

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:00-cv-01472-JDB**

NAJJAR v. ASHCROFT, et al
Assigned to: Judge John D. Bates
Demand: \$0
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 06/21/2000
Date Terminated: 03/31/2005
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

MAZEN AL NAJJAR

represented by **Joseph C. Hohenstein**
Nationalities Service center
1300 Spruce Street
Philadelphia, PA 19107
(215) 893-8400
Fax: 215-735-9718
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark E. Nagle
MARRIOTT VACATIONS
WORLDWIDE CORPORATION
Vice Presidents & Assistant General
Counsel
6649 Westwood Boulevard
Orlando, FL 32821
(407) 529-2587
Fax: (407) 206-6420
Email: mark.nagle@mvmc.com
TERMINATED: 06/21/2000
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven H. Schulman
AKIN, GUMP, STRAUSS, HAUER
&FELD, LLP
1333 New Hampshire Avenue
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 887-4071
Fax: (202) 887-4288
Email: sschulman@akingump.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

JANET RENO
Attorney General
TERMINATED: 03/02/2001

represented by **Paul A. Mussenden**
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
555 Fourth Street, NW
Room E-4812
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 305-4740
Fax: (202) 514-8780
Email: Paul.Mussenden@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

DORIS MEISSNER
*Commissioner, Immigration and
 Naturalization Service*

represented by **Paul A. Mussenden**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

PAUL SCHMIDT
*Chair, Executive Office for Immigration
 Review*

represented by **Paul A. Mussenden**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

ROBERT WALLIS
*District Director, Immigration and
 Naturalization Service, Miami Office*

represented by **Paul A. Mussenden**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

LOUIS J. FREEH
*Director, Federal Bureau of
 Investigations*

represented by **Paul A. Mussenden**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

UNKNOWN AGENCY

represented by **Mark E. Nagle**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Paul A. Mussenden
 (See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

JOHN ASHCROFT
Attorney General

represented by **Mark E. Nagle**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Paul A. Mussenden
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**IMMIGRATION
 & NATURALIZATION SERVICE**

represented by **Paul A. Mussenden**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
06/21/2000	1	COMPLAINT filed by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR; exhibits (11) (ab) (Entered: 06/27/2000)
06/21/2000		SUMMONS (6) issued to federal party(s) defendant JANET RENO, defendant DORIS MEISSNER, defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, defendant ROBERT WALLIS, defendant LOUIS J. FREEH , and non-party: U.S. Attorney (ab) (Entered: 06/27/2000)

06/22/2000	<u>2</u>	MOTION filed by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR for Joseph C. Hohenstein to appear pro hac vice (Nationalities Service Center, 1300 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107, (215) 893-8400) (ab) (Entered: 06/27/2000)
06/26/2000	<u>3</u>	ORDER by Judge Royce C. Lamberth : granting motion for Joseph C. Hohenstein to appear pro hac vice (Nationalities Service Center, 1300 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107, (215) 893-8400) [2-1] by MAZEN AL NAJJAR (N) (mon) Modified on 06/28/2000 (Entered: 06/28/2000)
07/12/2000	4	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney on 6/26/00; Exhibits (5) (tth) (Entered: 07/13/2000)
07/12/2000	5	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney General on 6/26/00 (tth) (Entered: 07/13/2000)
07/12/2000	6	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 6/26/00 upon federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER (tth) (Entered: 07/13/2000)
07/12/2000	7	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 6/26/00 upon federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH (tth) (Entered: 07/13/2000)
07/19/2000	<u>8</u>	STIPULATION filed and fiated by Judge Royce C. Lamberth regarding extending federal defendants' time to respond to complaint to 9/19/00. (N) (mon) (Entered: 07/19/2000)
07/20/2000	9	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for federal defendants by Paul Mussenden (tth) (Entered: 07/21/2000)
07/25/2000	10	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on (undated) upon federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS; Exhibit (1) (tth) (Entered: 07/26/2000)
09/19/2000	11	MOTION filed by federal defendant to extend time to 1/17/01 to respond to Plaintiff's Freedom of Information Act Complaint (tth) (Entered: 09/20/2000)
10/06/2000	12	RESPONSE by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR in opposition to motion to extend time to 1/17/01 to respond to Plaintiff's Freedom of Information Act Complaint [11-1] by LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO; exhibit (1). (ag) (Entered: 10/10/2000)
10/06/2000	13	MOTION filed by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR to produce documents , and for Vaughn Index (ag) (Entered: 10/10/2000)
10/20/2000	14	MOTION filed by federal defendant JANET RENO, federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH to extend time to 10/26/00 within which to reply to Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion for enlargement of time to Answer Plaintiff's Complaints (hsj) Modified on 10/24/2000 (Entered: 10/23/2000)
10/26/2000	15	REPLY by federal defendants JANET RENO, DORIS MEISSNER, PAUL SCHMIDT, ROBERT WALLIS, and LOUIS J. FREEH to response in opposition to motion to extend time to 10/26/00 within which to reply to Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion for enlargement of time to Answer Plaintiff's Complaints [14-1] by LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO (ag) (Entered: 10/27/2000)
10/26/2000	16	ANSWER TO COMPLAINT [1-1] by federal defendants. (jf) (Entered: 11/01/2000)
11/21/2000	<u>17</u>	ORDER by Judge Royce C. Lamberth : granting motion to extend time to 10/26/00 within which to reply to Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendant's Motion for enlargement of time to Answer Plaintiff's Complaints [14-1] by LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO (N) (lin) (Entered: 11/21/2000)
11/21/2000	<u>18</u>	ORDER by Judge Royce C. Lamberth : denying motion to produce documents [13-1] by MAZEN AL NAJJAR, denying motion for Vaughn Index [13-2] by

		MAZEN AL NAJJAR, dismissing motion to extend time to 1/17/01 to respond to Plaintiff's Freedom of Information Act Complaint by LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO [11-1] Status Report due: 11/28/00 (N) (lin) (Entered: 11/21/2000)
11/28/2000	19	MEET AND CONFER STATEMENT/REPORT PURSUANT TO L.R. 16 filed by plaintiff, federal defendants and defendant. (tth) (Entered: 11/29/2000)
12/04/2000	<u>20</u>	ORDER by Judge Royce C. Lamberth: that the federal defendants will file a Vaughn Index on or before 2/9/01; FURTHER ORDERED cross motions due 3/9/01 ; response to cross motions due 4/9/01 ; reply to cross motions due 4/23/01 ; (N) (gdf) (Entered: 12/05/2000)
02/06/2001	21	MOTION filed by federal defendants JANET RENO, DORIS MEISSNER, PAUL SCHMIDT, ROBERT WALLIS, and LOUIS J. FREEH to modify the 12/1/00 scheduling order ; Exhibits (6); Declarations (2) (ag) (Entered: 02/07/2001)
02/20/2001	22	RESPONSE by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR in opposition to motion to modify the 12/1/00 scheduling order [21-1] by LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO; Exhibits (2). (jdm) (Entered: 02/21/2001)
03/02/2001	23	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT, substituting John Ashcroft for Janet Reno, pursuant to Fed.R.Civ.P. 25(d)(1). (tth) (Entered: 03/05/2001)
03/02/2001	24	REPLY by federal defendant to response in opposition to motion to modify the 12/1/00 scheduling order [21-1] by LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO; Exhibits (3) (ag) (Entered: 03/13/2001)
05/23/2001	25	MOTION filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH, defendant UNKNOWN AGENCY, federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT to extend time to 6/14/01 to file appropriate Vaughn declarations and a dispositive motion (cas) (Entered: 05/25/2001)
05/23/2001	26	MOTION filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH, defendant UNKNOWN AGENCY, federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT to stay proceedings as to MAZEN AL NAJJAR ASHCROFT (cas) (Entered: 05/25/2001)
06/01/2001	27	RESPONSE by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR in opposition to motion to stay proceedings as to MAZEN AL NAJJAR ASHCROFT [26-1] by federal defendant, defendant, federal defendant, motion to extend time to 6/14/01 to file appropriate Vaughn declarations and a dispositive motion [25-1] by federal defendant, defendant, federal defendant; exhibit's (2) (cas) (Entered: 06/06/2001)
06/12/2001	28	REPLY by federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT in opposition to motion to stay proceedings as to MAZEN AL NAJJAR ASHCROFT [26-1] by federal defendant, defendant, federal defendant, motion to extend time to 6/14/01 to file appropriate Vaughn declarations and a dispositive motion [25-1] by federal defendant, defendant, federal defendant . (cas) (Entered: 06/14/2001)
06/14/2001	29	MOTION filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH, defendant UNKNOWN AGENCY, federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT to extend time to 6/21/01 to file their Vaughn declarations and dispositive motions (cas) (Entered: 06/19/2001)
06/14/2001	30	MOTION filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH, defendant UNKNOWN AGENCY, federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT to dismiss , or in the alternative for summary judgment ; exhibit's (3) (cas) (Entered: 06/19/2001)

06/14/2001	31	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH of in camera and ex parte submission (cjp) (Entered: 06/21/2001)
06/21/2001	32	MOTION filed by federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH to extend time to 6/28/01 to file vaughn index and dispositive motions (jf) (Entered: 06/22/2001)
06/21/2001	33	MOTION filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER to extend time to 7/17/01 to file vaughn index and dispositive motions (jf) (Entered: 06/22/2001)
06/22/2001	34	MOTION filed by defendant EOIR (Executive Office of Immigration Review) to extend time to 6/28/01 to file its Vaughn declaration and dispositive motion (cas) (Entered: 06/26/2001)
06/27/2001	35	MOTION filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER to extend time to 6/29/01 to file vaughn declaration and dispositive motion (tb) (Entered: 06/29/2001)
06/28/2001	36	MOTION (PARTIAL) filed by federal defendant to dismiss complaint [1-1] , or, in the alternative for summary judgment on behalf of the EXEC OFFC OF IMMIGRATION REVIEW ; exhibit (1) (tb) (Entered: 06/29/2001)
06/28/2001	37	RESPONSE by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR in opposition to motion to dismiss complaint [1-1] [36-1] by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, motion for summary judgment on behalf of the EXEC OFFC OF IMMIGRATION REVIEW [36-2] by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER . (tb) (Entered: 07/03/2001)
06/28/2001	38	RESPONSE by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR in opposition to motion to extend time to 6/29/01 to file vaughn declaration and dispositive motion [35-1] by DORIS MEISSNER, motion to extend time to 7/17/01 to file vaughn index and dispositive motions [33-1] by DORIS MEISSNER, motion to extend time to 6/28/01 to file vaughn index and dispositive motions [32-1] by LOUIS J. FREEH, motion to dismiss [30-1] by federal defendant, defendant, federal defendant . (tb) (Entered: 07/03/2001)
06/29/2001	39	MOTION (PARTIAL) filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH, defendant UNKNOWN AGENCY, federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT for summary judgment on behalf of the Federal Bureau of Investigation ; exhibit's (2) (cas) (Entered: 07/05/2001)
07/06/2001	40	REPLY by federal defendants DORIS MEISSNER, PAUL SCHMIDT, ROBERT WALLIS, LOUIS J. FREEH, JOHN ASHCROFT to response in opposition to motion to dismiss complaint [1-1] [36-1] by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, motion for summary judgment on behalf of the EXEC OFFC OF IMMIGRATION REVIEW [36-2] by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER (aet) (Entered: 07/09/2001)
07/17/2001	41	MOTION filed by federal defendant INS to extend time to 9/6/01 to file it's Vaughn declaration and dispositive motion (cas) (Entered: 07/18/2001)
07/17/2001	42	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH, defendant UNKNOWN AGENCY, federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT, federal defendant INS that on 6/29/01 the Supreme Court denied government's petition for certiorari in Maydak v. U.S. Department of Jusitce. (cas) (Entered: 07/18/2001)
07/17/2001	43	MOTION filed by federal defendant DORIS MEISSNER, federal defendant PAUL SCHMIDT, federal defendant ROBERT WALLIS, federal defendant LOUIS J. FREEH, defendant UNKNOWN AGENCY, federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT, federal defendant INS to withdraw motion to stay proceedings as to MAZEN AL NAJJAR ASHCROFT [26-1] (cas) (Entered: 07/18/2001)

07/27/2001	44	MOTION filed by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR for more specific Vaughn Indices , and for enlargement of time to respond to defendant's partial motions for summary judgemnt ; exhibit's (11) (cas) (Entered: 07/30/2001)
09/06/2001	45	MOTION filed by federal defendant INS to extend time to 10/31/01 to file its Vaughn declaration and dispositive motion ; Exhibit (1) (tth) (Entered: 09/07/2001)
09/27/2001	<u>46</u>	ORDER by Judge Royce C. Lamberth : granting motion to extend time to 10/31/01 to file its Vaughn declaration and dispositive motion [45-1] by INS; a futher scheduling order forthcoming dealing with all outstanding motions (N) (tb) (Entered: 09/27/2001)
10/31/2001	47	MOTION filed by federal defendant INS to extend time to 11/14/01 to file its Vaugh declaration and dispositive motion (tth) (Entered: 11/01/2001)
11/16/2001	48	MOTION filed by federal defendant for partial summary judgment on behalf of the Immigration and Naturalization Service ; Exhibits (5); Declarations (1) (ag) (Entered: 11/19/2001)
11/30/2001	49	MOTION filed by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR for Vaughn Index , and to extend time to 1/31/02 to respond to defendant INS partial motion for summary judgment (cas) (Entered: 12/03/2001)
02/12/2002		CASE REASSIGNED to Judge John D. Bates (aet) (Entered: 02/15/2002)
09/03/2002	<u>50</u>	ORDER by Judge John D. Bates : directing plaintiff to file with Court and serve defendants a statement no laterthank 09/10/02 to show why this case should not be dismissed as moot [50-1] (N) (tb) Modified on 09/03/2002 (Entered: 09/03/2002)
09/10/2002	51	RESPONSE by plaintiff MAZEN AL NAJJAR to order to show cause dated 8/30/02 [50-2] (rje) (Entered: 09/11/2002)
07/22/2003	<u>52</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION by Judge John D. Bates (N) (tb) (Entered: 07/22/2003)
07/22/2003	<u>53</u>	ORDER by Judge John D. Bates : granting in part, denying in part motion for Vaughn Index [49-1], denying without prejudice to renewal motion for partial summary judgment on behalf of the Immigration and Naturalization Service [48-1] by federal defendants, granting in part, denying in part motion for more specific Vaughn Indices [44-1], denying without prejudice for renewal motion for summary judgment on behalf of the Federal Bureau of Investigation [39-1] by federal defendant and defendant, denying without prejudice for renewal motion for summary judgment on behalf of the EXEC OFFC OF IMMIGRATION REVIEW [36-2] by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, ROBERT WALLIS, PAUL SCHMIDT, DORIS MEISSNER, denying without prejudice to renewal motion summary judgment [30-2] by federal defendant, defendant, dispositive motions due 10/20/03 ; (N) (tb) (Entered: 07/22/2003)
10/20/2003	54	MOTION filed by federal defendant to extend time to file renewed partial motions for summary judgment pursuant to 7/22/03 order until 1/21/04 for the unknown agency and 3/22/04 for the FBI, DHS and DOJ Criminal Division (mpt) (Entered: 10/22/2003)
10/20/2003	55	MOTION (RENEWED PARTIAL) filed by federal defendant JOHN ASHCROFT (DOJ/CRD) to dismiss , or in the alternative for summary judgment ; declaration (1) (mpt) (Entered: 10/22/2003)
10/22/2003	<u>56</u>	ORDER by Judge John D. Bates : granting motion to extend time to file renewed partial motions for summary judgment pursuant to 7/22/03 order until 1/21/04 for the unknown agency and 3/22/04 for the FBI, DHS and DOJ Criminal Division [54-1] by DORIS MEISSNER; dispositive motions due by 3/22/04 ; motion for summary judgment due by 1/21/04 ; (N) (tb) (Entered: 10/22/2003)
01/20/2004	<u>57</u>	Second MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Renewed (Partial) Motions for Summary Judgment</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 01/20/2004)
01/21/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>57</u> defendants' motion for extension of time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further

		ORDERED that defendant Executive Office of Immigration Review shall file its motion for partial summary judgment by not later than January 29, 2004, and defendant Unknown Agency shall file its motion for partial summary judgment by not later than February 20, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 01/21/04. (Entered: 01/21/2004)
01/29/2004	<u>58</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>on behalf of Classifying Agency</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, DORIS MEISSNER, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY, ROBERT WALLIS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 01/29/2004)
01/30/2004	<u>59</u>	Second MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Submit In Camera and Ex Parte Version of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment on Behalf of the Unknown Agency</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY, ROBERT WALLIS. (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 01/30/2004)
02/02/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>59</u> defendants' consent motion for enlargement of time to make an in camera, ex parte submission of a renewed motion for partial summary judgment and of the entire record in this case, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that defendants shall make an in camera, ex parte submission of the renewed motion for partial summary judgment by not later than February 3, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 02/01/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 02/02/2004)
02/03/2004	<u>60</u>	NOTICE by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, DORIS MEISSNER, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY, ROBERT WALLIS of <i>In Camera and Ex Parte Submission</i> (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 02/03/2004)
03/22/2004	<u>61</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Dispositive Motions</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY, ROBERT WALLIS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 03/22/2004)
03/23/2004	<u>62</u>	MOTION to Dismiss by <i>Department of Justice, EOUSA and Criminal Division</i> , MOTION for Summary Judgment by LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY, ROBERT WALLIS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Beck Declaration# <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex 1 to Beck Declaration# <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex 2 to Beck Declaration# <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex 3 to Beck Declaration# <u>5</u> Affidavit Luczynski Declaration# <u>6</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 03/23/2004)
03/26/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>61</u> defendants' consent motion for an extension of time to file dispositive motions, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that defendants EOUSA and the Department of Justice shall file their dispositive motions by not later than March 23, 2004, defendant EOIR shall file its renewed dispositive motion by not later than April 9, 2004, and defendants DHS/INS shall file their renewed dispositive motions by not later than May 12, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 03/26/04. (lcjdb2,) (Entered: 03/26/2004)
04/06/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: It is hereby ORDERED that defendant FBI shall file its renewed dispositive motion by not later than May 12, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 04/06/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 04/06/2004)
04/06/2004	<u>63</u>	NOTICE by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, JANET RENO AND <i>REPORT TO THE COURT REGARDING DEFENDANT DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, CRIMINAL DIVISION</i> (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 04/06/2004)
04/07/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: In light of <u>63</u> the notice and report regarding defendant Department of Justice, Criminal Division, it is hereby ORDERED that the Criminal Division shall report on the status of its review of the additional classified documents received from the Counterterrorism Section of the Criminal Division

		and propose a course of action by not later than April 26, 2004; and it is further ORDERED that the Criminal Division shall by that time have made a determination as to whether the documents are duplicates of others already processed and included in the Vaughn index. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 04/07/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 04/07/2004)
04/09/2004	<u>64</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>or in the alternative</i> , MOTION for Summary Judgment by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY, ROBERT WALLIS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Declaration of Crystal Souza# <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 04/09/2004)
04/23/2004	<u>65</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>Regarding Defendant Department of Justice, Criminal Division</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, DORIS MEISSNER, JANET RENO, PAUL SCHMIDT, UNKNOWN AGENCY, ROBERT WALLIS. (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 04/23/2004)
05/12/2004	<u>66</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Dispositive Motions</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE, JANET RENO. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 05/12/2004)
05/13/2004	<u>67</u>	ORDER granting <u>66</u> motion for an extension of time and requiring plaintiff to respond to pending motions or otherwise show cause why such motions should not be granted. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 05/13/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 05/13/2004)
06/28/2004	<u>68</u>	ORDER granting motions to dismiss or for summary judgment filed by defendants John Ashcroft <u>55</u> , the classifying agency <u>58</u> , the Executive Office of United States Attorneys and the Criminal Division of the Department of Justice <u>62</u> , and the Executive Office of Immigration Review <u>64</u> . Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 06/28/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 06/28/2004)
06/28/2004	<u>69</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Renewed Dispositive Motions</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 06/28/2004)
07/01/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>69</u> the consent motion of defendants Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Investigation, and Department of Homeland Security for an extension of time to file their respective renewed motions for partial summary judgment, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that renewed motions for summary judgment shall be filed by not later than July 6, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 07/01/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 07/01/2004)
07/06/2004	<u>70</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Renewed Motion to Dismiss</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration# <u>2</u> Declaration- Exhibit A# <u>3</u> Declaration- Exhibit B# <u>4</u> Declaration- Exhibit C# <u>5</u> Exhibit D Cover Sheet# <u>6</u> Declaration Exhibit D-1# <u>7</u> Declaration Exhibit D-2# <u>8</u> Declaration Exhibit D-3# <u>9</u> Declaration Exhibit D-4# <u>10</u> Exhibit E)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 07/06/2004)
07/06/2004	<u>71</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Renewed Partial Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, JANET RENO. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 07/06/2004)
07/07/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>71</u> the motion of defendant Federal Bureau of Investigation for an enlargement of time to file its renewed motion for partial summary judgment, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that the Federal Bureau of Investigation shall file not more than two status reports regarding its progress toward a renewed motion for summary judgment, by not later than August 9, 2004, and September 7, 2004, respectively, and shall file its renewed motion by not later than October 16, 2004, unless otherwise ordered by the Court. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 07/07/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 07/07/2004)

07/09/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Status Reports due by 8/9/2004 and 09/07/04. Renewed Summary Judgment motions due by 10/16/2004. (tb) (Entered: 07/09/2004)
07/27/2004	<u>72</u>	First MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>file a supplemental dispositive motion</i> by UNKNOWN AGENCY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 07/27/2004)
07/27/2004	<u>73</u>	Supplemental MOTION for Summary Judgment by JOHN ASHCROFT, IMMIGRATION & NATURALIZATION SERVICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> McIntyre Declaration# <u>2</u> Exhibit #1-Criminal Div# <u>3</u> Exhibit #2-EOIR# <u>4</u> Exhibit #3-DHS-CIS# <u>5</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 07/27/2004)
07/28/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>72</u> the motion of defendant unknown agency for an extension of time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that the agency shall file its supplemental motion for summary judgment by not later than September 10, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 07/28/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 07/28/2004)
07/29/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Supplemental Summary Judgment motion due by 9/10/2004. (tb) (Entered: 07/29/2004)
09/07/2004	<u>74</u>	STATUS REPORT <i>on behalf of the FBI</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, JANET RENO. (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 09/07/2004)
09/09/2004	<u>75</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Supplemental Dispositive Motion on Behalf of Unknown Agency</i> by UNKNOWN AGENCY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 09/09/2004)
09/13/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>75</u> defendant Unknown Agency's motion for enlargement of time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED, and it is further ORDERED that defendant Unknown Agency shall file its supplemental motion for summary judgment by not later than September 22, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 9/13/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 09/13/2004)
09/13/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: defendant Unknown Agency's supplemental motion for summary judgment due by 9/22/2004. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 09/13/2004)
09/22/2004	<u>76</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>In Camera, Ex Parte Supplemental Dispositive Motion</i> by UNKNOWN AGENCY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 09/22/2004)
09/23/2004	<u>77</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>In Camera, Ex Parte Supplemental Dispositive Motion</i> by UNKNOWN AGENCY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 09/23/2004)
09/24/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>76</u> & <u>77</u> defendant Unknown Agency's motions for an extension of time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motions are GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that defendant Unknown Agency shall file its supplemental motion for summary judgment by not later than September 24, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 9/24/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 09/24/2004)
09/24/2004	<u>78</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Supplemental Motion for Summary Judgment (Public Record Version)</i> by UNKNOWN AGENCY. (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 09/24/2004)
09/24/2004	<u>79</u>	NOTICE by UNKNOWN AGENCY <i>of In Camera and Ex Parte Submission</i> (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 09/24/2004)
10/14/2004	<u>80</u>	ORDER to show cause by not later than October 29, 2004, why <u>70</u> the motion of defendant Department of Homeland Security to dismiss or, in the alternative, for summary judgment, and <u>73</u> the supplemental motion for summary judgment of defendants Departments of Justice et al., should not be granted at this time. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 10/14/2004. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 10/14/2004)
10/14/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Response to order to show cause by 10/29/2004. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 10/14/2004)

10/15/2004	<u>81</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Renewed Dispositive Motion</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, JANET RENO. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 10/15/2004)
10/18/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>81</u> defendants' motion for extension of time, it is hereby ORDERED that defendants' motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that defendant FBI shall file its renewed dispositive motion by not later than October 20, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 10/18/2004. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 10/18/2004)
10/18/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motion due by 10/20/2004. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 10/18/2004)
10/20/2004	<u>82</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Renewed Dispositive Motion</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, JANET RENO. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 10/20/2004)
10/26/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>82</u> defendants' motion for an extension of time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that defendant Federal Bureau of Investigation shall file its renewed dispositive motion by not later than October 28, 2004. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 10/26/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 10/26/2004)
10/27/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Renewed Dispositive Motions due by 10/28/2004. (tb) (Entered: 10/27/2004)
10/27/2004	<u>83</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by JOHN ASHCROFT, LOUIS J. FREEH, JANET RENO. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 10/27/2004)
10/28/2004		MINUTE ENTRY: Upon consideration of <u>83</u> defendants' motion for an extension of time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is granted; and it is further ORDERED that defendant FBI shall file its renewed dispositive motion by not later than February 4, 2005. No further extensions will be granted absent extraordinary circumstances. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 10/28/04. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 10/28/2004)
10/28/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motions due by 2/4/2005. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 10/28/2004)
11/01/2004	<u>84</u>	ORDER granting <u>70</u> the motion of defendant Department of Homeland Security to dismiss or, in the alternative, for summary judgment, and <u>73</u> the supplemental motion of defendant Department of Justice, et al., for summary judgment. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 11/1/2004. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 11/01/2004)
12/21/2004	<u>85</u>	ORDER requiring plaintiff to respond to defendant the Classifying Agency's motion for summary judgment by not later than January 18, 2005, or otherwise SHOW CAUSE why that motion should not be granted at this time. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 12/21/2004. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 12/21/2004)
12/21/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Response to summary judgment motion or response to Show Cause due by 1/18/2005. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 12/21/2004)
01/25/2005	<u>86</u>	ORDER granting <u>78</u> the supplemental motion for summary judgment of defendant on behalf of "the Classifying Agency." Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 1/25/2005.(lcjdb2) (Entered: 01/25/2005)
02/03/2005	<u>87</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>FBI's Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by JANET RENO, LOUIS J. FREEH, JOHN ASHCROFT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 02/03/2005)
02/04/2005		MINUTE ORDER: Upon consideration of <u>87</u> defendant FBI's motion for an extension of time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED; and it is further ORDERED that defendant FBI shall file its renewed motion for summary judgment by not later than February 11, 2005. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 02/04/2005)
02/04/2005		Set/Reset Deadlines: Renewed Summary Judgment motion due by 2/11/2005. (lcjdb2) (Entered: 02/04/2005)

02/11/2005	<u>88</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>RENEWED</i> by LOUIS J. FREEH, JOHN ASHCROFT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1# <u>2</u> Exhibit 2# <u>3</u> Exhibit A# <u>4</u> Exhibit B# <u>5</u> Exhibit C)(Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 02/11/2005)
03/08/2005	<u>89</u>	ORDER requiring plaintiff to respond to the renewed motion for summary judgment on behalf of defendants Department of Justice and the Federal Bureau of Investigation <u>88</u> , or otherwise SHOW CAUSE why that motion should not be granted at this time. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 3/8/2005. (CK) (Entered: 03/08/2005)
03/08/2005		Set/Reset Deadlines: Plaintiff shall, by not later than 3/29/2005, respond to the renewed motion for summary judgment on behalf of defendants Department of Justice and the Federal Bureau of Investigation <u>88</u> , or otherwise show cause why that motion should not be granted at this time. (CK) (Entered: 03/08/2005)
03/31/2005	<u>90</u>	NOTICE of Voluntary Dismissal by all parties (Mussenden, Paul) (Entered: 03/31/2005)
03/31/2005		MINUTE ORDER: Upon consideration of the parties' stipulation of voluntary dismissal, it is hereby ORDERED that this action is DISMISSED with prejudice; it is further ORDERED that all parties are to bear their own costs; and it is further ORDERED that the renewed motion for summary judgment on behalf of defendants Department of Justice and the Federal Bureau of Investigation <u>88</u> is terminated as moot. Signed by Judge John D. Bates on 3/31/2005. (CK) (Entered: 03/31/2005)