

702 H Street, NW, Suite 300, Washington, DC 20001 Tel: 202-462-1177 • Fax: 202-462-4507

David H. Turpin President and Vice-Chancellor, University of Victoria Administrative Services Building, A220 PO Box 1700 STN CSC Victoria, BC V8W 2Y2 Canada

Fax: 250-721-8654 E-mail: <u>pres@uvic.ca</u>

Dear President Turpin,

Greenpeace is the world's largest independent environmental organization. For over 40 years we have been winning campaigns to protect the environment. We do not take any money from corporations, industry or government.

Last week, internal documents from the Chicago, Illinois-based Heartland Institute, a purported independent nonprofit organization, became public showing that the Institute has been receiving large donations from corporations to distribute misinformation about climate change science. According to *The New York Times*, these documents show that Heartland "is planning a new push to undermine the teaching of global warming in public schools."

Mark S. McCaffrey, programs and policy director for the National Center for Science Education, told *The New York Times* that the internal Heartland documents show that when it comes to climate change "they continue to promote confusion, doubt and debate where there really is none."²

Nina Federoff, the President of the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS) said that the documents show that the scientific community of being outgunned by "the growing influence of science skeptics, who have plenty of resources to spread their misinformation."

In one document titled, "Heartland Institute 2012 Proposed Budget," Heartland discussed plans for multi-year budget for its Nongovernmental International Panel on Climate Change (NIPCC), which is described as "an international group of scientists that produces critiques of the reports of the United Nation's IPCC" (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change). According the

¹ Justin Gillis and Leslie Kaufman, "Leak Offers Glimpse of Campaign Against Climate Science," *The New York Times*, February 12, 2012. ²*Ibid*.

³ Margaret Munro, "Scientist 'scared to death' of climate-change skeptics," Vancouver Sun, February 17, 2012.

document, climate contrarian Craig Idso had recruited several scientists to be contributors and authors to NIPCC reports that attempted to undermine the conclusions of the IPCC.

In the table that discusses the personnel budget for the NIPCC, there are several items that list monthly payments for authors who are drafting different chapters of a report. One line item lists Susan Crockford receiving monthly payments of \$750 to write Chapter "2.2 Terrestrial Animals." The document lists her affiliation as University of Victoria. [See Attachment A, p. 8]

According the website of the University of Victoria, Susan Crockford is Sessional Instructor and Adjunct Assistant Professor in the Department of Anthropology.⁴

CONFLICT OF INTEREST RULES IN U.S. FEDERAL SCIENCE

The U.S. federal government has rules regarding conflicts of interest (COI) and federally funded science. Following several high profile scandals at the National Institutes of Health (NIH) in 2004, Congressman Joe Barton as Chairman of the House Energy and Commerce Committee held several hearings on the matter. He found that several NIH scientists were moonlighting as consultants for pharmaceutical companies. In several stories, *The Los Angeles Times* reported that the NIH disciplined 35 scientists for violating conflict of interest rules, and six scientists were suspended or placed on probation.⁵

As then Chairman of the Energy and Commerce Subcommittee on Investigations, Rep. Edward Whitfield (R-Ky.) said, "This is the largest scandal in the NIH's existence."

The NIH later banned all outside consulting by NIH employees. The NIH Director stated that the ban helped "to provide the American public with an unbiased and trusted source of scientific and health information, while preserving our ability to recruit and retain world-class scientists and staff."

In recent years, Senator Charles Grassley (R-IA) led a high profile investigation of consultants and grantees from the NIH. He found that several of these consultants had severe conflicts of interest and were receiving grants from the NIH while also taking large payments from corporations. ⁸ In one case, a psychiatrist at Emory University received millions of dollars from

⁷ NIH Record Vol. LVII No. 18. See also

 $http://nihrecord.od.nih.gov/newsletters/2005/09_09_2005/story01.htm$

⁴ See University webpage: http://anthropology.uvic.ca/people/faculty/adjunct_and_sessional.php

⁵ David Willman, "Panel Challenges NIH Handling of Rules Violations," *Los Angeles Times*, September 14, 2006.

⁶*Ibid*.

⁸ Gardiner Harris, "Top Psychiatrist Didn't Report Drug Makers' Pay," The New York Times, October 3, 2008.

drug companies as a consultant while also receiving federal grants. ⁹ In response, the NIH tightened its rules last August regarding conflicts of interest. ¹⁰

A separate agency, the National Science Foundation has rules on conflicts of interest that are similar to those of the NIH. 11

CONFLICT OF INTEREST RULES AT UNIVERSITY OF VICTORIA

The University of Victoria maintains a conflict of interest policy that governs its faculty. ¹² This policy states in pertinent part:

Conflicts of interest may arise when activities or situations place a person in a real, perceived or potential conflict between their duties or responsibilities related to research, teaching, administrative decisions or other activities in which they participate in the University and their private interests.

We are concerned that Susan Crockford's advocacy on climate change, apparently paid for by the Heartland Institute, may conflict with her duties at the University. To help us better understand this matter, please respond to the following questions.

- 1. Does University policy require faculty to disclose outside income that may conflict with duties at the University? If yes, please provide pertinent documents. If not, why was there no disclosure?
- 2. Did Susan Crockford disclose to the University any potential outside income from the Heartland Institute to engage in climate change advocacy? If yes, please provide pertinent documents. If not, why was there no disclosure?

We thank you for your time and attention to this matter. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact my Research Director Kert Davies at 202-319-2455.

Sincerely,

Phil Radford Executive Director

⁹Ibid.

http://www.uvic.ca/universitysecretary/assets/docs/policies/GV0210_1310_.pdf

¹⁰ Brian Vastag, "NIH finalizes financial conflict of interest rules," *Washington Post*, August 23, 2011.

¹¹NSF 05-131 July 2005, Chapter V – Grantee Standards.

¹²University Policy No.: GV0210 (1310) See also:

Greenpeace USA