## **EXHIBIT E**

## Case 3:16-cv-06066-JSC Document 1-5 Filed 10/20/16 Page 2 of 4

Freedom of Information Act Office

U.S. Department of Homeland Security 500 12th St SW, Stop 5009 Washington, DC 20536



December 17, 2015

MICHAEL TAN ACLU IMMIGRANTS' RIGHTS PROJECT 125 BROAD ST, 18TH FL NEW YORK, NY 10004

**RE:** ICE FOIA Case Number 2016-ICFO-01568

Mr. Tan:

This is the final response to your Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request to U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) dated October 05, 2015, for records pertaining to parole decisions for non-citizens found to have a credible fear of persecution.

ICE has considered your request under both the FOIA, 5 U.S.C. § 552, and the Privacy Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552a. Information about an individual that is maintained in a Privacy Act system of records may be accessed by that individual unless the agency has exempted the system of records from the access provisions of the Privacy Act.<sup>2</sup>

A search for records produced nine Excel workbooks and 60 pages that are responsive to your request. After a review of the documents, ICE has determined that 16 pages will be released in their entirety. Portions of the nine Excel workbooks and 44 pages will be withheld pursuant to exemptions of the FOIA as described below:

**FOIA Exemption 2** protects information related solely to the internal personnel rules and practices of an agency.

**FOIA Exemption 6** exempts from disclosure personnel or medical files and similar files the release of which would cause a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. This requires a balancing of the public's right to disclosure against the individual's right to privacy. The privacy interests of the individuals in the records you have requested outweigh any minimal public interest in disclosure of the information. Any private interest you may have in that information does not factor into the aforementioned balancing test.

**FOIA Exemption 7(C)** protects records or information compiled for law enforcement purposes that could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. This exemption takes particular note of the strong interests of individuals, whether they are

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 5 U.S.C. § 552a(d)(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 5 U.S.C. §§ 552a(d)(5), (j), and (k).

suspects, witnesses, or investigators, in not being unwarrantably associated with alleged criminal activity. That interest extends to persons who are not only the subjects of the investigation, but those who may have their privacy invaded by having their identities and information about them revealed in connection with an investigation. Based upon the traditional recognition of strong privacy interest in law enforcement records, categorical withholding of information that identifies third parties in law enforcement records is ordinarily appropriate. As such, I have determined that the privacy interest in the identities of individuals in the records you have requested clearly outweigh any minimal public interest in disclosure of the information. Please note that any private interest you may have in that information does not factor into this determination.

**FOIA Exemption 7(E)** protects records compiled for law enforcement purposes, the release of which would disclose techniques and/or procedures for law enforcement investigations or prosecutions, or would disclose guidelines for law enforcement investigations or prosecutions if such disclosure could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law. I have determined that disclosure of certain law enforcement sensitive information contained within the responsive records could reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of the law. Additionally, the techniques and procedures at issue are not well known to the public.

You have the right to appeal ICE's determination and should you wish to do so, please send your appeal following the procedures outlined in the DHS regulations at 6 Code of Federal Regulations § 5.9 and a copy of this letter to:

U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Office of Principal Legal Advisor U.S. Department of Homeland Security Freedom of Information Act Office 500 12th Street, S.W., Stop 5900 Washington, D.C. 20536-5900

Your appeal must be received within 60 days of the date of this letter. Your envelope and letter should be marked "FOIA Appeal." Copies of the FOIA and DHS regulations are available at www.dhs.gov/foia.

Provisions of the FOIA and Privacy Act allow us to recover part of the cost of complying with your request. In this instance, because the cost is below the \$14 minimum, there is no charge.<sup>3</sup>

If you need to contact the FOIA office about this matter, please call (866) 633-1182 and refer to FOIA case number **2016-ICFO-01568**.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 6 CFR § 5.11(d)(4).

Sincerely,
Atriva Paulit-Kelven

Catrina M. Pavlik-Keenan FOIA Officer

Enclosure(s): 9 Excel workbooks and 60 page(s)