

**U.S. District Court  
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:96-cv-01522-CKK**

ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE v. AIR FORCE  
Assigned to: Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly  
Demand: \$0  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 06/27/1996  
Date Terminated: 05/19/1999  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE FUND,  
INC.**

represented by **Valerie J. Stanley**  
VALERIE J. STANLEY, ESQ.  
329 Prince George Street  
Laurel, MD 20707  
(301) 221-9726  
Email: [valeriejstanley@yahoo.com](mailto:valeriejstanley@yahoo.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**DEPARTMENT OF THE AIR FORCE**

represented by **Charles Francis Flynn**  
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE  
Judiciary Center Building  
555 Fourth Street, NW  
Room 4118  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-7188  
**TERMINATED: 07/19/1999**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Judith A. Kidwell**  
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE  
Civil Division  
555 Fourth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 252-2544  
Fax: (202) 252-2599  
Email: [judith.a.kidwell@usdoj.gov](mailto:judith.a.kidwell@usdoj.gov)  
**TERMINATED: 09/13/1999**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Marina Utgoff Braswell**  
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE  
Civil Division  
555 Fourth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 252-2561  
Fax: (202) 252-2599  
Email: [Marina.Braswell@usdoj.gov](mailto:Marina.Braswell@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
------------	---	-------------

06/27/1996	1	COMPLAINT filed by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE (tw) (Entered: 06/28/1996)
06/27/1996		MAILED CJRA brochure, Meet and Confer list, and Notice regarding dismissal to plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE . (tw) (Entered: 06/28/1996)
06/27/1996		SUMMONS (3) issued to federal party(s) federal defendant AIR FORCE , and non-parties: U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (tw) (Entered: 06/28/1996)
06/27/1996	2	RULE 109 Certificate of disclosure of corporate affiliations and financial interests by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE (tw) (Entered: 06/28/1996)
07/17/1996	3	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 6/28/96 upon federal defendant AIR FORCE ; green card signed and dated (bjsp) (Entered: 07/18/1996)
07/17/1996	4	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney General on 7/1/96 ; green card signed and dated (bjsp) (Entered: 07/18/1996)
07/17/1996	5	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney on 6/28/96 ; green card signed and dated (bjsp) (Entered: 07/18/1996)
07/29/1996	6	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for federal defendant AIR FORCE by Charles Francis Flynn (tw) (Entered: 07/30/1996)
07/29/1996	7	ANSWER TO COMPLAINT [1-1] by federal defendant AIR FORCE . (tw) (Entered: 07/30/1996)
08/14/1996	8	MEMORANDUM by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE to the court concerning filing of meet and confer report (tw) (Entered: 08/14/1996)
09/24/1996	9	STATUS REPORT by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE, federal defendant AIR FORCE (tw) (Entered: 09/25/1996)
10/02/1996	10	ORDER by Judge Ricardo M. Urbina: directing that defendant will make a submission to plaintiff pursuant to Vaughn v. Rosen, on or before 12/6/96; ten (10) days after making its Vaughn submission available to plaintiff, or on 12/16/96, whichever is earlier, defendant will file a motin for summary judgment as to any records remaining in dispute; plaintiff will respon d two weeks later, and defendant will reply ten (10) days later (N) (jwd) (Entered: 10/02/1996)
12/13/1996	11	JOINT MOTION by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE, federal defendant AIR FORCE to modify scheduling order. (tw) (Entered: 12/16/1996)
12/30/1996	12	ORDER by Judge Ricardo M. Urbina : granting joint motion to modify scheduling order. [11-1] by AIR FORCE, ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE dispositive motions due 1/14/97 ; response to dispositive motions due 1/28/97 ; reply to dispositive motions due 2/11/97 ; (N) (lin) (Entered: 12/31/1996)
01/14/1997	13	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant AIR FORCE of the declaration of Arthur L. Money with exhibits I through IX; exhibits (58 bulky) (tw) Modified on 01/15/1997 (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/14/1997	14	MOTION filed by federal defendant AIR FORCE for summary judgment because no genuine issue of fact remains to be decided, and defendant is entitled to judgment because the withheld documents and portions documents that are at issue in the Freedom of Information Act cassse are exempt from release. (tw) (Entered: 01/15/1997)
01/27/1997	15	MOTION (UNOPPOSED) filed by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE to extend time within which to respond to defendant's motino for summary judgment. (tw) (Entered: 01/28/1997)
01/28/1997	16	ORDER by Judge Ricardo M. Urbina : granting motion to extend time within which to respond to defendant's motino for summary judgment. [15-1] by ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE response to motion for summary judgment due by 2/18/97 ; (N) (jwd) (Entered: 01/29/1997)
02/05/1997	17	MOTION (UNOPPOSED) filed by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE to extend time to 2/11/97 in which to respond to defendant's motion for summary judgment (tw)

		(Entered: 02/05/1997)
02/07/1997	18	ORDER by Judge Ricardo M. Urbina : granting motion to extend time to 2/11/97 in which to respond to defendant's motion for summary judgment [17-1] by ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE response to dispositive motions due by 2/25/97 ; (N) (jwd) (Entered: 02/07/1997)
02/11/1997	19	MEMORANDUM by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE in opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment [14-1]; exhibits (5) (tw) (Entered: 02/12/1997)
02/25/1997	20	MOTION filed by federal defendant AIR FORCE to extend time to 3/6/97 within which to reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment. (tw) (Entered: 02/26/1997)
03/03/1997	21	ORDER by Judge Ricardo M. Urbina : granting motion to extend time to 3/6/97 within which to reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment. [20-1] by AIR FORCE response to motion for summary judgment due 3/6/97 ; (N) (jwd) (Entered: 03/03/1997)
03/04/1997	22	MOTION filed by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE for IN CAMERA inspection. (tw) (Entered: 03/05/1997)
03/06/1997	23	REPLY by federal defendant AIR FORCE in response to plaintiff's opposition to defendants' motion for summary judgment [14-1] (tw) (Entered: 03/07/1997)
03/06/1997	24	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant AIR FORCE of the declaration of Charles W. MacDonald in connection with the filing this date of defendant's reply to plaintiff's oppositon to defendant's motion for summary judgment. (tw) (Entered: 03/07/1997)
03/17/1997	25	NOTICE OF FILING by federal defendant AIR FORCE of the original declaration of Charles W. MacDonald in connection nwith defendant's reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment. (tw) (Entered: 03/18/1997)
03/18/1997	26	MEMORANDUM by federal defendant AIR FORCE in opposition to plaintiff's motion for IN CAMERA inspection. [22-1] (tw) (Entered: 03/19/1997)
03/28/1997	27	ERRATA by federal defendant AIR FORCE filing original declaration of Charles W. MacDonald. (tw) (Entered: 03/31/1997)
04/08/1997	28	REPLY by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE memorandum in support of motion for IN CAMERA inspection. [22-1]; attachment (1) (tw) (Entered: 04/09/1997)
04/28/1997		REASSIGNMENT OF CIVIL CASE from Judge Urbina to Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly by direction of the Calendar Committee. Emergency matters will continue to be handled by Judge Urbina until Judge Kollar-Kotelly takes the oath of office. (N) (tw) (Entered: 04/30/1997)
02/16/1999	29	MEMORANDUM OPINION by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly (N) (adc) (Entered: 02/16/1999)
02/16/1999	30	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : denying motion for IN CAMERA inspection [22-1] by ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE, denying motion for summary judgment because no genuine issue of fact remains to be decided, and defendant is entitled to judgment becasue the withheld documents and portions documents that are at issue in the Freedom of Information Act cassse are exempt from release [14-1] by AIR FORCE plaintiff's cross motions for summary judgment due 5/7/99 ; plaintiff's reply to motions due 6/4/99 ; defendant's motion for summary judgment due 4/16/99 ; plaintiff's cross motions for summary judgment and response to motion for summary judgment due 5/7/99; defendant's reply and opposition to plaintiff's motion for summary judgment due 5/21/99 (N) (adc) (Entered: 02/16/1999)
04/14/1999	31	ATTORNEY APPEARANCE for federal defendant AIR FORCE by Judith A. Kidwell (tb) (Entered: 04/15/1999)
04/14/1999	32	MOTION (UNOPPOSED)filed by federal defendant AIR FORCE to extend time to 4/30/99 to file motion for summary judgment (lkn) (Entered: 04/16/1999)

04/20/1999	33	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : granting motion to extend time to 4/30/99 to file motion for summary judgment [32-1] by AIR FORCE; plaintiff's cross motion for summary judgment due by 5/21/99; plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for summary judgment due 5/21/99; defendant's motion for summary judgment and vaughn index and agency affidavits due by 4/30/99 ; ; defendant's reply and opposition to plaintiff's motion for motion for summary judgment due by 6/4/99 ; plaintiff's reply due 6/18/99 (N) (adc) (Entered: 04/20/1999)
04/30/1999	34	NOTICE OF FILING RE: parties will be filing a joint stipulation of dismissal in the near future by federal defendant AIR FORCE (tb) (Entered: 05/03/1999)
05/19/1999	35	STIPULATION (JOINT) OF DISMISSAL of case by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE, federal defendant AIR FORCE . (adc) (Entered: 05/19/1999)
07/15/1999	36	ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : granting consent motion to extend time in which to file a motion setting forth a proposed schedule for briefing the issues of attorneys' fees; motion due 8/24/99 (N) (adc) (Entered: 07/16/1999)
07/19/1999	37	JOINT MOTION by plaintiff ANIMAL LEGAL DEFENSE, federal defendant AIR FORCE to extend time to 8/24/99 to file motion setting forth a proposed schedule for briefing the issue of attorneys' fees (tb) (Entered: 07/21/1999)
09/03/1999	38	STIPULATED ORDER by Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly : regarding award of attorneys' fees, defendant will pay plaintiff the amount of \$35,120.00 as settlement for its attorneys' fees and costs in this case; such payment shall be made as promptly as possible consistent with the normal and customary procedures followed by the Department of Justice and Department of Treasury. (N) (dot) (Entered: 09/03/1999)
09/13/1999	39	SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL for federal defendant DEPT. OF AIR FORCE , substituting Marina Utgoff Braswell for attorney Judith A. Kidwell for DEPT. OF AIR FORCE (tb) (Entered: 09/14/1999)