going back to that 2/21 meeting, Q.
- 22 you see Mr. Faust make his statement. Following
- 23 that statement and that meeting, did you -- and
- 24 I mean immediately, did you take any immediate
- actions to --25

- 1 A. No.
- 2 BY MR. CAHN:
- 3 You've got to let him finish
- 4 his question.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 Okay. Sorry.
- 7 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 8 Q. That's all right.
- 9 So, following that meeting, that 2/21
- 10 meeting and Mr. Faust's statements, did you on
- 11 behalf of Entergy take any immediate steps to
- 12 cancel Hawthorn's contract?
- 13 A. No, because I had no reason to believe
- 14 Mr. Faust was telling the truth.
- 15 Q. And this, obviously, we referenced
- 16 earlier in your testimony, not we, but you had
- 17 received similar allegations following that
- 18 10/16 meeting?
- 19 A. 10/16 of what year?
- 20 O. 2017.
- 21 A. Well, that doesn't make sense because
- 22 this is October 3rd of 2017. So, this was
- 23 before that.
- Q. Correct. And I'm just kind of
- 25 referencing now 2/21. Okay? You had two

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 meetings at issue focused of this inquiry.

- 2. Α. Okay.
- 3 October 23 of 2017 as well as earlier O.
- 4 this year, February 21, 2018.
- 5 Α. Okay.
- And so, you reviewed those e-mails 6 Ο.
- following October 16th. And I believe the date 7
- is October 23 of 2017 -- we haven't looked at 8
- 9 that one -- where there was some Internet
- 10 discussion, so to speak, regarding people
- 11 allegedly being paid to attend and/or speak on
- 12 Entergy's behalf.
- 13 Are you talking about this one? Α.
- Yes. Exhibit 31. 14 Q.
- 15 Α. So, what was your question?
- My question was, when Mr. Faust stood 16 Ο.
- 17 up, that was at least the second time that you
- 18 had heard that allegation; is that correct?
- 19 It was subsequent to this Sprinklr
- 20 note. So, that was probably the second time I
- 21 heard it.
- 22 Q. Let me show you what is already marked
- 23 as Exhibit 45.
- 24 Α. Okay.
- Then on March 23rd of 2018 -- and I 25 Q.

- 1 don't believe you're a party to this particular
- 2 communication -- but did Ms. Pollard on behalf
- 3 of Entergy take actions to see that the Hawthorn
- 4 Group, their invoices was facilitated and paid;
- 5 is that correct?
- 6 A. The document says, "Please process the
- 7 attached invoice for the Hawthorn Group. Let me
- 8 know if you need any additional information."
- 9 Q. And "process the attached invoice,"
- 10 when Ms. Pollard sent that to accounts payable,
- 11 that means pay it, correct?
- 12 A. If she asked them to process the
- 13 payment, I think --
- 14 BY MR. CAHN:
- No. Different. That's not
- 16 related to that.
- 17 BY THE WITNESS:
- 18 And if she asked them to
- 19 process payment, then it's fair to
- assume she was asking that they be
- 21 paid.
- 22 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 23 Q. If you can, look at Exhibit 46, which
- 24 for the record is ENO-NOPS 319 through and
- 25 including 322.

CHARLES RICE

- 1 (WITNESS COMPLIED). Α.
- 2. Ο. If you just look at the last page,
- 322. 3
- 4 Α. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 5 I don't have very many questions. But Q.
- just following up on that previous e-mail, is 6
- 7 this Ms. Pollard submitting both to Bright
- Moments as well as the Hawthorn Group an invoice 8
- 9 for payment; is that correct?
- 10 Α. That's what the document states.
- 11 Did Ms. Pollard ever discuss with you 0.
- -- In fact, let me just show you Exhibit 47. 12
- 13 This is an e-mail thread that I do not believe
- 14 you are on. It's ENO-NOPS 249 through and
- 15 including 252. Take a moment to look at those
- 16 four pages, and let us know when you're ready to
- 17 answer a couple of questions.
- (WITNESS COMPLIED). Okay. 18 Α.
- 19 Let me show you. These kind of --Ο.
- 20 These all go together, Exhibits 48 and 49, which
- 21 I don't have an extra copy of.
- 22 Α. Is this the same document, or is this
- 23 something different?
- 24 Q. It's something different, and I'll
- point it out to you. Are you ready now? 25

- 1 A. (WITNESS SHOOK HEAD NEGATIVELY).
- Q. Just for your reference, Section A has
- 3 a difference between the two, 1A.
- 4 A. Okay.
- 5 Q. The first exhibit is an e-mail thread
- 6 between Ms. Pollard and a few others, not
- 7 including you, that requests that a contract
- 8 change order, being 48, be edited to remove the
- 9 phrase "talk point and testimony" -- "Talk
- 10 points and testimony will be vetted, " which then
- 11 results in a new contract change order for the
- 12 Hawthorn Group, Exhibit 49. Do you see that,
- 13 Mr. Rice?
- 14 A. The e-mail, yeah. "Talk point and
- 15 testimony will be vetted."
- 16 Q. And Ms. Pollard is telling others at
- 17 Entergy that she's asking for that line to be
- 18 removed, correct?
- 19 A. She writes, "Please delete the line
- 20 'Talk point and testimony will be vetted.' This
- 21 was also general vendor discussion not intended
- 22 for the final contract."
- 23 Q. So, you see the difference between the
- 24 result -- the difference between the two, 48 and
- 25 49, at that line that Ms. Pollard referenced in

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 the e-mail has been removed?

- 2. Α. Yes.
- 3 Did she discuss -- Did Ms. Pollard Ο.
- 4 discuss this with you?
- 5 Not that I recall. Α.
- 6 Ο. Tell us about an asset sweep. How
- does that work to an outsider? 7
- Unfortunately, I can't really give you 8 Α.
- a class on asset sweep. Probably my assistant 9
- 10 is better -- My former assistant is probably
- 11 better suited to give you a class on asset
- 12 sweep. But my experience is I will get an
- 13 e-mail that there was something for me to
- 14 approve. I would log into the system, and it
- 15 would have a line, approve whatever it is.
- I think it might say it's been reviewed by 16
- 17 somebody previously, and then I would approve
- 18 it.
- 19 And, what, you just check "approved" Ο.
- 20 in a box, and then say "okay" or something to
- 21 that effect?
- 22 Α. Pretty much.
- 23 I will show you Exhibit 50, and that Ο.
- is for the record ENO-NOPS 6009 through and 24
- including 6014. 25

CHARLIED RICE OCCODET 15, 2010

- 1 A. Okay.
- Q. My question is specifically on 6011.
- A. And I apologize. This is too small
- 4 for me to make this out totally, but go ahead.
- 5 I'll try and answer.
- 6 Q. The top half of 6011, in looking at
- 7 it, you see the user ID? The first one says,
- 8 "T. Guidro" and then "C. Rice," upper left-hand
- 9 -- sort of upper left-hand corner?
- 10 A. Where is that? Show me.
- 11 O. (INDICATING).
- 12 A. I'm sorry, man. I need to upgrade my
- 13 readers.
- Q. My question is, this appears to show
- 15 that you approved the Hawthorn invoice for the
- 16 power station on, let's say, 10/18 of 2017?
- 17 A. I see my name on it. I apologize. I
- 18 can't tell you whether or not this indicates I
- 19 approved it.
- Q. Well, you see the word "action"?
- 21 A. Within the normal process at Entergy,
- 22 more than likely, I would have approved this.
- 23 Q. Specifically, if you look in that
- 24 middle column, you see the word "approved" on
- 25 the same line as your name?

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE). Α.

- 2 Ο. So, you approved -- This shows that
- 3 you approved the Hawthorn Group invoice,
- 4 correct?
- 5 Α. It has the word "approved," yeah.
- 6 approved it.
- 7 Q. Ms. Pollard does not have or did not
- have at the time authority to perform that 8
- function? That's what we understand; is that 9
- 10 correct?
- 11 She more than likely would have been Α.
- the first reviewer, and then she probably would 12
- -- I don't know. I can't say. I don't want to 13
- 14 speculate.
- 15 Q. If we told you that's what she
- 16 testified to, she didn't have that authority,
- 17 she may have had access, but not authority to
- 18 approve an invoice, would you have any cause to
- disbelieve her assertion? 19
- 20 I have no reason to dispute it. Α.
- 21 And then look at the -- Go to 6013, 0.
- 22 second to last page. The typed-in narrative
- 23 there, I guess that winds up being typed in
- scope. Someone took the time to retype it so we 24
- could actually read it in that screen shot. 25

MAKIES KICE OCCODET 15, 2010

- 1 Where does that information come from?
- 2 A. I have no idea.
- 3 Q. That's not something you would type
- 4 in, correct?
- 5 A. Uh-uh (NEGATIVE RESPONSE).
- 6 Q. I'm sorry.
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. In the last page there, 6014, again,
- 9 do you see your name as having approved this
- 10 second Hawthorn expenditure on 2/19 of 2018? Do
- 11 you see that?
- 12 A. It looks like what appears to be
- 13 "Rice," and then under one of the columns, it
- does say "approved."
- 15 Q. The column next to your name says,
- 16 "approved," correct?
- 17 A. Yeah. Yes. Sorry.
- 18 Q. Then moving on, April 30th, Exhibit
- 19 52, if you take a moment to review that two-page
- 20 e-mail thread, which is for the record ENO-NOPS
- 21 5763 and 5764.
- A. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- 23 Q. On the second page, Mr. Stein sends an
- 24 e-mail to Ms. Cavell notifying her that he's
- 25 going to write a story, quote, about people

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 allegedly being paid to show up to utility

- 2. committee meetings to show support for Entergy's
- proposed power plant, correct? 3
- 4 Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- Then he asked Ms. Cavell did Entergy 5 Q.
- 6 want to provide a response, correct?
- 7 Α. He did.
- And you're a couple of days later on 8 Ο.
- 9 April 30th, on the front page, 2018, your
- 10 position was to not "respond unless he provides
- 11 more details, and then I still don't know if we
- 12 should." Is that what you wrote on that
- particular e-mail? 13
- 14 I wrote that. I wrote that because I Α.
- 15 had no reason to believe anything in that story
- 16 was true. And that's why I didn't think we
- 17 should respond, because we had no knowledge of
- 18 anyone being paid, so why would we respond. And
- that's why I said, unless he provides more 19
- 20 details. And then I still don't know if we
- 21 should because we couldn't really verify
- 22 whatever it was that he may have come up with.
- 23 So, this is the third instance that Ο.
- 24 we've reviewed today that Entergy was notified
- regarding these allegations, correct? 25

- 1 A. Yeah. And if you see at that time, we
- 2 actually elevated it to people in the legal
- 3 department.
- 4 Q. Take a look, if you could, at Exhibit
- 5 57, ENO-NOPS 5923 and 5924.
- 6 A. (WITNESS COMPLIED). Okay.
- 7 Q. If you could, look at the -- I guess,
- 8 first, this is an e-mail thread. Mr. Ehrhardt
- 9 sends a statement to you on May 4, 2018; is that
- 10 correct?
- 11 A. Yeah.
- 12 O. Where did Mr. Ehrhardt receive the
- 13 information for him to draft this particular
- 14 statement?
- 15 A. I have no idea.
- 16 Q. Did you have personal one-on-one
- 17 conversations with Malcolm Ehrhardt?
- 18 A. That's possible, but I'm sure -- I
- 19 mean, I don't know if this was -- had been on
- 20 the news or not by this time. I mean, I don't
- 21 know if he and I would have specifically spoken
- 22 about it at that time.
- 23 Q. If you turn to the second page, first
- 24 sentence of that first full paragraph, it reads,
- 25 "Entergy New Orleans had no knowledge of

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 individuals or organizers of an effort to seed

- 2. an audience, period.
- Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE). 3 Α.
- 4 And this is under your name, Charles Ο.
- Rice, President and CEO, at least at that point, 5
- 6 correct?
- 7 Α. This was something that Mr. Ehrhardt
- drafted for me to consider sending, I'm sure. 8
- 9 The sentence that I just read, is that Ο.
- 10 true or false?
- 11 I mean, we didn't -- I don't know if Α.
- -- Attempt to seed an audience. Did we want to 12
- 13 have supporters there for us? Sure, we did.
- 14 Did we want people there who would speak on
- 15 behalf of the power plant? Definitely. Did we
- want people there who were knowledgeable of the 16
- 17 issues and who could articulate our
- 18 position? Definitely.
- 19 I wouldn't say we were attempting to
- 20 seed the audience. I mean, we wanted grassroot
- support there. We wanted people who were 21
- 22 identified as being in support of the plant to
- 23 be there.
- 24 Q. And I understand that. My question is
- just very straight forward. Is the statement 25

- 1 that was attributed to you, at least on that
- 2 particular date --
- 3 A. I don't know if this statement ever
- 4 went out. Did it?
- 5 BY MR. BECKER:
- Not attributed, just suggested.
- 7 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 8 Q. The words on the piece of paper.
- 9 A. Look. Unless you can show me that the
- 10 statement went out --
- 11 Q. I'm not asking you that.
- 12 A. I am telling you, and if you will
- 13 allow me to answer.
- 14 O. Sure.
- 15 A. Unless you can show me that the
- 16 statement went out, then you would have to ask
- 17 Mr. Ehrhardt what he meant by that. I mean, did
- 18 we -- I mean, I don't know if this ever went
- 19 out. I don't recall if it ever went out. I
- 20 mean, what "seeding an audience" means to him
- 21 and what it means to me may be two different
- 22 things.
- Q. And I'm not asking about whether it
- 24 went out. My question was just is that
- 25 statement true or false?

1 A. And I am telling you I don't know what

- "seed an audience" means.
- 3 Q. So, where did Mr. Ehrhardt get the
- 4 information from so he could sit down and type
- 5 out this statement, assuming that's what took
- 6 place?
- 7 A. I mean, you would have to ask him
- 8 that. I mean, I don't know if he got it from
- 9 the news. I don't know if he spoke with people.
- 10 I don't know. He could have got it from
- 11 somebody on his team. I don't know where he got
- 12 it.
- Q. But if it's a denial on Entergy's
- 14 behalf, Mr. Ehrhardt would not be in a position
- 15 to make his own unilateral conclusion as to what
- 16 Entergy knew, didn't know, did, or didn't do?
- 17 He would have to communicate with someone at
- 18 Entergy, correct?
- 19 BY MR. CAHN:
- 20 Matt, I think there are other
- 21 documents you have that show how the
- 22 statement came about.
- BY MR. COMAN:
- I'm just asking what he knows.
- 25 BY THE WITNESS:

- I mean, I don't know if
- 2 Mr. Ehrhardt is a public relations
- 3 professional. He probably was being
- 4 proactive. I mean, like I said, I
- 5 don't know where he got it. He could
- 6 have seen something on the news.
- 7 Someone on his team could have been
- 8 following social media.
- 9 I mean, I'm not going to sit
- 10 here and speculate as to what Malcolm
- 11 knew and when or who he communicated
- 12 with.
- 13 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 14 Q. And then from this e-mail, you
- 15 forwarded it on to Mr. Lagarde; is that correct?
- 16 A. That's what it looks like.
- 17 Q. And what did Mr. Lagarde say in
- 18 response?
- 19 A. He said he liked it. In fact, his
- 20 exact quote is, "I like it."
- 21 O. And then take a look at 58, which
- should be ENO-NOPS 5737 and 5738.
- A. (WITNESS COMPLIED).
- Q. In this e-mail thread, it looks like
- 25 it's the same statement, a draft statement from

1 Mr. Ehrhardt, but then it's circulated to others

- 2 on the Entergy team; is that correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 O. Take a look at 59.
- 5 BY MR. CAHN:
- 6 Oh, wait. Let's just be clear.
- 7 That's not the statement -- the prior
- 8 statement, is it?
- 9 BY MR. COMAN:
- 10 It is. It is the same one.
- BY MR. CAHN:
- 12 Okay.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 Okay.
- 15 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 16 Q. If you could, look at 59.
- 17 A. (WITNESS COMPLIED). All right.
- 18 Q. And so, going back, 57 -- So, 59 is
- 19 the statement again, but now, quote, in final
- 20 version that's going to be distributed; is that
- 21 correct?
- 22 A. It says, "See final version." But if
- 23 you notice that statement regarding the one you
- 24 were making a issue about, "Entergy New Orleans
- 25 had no knowledge of individuals or organizers of

CHARLES RICE OCCODET 15, 2016

- 1 an effort to seed an audience, "that's not in
- 2 the so-called "final version."
- 3 Q. Exactly. This is an e-mail you sent,
- 4 correct, Mr. Rice?
- 5 A. It appears that way, yes.
- 6 Q. And if you turn to that second page,
- 7 which is 5808, the sentence that we looked at
- 8 earlier regarding seeding an audience, quote,
- 9 unquote, has now been changed or was changed to,
- 10 "As we've stated previously, Entergy New Orleans
- 11 did not pay anyone to attend the council
- 12 meetings or direct anyone to attend public
- 13 meetings, " period. Did I read that correctly?
- 14 A. You did.
- 15 O. Who made that change?
- 16 A. I don't know.
- 17 Q. I'm sorry.
- 18 A. I don't know.
- 19 O. All right.
- 20 A. It could have been a number of people.
- 21 O. Was it you?
- 22 A. I have no recollection. I mean, I
- 23 would be speculating if I told you who I think
- 24 made the change.
- 25 Q. Okay.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 It also says, "Instead, we worked Α.

- 2 tirelessly to encourage our supporters to take
- time from their busy workday schedules to 3
- 4 testify on behalf of this project."
- 5 And that was in the original version Q.
- as well, correct? 6
- 7 Α. Yeah, it was.
- 8 So, that part was not changed, Q.
- correct? 9
- 10 Α. No.
- 11 Similar to the text message 0.
- 12 communications that you had with Ms. Pollard,
- 13 did you text other Entergy employees regarding
- the NOPS application or any related topic? 14
- 15 I'm sure I did. I mean, I know at
- 16 some point I'm sure I traded text messages with
- 17 several people.
- 18 Ο. Have you ever exchanged text messages
- 19 with anyone regarding the general topic of
- 20 Entergy paying people to attend and/or speak at
- 21 public meetings?
- I have no recollection of that. 22 Α.
- 23 mean, if there's a text message that shows I
- 24 did, then I did, but I have no recollection of
- doing that. 25

- 1 Q. What telephone device did you use,
- 2 let's say, starting with, say, summer of last
- 3 year?
- 4 A. iPhone.
- 5 Q. The same iPhone?
- 6 A. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE). Yes
- 7 Q. What version of that? What version
- 8 was it?
- 9 A. You'd have to ask my son.
- 10 Q. How long have you had it, ballpark?
- 11 A. I don't know. Maybe two years. I
- 12 don't know. Maybe longer. It's probably -- I
- 13 know it's not the latest and greatest.
- 14 O. And as part of the aftermath of
- 15 various allegations and the City Council's
- 16 investigation, did you turn that telephone, that
- 17 device in to Entergy?
- 18 A. Twice.
- 19 O. When was the first time, ballpark?
- 20 A. I can't give you the date.
- 21 O. Was it --
- 22 A. It's probably in the last six months.
- 23 Q. Did you before turning it in or at any
- 24 point review the phone yourself to see what text
- 25 messages you may have that would have been

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 relevant to this inquiry?
- 2. I don't think so.
- And when was the most recent time that 3 Ο.
- 4 you turned the telephone in to Entergy?
- I think it was last week. Let me go 5
- back. I probably did look through my phone at 6
- 7 some point. But I swap text messages with
- people that work for me all the time, depending 8
- on where I'm at and what's going on. 9
- 10 Ο. Sure. Can you explain why, except for
- 11 one text message that we will review in a little
- 12 bit, that there have been no text messages
- 13 disclosed to us?
- You would have to ask the 14 Α.
- 15 technological expert that question. But I can
- 16 assure you that I made no purposeful effort to
- 17 delete any text messages. I would have no need
- 18 to.
- 19 Did you have any issues with the Ο.
- 20 telephone, an accident, somebody ran over it in
- 21 the street, anything like that?
- 22 Α. Not that I'm aware of.
- 23 So, same telephone with no issues, Ο.
- 24 correct?
- 25 Α. Correct.

- 1 Q. The text messages that we did review
- 2 so far, the ones that you had with Ms. Pollard,
- 3 would you have any personal issue with turning
- 4 over the actual spreadsheet of those text
- 5 message exchanges?
- 6 BY MR. CAHN:
- 7 Matt, that's being handled
- 8 through legal.
- 9 BY MR. COMAN:
- 10 I'm asking him. I understand
- 11 y'all's position.
- 12 BY THE WITNESS:
- What you mean, "spreadsheet"?
- 14 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 15 Q. What I showed you before is actually
- 16 words on a piece of paper that we've already
- 17 discussed. I'm talking about more of a
- 18 technological printout as opposed to what we
- 19 reviewed. Would you have any issue with
- 20 producing that to us during this inquiry?
- 21 BY MR. CAHN:
- Matt, that's going to be
- 23 handled through legal.
- 24 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 25 Q. So, what is your personal view on

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 that?
- 2. Α. On what?
- On whether or not you would allow us 3 Ο.
- 4 to -- Why won't you give us the text messages?
- 5 BY MR. CAHN:
- He's going to defer to legal. 6
- 7 And we've stated our position to the
- investigators, including yourself. 8
- EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN: 9
- 10 Ο. Is that accurate? Do you want to
- 11 defer to legal as opposed to make your own
- 12 decision? I'm asking you, Mr. Rice.
- 13 I am a lawyer. I'm deferring to legal Α.
- 14 counsel.
- 15 Ο. Were you interviewed as part of an
- 16 investigation conducted by Entergy's in-house
- 17 counsel?
- 18 Α. Yes.
- 19 And who interviewed you? 0.
- 20 I'm sure I spoke with Mr. Cahn. I'm Α.
- 21 sure I had conversations with Mr. Brown, Tim
- 22 Cragin, and Brian Guillot. Those are people
- 23 that I spoke to in the legal department. As far
- 24 as the so-called "investigation," it was
- probably Mr. Cahn. 25

- 1 Q. And who was present during that
- 2 particular interview session, if anyone else?
- 3 A. I think it was just me and Mr. Cahn.
- 4 Q. Let me show you a letter that's marked
- 5 as Exhibit 67.
- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 Q. This is a letter, I think a public
- 8 document dated May 15, 2018 on City Council
- 9 letterhead, as well as it appears to be signed
- 10 by all the current City Council members; is that
- 11 correct?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 0. And this is what I'll call a "hold
- 14 notice" or a "hold letter" addressed to you,
- 15 Charles Rice, Junior, President and CEO of
- 16 Entergy New Orleans; is that correct?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. What efforts did you take at Entergy
- in order to comply with this letter?
- 20 A. As soon as I got it, I forwarded it to
- 21 the legal department, I'm sure. Based on prior
- 22 experience, they did what we do when there's a
- 23 litigation hold.
- Q. Besides whatever the legal department
- 25 did, did you perform any functions yourself

CHARLES RICE

1 besides forwarding it on to legal?

- 2. Α. I mean, I followed our normal process.
- I mean, I have e-mails that are on the system. 3
- 4 We have -- The system searches it. And, you
- 5 know, based upon past experience, they hold the
- documents for so long. I'm sure once the 6
- 7 litigation was hold -- was put on, the legal
- department did what they were supposed to do. 8
- 9 Right. And my question was this: Did Ο.
- 10 you take this letter and then -- besides giving
- 11 it to the legal department and letting that
- process take place, did you sit down, did you 12
- 13 type an e-mail to employees or have staff
- 14 meetings or anything along those lines where you
- 15 said --
- 16 That's not my --Α.
- 17 BY MR. CAHN:
- 18 Let him finish his question.
- EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN. 19
- 20 -- where you said, "Hey, look. Ο.
- 21 got this letter. I want y'all to do X, Y, and
- 22 Z"?
- 23 Well, that's not my job. It would not Α.
- 24 have been my job to do that. That would have
- been the legal department's job. And I'm sure 25

MAKHED KICE OCCODE 13, 2010

1 once I received this, I immediately sent it to

- 2 the legal department.
- 3 BY MR. COMAN:
- I have another exhibit, but I
- 5 need to go print it out. We need to
- 6 take a break.
- 7 (BREAK TAKEN)
- 8 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 9 Q. I just have a couple more things I
- 10 want to show you. Exhibit 68 is a series of
- 11 still color photographs from the October 16,
- 12 2017 meeting. And as you look at those, my
- 13 question is basically this: Do you know any of
- 14 those individuals?
- 15 A. This one looks familiar, but I can't
- 16 say that I know him.
- 17 Q. It's Mr. Hampton. He lives in
- 18 Marrero. Do you know him?
- 19 A. I mean, he looks familiar. I can't
- 20 say that. He just looks familiar. I live on
- 21 the Westbank, so I may have encountered him over
- 22 there.
- 23 Q. All right. If I told you these
- 24 individuals or many of these individuals were
- 25 paid to speak on Entergy's behalf, would you

CHARLES RICE

have any reason to disbelieve my assertion? 1

- 2. Α. No.
- I will show you Exhibit 69 which is, 3 0.
- 4 again, an un-Bates-labeled copy or document that
- reads "September 17, 2018 Text Message 5
- 6 Communication."
- 7 Α. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- It reads, "Wendell Bugg to Charles 8 Ο.
- 9 Rice. You made This Week with John Oliver in a
- 10 segment about astroturfing. Crowds on Demand
- 11 was hung out there, " period. Did you receive
- 12 that text from Mr. Bugg recently?
- 13 Α. Sure.
- And who is Mr. Bugg? Did I pronounce 14 0.
- 15 it correctly?
- 16 Let's see. One of my best friends Α.
- 17 from college. We were in ROTC together. We
- 18 served in the 101st together. We lived together
- 19 while we were in the Army. He's the godfather
- 2.0 to one of my kids. He is a former PR
- 21 professional; former Vice President of Public
- Relations and Governmental Affairs for Honda; 22
- 23 and later held a similar role at Toyota; and
- then later held a similar role with Northrop 24
- Grumman; and now lives in Washington, D.C. 25

- 1 Q. Where does he work now?
- 2 A. He is self-employed right now.
- 3 Q. What's the Invictus Group, and are you
- 4 involved in that entity?
- 5 A. The Invictus Group is a company that
- 6 he formed where he has listed me on his roster
- 7 of professionals.
- 8 Q. And what type of company?
- 9 A. He does consulting.
- 10 Q. Is it a PR firm, public affairs?
- 11 A. I'm sure he does some of that with it.
- 12 Q. Do you know if Invictus Group has ever
- 13 retained, associated, or employed in any way the
- 14 Hawthorn Group and/or Crowds on Demand?
- 15 A. No, not that I'm aware of.
- 16 Q. What does the term "astroturfing" mean
- 17 to you?
- 18 A. I had never heard of the term
- 19 "astroturfing" until this event. So, I mean, if
- 20 I gave you a definition, it would be strictly
- 21 based upon whatever I observed during the
- 22 situation, I guess, which would be people paying
- 23 a crowd to show up.
- Q. Did you watch the HBO segment that
- 25 Mr. --

CHARLES RICE

1 No, I haven't watched it. Α.

- 2. Ο. I'm sorry.
- I haven't watched it. 3 Α.
- 4 BY MR. COMAN:
- 5 Gentlemen.
- EXAMINATION BY MR. IBERT: 6
- 7 Q. Mr. Rice, you said that Hawthorn, you
- retained them to identify people who would 8
- support the plant, but all the contracts 9
- 10 referred to turning out that support. If you
- 11 were just interested in the -- them identifying
- 12 supporters, why didn't you-all just pay for the
- 13 list?
- 14 That's an interesting question. Well,
- 15 we have a very small staff. So, if they had a
- list of thousands, it would be very difficult 16
- 17 for us to have contacted all those people.
- 18 Ο. Well, you would have been able to go
- 19 through that list, right, and double-check
- 20 versus the people that you already knew,
- eliminated duplicates, and not waste time? 21
- 22 Α. If someone had time to do that, sure.
- 23 And it's your position that no one at Ο.
- Entergy had time to make sure the supporters 24
- turned out on their own? 25

- 1 A. There were plenty of people that
- 2 showed up on their own. I'm not quite sure what
- 3 you're talking about.
- 4 Q. Are you saying the efforts of Ms. Toni
- 5 Green-Brown, Mr. Dunn, and the other Entergy
- 6 employees to get these people out there were in
- 7 vain and not effective?
- 8 A. No way, shape, or form am I making
- 9 that statement. Those are three people. It
- 10 would be very difficult for them, considering
- 11 all the other things that they have to do, to
- 12 take a list of thousands and contact thousands
- of people or hundreds of people.
- 14 Q. Did you know that the list was
- 15 thousands of people?
- 16 A. I never saw a list. But the Hawthorn
- 17 Group, if you look at their material, I think it
- 18 says they have approximately a quarter million
- 19 people that they can reach out to.
- 20 Q. Did they tell you how they were going
- 21 to reach out to those people?
- 22 A. I didn't have that conversation with
- 23 them.
- Q. Did you ever ask them?
- 25 A. No.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Q. In your professional capacity

- throughout your career, you've worked for groups 2.
- that measure performance consistently, correct? 3
- 4 BY MR. CAHN:
- 5 Can you clarify that question?
- EXAMINATION BY MR. IBERT: 6
- 7 Q. I mean, the Army measures performance,
- right? 8
- 9 Sure. Α.
- 10 Ο. Do fitness reports -- As part of your
- 11 duties in the Army, you had to write the fitness
- 12 reports, correct?
- 13 In the Army, they're called "OERs." Α.
- BY MR. CAHN: 14
- 15 He's Navy, so be careful.
- 16 BY THE WITNESS:
- 17 OERs for officers. I can't
- 18 remember what you call it for NCOs.
- EXAMINATION BY MR. IBERT: 19
- 20 But there were reports that were Ο.
- written on performance? 21
- 22 Α. Yeah.
- 23 And you measured the individual versus Ο.
- 24 other people in a similar situation, correct?
- Sometimes there are goals that are 25 Α.

- 1 given.
- 2 O. And you do that as part of your job at
- 3 Entergy as the president, correct?
- 4 A. I would evaluate people's performance,
- 5 yes.
- 6 Q. And you would evaluate contractors,
- 7 correct?
- 8 A. Depends on whether or not I was
- 9 directly supervising that contractor.
- 10 Q. Other employees within your
- 11 organization measured the performance of
- 12 contractors, correct?
- 13 A. Sure.
- 14 O. And there was some kind of
- 15 understanding prior to engaging the contractor
- 16 as to how the contractor was going to be
- 17 measured, correct?
- 18 A. I guess in some respects that's true.
- 19 That doesn't necessarily mean that I would
- 20 necessarily lay out the performance measures.
- 21 Q. But someone at Entergy would lay out
- the performance measures, correct?
- 23 A. Sure.
- Q. And that's part of every contract with
- 25 Entergy?

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 I couldn't talk about every contract Α.

- 2. at Entergy.
- Under what kind of contracts at 3 Ο.
- 4 Entergy would Entergy engage a contractor and
- 5 not provide in the contract how Entergy was
- going to measure performance of the contract? 6
- 7 Α. I can't speak for the entire company.
- Under your direction, would you ever 8 Q.
- 9 have approved contracts that could not be
- 10 measured as to whether or not the paid-for
- 11 service was delivered?
- 12 I don't think -- I mean, you're really Α.
- 13 talking in generalities. I mean, there are
- certain contracts where there may not be a 14
- 15 performance matrix associated with it.
- 16 Ο. Okay.
- 17 Establish a certain task, and an Α.
- 18 individual could accomplish that task. It could
- 19 be just to provide information to someone.
- 20 could be to do research. So, you know, I can't
- speak for every single contract that's ever 21
- 22 written by Entergy.
- 23 Those are, again, things that can be Ο.
- 24 measured, whether or not the research was, in
- fact, provided on time, whether the information 25

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

- 1 is provided, right?
- It could be evaluated. 2.
- Measured? I mean, it was either 3 Ο.
- 4 received on the date due or it wasn't received
- 5 at all, right? That's a measurement.
- 6 Α. I don't necessarily agree with what
- you're saying.
- Well, how would you describe that? 8 Ο.
- 9 There's a deliverable. Α.
- 10 Ο. In every contract, do you have
- 11 deliverables stated?
- 12 I can't make a comment on every single Α.
- 13 contract. I'm sorry.
- What kind of contracts don't have 14 Ο.
- 15 deliverables at Entergy?
- I don't know. I'm not familiar with 16 Α.
- 17 every contract at Entergy.
- 18 Ο. But the ones that you would approve or
- personally sign off on and approve for payment, 19
- 20 did any not have deliverables?
- 21 Α. Probably not.
- 22 Q. Well, you said, "probably." So, in
- 23 what instances would you have approved for
- 24 payment and not checked or known what the
- 25 deliverable was?

1 A. I mean, there are agreements where you

- 2 may have someone on retainer. You may pay them
- 3 a certain amount of money every month. And
- 4 there may be a month where they don't perform
- 5 any services, but you still keep them on
- 6 retainer.
- 7 Q. Now, you mentioned your belief that
- 8 the Alliance for Affordable Energy and other
- 9 groups were engaged in misinformation and
- 10 disinformation campaigns. Is that a fair
- 11 statement?
- 12 A. I wouldn't say it was a belief. I
- 13 said if you go and read some of the Advocate and
- 14 Nola.com articles, you can see misinformation
- 15 that's contained in the articles.
- 16 O. What particular misinformation?
- 17 A. They said that subsidence in New
- 18 Orleans East was due to the operation of the
- 19 Michoud plant. They said that the operation of
- 20 the Michoud plant had been responsible for
- 21 people having cancer in the area. They said
- 22 that the operation of the Michoud plant released
- 23 toxins into the air that were outside EPA
- 24 limits.
- They said that we were pumping

- 1 groundwater out of the area, and as a result of
- 2 that, it was causing subsidence, when in reality
- 3 the studies actually showed that the aquifer
- 4 from which the groundwater was being taken was
- 5 actually at a higher level than when the plant
- 6 started operating. Those are just some of the
- 7 things that they were not putting out accurate
- 8 information on.
- 9 Q. And you know it was inaccurate because
- 10 you reviewed the technical data provided to you
- 11 by engineers at Entergy, correct?
- 12 A. I had read some of it, and I had
- 13 actually met with the experts.
- 14 Q. As part of that regulatory hearing,
- 15 you presented -- or rather, the company
- 16 presented experts refuting those claims,
- 17 correct?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 O. And the Alliance and the intervener
- 20 put on experts that it claims substantiated
- 21 those claims, correct?
- 22 A. I don't remember every witness. I do
- 23 not recall there being a witness presented at
- 24 the evidentiary hearing which discussed many of
- 25 the technical -- or refuted the technical

- 1 information that we presented.
- 2 Q. So, Entergy was able to present
- 3 accurate, technical information throughout this
- 4 process, correct?
- 5 BY MR. CAHN:
- 6 Present to who?
- 7 BY MR. IBERT:
- 8 To the City Council.
- 9 BY THE WITNESS:
- 10 Presented information based
- 11 upon science that was subject to or
- 12 could be peer reviewed by other
- scientists, if they wanted to take a
- look at it and review it.
- 15 EXAMINATION BY MR. IBERT:
- 16 O. Was it accurate?
- 17 A. Yes, it was accurate.
- 18 Q. Mr. Coman asked you about Mr. Faust
- 19 speaking at a particular hearing. Do you recall
- 20 those questions from Mr. Coman?
- 21 A. Sure.
- Q. And you stated that you did not
- 23 believe Mr. Faust and chose to disregard him,
- 24 correct?
- 25 A. I believe what I stated is Mr. Faust

- 1 showed up at a number of meetings. In those
- 2 meetings, Mr. Faust appeared somewhat erratic
- 3 and was not necessarily accurate in the
- 4 information that he was putting out. That's
- 5 paraphrasing what I said.
- 6 O. He was accurate in his statement that
- 7 people were paid to attend meetings on behalf of
- 8 Entergy, correct?
- 9 A. That was revealed to me subsequently,
- 10 yes.
- 12 communications with Ms. Pollard. I believe
- 13 that's the text messages about the effectiveness
- 14 of the turnout. How had you -- Did you
- 15 determine that that turnout was grassroots
- 16 support?
- 17 A. We retained the Hawthorn Group to
- 18 conduct a grassroots effort. I mean, I don't
- 19 know if I could answer it any different than
- 20 that. We retained them to identify grassroot
- 21 supporters, and that's what we expected that
- 22 they would do.
- Q. And you mentioned at the very
- 24 beginning of today that you had first seen
- 25 Mr. Ashford give a presentation?

- 1 A. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE). Yes.
- 2 O. Where was that?
- 3 A. My recollection was Mr. Ashford had
- 4 done a presentation on the national political
- 5 landscape in the country at an Entergy meeting.
- 6 I can't recall which meeting it was, but that
- 7 was my recollection of him. And it could have
- 8 been on the presidential race.
- 9 BY MR. IBERT:
- 10 Thank you, Mr. Rice.
- 11 EXAMINATION BY MR. LAWRENCE:
- 12 Q. Mr. Rice, first thank you for your
- 13 service. I did not know that you were former
- 14 military.

CHARLES RICE

- 15 A. Thank you.
- 16 Q. I knew that you were from here and
- 17 very much of this community, politically active
- in the community. That's accurate; am I
- 19 correct?
- 20 A. I would say I was active in the
- 21 community.
- 22 Q. You worked with the City at some point
- 23 in time; am I right?
- 24 A. Yean, I did. But I didn't -- Let me
- 25 say this. I didn't work on Ray Nagin's campaign

- 1 before I went to work for him. So, politically
- 2 active, do I know people in politics? Oh, yeah,
- 3 I do. Do I associate with people in politics?
- 4 Yes. Do people ask me for their support when
- 5 they're running for office? Yes.
- 6 Q. Now, you're familiar with New Orleans
- 7 East; am I correct?
- 8 A. Yes, sir.
- 9 Q. Did you ever live in that area?
- 10 A. No, I didn't.
- 11 O. You're familiar with the area around
- 12 your plant; am I right?
- 13 A. Yes, sir.
- 14 Q. And you mentioned the fact that you
- 15 conducted surveys. How many surveys did you say
- 16 you conducted?
- 17 A. Two, maybe three.
- 18 Q. Two to three surveys?
- 19 A. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 20 O. Is that citywide?
- 21 A. Two were citywide. I think one was
- 22 New Orleans East. And I may have done -- Yeah,
- 23 for this plant, it was probably two or three.
- 24 Yeah.
- Q. And during your tenure at Entergy, say

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 from '09 forward, how many surveys do you think

- 2. you conducted?
- Probably at least one yearly to see 3 Α.
- 4 how customers were feeling about the company.
- 5 You were interested in the support for Ο.
- this particular project; am I right? 6
- 7 Α. Yes.
- Everything was not in support for the 8 Q.
- project. You wanted community support. 9
- 10 much support did you seek in the area around the
- 11 plant?
- 12 Α. Oh, a lot. Mr. Dunn spent a lot of
- 13 time in that area. I did several meetings in
- 14 that area myself. So, yeah, we were actively
- 15 seeking support of the citizens of that area.
- And when I mentioned -- Let me come up 16 Ο.
- 17 with a specific area. Say east of Michoud or
- 18 east of Bullard and south of the interstate, are
- 19 you familiar with that area?
- 2.0 I'm not quite sure what area you're Α.
- 21 talking about, but go ahead.
- 22 Q. Do you know where the interstate is?
- 23 Α. Yeah.
- 24 Q. Right. And the interstate moving
- towards the river, moving towards St. Bernard? 25

CHARLES RICE

- 1 Α. Yeah.
- 2. Ο. And when I say, "east of Bullard," you
- know where Bullard is? 3
- 4 Α. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- Bullard moving towards the Rigolets. 5 Ο.
- 6 Α. Okay.
- 7 Q. Towards St. Bernard. You can picture
- that area? 8
- 9 (WITNESS NODDED HEAD AFFIRMATIVELY). Α.
- 10 Ο. And you are familiar with the people
- who, in fact, inhabit that area? 11
- I have employees that live in that 12 Α.
- area, or I had employees that lived in that 13
- I have friends that live in that area. 14 area.
- 15 Ο. You identified supporters for the
- plant, and you identified opponents to the 16
- plant; am I correct? 17
- 18 Α. I don't know if we necessarily
- 19 identified opponents. But as we would do
- 20 community meetings, there were individuals who
- would stand up and say they didn't support the 21
- 22 project.
- 23 You were actively seeking supporters Ο.
- 24 for the plant; am I right?
- 25 Oh, definitely. Α.

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Q. And you identified people who were

- 2. supporting the effort for the plant?
- 3 Yeah. We would ask people if we went Α.
- 4 to a community meeting, if we had a community
- meeting, and people were willing to sign a 5
- support card. We asked them to sign a support 6
- 7 card. We also had a website which allowed
- people -- We would encourage people after the 8
- 9 meeting to go to the website. And I don't know
- 10 if "sign" is the right word, but you could
- 11 autogenerate a letter that would go to their
- 12 council person.
- 13 You described Entergy as being a Ο.
- Fortune 500 company having resources and 14
- 15 abilities earlier, did you not?
- 16 I didn't say we had resources and Α.
- 17 I said we were a Fortune 500 company. ability.
- 18 0. And you described the fact that --
- 19 Well, you mentioned the fact that, of course,
- 20 you were going to see -- being a Fortune 500
- 21 company, you did a certain amount of research?
- I did a lot of research. 22 Α.
- 23 You did a lot of research. Did you Ο.
- 24 identify opponents to the plant?
- I will say it again. As we did a 25 Α.

- 1 number of community meetings around the area, to
- 2 include New Orleans East, there are people that
- 3 would stand up and speak and say they were
- 4 against the plant. And often times I would have
- 5 -- Sometimes after the meetings I'd actually
- 6 have a private conversation with those
- 7 individuals to find out exactly what their
- 8 issues were.
- 9 And sometimes Mr. Dunn, or it might be
- 10 Ms. Green, or it might have been Ms. Mercadel,
- 11 might have had a conversation with a person even
- 12 after I had a conversation with the person to
- 13 see if we could assuage their concerns.
- 14 Were we out there specifically saying,
- 15 "Oh, we're going to look into this community and
- 16 we're going to find Mr. Smith who is against the
- 17 plant"? No, we weren't doing anything like
- 18 that.
- 19 O. So, nowhere within your organization
- 20 was there a list of individuals who opposed this
- 21 particular plant?
- 22 A. I don't think we ever generated a list
- 23 that said that this one, this one, this one, and
- 24 this one are against the plant, not at my
- 25 direction. I don't know if somebody else may

- 1 have done it. But I can tell you, at my
- 2 direction, no one ever put together a list that
- 3 said that this one is for, this one is against,
- 4 not at my direction.
- Now, that doesn't mean that we were at
- 6 a meeting and somebody on my team may have been
- 7 writing down who spoke, and may have written who
- 8 was for and who was against. That possibly
- 9 could have happened, but that wasn't done at my
- 10 direction.
- 11 Q. At any point in time, did you come to
- 12 put together a list of people whom you thought
- 13 needed to be lobbied to see if you could gain
- 14 support for the plant?
- 15 A. I mean, there were meetings where we
- 16 discussed organizations that we would want to
- 17 seek their support and who were the leaders of
- 18 those organizations, who was the leader of a
- 19 neighborhood group.
- But, I mean, yeah, we had a list of
- 21 neighborhoods throughout the city that we wanted
- 22 to contact people and see if we could go in, and
- 23 they would allow me or somebody from my team to
- 24 speak about the plant.
- 25 And then, you know, if there were

- 1 people against it, again, you know, we would --
- on occasion, I'm sure we would go speak with
- 3 those people to see if we can assuage their
- 4 concerns.
- 5 Q. Has any of that information ever been
- 6 memorialized?
- 7 A. Somebody may have written a list. I
- 8 don't know. But it would have been -- It wasn't
- 9 at my direction.
- 10 Q. So, at the point in time that you-all
- 11 sat together and figured out who to go out and
- 12 talk to, everybody knew, or did you refer to
- 13 former meetings of people that had been
- 14 identified or things that had been said?
- 15 A. Yeah. You know, we have a list of the
- 16 neighborhood associations in the city.
- 17 Q. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 18 A. And we try to know who the president
- 19 is of those neighborhood associations. If there
- 20 were people that we considered a leader in the
- 21 community for whatever reason -- For example,
- 22 the pastor of Greater St. Stephen's Church would
- 23 be considered a community leader, but we never
- 24 sat down with him.
- The pastor of Franklin Avenue Baptist

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Church would be considered a community leader.

- We didn't sit down with him. The leaders of --2.
- I think it's called "New Orleans East Business 3
- 4 Alliance" or "Business Group." I personally met
- with three of their board members to answer 5
- 6 questions that they may have had about the
- 7 plant.
- 8 But no, we weren't sitting there
- 9 picking off a list saying, "Talk to Ms. Jones."
- 10 I mean, some of the people who we ended up
- 11 having to come speak at the meeting were people
- 12 who showed up at community meetings that we were
- 13 having throughout the city and said they
- 14 supported the project.
- 15 You have a list of community partners.
- 16 Is that the right way to -- Is that how you
- 17 describe them?
- 18 Α. I mean, if you're asking me do we have
- 19 a list of organizations that we are supporting,
- 20 sure, yeah, we have a list.
- 21 And these are some of the people that
- 22 you asked to come and show up and speak at the
- 23 council meeting; am I correct?
- And some did and some didn't. 24 Α.
- Some did, some didn't. But you did 25 Q.

- 1 ask them to come out?
- 2 A. I didn't personally ask them. There
- 3 may have been one or two people that I had a
- 4 personal relationship with that I may have asked
- 5 to consider coming.
- 6 O. You are -- were the CEO of this
- 7 organization, correct?
- 8 A. I was the President and CEO of Entergy
- 9 New Orleans.
- 10 Q. And you had people who worked for you?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And you had people who worked for you
- or designated to do different things for you,
- 14 correct?
- 15 A. Yes, sir.
- 16 Q. You had people who, in fact, went to
- 17 the council where the council members were, in
- 18 fact, elected to speak to them to educate them
- 19 as to Entergy and what Entergy did for the city;
- 20 am I correct?
- 21 A. Yep.
- Q. You had people who reached out into
- 23 the community to these community partners, to
- 24 the business groups, to people around the city;
- 25 am I correct?

CHARLES RICE

1 And sometimes I was the person doing Α.

- 2. t.hat..
- And you-all spent a substantial amount 3 Ο.
- 4 of money helping the city; am I correct?
- Do we contribute to organizations in 5
- the city of New Orleans? Yes, we do. 6
- 7 contribute to organizations that help to
- eradicate profiting. We contribute to 8
- organizations that help to better the education 9
- 10 system in this city, yes. We contribute to
- 11 organizations that help improve the environment
- 12 around the city. We contribute to organizations
- 13 that help with Head Start.
- 14 I've seen the list. It's a Ο.
- 15 substantial list, and it's impressive.
- these are some of the people that you reached 16
- 17 out to get them -- to ask them to come and
- 18 support this effort, correct?
- 19 Α. Sure.
- 20 In that area that I described, east of Ο.
- 21 Bullard, south of the interstate, did you-all
- 22 spend a lot of money in that area or any money
- 23 in that area?
- I don't know what you consider a lot 24 Α.
- of money. Are there groups that we supported in 25

- 1 that area?
- 2 O. Yes.
- 3 A. Of course we did.
- 4 Q. And I understand that you-all reached
- 5 out to many, many businesses, business people
- 6 who you thought might be interested in
- 7 supporting the plant; am I correct?
- 8 A. Yes, sir.
- 9 Q. How many did you reach out to in that
- 10 particular area?
- 11 A. I can't give you a number.
- 12 Q. Can you give me any?
- 13 A. Huh?
- 14 Q. Can you give me any?
- 15 A. Any what?
- 16 Q. Any business you reached out to in
- 17 that area.
- 18 A. Like I said, I personally -- I did a
- 19 presentation to the Black Chamber of New Orleans
- 20 East. I did a presentation to -- I think I did
- 21 maybe three community meetings. I did a
- 22 presentation to -- what's the community group
- 23 out there -- ENONAC. I did one to two or three
- 24 other homeowner associations out there. I spoke
- 25 with the New Orleans East Business Owners

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Association. And I may be getting the name

- 2. wrong.
- 3 I specifically recall sitting down
- 4 with Troy Henry. He lives out there. I think I
- even briefed Alden McDonald. His bank is 5
- headquartered out there. 6
- 7 Q. So, Mr. McDonald and Mr. Henry live
- east of Bullard and south of the interstate? 8
- 9 I mean, I don't know exactly. I think
- 10 Mr. McDonald lives on Park Island, but his
- 11 business is headquartered in New Orleans East.
- 12 And I think Troy lives in New Orleans East. I'm
- 13 not quite sure where.
- 14 I went to the pastor of Mary Queen of
- 15 Vietnam Church, had a one-on-one meeting with
- 16 him.
- 17 Q. Was he a supporter?
- 18 Α. I would say no.
- No? And the bus --19 Ο.
- 20 And actually, we even did a meeting. Α.
- 21 I can't remember if it was at the church. I
- recall at least one, maybe two meetings just 22
- 23 with the Vietnamese community.
- And were they in favor of your 24 Q.
- installation? 25

- 1 A. There were some people in there that
- 2 was supporters, and there were some people that
- 3 were not.
- 4 Q. You identified some supporters?
- 5 A. I'm sure my team did.
- 6 O. Was there an effort to reach out to
- 7 the supporters by your team?
- 8 A. I'm sure we reached out to people.
- 9 O. Who would have reached out?
- 10 A. Probably Mr. Dunn and Ms. Mercadel.
- 11 O. This busload that was coming in from
- 12 New Orleans East, it was full of Vietnamese
- 13 people, right?
- 14 A. I didn't see the bus, so any statement
- 15 I would make would be based upon hearsay. But
- 16 that's what I was told.
- 17 Q. That's what you were told. And those
- 18 people sitting outside the chambers chanting,
- 19 were many of them Vietnamese?
- 20 A. Some were African-American. Some were
- 21 Vietnamese. I would say probably the majority
- 22 of them chanting were probably African-American.
- 23 Q. And you can't -- Can you name any of
- 24 the business owners in that area who support
- 25 your plant?

CHARLES RICE

1 In New Orleans East? Α.

- 2. Ο. Yes.
- You're trying to pin me down. 3 Α.
- 4 apologize. I'm not intimately familiar with the
- geography which you've laid out. But I do know 5
- that there was a owner of a business right on 6
- 7 the same road with the Michoud plant that was
- supportive. It was an African-American 8
- gentleman whose name escapes me at this time. I 9
- 10 apologize. I can't remember.
- 11 The area immediately around your Ο.
- plant, this area that I'm talking about, I'm not 12
- trying to confuse you. I'm talking about down 13
- Chef Highway, down Michoud Boulevard, Alcee 14
- 15 Fortier. I mean, there's a substantial
- 16 population there; am I correct?
- 17 Α. I would disagree with your statement.
- 18 I think if you actually look at an aerial view
- 19 of the plant, I think the closest house may have
- 20 been almost two miles away.
- 21 Two miles away? Your plant is on
- 22 Michoud Boulevard --
- 23 Α. Right.
- -- right next to the old green bridge 24 Q.
- there, isn't it? 25

- 1 A. The bridge going to Chalmette?
- Q. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 3 A. Yeah. Yeah. If you go across that
- 4 bridge, I think if you look to the left, you can
- 5 see the plant.
- 6 Q. If you go by land, right? Past that,
- 7 you've got to go by sea, launch you a boat, and
- 8 get to the Hotwater Canal, and you're there?
- 9 A. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 10 Q. I mean, there's some population around
- 11 it? It's just not heavily populated, right?
- 12 A. I would say there are probably people
- in St. Bernard Parish that are closer to the
- 14 plant than people in New Orleans East.
- 15 Q. But when it comes to the people in New
- 16 Orleans East and Orleans Parish, all right,
- 17 which is -- who are most of the people that
- 18 we're talking about right now, I mean, were you
- 19 lobbying people in St. Bernard to come in and
- 20 speak in support of the plant?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. But you were lobbying people in
- 23 Orleans Parish to come speak in support of the
- 24 plant?
- 25 A. We were engaging and reaching out to

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 the community. Yes.
- 2. Ο. And the nearest of those who are, in
- fact, in proximity to the plant would be in the 3
- 4 area that I'm describing, would they not?
- Mr. Lawrence, I don't want to say yes 5
- or no because -- I apologize. I know you gave 6
- 7 me the geography. I'm familiar with the area,
- but I'm not that intimately familiar with the 8
- 9 area.
- 10 Ο. And you're not that intimately
- 11 familiar with the people in the area?
- 12 I would beg to differ. I have friends Α.
- 13 that live in the Rigolets. I mean, not the
- Rigolets. Venetian Isles. I have friends that 14
- 15 live in Eastover. I have employees that live
- where the tornado hit, which was not that far 16
- 17 from the plant. I know people that work at the
- 18 NASA Michoud facility.
- 19 You were personally involved in Ο.
- 20 40-plus meetings; am I correct?
- 21 Roughly. Α.
- 22 Q. And basically, you were personally
- 23 involved in working up and getting people to
- 24 come and support this effort; am I right?
- I was involved in the effort to 25 Α. Yeah.

- 1 get people to come out and support it.
- Q. And I'm asking basically about the
- 3 people in the immediate proximity of the plant.
- 4 Did you know anything about them and how many of
- 5 them you got to support it?
- 6 A. Huh?
- 7 Q. How many of those people in the
- 8 immediate proximity of the plant did you get to
- 9 support you?
- 10 A. Mr. Lawrence, I can't tell you.
- 11 BY MR. CAHN:
- Mr. Lawrence, he's answered
- these questions. I don't know what
- 14 this has to do with the allegations
- about Hawthorn's work.
- 16 You know, I understand that
- there are issues in New Orleans East,
- but this has nothing to do with
- 19 whether or not Entergy or Mr. Rice
- 20 knew that Hawthorn had hired Crowds on
- 21 Demand without its authorization and
- 22 Crowds on Demand paid people to attend
- 23 two meetings. So, I'm just going to
- 24 --
- 25 BY MR. LAWRENCE:

1		I'm asking a question. I mean,
2		basically, I'm asking him about the
3		people trying to bring in support.
4		The people I'm asking I'm trying
5		to get to whether or not any of those
6		people were, in fact, contacted by
7		him, by Hawthorn, by anybody
8		associated with Entergy.
9		BY MR. CAHN:
10		Well, if you want to ask him if
11		he knows that, I think he can answer
12		that. But I don't think I mean,
13		this you know, who he knows in
14		Orleans East is not relevant to the
15		issue that we're here today to talk
16		about.
17		BY MR. LAWRENCE:
18		That's your opinion.
19	EXAMINATI	ON BY MR. LAWRENCE:
20	Q.	Mr. Rice, do you know if Hawthorn was
21	reaching	out to any of the people in that area?
22	Α.	I have no idea.
23	Q.	You mentioned VAYLA?
24	Α.	Huh?
25	Q.	You mentioned VAYLA?

- 1 A. VAYLA. I think it's V-A-Y-L-A.
- 2 Q. Yes. Do you know where they're
- 3 located?
- 4 A. I don't know where their exact office
- 5 is.
- 6 Q. And the comments around this being
- 7 war, all right, you mentioned the need for foot
- 8 soldiers; am I correct?
- 9 A. Yes, sir.
- 10 Q. And with your military background,
- 11 it's fair to say that you would understand that
- 12 soldiers have to be paid?
- 13 A. Are you asking me was I paid when I
- 14 was in the military?
- 15 O. Yeah.
- 16 A. Are you asking me that the United
- 17 States Government pays its soldier that serve
- 18 this country every day?
- 19 O. Yes.
- 20 A. Yeah, the United States Government
- 21 paid us.
- Q. Do you know any soldiers who are not
- 23 paid?
- A. That are members of the United States
- 25 military, be it Coast Guard, Army, Navy, Air

- 1 Force, Marines, including the Merchant Marines,
- 2 I don't know of anyone that hasn't been paid or
- 3 don't get paid.
- 4 Q. Did you anticipate your soldiers being
- 5 paid?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. Why not?
- 8 A. Because that's not what we do, and
- 9 that's not something that we were in the
- 10 business of doing. That's not something that we
- 11 anticipated.
- 12 Q. You expressed the need to have
- 13 soldiers; am I correct?
- 14 A. Well, I think that's used in a generic
- 15 sense. I mean, when people engage in political
- 16 campaigns, they talk about having soldiers. I
- 17 mean, "soldiers" is used in a lot of different
- 18 ways and a lot of different terms.
- 19 O. You spoke of soldiers to your people
- 20 who were ordering people from Hawthorn, did you
- 21 not?
- 22 A. I beg to differ on your terminology.
- 23 What did you just say?
- Q. It's not my terminology. It was
- 25 yours.

1 A. No, that was your terminology because

- 2 I didn't use the word that you used.
- 3 O. You didn't mention soldiers?
- 4 A. Huh?
- 5 O. You didn't mention soldiers?
- 6 A. I'm not talking about your use of the
- 7 word "soldiers." It was a term you used.
- 8 BY MR. CAHN:
- 9 He did not use the term
- 10 "ordering people from Hawthorn."
- 11 BY THE WITNESS:
- 12 That was it. I never said
- those words.
- 14 EXAMINATION BY MR. LAWRENCE:
- 15 Q. You authorized and you signed off on
- 16 money going to Hawthorn; am I correct?
- 17 A. I approved the contract, yes.
- 18 Q. And you approved an increase in the
- 19 contract for a certain amount of money,
- 20 depending upon the number of people they were
- 21 going to provide?
- 22 A. No. I approved the change order. I
- 23 will say it again. If there would have been one
- 24 person that showed up or 300 people that showed
- 25 up, Hawthorn would have been paid the same

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 amount of money.
- 2. BY MR. LAWRENCE:
- 3 I'm done.
- 4 EXAMINATION BY JUDGE JOHNSON:
- Mr. Rice, I'm going to try my best not 5
- 6 to make this long story longer. That's my goal.
- 7 And I very truly -- And I said this to Cory
- outside. I have no intention of beating up on 8
- 9 you.
- 10 Α. I appreciate that.
- 11 That's not my intent. O.
- 12 I've been around a while. I've been Α.
- 13 beat up before in a number of different
- 14 environments.
- 15 Ο. I feel you, my brother. I do. I do.
- One of the things, though -- And I am 16
- 17 really impressed with the people who work for
- 18 Entergy, the people who we have had here and we
- 19 have interviewed. I mean, to a person, I'm
- 20 impressed with them. I'm impressed with their
- dedication, with their knowledge, with their 21
- belief in Entergy and truly in the values of 22
- 23 Entergy. And to a person, I would think, they
- 24 all have shared, and I'm impressed with that.
- 25 You are 101st --

- 1 A. Yes, sir.
- 2 O. -- Airborne?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. I shared with the folks here, and I'll
- 5 share with you. I wasn't brave enough, I
- 6 wasn't. Air Force. Air Force. I had a
- 7 commission in the Army, and I turned it down. I
- 8 just wasn't brave enough. Now, I'm older than
- 9 you.
- 10 A. If I had to do it again, I would
- 11 probably go in the Air Force.
- 12 O. Well, I was there in the middle of the
- 13 war, and so that was part of my decision to turn
- 14 it down.
- 15 A. I hear you. I totally understand. My
- 16 dad served in the Army also. He actually served
- in Vietnam and is now a disabled vet as a result
- 18 of it.
- 19 O. I had a few hours in Saigon. When we
- 20 were getting out of Saigon -- I had a few hours
- 21 there. Yeah, but I wasn't brave enough for
- 22 that.
- 23 We've had a lot of conversation here
- 24 about a lot of things. One of those things,
- 25 from my perspective, has been Entergy's ability

1 to preserve information. And one of the things

- 2 I've heard is that some things happen
- 3 automatically with Entergy in preserving
- 4 information.
- 5 That is, is that e-mails are
- 6 automatically destroyed. That may be the wrong
- 7 word. Or they're only kept on your server or
- 8 servers for a period of time, and then they
- 9 automatically are -- I'm going to use "erased."
- 10 That may not be the right word, but they're no
- 11 longer there.
- 12 A. I think they roll off the system.
- 0. But then there are also historical
- 14 documents. This is what I was told. Well, I'll
- 15 put it differently. Entergy has a -- not only
- 16 the ability to, but the necessity to preserve
- 17 historical documents?
- 18 A. For example, regulatory filings, sure.
- 19 O. Because that would probably be as
- 20 regards other kinds of bodies that look across
- 21 Entergy in terms of Entergy's compliance with
- 22 other bodies, with, like you just said,
- 23 regulatory bodies?
- A. I have no reason -- Yeah, that's
- 25 probably accurate.

- 1 Q. I would also think -- And you can
- 2 correct me too if I'm wrong. But in terms of an
- 3 entity like Entergy, you as an entity, you want
- 4 to preserve your own history. You want to be
- 5 able to look backwards at this corporation in
- 6 terms of its corporate history. And to do so,
- 7 you preserve certain information. Would that be
- 8 accurate?
- 9 A. That's probably accurate.
- 10 Q. And a thing like NOPS, because of the
- 11 nature of NOPS and the size of this thing now,
- 12 would be something that you would want to
- 13 preserve information around, historical
- 14 documents, again, for the history of Entergy?
- 15 A. I am sure there are certain things
- 16 that we did retain.
- 17 Q. My whole point here is that I have a
- 18 difficulty. And I'm not accusing -- This is not
- 19 accusatorial, but a difficulty believing that
- 20 all of the information that surrounds NOPS is
- 21 not available for whatever the reason, but is
- 22 not available. That's a difficulty I have.
- 23 A. I mean, I don't -- I wasn't
- 24 participating. I didn't participate in the
- 25 document production from the aspect of combing

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 the documents. We have 14,000 employees.

- 2. Ο. That's an interesting point.
- Sometimes I compare stuff that's not necessarily 3
- 4 comparable. I ran an entity, but the entity I
- ran only had around 220 staff, but it was a 5
- state entity. And as a result, I preserved 6
- 7 information because it was a state entity and I
- had to. 8
- 9 You made a reference, though, to the
- 10 fact that you received on a daily basis hundreds
- 11 of e-mails?
- 12 Α. Sure.
- 13 When I ran this entity, I had Ο.
- 14 assistance. I had people who worked around and
- 15 for me, including people who made sure that I
- wasn't missing information like e-mails. Now, 16
- 17 this was a decade ago, I guess, a little less
- 18 than that. But I was not missing information.
- 19 So, they made sure that even if I didn't open
- 20 the e-mail that was important, someone else
- 21 would. Did you have a person like that?
- 22 Α. I mean, I had an assistant. But I
- 23 think if y'all interviewed Ms. Raymond, she
- probably told y'all that I like to read my own 24
- e-mails. 25

- 1 Q. Well, I hear that.
- 2 A. And on top -- Hold on. And on top of
- 3 that, I returned all my own phone calls. So, if
- 4 a customer called with a issue, it was important
- 5 enough for them to call me, then I wanted to
- 6 call them back. If a customer sent an e-mail
- 7 and they took time out of their day and it was
- 8 important enough for them to send me an e-mail,
- 9 I wanted to respond. So, I read -- I probably
- 10 read all my e-mails.
- Now, there may be some that come in
- 12 here that I knew were junk that I may not have
- 13 given but a cursory review. But yeah,
- 14 Ms. Raymond, you know, if there was something
- 15 that she thought I may have missed, she would
- 16 tell me.
- 17 Q. There was a Kim? I'm missing a name.
- 18 Maybe Kim Raymond or Kim --
- 19 A. Yeah. So, Kim Mitchell was my --
- 20 O. Kim Mitchell.
- 21 A. -- assistant at one point.
- Q. And then she left?
- 23 A. She got promoted.
- Q. She got promoted.
- 25 A. And still worked for Entergy New

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 Orleans. And then Karen took over.

- 2. Ο. Yes. And she took over months or so
- 3 ago?
- 4 Α. I don't know if it was months. It was
- 5 probably a year. It might have been a year.
- 6 Maybe a year. Ο.
- 7 Α. Maybe a little more or a little less.
- You had -- When you were actually 8 Q.
- president and CEO, you had those direct reports. 9
- 10 Who all was a direct report to you?
- 11 So, that would be Tara, Kim, Gary, Α.
- 12 Toni. And it changed in some respects. At one
- point, Brian Washington as well as Sandra 13
- 14 Hickman. I talked about Gary, Seth Cureington.
- 15 Although, you know, they weren't technically a
- part of the organization, they did work for me 16
- 17 because we operate in a matrix environment.
- That would have included Yolanda and 18
- 19 Orlando Tyler as well as Dennis Dawsey, Melonie
- 20 Stewart, and Tad Patella, oh, and as well as the
- 21 gas operations, which would have been Michelle
- 22 Bourg.
- 23 I do strange things sometimes, 0.
- 24 Charles. Mr. Rice, I do strange things.
- is my own strangeness. I read strange stuff. I 25

1 read the Art of War. Did you ever read the Art

- 2 of War?
- 3 A. I didn't finish it. I bought it, but
- 4 I didn't finish it.
- 5 Q. Interesting book in terms of
- 6 explaining tactics and stuff. I also in terms
- 7 of this looked at entergy.com's website. Are
- 8 you familiar with entergy.com's website?
- 9 A. Sure. Yeah.
- 10 O. It has an area there that is shared
- 11 values and ethics. It says, "Values & Ethics,"
- 12 for instance. I'm going to read you some of
- 13 what it says. This is Values & Ethics. This is
- 14 from the website. "At Entergy, we are committed
- 15 to a system of shared values to guide
- interactions of our owners, customers,
- 17 employees, and communities.
- 18 "These values are: Create and sustain
- 19 a safe and healthy life. Cultivate a diverse
- 20 and inclusive work culture. Possess a winning
- 21 spirit. Focus on our customers. Grow the
- 22 business. Be active team players. Treat people
- 23 with respect. Aggressively look for better
- 24 ways. Take actions to achieve results."
- 25 A. Above all, act --

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 Q. "Above all, act with integrity."

- 2 Say it.
- To act with integrity. 3 Α.
- 4 Ο. Say it all. "Above all" --
- 5 Α. Act with integrity.
- "Above all, act with integrity." 6 Q.
- 7 That's the last thing.
- Α. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE). 8
- 9 Your CEO, I'm going to mispronounce Ο.
- 10 his name, but I always do, Leo Denault.
- 11 Α. Denault.
- 12 Is that a correct pronunciation? Ο.
- 13 Denault. Α.
- 14 I'm reading him. He said, "Our Q.
- 15 commitment to integrity, to community service,
- to ethics beyond compliance and doing the right 16
- 17 thing, even if it is hard or uncomfortable, will
- 18 never change." Do you agree with that?
- 19 Α. I agree.
- 20 Would it be fair then to say, Charles Ο.
- -- I'm sorry. Mr. Rice, would it be fair to 21
- 22 say --
- 23 Α. You can call me Charles.
- 24 Q. And you can call me Calvin.
- October 16, 2017, did ENO conduct itself in a 25

- 1 fair and honest fashion? Can you say that?
- 2 A. I would tell you that the employees of
- 3 Entergy New Orleans conducted themselves in a
- 4 fair and honest fashion. We had a contractor
- 5 that acted outside of the values that we
- 6 typically hold. And I can tell you this. If
- 7 there was anyone on my team or myself who was
- 8 aware of that, I assure you, I would have
- 9 resigned before I got fired. I would have got
- 10 fired. But before I even got fired, I would
- 11 have resigned.
- 12 Q. I believe that.
- 13 A. And I can tell you, any one of my
- 14 employees probably would have done the same
- 15 thing because we know the actions that that
- 16 group took would have been an offense that was
- 17 against the values of the company and would have
- 18 resulted in someone being terminated.
- 19 O. So, Charles, would it be fair to say
- 20 that on October 16, 2017, when people were paid
- 21 by ENO to sit in the council chambers and paid
- 22 to speak, ENO's fundamental commitment to
- 23 integrity and ethics changed?
- A. First of all, people were not paid by
- 25 Entergy New Orleans. It's my understanding

- 1 people were paid by Crowds on Demand. And I go
- 2 back to my same point. Neither I nor anybody on
- 3 my team was aware that anyone was being paid to
- 4 appear on behalf of Entergy New Orleans.
- 5 And I will say it again. If I had
- 6 authorized that or anyone on my team had
- 7 authorized that, I would not be working for this
- 8 company at this particular time. Now, going a
- 9 step further and say I would have resigned
- 10 because I know I would have been terminated.
- 11 Q. And the money that Crowds on Demand
- 12 used came from Hawthorn, correct?
- 13 A. As best -- We didn't have a direct
- 14 relationship with them, so it would have had to
- 15 come from Hawthorn.
- 16 Q. And the money that Hawthorn used came
- 17 from ENO?
- 18 A. We paid Hawthorn. Yes.
- 19 O. Your CEO says -- and I'm quoting again
- 20 -- "It is a culture of integrity where our
- 21 employees are trusted to take the right actions,
- 22 even when there are no rules." You agree with
- 23 that?
- A. Yeah. Let me go back one part. So,
- 25 you were a military officer?

- 1 Q. No, I wasn't. I was -- I couldn't go
- 2 in the Air Force as an officer because I turned
- 3 down the commission.
- 4 A. Well, as a officer in the United
- 5 States Army, which I became at the age of 21,
- 6 you have two things. You actually have two
- 7 things in life, your integrity and your word.
- 8 And that's the environment that I was brought up
- 9 in, and that is what my parents taught me.
- So, again, acting with integrity is
- 11 extremely important. It's the same thing that I
- 12 teach my kids. So, I'll say it one more time.
- 13 If I or anyone on my team had acted in
- 14 compromising integrity, I wouldn't be sitting
- 15 here today, nor would they still be employed by
- 16 the company.
- So, for me as a person, integrity is
- 18 foremost and utmost. And I think I shared with
- 19 you about my son who is named after me. So, I
- 20 don't want to disparage my name, let alone my
- 21 father's name and put my son in a position where
- 22 he would suffer because of my actions.
- 23 Q. On Wednesday, I mentioned this off the
- 24 record. On Wednesday, at the end of our
- 25 conversations with Ms. Pollard, I had a

- 1 meltdown. I got really upset. And one of the
- 2 reasons I got upset is because of what you just
- 3 said; that is, my integrity was questioned and I
- 4 got very upset.
- 5 So, I can understand when you sit here
- 6 right now and be upset because the overall-ness
- 7 of this has been a question of your integrity.
- 8 I can truly understand that. I really can.
- 9 When I said this thing just now about
- 10 your CEO's comment and it ended with "even when
- 11 there are no rules, " the City Council doesn't
- 12 have any rules that say you cannot pay people to
- 13 come to a meeting and sit in their room; isn't
- 14 that correct? There's no rule that says you
- 15 can't; isn't that correct? Now, if it is, then
- 16 you broke a rule that -- So, I take it there is
- 17 no rule?
- 18 A. I am -- You know, Judge, I -- Yes, I
- 19 did work in city government. I'm not intimately
- 20 familiar with every single part of the New
- 21 Orleans city code, but I would have to probably
- 22 agree with your statement.
- Q. Because honestly, I don't know for a
- 24 fact that there are no rules that say that. But
- 25 I assume there are no, in fact, rules that say

- 1 you cannot pay people to come to a counsel
- 2 hearing and sit in the room. That's an
- 3 assumption I make.
- 4 I also assume there are no City
- 5 Council rules that say that you can't pay people
- 6 to come to a microphone and speak. That's an
- 7 assumption I make.
- 8 A. I'm not aware of any.
- 9 Q. All right. I'm not aware of any
- 10 either.
- 11 One of the things I saw in your Values
- 12 & Ethics was this statement. "Your code of
- 13 ethics gives some guidance when there might be a
- 14 risk of noncompliance with the code of ethics."
- 15 Is that correct? See, that's the statement, I
- 16 believe, in the code of ethics. It gives some
- 17 guidance. It gives some guidance that there
- 18 might be a risk of noncompliance. It gives
- 19 quidance, Charles?
- 20 A. Yes, sir.
- 21 Q. And one of the things it implies or it
- 22 even says is that there are actions you should
- 23 take to be sure you are not out of compliance.
- 24 There are actions. Investigate. Research. But
- 25 there are actions you should take when you're

- 1 outside of -- when you might be noncompliant,
- 2 might. That's your code of ethics, Charles; is
- 3 that accurate?
- 4 A. I mean, I'm not familiar with it word
- 5 for word. But if you're telling me you got that
- from my website and that's what it says, I'm not
- 7 going to disagree with you.
- 8 Q. If I give Cory money to do something
- 9 for me; and Cory gives money to Walter to do
- 10 that thing that I gave money to Cory to do; and
- 11 Walter takes the money and gives it to Judge
- 12 Alarcon; and Judge Alarcon comes forward, is it
- 13 conceivable, conceivable if I give money to
- 14 Cory, Judge Alarcon will happen? Is that
- 15 conceivable?
- 16 A. I'm not quite sure what you're asking
- 17 me. If you're asking me will Judge Alarcon do
- 18 whatever it was you asked Cory to do, if he
- 19 asked him to do it, then depending on the
- 20 Judge's ethics and constitution, he may do it.
- 21 I mean, just because there is flexibility in
- 22 rules, you also always have your own moral
- 23 compass and your own ethics and integrity.
- 24 And that's something that I think most
- 25 people that I work with strive to do, is to act

- 1 with integrity and to act within their moral
- 2 compass.
- 3 And I think if you were to study --
- 4 not to get on my soapbox here -- my career and
- 5 what I've done throughout my life, I've always
- 6 acted and done what I thought was the right
- 7 thing. Now, you may not necessarily agree with
- 8 it being the right thing. But I don't think
- 9 I've ever been in a situation where --
- 10 Q. Sometimes, Charles, you make mistakes.
- 11 Sometimes that's just a part of doing. I make
- 12 mistakes.
- 13 A. People make mistakes every day.
- 14 Q. All the time. That's just a part of
- 15 doing.
- 16 A. It's a part of life.
- 17 Q. And in our profession, the legal
- 18 profession, there's always that piece that talks
- 19 about appearance, the appearance of impropriety.
- 20 There's always that piece. And the thing that
- 21 we as lawyers are supposed to avoid, utmostly
- 22 avoid, is the appearance of impropriety, not
- 23 necessarily the doing, but the appearance.
- 24 Would you agree with that?
- 25 A. I agree with that statement.

CHARLES RICE

1 More than one person who was in this Q.

- 2 room working for Entergy -- Let me back up for a
- You play golf, right? 3 second.
- 4 Α. Yes, sir.
- 5 You like the game? Q.
- 6 Love the game. Α.
- 7 Q. I'm going to be honest with you. I
- play. I love golf courses. They're beautiful, 8
- beautiful places to be, unless the people who I 9
- 10 go out with don't necessarily like for me to
- come because you know I don't necessarily like 11
- 12 the game. I like to be drinking, and I like all
- 13 of that.
- 14 But people who play, they don't
- 15 necessarily play against each other. They play
- against themselves. This is what I hear from 16
- 17 golfers. They're trying to better their play
- 18 from another day on the same course. But this
- 19 time I shot 100, now I want to do 95, that kind
- 20 of thing. So, they're playing against
- themselves. Would that be an accurate statement 21
- 22 about golf?
- 23 Depending on your perspective, it Α.
- could be. 24
- 25 Q. Well, who do you -- when you play

CHARLES RICE OCCODET 13, 2010

- 1 golf, are you playing against yourself?
- 2 A. Depends on who I'm playing against.
- 3 Q. Well, some people you got money up on,
- 4 and you want to beat them straight up.
- 5 A. It depends on who I'm playing with.
- 6 Q. I used to play with a little bat. And
- 7 this is what irritated others. I would play
- 8 with them. I would carry a little bat, and I
- 9 would irritate. I'd hit the ball with the bat.
- 10 That's the kind of guy I am.
- 11 Do you play tennis?
- 12 A. I actually grew up playing tennis.
- 13 Q. And tennis, you're playing directly
- 14 against someone, correct?
- 15 A. Uh-huh (AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE).
- 16 Q. I mean, you got somebody on the other
- 17 side of the net you are playing against.
- 18 A. Yeah.
- 19 O. And in tennis, you have this thing
- 20 called "unforced error," right? What's an
- 21 unforced error in tennis?
- 22 A. Depends on the sport. It could be --
- 23 O. Well, in tennis, because they always
- 24 use it in tennis. That was an unforced error.
- 25 I love tennis. I mean, I want to go to watch

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

- 1 the U.S. Open.
- 2. If somebody hits a good shot and you
- hit into the net, and that could be because you 3
- 4
- That's not unforced error, right? 5 Q.
- I don't know. You're going to have to 6 Α.
- 7 explain to me what an unforced error is.
- Well, when you're doing that lob, and 8 Q.
- it's perfectly situated for you to go left or 9
- 10 right or straight down the middle with it, but
- 11 it's perfect. It's in the air. You're
- 12 situated. It's perfectly there for you to do
- it, and it's going to be the winning shot and 13
- 14 you hit it directly in the net. Some people
- 15 call that "an unforced error." Would that be
- 16 accurate to say?
- 17 Α. I quess.
- 18 Ο. Two people came here who worked for
- 19 Entergy, and this same conversation, at least a
- 20 lot of it we've had with you, we had with them.
- 21 And separately, they both called what happened
- 22 with Hawthorn, what happened with Crowds on
- 23 Demand, what happened with this thing that went
- 24 on from October 16th to March 8th, they
- described it as an unforced error. That's how 25

- 1 they described it. Would you agree with that?
- 2 A. I'm not sure what they meant by
- 3 "unforced error." I mean, all I can tell you on
- 4 that, Judge, is there's no way, shape, or form
- 5 that I ever thought that Hawthorn retained
- 6 Crowds on Demand, nor did I ever think or ever
- 7 contemplated Hawthorn retaining Crowds on Demand
- 8 and paying people to show up at that meeting.
- 9 That is not anything that I -- And I'm
- 10 assuming no one on my team anticipated that
- 11 could possibly be what they meant by an unforced
- 12 error.
- 13 Q. Did you ever tell any of those direct
- 14 reports you describe who directly reported to
- 15 you, did you ever tell any one of them or
- 16 Suzanne Hammelman or John Ashford not to take
- 17 the money we are giving Hawthorn -- not to take
- 18 a dollar of it and give it to anyone else to do
- 19 anything? Did you ever say those words to
- 20 anyone at Entergy or outside of Entergy at
- 21 Hawthorn?
- 22 A. Well, I only had one direct
- 23 conversation with Mr. Ashford where he made a
- 24 presentation. I didn't have any direct
- 25 conversations with Ms. Hammelman. Third, the

- 1 contract specifically states that they were not
- 2 supposed to hire a subcontractor without our
- 3 permission.
- 4 So, again, I wouldn't anticipate nor
- 5 contemplate that they would go out and hire a
- 6 third party to pay people to show up at the
- 7 meeting. It's just something that never
- 8 occurred to me, never occurred to me that it was
- 9 a possibility, never occurred to me that it was
- 10 even in the universe of possibilities.
- 11 Q. So, the answer is no?
- 12 A. Again, I never had a conversation with
- 13 Ms. -- What's her last name?
- 14 Q. Hammelman.
- 15 A. Hammelman. I had one conversation
- 16 where Mr. Ashford did his presentation. And
- 17 nobody on my team -- Or there was never any
- 18 meeting or never ever a discussion where any of
- 19 us even thought or contemplated paying people to
- 20 show up at a meeting. So, there was no need for
- 21 me to have that conversation.
- Q. I'm going to do something that the
- 23 people on this side the table are not going to
- 24 appreciate. I talked to John Ashford, and I'm
- 25 assuming they know that. Because this is how

- 1 Cal rolls. I assume there are no secrets. See,
- 2 I assume that.
- 3 And I was impressed with him. He's my
- 4 kind of guy. I saw him on the website, yeah, on
- 5 the website. I didn't see him beyond that. But
- 6 I assume he's large in stature. He's a country
- 7 quy. He's like me. You know, he can tell a
- 8 good story. He can do all that kind of stuff
- 9 that country people like me do. And that's the
- 10 guy I talked to on the phone.
- 11 And I looked at his -- And looking at
- 12 the website and the description of him, which
- 13 again, he's kind of described in that fashion,
- 14 he's well educated, very well educated. But
- 15 that's his take. That's how he goes. That's
- 16 his personality. He is renowned in terms of
- 17 business. If you Google John Ashford, he's
- 18 renowned in terms of business.
- 19 And he grew up with another guy, Nat
- 20 Reese. If you Google Nat Reese, I mean, these
- 21 two guys are movers and shakers across
- 22 corporations, across political entities, across
- 23 entities like Entergy. John Ashford is a mover
- 24 and a shaker. Would you agree with that?
- 25 A. I mean, I'm not that familiar with his

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1 background. But if you said he's world

- renowned, that's --2.
- You know --3 Ο.
- 4 -- or nationally renowned, then I
- assume that to be the case, which is why I think 5
- it would be fair for somebody to assume that he 6
- 7 would conduct himself appropriately, along with
- other members of his organization. 8
- One of the interesting things that 9 Ο.
- 10 have come out here is that what few, if anyone,
- 11 at Entergy actually did what I just said.
- 12 What's that? Α.
- 13 Google John Ashford, Hawthorn. I Ο.
- mean, just do a little Google search. It's just 14
- 15 so interesting in terms of the people we have
- 16 talked to that that hasn't come out; that is, is
- 17 that, well, we just out of caution, we looked up
- 18 Hawthorn to see what they were about. I didn't
- 19 talk to a person from Entergy who said they did
- 20 that. Did you do that? I don't think -- The
- 21 answer is no, because you actually already said
- 22 no, you didn't.
- 23 I didn't. But he had done work for Α.
- 24 the company previously and apparently had done a
- 25 good job.

- 1 Q. Did Hawthorn or any other entity
- 2 similar did this kind of work for ENO before,
- 3 specifically?
- 4 A. I had never hired Hawthorn.
- 5 Q. Well, no, not only just Hawthorn, but
- 6 any entity similarly structured as Hawthorn do
- 7 this kind of work?
- 8 A. To do community outreach?
- 9 Q. No. No. Get money from ENO to get
- 10 people to come to a council meeting and to speak
- 11 at a microphone, specifically, any entity ever.
- 12 A. Are you asking me if ENO ever paid
- 13 people to show up at a meeting? Is that your
- 14 question?
- 15 Q. I'm not -- No. I'm not saying --
- 16 A. I'm trying to understand your
- 17 question.
- 18 Q. For purposes of this question, I'm not
- 19 asking that.
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 Q. For purposes of this question, I'm
- 22 only asking, has Entergy ever in the past paid
- 23 someone like Hawthorn to do what you paid
- 24 Hawthorn to do?
- 25 A. To help get grassroots support?

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 You paid Hawthorn. The menu that Matt Q.

- 2 went through, you paid Hawthorn to have people
- come and have people speak. I'm not saying in 3
- 4 terms of this question that you paid the people
- to do anything. I'm saying you paid Hawthorn to 5
- do those things. That's a fact, isn't it? 6
- 7 Α. No, it's not a fact. With all due
- 8 respect --
- 9 I give up. If that's not a fact, I've 0.
- 10 got to give up.
- 11 With all due respect, we retained Α.
- Hawthorn to do grassroots outreach. We didn't 12
- 13 pay Hawthorn or retain Hawthorn to pay people to
- show up at a meeting. That was not why Hawthorn 14
- 15 was retained. Hawthorn was retained to identify
- 16 people in the community that would be supportive
- 17 of safe, reliable power, economic development,
- 18 all the things that we were trying to do to
- better this community. 19
- 20 I'm just going to leave it alone after Ο.
- 21 this. But if I have a point -- And in life I
- have been pointless. If I have a point, my 22
- 23 point is that what you gave a contract to
- 24 Hawthorn to do, Entergy had never done that
- before. And if Entergy had ever done it before, 25

- 1 tell me when those instances or instance was.
- 2 A. Again, the contract was for grassroot
- 3 support.
- 4 Q. Charles, the contract that you gave to
- 5 Hawthorn --
- 6 A. It was to identify supporters.
- 7 Q. I don't care what it was. Have you
- 8 ever done that before with any entity whatsoever
- 9 other than Hawthorn ever, ENO ever doing
- 10 anything like that before in the history of ENO?
- 11 A. I can't speak for the entire history
- 12 of Entergy New Orleans --
- 13 Q. I hear you.
- 14 A. -- which has been around for almost --
- 15 I guess since the turn of the century.
- 16 BY JUDGE JOHNSON:
- 17 I quess I have made this long
- 18 story longer. I'm done. I'm done.
- 19 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 20 Q. I just have a couple of follow-ups.
- 21 So, prior to the October 16, 2017 meeting, the
- 22 orange T-shirt photograph, Mr. Rice, that we
- 23 were discussing before, did you ever -- did you
- or anyone else with Entergy ever use the phrase
- 25 "cascading outages"?

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 Cascading outages? I mean, that was Α.

- 2. part of the testimony that was filed with regard
- to the need for the power plant to prevent 3
- 4 cascading outages.
- In fact, I think you referenced that a 5 O.
- couple of times in your December testimony, 6
- 7 cascading outages. Does that sound familiar?
- My testimony at the evidentiary 8 Α.
- 9 hearing?
- 10 Ο. Yes, sir.
- 11 I'm sure I said that. Α.
- 12 Ο. And let me see -- Could I borrow your
- 13 stash right quick?
- 14 Α. Sure.
- 15 Ο. Oh, and real quick, the meeting was on
- October 16, 2017. We've seen the e-mail traffic 16
- 17 starting in kind of August of 2017 between
- 18 Entergy and the Hawthorn Group. If I told you
- that the contract was not executed until 19
- 20 Halloween, October 31st of last year, 2017,
- 21 would you have any cause to disbelieve my
- 22 assertion?
- 23 Α. If that's what the document says,
- 24 that's what the document says.
- 25 BY MR. COMAN:

- 1 Let's take a five-minute break.
- 2 (BREAK TAKEN)
- 3 EXAMINATION BY MR. COMAN:
- 4 Q. Going back on the record, Exhibit 68,
- 5 it looks like maybe the third page here,
- 6 Mr. Wood, this individual, you testified earlier
- 7 you don't know who he is, correct?
- 8 A. I don't know who he is.
- 9 Q. And this was a meeting that you
- 10 attended and observed speakers, correct?
- 11 A. I'm sure I was there.
- 12 Q. He used the phrase "cascading
- 13 outages." Did you notice that at the time when
- 14 he said it?
- 15 A. No. I may not even been in the room
- 16 when he spoke.
- 17 Q. And Mr. Hampton, who's from Marrero,
- 18 you identified him earlier as somebody that you
- 19 recognize from somewhere. He also used the
- 20 phrase "cascading outages." Did you see that at
- 21 the time it occurred?
- 22 A. I have no recollection.
- 23 Q. And do you agree or disagree with the
- 24 following statement: "Astroturfing is a serious
- 25 threat to public discourse"?

October 15, 2018 CHARLES RICE

1 I don't know what type of public Α.

- 2. discourse you're talking about.
- Public debate. 3 Ο.
- 4 Let me say this. I would hope that no
- one on the City Council made their decision 5
- based upon how many people showed up at that 6
- meeting on one side or the other. I would hope 7
- that any politician, when he has to make a 8
- decision, is basing that decision on whatever 9
- 10 evidence that's presented to them and based upon
- 11 what he or she feels is the right thing to do
- 12 for their constituents.
- 13 I don't know who made that statement
- about astroturfing. I don't want to get into a 14
- 15 debate because I'm not a political science
- 16 professor, nor am I an expert in what
- 17 constitutes appropriate public discourse.
- 18 But I will just leave it with saying I
- would hope that the council members that voted 19
- 20 for or against this project based their decision
- 21 on the information and evidence that was
- 22 presented and not based upon how many people
- 23 showed up at a meeting in favor of one side or
- the other. 24
- Right. And I'm not asking for a 25 Q.

- 1 political science expert opinion. I'm saying
- 2 Charles Rice's opinion. That's what I'm looking
- 3 for here. The ENO president and CEO, although
- 4 former, do you agree or disagree, quote,
- 5 astroturfing is a serious threat to public
- 6 discourse or public debate?
- 7 A. Mr. Coman, I'll just tell you the
- 8 truth. I don't think that's appropriate for me
- 9 to answer. And I could be getting myself in hot
- 10 water one way or the other, but I just don't
- 11 think it's appropriate for me to opine one way
- 12 or the other.
- But I will tell you and I will say it
- 14 again. I'm sure this has occurred or occurs in
- 15 other places. I don't know what the impact that
- 16 it's had on other things, but there are
- 17 politicians that pay people every election
- 18 season to come out and wave signs in support.
- 19 So, is that considered a detriment to public
- 20 discourse? Is that considered where someone is
- 21 attempting to lie to people and feigh their
- 22 support? That's not for me to say.
- BY MR. COMAN:
- 24 Unless the investigators have
- any additional questions, this will

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1	conclude Mr. Rice's sworn statement.
2	We thank you for your time.
3	[WHEREUPON THE SWORN STATEMENT WAS CONCLUDED]
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

1	REPORTER'S PAGE					
2						
3	I, Leslie L. Nicosia, Certified Court					
4	Reporter, in and for the State of Louisiana, the					
5	officer, as defined in Rule 28 of the Federal					
6	Rules of Civil Procedure and/or Article 1434 (B)					
7	of the Louisiana Code of Civil Procedure, before					
8	whom this sworn testimony was taken, do hereby					
9	state on the record;					
10	That due to the interaction and the					
11	spontaneous discourse of this proceeding, dashes					
12	() have been used to indicate pauses, changes					
13	in thought, and/or talk-overs; that same is the					
14	proper method for a court reporter's					
15	transcription of proceeding, and that the dashes					
16	() do not indicate that words or phrases have					
17	been left out of this transcript; that any words					
18	and/or names which could not be verified through					
19	reference material have been denoted with the					
20	phrase "phonetically spelled."					
21						
22	I and i a Ni namin C C D					
23	Leslie L. Nicosia, C.C.R.					
24						
25						

CHARLES RICE October 15, 2018

Τ	CERTIFICATE
2	This certification is valid only for a transcript with my original signature and original required seal on this page.
3	
4	I, LESLIE L. NICOSIA, Certified Court Reporter in and for the State of Louisiana, the "Officer" before whom this sworn testimony was taken, do hereby certify:
5	That CHARLES RICE, to whom oath was administered by me
6	upon authority of R.S. 37:2554, did testify as herein set forth in the foregoing pages;
7	
8	That this proceeding and testimony was reported by me in stenotype method, was prepared and transcribed by me or under my personal direction and supervision, and is a true and correct transcript to the best of my ability and
	understanding;
10	
	That this transcript has been prepared in compliance with
11	transcript format guidelines required by statute or rules of the Board, and I am informed about the complete arrangement,
12	financial or otherwise, with the person or entity making arrangements for deposition services;
13	
14	That I have acted in compliance with the prohibition on contractual relationships as defined by Louisiana Code of Civil Procedure Article 1434 and in rules and advisory
15	opinions of the Board;
16	That I have no actual knowledge of any prohibited
17	employment or contractual relationship, direct or indirect, between a court reporting firm and any party litigant in this matter, nor is there any such relationship between myself and
18	a party litigant in this matter;
19	That I am not related to counsel or to the parties herein, nor am I otherwise interested in the outcome of this
20	matter.
21	
0.0	
22	LESLIE L. NICOSIA, CCR Cert. No. 95004
23	
24	
25	