

# **Exhibit 3**

**Sasha (Alexandra) Dudding**

---

**From:** Sasha (Alexandra) Dudding  
**Sent:** Monday, June 25, 2018 11:16 AM  
**To:** 'foiaappeal@dol.gov'  
**Cc:** Howard Berkes; Micah Ratner  
**Subject:** Appeal of FOIA No. 859185  
**Attachments:** image001.jpg; MSHA DebtByAge FOIA Appeal 859185.pdf

Dear Ms. O'Scannlain:

Attached please find the appeal of FOIA request number 859185, filed with the Mine Safety and Health Administration. This appeal is on behalf of NPR Correspondent Howard Berkes.

Best,  
Sasha Dudding

 | Sasha Dudding | Office of the General Counsel  
[sdudding@npr.org](mailto:sdudding@npr.org) | 202.513.3562

Howard Berkes, NPR  
Correspondent – Investigations  
1565 Garfield Ave  
Salt Lake City, UT 84105  
202-513-3410

**VIA EMAIL TO: Kate O'Scannlain**

June 25, 2018

Kate O'Scannlain  
Solicitor of Labor, Office of the Solicitor  
FOIA Appeals Unit  
Division of Management and Administrative Legal Services  
U.S. Department of Labor  
200 Constitution Avenue NW, Room N-2420  
Washington, DC 20210

FOIA Request Tracking No.: 859185  
Subject: Release of MSHA's Debt By Age Report

**ADMINISTRATIVE APPEAL FROM DENIAL OF FOIA REQUEST**

To Whom It May Concern:

I hereby appeal from the Mine Safety and Health Administration's ("MSHA") June 4, 2018 letter denying my May 9, 2018 FOIA Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request for MSHA's latest monthly report on safety penalties assessed by MSHA but delinquent due to non-payment. The basis of my appeal is that MSHA has not adequately justified its failure to respond to the request within the 20-day time limit required under FOIA, which passed on June 6, 2018. Although FOIA allows an extension under "unusual circumstances," including the need to consult with other agencies that have a substantial interest in the request, MSHA has failed to demonstrate that it qualifies for this extension. MSHA has given me and my journalistic colleagues the requested Debt By Age Reports on numerous occasions without requiring any extensions, and without citing any need to consult with other agencies. In its response to this FOIA request, MSHA has failed to show any reasons for its sudden need to do so. As such, MSHA fails to meet FOIA's requirements and must promptly release the record.

**I. Background**

On May 9, 2018, I submitted a FOIA request to MSHA. I requested "the latest monthly report produced by the Mine Safety and Health Administration (MSHA) known as DebtByAge, which provides the latest accounting of final mine safety penalties assessed by MSHA but delinquent due to non-payment." This report provides crucial information on which mines have failed to pay the penalties MSHA has assessed against them due to safety violations. The delinquency of the debt ranges from under a month to over 10 years, in amounts from under a dollar to over \$1 million. Without this information, the press and public cannot gauge the effectiveness of mine safety compliance efforts.

I asked to receive the information in an Excel spreadsheet and electronically in a return email. As a representative of the news media seeking these records on behalf of National Public Radio, Inc. (“NPR”) for dissemination to the public, I requested a fee waiver. I also asked that if my request is denied, in whole or in part, MSHA justify all redactions in a *Vaughn* index that references the specific claimed exemption, and that MSHA release all segregable portions of otherwise exempt material. A copy of my original request is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

I received a response from MSHA stating that “due to the unusual circumstances surrounding the records you are seeking, the statutory time limits for processing your request cannot be met.” The letter did not describe these “unusual circumstances,” saying only that “there is a need to consult with another agency or two or more agency components.” MSHA said it would provide a response within 60 working days. MSHA included contact information for its FOIA liaisons and for the Office of Government Information. MSHA said it would grant my request for a fee waiver. A copy of the response letter is attached hereto as Exhibit B.

## **II. Arguments Supporting Disclosure**

MSHA is required to release the Debt By Age Report under FOIA and the Federal Mine Safety and Health Act of 1977 (the “Mine Act”), and has done so without delay on many recent occasions. If MSHA believes that this report falls under one of FOIA’s narrow exemptions—which it does not—it must explain any denial in detail. The Supreme Court’s directive is that “disclosure, not secrecy, is the dominant objective of FOIA.”<sup>1</sup> MSHA’s sudden and unexplained failure to release the Debt By Age Report is not consistent with this objective, or with the text of the law.

FOIA requires agencies to respond within 20 business days, or 30 under “unusual circumstances.” There are three narrow categories of allowed “unusual circumstances,” one of which is the need to consult with other agencies. However, this is not an open-ended extension. Agencies may only request extensions to consult with other agencies “to the extent reasonably necessary to the proper processing of the particular requests.”<sup>2</sup> Further, this consultation must be “conducted with *all practicable speed*,” and the other agencies must have “a *substantial interest* in the determination of the request.”<sup>3</sup> Further, agencies must provide detailed responses when seeking such an extension. Under FOIA’s “unusual circumstances” provision, the D.C. Circuit has held that “it is not enough that, within the relevant time period, the agency simply decide to later decide. Therefore, within the relevant time period, the agency must at least inform the requester of the scope of the documents that the agency will produce, as well as the scope of the documents that the agency plans to withhold under any FOIA exemptions.”<sup>4</sup> Otherwise, agencies could simply request extensions on every request, and requesters would not have the information they needed to appeal or file suit.

Here, MSHA provided no details on its delay, nor did it provide any information regarding its planned response to the FOIA request. MSHA states only that it must “consult with another agency or two or more agency components.” This formulaic response provides no information on which agencies these might be, why this consultation is necessary, or why it will

---

<sup>1</sup> *U.S. Dep’t of Def. v. Fed. Labor Relations Auth.*, 510 U.S. 487, 494 (1993).

<sup>2</sup> 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(6)(B)(iii) (emphasis added).

<sup>3</sup> 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(6)(B)(iii)(III) (emphasis added).

<sup>4</sup> *Citizens for Responsibility & Ethics in Wash. v. FEC*, 711 F.3d 180, 186 (D.C. Cir., 2013).

take 60 additional business days to complete. Indeed, MSHA’s past conduct in releasing the Debt By Age Reports promptly and consistently casts serious doubt on its claim to “unusual circumstances.” MSHA has promptly and consistently released these records to myself and other journalists on many occasions:

- On February 25, 2011, MSHA sent me and NPR reporter Robert Benincasa a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of January 30, 2011. See Exhibit C.<sup>5</sup>
- On March 24, 2011, MSHA sent me and NPR reporter Robert Benincasa a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of February 28, 2011. See Exhibit D.
- On November 18, 2011, MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of October 31, 2011. See Exhibit E.
- On January 11, 2012, MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of December 31, 2011. See Exhibit F.
- On August 19, 2013, MSHA sent me and Ellen Smith, Owner and Managing Editor of Mine Safety and Health News, a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of July 31, 2013. See Exhibit G.
- On June 10, 2013, MSHA sent me and Ellen Smith a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of May 31, 2013. See Exhibit H.
- On November 1, 2013, MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of September 30, 2013. See Exhibit I.
- MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of February 28, 2014. See Exhibit J.
- MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of July 3, 2014. See Exhibit K.
- MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of January 31, 2015. See Exhibit L.
- MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of January 31, 2016. See Exhibit M.
- MSHA sent me a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of April 3, 2016. See Exhibit N.
- On April 7, 2017, MSHA sent Ellen Smith a copy of the Debt By Age report current as of April 1, 2017, with an apology for the late response. See Exhibit O.

The above emails show that MSHA voluntarily provided the spreadsheets within fewer than 25 business days of the most current data contained in the report. In MSHA’s exchanges with me and my colleagues, it did not mention needing inter-agency consultations, and the rare delays were brief ones caused by staff vacations and data processing needs. This past transparency has changed suddenly, and without justification. MSHA has not met its burden to explain its failure to release the record, and “although the agency may desire to keep FOIA requests bottled up in limbo for months or years on end, the statute simply does not countenance such a system.”<sup>6</sup>

In addition, the disclosure of these records cannot be “unusual” because the Mine Act requires MSHA to release these records. The Act requires that “all records, information, reports,

---

<sup>5</sup> I have excerpted the first page of each Debt By Age spreadsheet due to the files’ large size, but I am happy to provide the full documents upon request.

<sup>6</sup> *Id* at 186-87.

findings, citations, notices, orders, or decisions required or issued pursuant to or under this Act may be published from time to time, may be released to any interested person, and *shall be made available for public inspection.*<sup>7</sup> The Debt By Age Report is at the core of MSHA’s responsibilities in ensuring mine operators’ compliance with the Act’s safety requirements, and under the Mine Act (and FOIA) must be made available to the public as MSHA has done in the past. MSHA and its predecessors have been collecting data on delinquent fines for over 40 years, and concern with this issue was critical to Congress’s intent in drafting the Mine Act.<sup>8</sup> The congressional reports accompanying the Mine Act state several times that, in order to have safe mines, this information must be public.<sup>9</sup> The 2006 amendments to the Mine Act increase penalties in an effort to ensure mine compliance—an effort whose success the public cannot gauge without information on whether such penalties are being paid.

### III. Conclusion

In a sudden change from a history of transparency, MSHA has failed to release a record critical to the public’s understanding of mine safety, and has failed to adequately respond to NPR’s FOIA request. MSHA has consistently released these records to me and other journalists within days of a request, and has not stated a valid reason to stop. MSHA did not include any information to support its claim of “unusual circumstances,” nor did it meet its burden to demonstrate that the requested record falls under one of FOIA’s exemptions. In addition to FOIA, MSHA is also required to release these records under the Mine Act. Thus, MSHA should release the Debt By Age Report immediately.

Sincerely,

Howard Berkes

---

<sup>7</sup> 30 U.S.C. § 813(h).

<sup>8</sup> H.R. Rep No. 95-181 (1977) (describing the importance of penalties to compliance efforts). *See also* S.R. Rep No. 109-365 (2006) (describing the importance of increasing penalties under the 2006 updates to the Mine Act).

<sup>9</sup> E.g., H.R. Rep No. 95-181 at 45 (1977) (“The Committee strongly feels that the purpose of civil penalties, convincing operators to comply with the Act’s requirements, is best served when the process by which these penalties are assessed and collected is carried out in public, where miners and their representatives, as well as the Congress and other interested parties, can fully observe the process.”)

# Exhibit A

U.S. Department of Labor - MSHA  
FOIA Officer  
201 12th Street South Room 4E401  
Arlington, Virginia 22202-5450

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request

Dear FOIA Officer:

This is a request under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. Section 552. I am a full time journalist for National Public Radio, Inc. (NPR) and I am reporting stories about coal mine safety. NPR is a non-commercial, non-profit entity organized and incorporated in the District of Columbia which creates and distributes awarding winning news and information programming.

I request the latest monthly report produced by the Mine Safety and Health Administration (MSHA) known as DebtByAge, which provides the latest accounting of final mine safety penalties assessed by MSHA but delinquent due to non-payment.

The DebtByAge report is typically produced in Excel spreadsheet form and typically includes all or some of the following columns: Assess Case Nbr; Mine ID; Mine Status; Violator ID; Violator Name; Violator Type; Controller ID; Controller Name; Age Category; Delinquent Date; Delinquent Type; Ending Balance; Current Operator ID; Current Operator Name.

The DebtByAge report also typically includes two additional tabs: Summary Data, which summarizes the data by Days Delinquent, At Agency, AtAgency-TreasRecall, Hold Status, In Bankruptcy, Sent To Treasury and Grand Total; and Controllers, which provides columns listing Controller ID and Controller Name.

A DebtByAge report from January 2016 and provided by MSHA without a FOIA request is attached for your reference.

Please provide the requested DebtByAge report in Excel spreadsheet format and electronically in a return email.

MSHA routinely provided monthly DebtByAge reports upon request but has not responded to our most recent requests.

MSHA has a statutory obligation under Section 103 (h) of the Federal Mine Safety & Health Act of 1977 (Public Law 91-173, as amended by Public Law 95-164) to make available for public inspection "all records, information, reports, findings, citations, notices, orders or decisions required or issued pursuant to or under this Act..."

The monthly DebtByAge reports fit the definition of “all records, information, reports, findings, citations, notices, orders or decisions required or issued pursuant to or under this Act...” that must be made available for public inspection by request.

I request a waiver for all fees for this request. Disclosure of the requested information to me is in the public interest because it is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of the operations or activities of the government, the status of coal mine safety in the United States, and/or the process by which the government protects the welfare of miners. This request is part of the reporting process and will be used for further story development.

If my request is denied in whole or in part, I ask that you justify each and every denial by referencing the specific exemption to FOIA which you rely on. I further ask that you release any and all portions of the material that can be segregated from the exempt material.

Please contact me at the phone numbers or email address below if there are any questions about this request.

Sincerely,

Howard Berkes



| Howard Berkes | Correspondent - Investigations | [hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org) |  
202-513-410  
801-598-9372 (cell)

# Exhibit B

**U.S. Department of Labor**

Mine Safety and Health Administration  
201 12th Street South, Suite 401  
Arlington, Virginia 22202-5452



JUN - 4 2018

Mr. Howard Berkes  
NPR  
1565 Garfield Ave.  
Salt Lake City, UT 84105

Re: Freedom of Information Act Request Acknowledgement – Tracking No. 859185

Dear Mr. Berkes:

This letter acknowledges receipt of your Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request dated May 9, 2018. Your request has been referred to the Mine Safety and Health Administration (MSHA), Office of Assessments and has been assigned Tracking Number 859185. Please refer to this number in any future correspondence relative to your FOIA request.

You have requested “the latest monthly report produced by the Mine Safety and Health Administration (MSHA) known as DebtByAge, which provides the latest accounting of final mine safety penalties assessed by MSHA but delinquent due to non-payment.”

Due to the unusual circumstances surrounding the records you are seeking, the statutory time limits for processing your request cannot be met. There is a need to consult with another agency or two or more agency components. Based on these unusual circumstances, we estimate that you will receive a response within 60 working days of the date of this letter.

Your request for a fee waiver has been granted.

If you have any questions or wish to discuss narrowing the scope of your request or an alternative time frame for the processing of your request, you may contact Carolyn Settles at 202-693-9550 or by email at [settles.carolyn@dol.gov](mailto:settles.carolyn@dol.gov) or the DOL FOIA Public Liaison, Thomas Hicks, at (202) 693-5427 or [hicks.thomas@dol.gov](mailto:hicks.thomas@dol.gov). Alternatively, you may contact the Office of Government Information Services (OGIS) within the National Archives and Records Administration (NARA) to inquire about the mediation services they offer. The contact information for OGIS is as follows:

Office of Government Information Services  
National Archives and Records Administration  
8601 Adelphi Road  
College Park, MD 20740-6001  
Phone - (202) 741-5570  
Toll free - (877) 684-6448  
Fax - (202) 741-5769  
Email - [ogis@nara.gov](mailto:ogis@nara.gov)

Please note that FOIA applies to existing records and does not require agencies to conduct research or generate documents based on that research. The FOIA requires that agencies generally disclose records unless agencies are authorized or required to withhold requested records, either in whole or part due to one or more of the nine established exemptions.

For information about FOIA practices and procedures, please visit our website at [www.msha.gov](http://www.msha.gov) or visit the DOL website at [www.dol.gov](http://www.dol.gov).

Sincerely,



Thomas W. Charboneau  
Director, Office of Assessments

# Exhibit C

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:[Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV](mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV)]

**Sent:** Friday, February 25, 2011 4:39 PM

**To:** Howard Berkes; Robert Benincasa

**Cc:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA

**Subject:** Debt by Age Report - Coal

Howard and Robert,

Attached is the report we discussed earlier today. The data is fairly self-explanatory but I'm sure you'll have questions and want more info, but this gets you started. It is delinquent debt (coal only) on the books as of January 30, 2011.

Regards,

Jay

<>

*Jay Mattos*

*Director, Office of Assessments*

*U.S. Dept. of Labor*

*Mine Safety and Health Administration*

*202.693.9702*



**End of excerpt**

# Exhibit D

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:[Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV](mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV)]  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 24, 2011 9:57 AM  
**To:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA; Lyons, Jeri A - MSHA; Robert Benincasa; Howard Berkes  
**Subject:** RE: Debt by Age Report - Coal

Jeri was unable to get to this – attached is the data for delinquent debt through February – there's a tab in there with a listing of all controller IDs and names in our system. We need to do a little research on the mines not in the OGI data but if you sent me the list of 40 mines referred to below, I can't find it now. The MIS converted data violators are all miners, and we honestly don't have time to go back into the archives to find out who they were.

If you could resend the missing mine info, we'll take a look to see what that's all about.

---

**From:** Lyons, Jeri A - MSHA  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 24, 2011 11:05 AM  
**To:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA  
**Subject:** RE: Debt by Age Report - Coal

Jay,

I did not get a chance to help them while you were gone.

Jeri Lyons  
MSHA, Office of Assessments  
1 Denver Federal Center  
2nd Street, Bldg 25, Rm. 2323  
Denver, CO 80225  
Phone: 303-231-5437

Fax: 303-231-5542

---

**From:** Robert Benincasa [mailto:RBenincasa@npr.org]  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 24, 2011 9:01 AM  
**To:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA; Howard Berkes  
**Cc:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA; Lyons, Jeri A - MSHA  
**Subject:** RE: Debt by Age Report - Coal

Hi Jay,

Have you been able to help us with this?

Many thanks,

Robert Benincasa  
Producer, Computer-Assisted Reporting  
NPR News  
202-513-2218  
[rbenincasa@npr.org](mailto:rbenincasa@npr.org)

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 08, 2011 6:50 PM  
**To:** Robert Benincasa; Howard Berkes  
**Cc:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA; Lyons, Jeri A - MSHA  
**Subject:** RE: Debt by Age Report - Coal

I'm out of the office until Thursday March 17, so I'm afraid we'll have to get you the latest report then. I've copied Jeri Lyons of my staff in, and she may have time to look into this, but we're woefully swamped at the moment. Best not to expect anything until next Thursday or Friday.

The MIS converted data is from when we migrated to Oracle but Jeri will be able to figure those out. The lack of a Controller ID means there is no parent company, usually a sole proprietorship. We'll have to populate the Controller names from other data. We'll also have to look into why the missing Mine IDs.

---

**From:** Robert Benincasa [mailto:RBenincasa@npr.org]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 08, 2011 3:38 PM  
**To:** Robert Benincasa; Mattos, Jay P - MSHA; Howard Berkes  
**Cc:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Subject:** RE: Debt by Age Report - Coal

Sorry, I forgot the attachment.

---

**From:** Robert Benincasa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 08, 2011 3:35 PM  
**To:** 'Mattos, Jay P - MSHA'; Howard Berkes  
**Cc:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Subject:** RE: Debt by Age Report - Coal

Hi Jay,

Thanks for your help with this data. We have a few questions:

In the Violator Name field, 52 records say "MIS Converted Data." Can we get the name for those?

The controller ID field is blank for 2,826 records. Can you explain and populate those fields?

In the fields where there is a controller ID, can you also provide the name of the controller?

Forty mines do not appear in MSHA's OGI table of all mines (spreadsheet attached) Can you explain and populate those fields?

Can you update the data to reflect the most recent monthly totals?

Regards,

Robert Benincasa

Producer, Computer-Assisted Reporting  
NPR News  
202-513-2218  
[rbenincasa@npr.org](mailto:rbenincasa@npr.org)

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:[Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV](mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV)]

**Sent:** Friday, February 25, 2011 6:39 PM

**To:** Howard Berkes; Robert Benincasa

**Cc:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA

**Subject:** Debt by Age Report - Coal

Howard and Robert,

Attached is the report we discussed earlier today. The data is fairly self-explanatory but I'm sure you'll have questions and want more info, but this gets you started. It is delinquent debt (coal only) on the books as of January 30, 2011.

Regards,

Jay

<>

Jay Mattos

*Director, Office of Assessments*

*U.S. Dept. of Labor*

*Mine Safety and Health Administration*

202.693.9702



**End of excerpt**

# **Exhibit E**

---

**From:** Lawder, Jesse - OPA [mailto:[Lawder.Jesse@dol.gov](mailto:Lawder.Jesse@dol.gov)]

**Sent:** Friday, November 18, 2011 11:24 AM

**To:** Howard Berkes

**Subject:** Delinquent Debt

Attached is the delinquent debt report as of October 31, 2011. The first tab is the detailed debt data, the second tab lists the dollars in suspense – checks we haven't applied yet to specific debt – so before you cite a company with large debt, please check for payments first. The third tab is a controlling company lookup for use when sorting through the detailed debt. The fourth tab has some summary debt data from the detailed debt data as well as general final order and collection numbers. Usually takes three-four years to close out the books on the debt – we collected 90% of final orders in 2006 and 2007 and are on track to continue that rate for 2008 through 2011 when we finish the various collection actions in progress.

<<DEBTAGE11012011\_DET.xlsx>>



**End of excerpt**

# **Exhibit F**

---

**From:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA [mailto:[Louviere.Amy@DOL.GOV](mailto:Louviere.Amy@DOL.GOV)]

**Sent:** Wednesday, January 11, 2012 12:30 PM

**To:** Howard Berkes

**Subject:** Updated delinquent fines data



**End of excerpt**

# **Exhibit G**

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:[Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV](mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV)]  
**Sent:** Monday, June 10, 2013 12:47 PM  
**To:** MineSafety@aol.com; Howard Berkes  
**Cc:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Subject:** Newmont settlement...and May Delinquent Debt Data

Ellen,

The Purcell docket is WEST 2013-119M; decision date April 10, 2013  
The Newmont docket is WEST 2013-130M; same decision date.

Attached are copies of the decisions.

Also, attached is the May delinquent debt listing – copying in Howard, as well.

I will forward the current “ scofflaw ” list as soon as we update for May – next day or so.

Jay

*Jay Mattos  
Director, Office of Assessments, Accountability,  
Special Enforcement and Investigations  
U.S. Dept. of Labor  
Mine Safety and Health Administration  
202.693.9702*

---

**From:** MineSafety@aol.com [mailto:[MineSafety@aol.com](mailto:MineSafety@aol.com)]  
**Sent:** Saturday, June 08, 2013 3:46 PM  
**To:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA  
**Subject:** Newmont settlement...

Jay -- I am doing a story on a private lawsuit stemming from a fatality at Newmont on 10/28/2011. I saw in the DRS that the penalties are settled, and the payment date in the DRS is 5/21/2013. The case numbers on the DRS are:

000303429 (Purcell)  
000303428 (Newmont)

Do you have a docket number on this case before the Commission? I am looking to incorporate the settlement into the lawsuit story.

-- Ellen

---

Ellen Smith, Owner and Managing Editor  
Mine Safety and Health News  
888 Pittsford Mendon Center Rd.  
Pittsford, NY 14534  
phone: 585-721-3211; email: [MineSafety@aol.com](mailto:MineSafety@aol.com)  
On the web: [www.Minesafety.com](http://www.Minesafety.com)  
fax: 585-582-2879



**End of excerpt**

# **Exhibit H**

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:[Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV](mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV)]  
**Sent:** Monday, August 19, 2013 3:42 PM  
**To:** Howard Berkes; Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** minesafety@aol.com  
**Subject:** RE: Request for an updated Debt By Age report and Scofflaws List; status of additional data from Treasury

Here's the debt by age report for August 1, 2013.

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [mailto:[HBerkes@npr.org](mailto:HBerkes@npr.org)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 14, 2013 5:33 PM  
**To:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA; Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** minesafety@aol.com  
**Subject:** RE: Request for an updated Debt By Age report and Scofflaws List; status of additional data from Treasury

I was able to get it from them. All is well.

**Howard Berkes | Rural Affairs Correspondent | National Public Radio**

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

**202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)**

**801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)**

**801-598-9372 (cell)**

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:[Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV](mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 14, 2013 3:30 PM  
**To:** Howard Berkes; Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** minesafety@aol.com  
**Subject:** RE: Request for an updated Debt By Age report and Scofflaws List; status of additional data from Treasury

Howard,

Treasury didn't send me the password, I've pinged them for it and will send it along when they share it with me..

Jay

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [mailto:[HBerkes@npr.org](mailto:HBerkes@npr.org)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 14, 2013 12:37 PM  
**To:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA; Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** minesafety@aol.com  
**Subject:** RE: Request for an updated Debt By Age report and Scofflaws List; status of additional data from Treasury

Hi Jay The 2nd document, which is attached, won't open without a password: What is the password? Thanks...

**Howard Berkes | Rural Affairs Correspondent | National Public Radio**

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

**202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)**

**801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)**

**801-598-9372 (cell)**

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA [mailto:[Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV](mailto:Mattos.Jay@DOL.GOV)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 14, 2013 8:31 AM  
**To:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA; Howard Berkes; Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** minesafetyaol.com@dol.gov  
**Subject:** RE: Request for an updated Debt By Age report and Scofflaws List; status of additional data from Treasury

Here's the info Treasury sent me....

---

**From:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 13, 2013 9:12 PM  
**To:** 'HBerkes@npr.org'; Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** 'minesafetyaol.com@dol.gov'  
**Subject:** Re: Request for an updated Debt By Age report and Scofflaws List; status of additional data from Treasury

Howard and Ellen,

Regarding the question on the Treasury data, they did send me some data but I thought it was a copy of data they sent you directly.

I'll dig it out and shoot it to you tomorrow.

Jay

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [mailto:[HBerkes@npr.org](mailto:HBerkes@npr.org)]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 13, 2013 06:01 PM  
**To:** Mattos, Jay P - MSHA; Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** minesafety@aol.com  
**Subject:** Request for an updated Debt By Age report and Scofflaws List; status of additional data from Treasury

Hi Jay and Amy.

Ellen Smith and I continue to work on delinquent fines. Vacations and other distractions have interfered. Now that we've hit mid-August, we'd like to have the latest Debt By Age report and Scofflaws list so that we're working with the most current information.

Treasury also tells us that they provided to MSHA, at our request, MSHA debt details for three additional fiscal years - 2010, 2011 and 2012. Tom Longnecker told us on 7/19 that that data had been provided to MSHA for review and for distribution to us.

Can you tell us the status of that data?

We're also anticipating interview requests for our stories. Assuming that we get the latest Debt By Age report, Scofflaws lists and Treasury data, soon, we'd like to interview Jay and Joe Main (and perhaps Kevin Stricklin) after Labor Day. We're also interested in discussing the Scofflaws program, including how cases are selected for referral to U.S. Attorneys and the outcomes of some of those cases. We anticipate that you may want someone in the Solicitor's office to discuss that.

I will travel to DC for these interviews. We don't need everyone at the same time. I can meet with Jay, Joe, et al, separately but it would be preferable to interview them on the same or adjacent days. We'll likely have Ellen participate via speakerphone.

We'll prep you in advance but we wanted to get you thinking about scheduling.

Many thanks for your assistance.

Best,

Howard and Ellen

Ellen Smith  
Mine Safety and Health News

**Howard Berkes | Rural Affairs Correspondent | National Public Radio**

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

**202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)**

**801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)**

**801-598-9372 (cell)**



**End of excerpt**

# **Exhibit I**

---

**From:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA [mailto:Louviere.Amy@DOL.GOV]  
**Sent:** Friday, November 01, 2013 1:05 PM  
**To:** Howard Berkes  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [mailto:HBerkes@npr.org]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 31, 2013 6:05 PM  
**To:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

OK. Many thanks for the update. My data guru (Anna) is out tomorrow so if he needs more time to make sure it's good, Monday is fine.

Howard Berkes  
Rural Affairs Correspondent  
National Public Radio

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)  
801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)  
801-598-9372 (mobile)

---

**From:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA [mailto:Louviere.Amy@DOL.GOV]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 31, 2013 4:01 PM  
**To:** Howard Berkes  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

Jay says the data query is still running. Maybe tomorrow.

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [<mailto:HBerkes@npr.org>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 30, 2013 2:01 PM  
**To:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** [minesafety@aol.com](mailto:minesafety@aol.com)  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

Thanks. Any ETA on the latest Debt By Age data?

Howard Berkes  
Rural Affairs Correspondent  
National Public Radio

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)  
801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)  
801-598-9372 (mobile)

---

**From:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA [<mailto:Louviere.Amy@DOL.GOV>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 30, 2013 11:59 AM  
**To:** Howard Berkes  
**Cc:** [MineSafety@aol.com](mailto:MineSafety@aol.com)  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

NA means that the mine was not in operation during that year.  
0.0 means that mine reported hours worked but no NFDL injuries for that year.

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [<mailto:HBerkes@npr.org>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 29, 2013 11:44 AM  
**To:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** [minesafety@aol.com](mailto:minesafety@aol.com)  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

Hey Amy. A couple of quick questions about the NFDL data:

1. NA – what does NA designate. We assume not applicable. Is that because the mine was not operating that year or are there other reasons for an NA designation?
2. 0.00 – we assume that means no NFDL in that calendar year for a mine that was in operation.

Thanks!

Howard Berkes  
Rural Affairs Correspondent  
National Public Radio

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)  
801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)  
801-598-9372 (mobile)

---

**From:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA [<mailto:Louviere.Amy@DOL.GOV>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 29, 2013 9:00 AM  
**To:** Howard Berkes  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [<mailto:HBerkes@npr.org>]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 24, 2013 10:45 AM  
**To:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA  
**Cc:** [minesafety@aol.com](mailto:minesafety@aol.com)  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

Hi Amy. The delinquent debt goes back to 1985 so, ideally, we'd like the NFDL data back to 1985. If that's not available, we'd like data as far back as you can go.

Howard Berkes  
Rural Affairs Correspondent  
National Public Radio

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)  
801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)  
801-598-9372 (mobile)

---

**From:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA [<mailto:Louviere.Amy@DOL.GOV>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 23, 2013 5:44 PM  
**To:** Howard Berkes  
**Cc:** [MineSafety@aol.com](mailto:MineSafety@aol.com)  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

Howard, what timeframe are you seeking for NFDL rates?

---

**From:** Howard Berkes [<mailto:HBerkes@npr.org>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 22, 2013 12:55 PM  
**To:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA; Mattos, Jay P - MSHA  
**Cc:** [minesafety@aol.com](mailto:minesafety@aol.com)  
**Subject:** RE: Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News  
**Importance:** High

Hi Amy and Jay. Do you have an ETA on the data we've requested below?

Many thanks.

Best,

Howard and Ellen

Howard Berkes, NPR  
Ellen Smith, Mine Safety and Health News

**From:** Howard Berkes  
**Sent:** Friday, October 18, 2013 10:26 AM  
**To:** Louviere, Amy - MSHA; 'Mattos, Jay P - MSHA'  
**Subject:** Data request - NPR and Mine Safety and Health News

Hi Amy and Jay. Hope you're not too overworked getting back to work.

We are close to completing our analysis of delinquent fines but need two more sets of data:

1. The latest Debt By Age spreadsheet. If you're working on the September list and will have that soon we'll wait for that.
2. A spreadsheet showing the Non-Fatal Days Lost calculations for all mines. We know this data is spread throughout the Mine Data Retrieval System, mine by mine, but trying to retrieve it is exceptionally laborious. A single spreadsheet containing NFDL data will be most helpful.

Please let me know if you have questions.

Many thanks.

Best,

Howard

**Howard Berkes | Rural Affairs Correspondent | National Public Radio**

[hberkes@npr.org](mailto:hberkes@npr.org)

**202-513-3410 (from DC or anywhere)**

**801-486-3874 (from Utah or anywhere)**

**801-598-9372 (cell)**



**End of excerpt**

# Exhibit J



**End of excerpt**

# **Exhibit K**



**End of excerpt**

# Exhibit L



**End of excerpt**

# Exhibit M



**End of excerpt**

# Exhibit N



**End of excerpt**

# **Exhibit O**

**From:** Ellen Smith [mailto:[minesafety@aol.com](mailto:minesafety@aol.com)]  
**Sent:** Friday, June 08, 2018 10:38 AM  
**To:** Howard Berkes  
**Subject:** Fwd: Debt by Age

-----Original Message-----

From: Powell, Alton - MSHA  
To: 'MineSafety@aol.com'  
Cc: Blue, Kelvin B - MSHA  
Sent: Fri, Apr 7, 2017 2:15 pm  
Subject: RE: Debt by Age

Hi Ellen,

I apologize for the late response. Just returned from leave today.

Attached please find the report you asked for including the Controller information. Pls let me know if you questions or concerns.

Regards,

Alton Powell | Financial Specialist  
U.S. Department of Labor (DOL)  
Mine Safety and Health Administration (MSHA)  
Address: 201 12<sup>th</sup> Street South-Suite 400  
Arlington, VA 22202-5452  
Phone: 202.693.9724  
Fax: 202.693.9701

*The information transmitted is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. Notify sender if this email was received in error.*

---

**From:** [MineSafety@aol.com](mailto:MineSafety@aol.com) [mailto:[MineSafety@aol.com](mailto:MineSafety@aol.com)]

**Sent:** Monday, April 03, 2017 5:02 PM

**To:** Powell, Alton - MSHA

**Subject:** Debt by Age

Alton -- can you send me a new Debt by Age spreadsheet?

Somehow, the one I was working with from January is completely corrupted.

Many thanks.

Ellen

---

Ellen Smith, Owner and Managing Editor

Mine Safety and Health News

888 Pittsford Mendon Center Rd.

Pittsford, NY 14534

Phone: 585-721-3211 / Fax: 585-582-2879

Email: [MineSafety@aol.com](mailto:MineSafety@aol.com)

On the Web: [www.minesafety.com](http://www.minesafety.com)

---

*Mine Safety and Health News is an award-winning, independent, credentialed, legal reporting service covering MSHA and the Federal Mine Safety and Health Review Commission. Member of the Society of Professional Journalists; Specialized Information Publishers Assn.; Investigative Reporters and Editors Inc.; Associate Member of the Associated Press.*



**End of excerpt**