

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:22-cv-03712-PAE**

Koch et al. v. U.S. Department of Justice
Assigned to: Judge Paul A. Engelmayer
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 05/06/2022
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff**William I. Koch**

represented by **John Clopper**
Clopper Law PC
208 Washington Park
Ste #2b
Brooklyn, NY 11205
347-752-7757
Email: jclopper@clopperlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff**Bradley Goldstein**

represented by **John Clopper**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant**U.S. Department of Justice**

represented by **Stephen Seungkun Cha-Kim**
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP
Southern District Of New York
250 West 55th Street
New York, NY 10019-9710
212-836-7270
Email: stephen.cha-kim@arnoldporter.com
TERMINATED: 05/08/2023
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeannette Anne Vargas
U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86 Chambers St.)
86 Chambers Street
New York, NY 10007
212-637-2000
Fax: 212-637-2730
Email: Jeannette.Vargas@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 04/02/2024

Jeremy Liss
86 Chambers Street
Floor 3
New York, NY 10007
212-637-2795
Email: jeremy.liss@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
------------	---	-------------

05/06/2022	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against U.S. Department of Justice. (Filing Fee \$ 402.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-26114007) Document filed by William I. Koch, Bradley Goldstein. (Clopper, John) (Entered: 05/06/2022)
05/06/2022	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed..(Clopper, John) (Entered: 05/06/2022)
05/06/2022	<u>3</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Justice, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch..(Clopper, John) (Entered: 05/06/2022)
05/09/2022		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above-entitled action is assigned to Judge Lewis J. Liman. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at https://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/district-judges . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at https://nysd.uscourts.gov/rules/ecf-related-instructions..(gp) (Entered: 05/09/2022)
05/09/2022		Magistrate Judge Jennifer Willis is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: https://nysd.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/2018-06/AO-3.pdf . (gp) (Entered: 05/09/2022)
05/09/2022		Case Designated ECF. (gp) (Entered: 05/09/2022)
05/09/2022	<u>4</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of Justice..(gp) (Entered: 05/09/2022)
05/10/2022		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. Judge Lewis J. Liman is no longer assigned to the case. (vba) (Entered: 05/10/2022)
06/16/2022	<u>5</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Stephen Cha-Kim dated 6/16/22. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 06/16/2022)
06/16/2022	<u>6</u>	ORDER: granting <u>5</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer re <u>5</u> CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer. addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Stephen Cha-Kim dated 6/16/22. Granted. SO ORDERED. U.S. Department of Justice answer due 7/1/2022. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/16/2022) (ama) (Entered: 06/16/2022)
07/01/2022	<u>7</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/01/2022)
07/05/2022	<u>8</u>	NOTICE OF INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE: The parties should call into the Court's dedicated conference line at (888) 363-4749, and enter Access.Code 468-4906, followed by the pound(#) key. (And as further set forth herein.) SO ORDERED. Initial Conference set for 8/2/2022 at 02:00 PM before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 7/5/2022) (jca) (Entered: 07/05/2022)
07/27/2022	<u>9</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Stephen Cha-Kim dated 7/27/2022 re: Status Report Prior to Initial Conference. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Cha-Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 07/27/2022)
08/02/2022		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Paul A. Engelmayer: Telephonic Initial Pretrial Conference held on 8/2/2022. (ajs) (Entered: 08/03/2022)
08/03/2022	<u>10</u>	ORDER: As consented to by the parties in the pretrial conference on August 2, 2022, the Court instructs the parties to submit a joint status update outlining the status of the case as to all parties on October 3, 2022, and thereafter on the first Monday of each month. The Court appreciates the parties' cooperation thus far in moving this matter forward. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 8/3/2022) (va) (Entered: 08/03/2022)
10/04/2022	<u>11</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Status Update</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Stephen Cha-Kim dated 10/4/2022. Document filed by U.S.

		Department of Justice..(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 10/04/2022)
10/04/2022	<u>12</u>	ORDER granting <u>11</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 10/4/2022) (vfr) (Entered: 10/04/2022)
10/06/2022	<u>13</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 10/06/2022)
10/11/2022	<u>14</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>13</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties and is hopeful that the next joint letter, due on November 7, 2022, indicates substantial progress in production. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 10/11/2022) (tg) (Entered: 10/11/2022)
11/07/2022	<u>15</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Report re FOIA Processing</i> Document filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch..(Clopper, John) (Entered: 11/07/2022)
11/09/2022	<u>16</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>15</u> Status Report filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch ENDORSEMENT: The Court orders the parties to confer regarding a per month processing rate and file a joint letter by November 14, 2022, alerting to a consensus figure. The Court strongly urges the parties to work collaboratively to determine a rate that is both feasible and brisk. In the event that the parties cannot come to an agreement, they should notify the Court in a joint letter by that same date, at which point the Court will set a briefing schedule for the issue. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 11/9/2022) (ks) (Entered: 11/09/2022)
11/14/2022	<u>17</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Regarding FOIA Processing Rate</i> Document filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch..(Clopper, John) (Entered: 11/14/2022)
11/15/2022	<u>18</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>17</u> Status Report filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates the parties' efforts to work collaboratively to make progress on production. The next status letter is due on January 6, 2023. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 11/15/2022) (va) (Entered: 11/15/2022)
01/05/2023	<u>19</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jeannette Anne Vargas on behalf of U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 01/05/2023)
01/06/2023	<u>20</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Regarding Government's Processing of FOIA Request</i> Document filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch..(Clopper, John) (Entered: 01/06/2023)
01/10/2023	<u>21</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>20</u> Status Report filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties. The next status update is due February 9, 2023. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 1/10/2023) (kv) (Entered: 01/10/2023)
02/09/2023	<u>22</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch..(Clopper, John) (Entered: 02/09/2023)
02/10/2023	<u>23</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>22</u> Status Report filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties. The next status update is due March 15, 2023. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 2/10/2023) (ks) (Entered: 02/10/2023)
03/16/2023	<u>24</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Nunc Pro Tunc to File Joint Status Report</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Jeannette A. Vargas dated March 16, 2023. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 03/16/2023)
03/17/2023	<u>25</u>	ORDER granting <u>24</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 3/17/2023) (va) (Entered: 03/17/2023)
03/20/2023	<u>26</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 03/20/2023)
03/21/2023	<u>27</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>26</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties. The next status report is due April 20, 2023. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 3/21/2023) (rro) (Entered: 03/21/2023)

04/20/2023	<u>28</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 04/20/2023)
04/21/2023	<u>29</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>28</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties. The next status update is due on May 22, 2023. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/21/2023) (rro) (Entered: 04/21/2023)
05/08/2023	<u>30</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Stephen Cha–Kim dated 5/8/2023 re: Termination as Counsel of Record. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Cha–Kim, Stephen) (Entered: 05/08/2023)
05/08/2023	<u>31</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>30</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: Granted. SO ORDERED. Attorney Stephen Seungkun Cha–Kim terminated. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/8/2023) (kv) (Entered: 05/08/2023)
05/22/2023	<u>32</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 05/22/2023)
05/23/2023	<u>33</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>32</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties. The next status update is due June 26, 2023. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/23/2023) (rro) (Entered: 05/23/2023)
06/26/2023	<u>34</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Joint Status Report</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Jeannette A. Vargas dated June 26, 2023. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 06/26/2023)
06/26/2023	<u>35</u>	ORDER granting <u>34</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/26/2023) (rro) Modified on 6/27/2023 (rro). (Entered: 06/27/2023)
06/27/2023	<u>36</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 06/27/2023)
06/28/2023	<u>37</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>36</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties. The next joint status update is due August 2, 2023. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/28/2023) (rro) (Entered: 06/28/2023)
08/02/2023	<u>38</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 08/02/2023)
08/03/2023	<u>39</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>38</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court orders the parties to file a further status update by September 4, 2023. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 8/3/2023) (tg) (Entered: 08/03/2023)
09/12/2023	<u>40</u>	ORDER On August 3, 2023, the Court endorsed the parties' August 2 status update and ordered the parties to file a further status update by September 4. As of September 12, no such update has been filed. The Court orders the parties to file such an update by September 19. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 9/12/2023) (jca) (Entered: 09/12/2023)
09/19/2023	<u>41</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 09/19/2023)
09/20/2023	<u>42</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>41</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court appreciates this update from the parties. The next joint status report is due on October 23, 2023. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 9/20/2023) (rro) (Entered: 09/20/2023)
10/23/2023	<u>43</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 10/23/2023)
10/26/2023	<u>44</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>43</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice ENDORSEMENT The Court thanks the parties for this update. The next status update is due November 23, 2023. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on

		10/24/2023) (jca) (Entered: 10/26/2023)
11/27/2023	<u>45</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Joint Status Report</i> addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Jeannette A. Vargas dated November 27, 2023. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 11/27/2023)
11/28/2023	<u>46</u>	ORDER granting <u>45</u> Motion for Extension of Time. GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 11/28/2023) (ks) (Entered: 11/28/2023)
12/01/2023	<u>47</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 12/01/2023)
12/04/2023	<u>48</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>47</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice ENDORSEMENT: The Court thanks the parties for this update. The next status update is due January 4, 2024. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 12/4/2023) (ks) (Entered: 12/04/2023)
01/04/2024	<u>49</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch..(Clopper, John) (Entered: 01/04/2024)
01/05/2024	<u>50</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>49</u> Status Report filed by Bradley Goldstein, William I. Koch. ENDORSEMENT: The Court thanks the parties for this update. A further status update is due on February 6, 2024.SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 1/5/2024) (ks) (Entered: 01/05/2024)
02/06/2024	<u>51</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 02/06/2024)
02/09/2024	<u>52</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>51</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court thanks the parties for this update. A further status update is due March 7, 2024. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 2/7/2024) (va) (Entered: 02/09/2024)
03/07/2024	<u>53</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jeremy Liss on behalf of U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 03/07/2024)
03/07/2024	<u>54</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 03/07/2024)
03/08/2024	<u>55</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>54</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court thanks the parties for this update. A further status update is due April 8, 2024. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 3/7/2024) (va) (Entered: 03/08/2024)
04/01/2024	<u>56</u>	LETTER MOTION to Substitute Attorney. Old Attorney: Jeannette Vargas, New Attorney: Jeremy Liss addressed to Judge Paul A. Engelmayer from Jeannette Vargas dated 4/1/2024. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Vargas, Jeannette) (Entered: 04/01/2024)
04/02/2024	<u>57</u>	ORDER granting <u>56</u> Letter Motion to Substitute Attorney. GRANTED. SO ORDERED. Attorney Jeannette Anne Vargas terminated. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/2/2024) (va) (Entered: 04/02/2024)
04/08/2024	<u>58</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 04/08/2024)
04/09/2024	<u>59</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>58</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice ENDORSEMENT GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 4/9/2024) (jca) (Entered: 04/09/2024)
05/23/2024	<u>60</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 05/23/2024)
05/24/2024	<u>61</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>60</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: The Court thanks the parties for this update. A further status update is due on June 24, 2024. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 5/24/2024) (vfr) (Entered: 05/24/2024)

06/25/2024	<u>62</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 06/25/2024)
06/26/2024	<u>63</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>62</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 6/25/2024) (tg) (Entered: 06/26/2024)
07/23/2024	<u>64</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 07/23/2024)
07/23/2024	<u>65</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>64</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 7/23/2024) (tg) (Entered: 07/23/2024)
08/26/2024	<u>66</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 08/26/2024)
08/27/2024	<u>67</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>66</u> Status Report filed by U.S. Department of Justice. ENDORSEMENT: GRANTED. The Court thanks the parties for this update. A further status update is due September 26, 2024. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Paul A. Engelmayer on 8/27/2024) (tg) (Entered: 08/28/2024)
09/26/2024	<u>68</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice..(Liss, Jeremy) (Entered: 09/26/2024)