U.S. District Court California Northern District (San Francisco) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:22-cv-07663-EMC

Lindsay-Poland v. United States Department of Justice et al

Assigned to: Judge Edward M Chen

Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 12/05/2022 Date Terminated: 07/01/2024

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of

Information Act

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

John Lindsay-Poland

represented by **Heather S. Nyong'o**

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP 650 California Street

Suite 2000

San Francisco, CA 94108

415-796-4480

Email: hnyongo@cgsh.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Andrew Garo Khanarian

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP One Liberty Plaza

New York, NY 10006 212–225–2178

Email: akhanarian@cgsh.com

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David M Pucino

Giffords Law Center to Prevent Gun

Violence

244 Madison Ave

Ste 147

New York, NY 10016

917-524-7816

Email: dpucino@giffords.org

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elizabeth Vicens

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP

One Liberty Plaza

New York, NY 10006

212-225-2524

Email: evicens@cgsh.com

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William T. Clark

Giffords Law Center

244 Madison Ave

Ste 147

New York, NY 10016

415-433-2062

Email: wclark@giffords.org

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

United States Department of Justice

represented by James Bickford

U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20530 202–305–7632 Email: James.Bickford@usdoj.gov LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Adrienne Zack

United States Attorney's Office Northern District of California 450 Golden Gate Avenue P.O. Box 36055 San Francsico, CA 94102–3495 (415) 436–7031 Fax: (415) 436–6748 Email: adrienne.zack@usdoj.gov ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Pardis Gheibi

U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch 1100 L Street NW Room 12406 Washington, DC 20005 202–305–3246 Email: pardis.gheibi@usdoj.gov ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives

represented by James Bickford

(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Adrienne Zack

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Pardis Gheibi

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Amicus

Global Action on Gun Violence

represented by Amanda Zohreh Saber

Crowell & Moring LLP 3 Embarcadero Center 26th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 415–365–7452 Fax: 415–986–2827 Email: asaber@crowell.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristin J. Madigan Crowell & Moring LLP

3 Embarcadero Center, 26th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 (415) 986–2800 Fax: (415) 986–2827 Email: kmadigan@crowell.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anuj Vohra

Crowell & Moring 1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20001 202–624–2502 Fax: 202–624–3511 Email: <u>AVohra@crowell.com</u> *ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Issac D Schabes

Crowell & Moring LLP 1001 Pennsylvania Ave. Washington, DC 20004 202–654–6706 Email: <u>ischabes@crowell.com</u> ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Amicus

The Center for Investigative Reporting

represented by Diana Victoria Baranetsky

The Center for Investigative Reporting 1400 65th Street, Suite 200 Emeryville, CA 94608 (510) 809–3160 Fax: (510) 849–6141 Email: vbaranetsky@revealnews.org

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/05/2022	1	COMPLAINT against Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, United States Department of Justice (Filing fee \$ 402, receipt number ACANDC-17785699.). Filed by John Lindsay-Poland. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2, # 3 Exhibit 3, # 4 Exhibit 4, # 5 Civil Cover Sheet)(Nyong'o, Heather) (Filed on 12/5/2022) (Entered: 12/05/2022)
12/05/2022	2	Proposed Summons. (Nyong'o, Heather) (Filed on 12/5/2022) (Entered: 12/05/2022)
12/05/2022	3	Case assigned to Magistrate Judge Alex G. Tse. Counsel for plaintiff or the removing party is responsible for serving the Complaint or Notice of Removal, Summons and the assigned judge's standing orders and all other new case documents upon the opposing parties. For information, visit <i>E–Filing A New Civil Case</i> at http://cand.uscourts.gov/ecf/caseopening. Standing orders can be downloaded from the court's web page at www.cand.uscourts.gov/judges. Upon receipt, the summons will be issued and returned electronically. A scheduling order will be sent by Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) within two business days. Consent/Declination due by 12/19/2022. (bw, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/5/2022) (Entered: 12/06/2022)
12/06/2022	4	Initial Case Management Scheduling Order with ADR Deadlines: Case Management Statement due by 3/3/2023. Initial Case Management Conference set for 3/10/2023 02:00 PM in San Francisco, Courtroom A, 15th Floor. (cv, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/6/2022) (Entered: 12/06/2022)

12/06/2022	_	Commons January as to Domestry of Aleskal Takasas Einsamus and Englasions United
12/06/2022	<u>5</u>	Summons Issued as to Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, United States Department of Justice, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (cv, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/6/2022) (Entered: 12/06/2022)
12/19/2022	<u>6</u>	CONSENT/DECLINATION to Proceed Before a US Magistrate Judge by John Lindsay–Poland (Nyong'o, Heather) (Filed on 12/19/2022) (Entered: 12/19/2022)
12/20/2022	7	CLERK'S NOTICE OF IMPENDING REASSIGNMENT TO A U.S. DISTRICT COURT JUDGE: The Clerk of this Court will now reassign this case to a District Judge because a party has not consented to the jurisdiction of a Magistrate Judge. You will be informed by separate notice of the district judge to whom this case is reassigned.
		ALL HEARING DATES PRESENTLY SCHEDULED BEFORE THE CURRENT MAGISTRATE JUDGE ARE VACATED AND SHOULD BE RE-NOTICED FOR HEARING BEFORE THE JUDGE TO WHOM THIS CASE IS REASSIGNED.
		This is a text only docket entry; there is no document associated with this notice. (shy, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/20/2022) (Entered: 12/20/2022)
12/21/2022	8	ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned using a proportionate, random, and blind system pursuant to General Order No. 44 to Judge Edward M. Chen for all further proceedings. Magistrate Judge Alex G. Tse no longer assigned to case, Notice: The assigned judge participates in the Cameras in the Courtroom Pilot Project. See General Order No. 65 and http://cand.uscourts.gov/cameras. Signed by Clerk on 12/21/2022. (Attachments: # 1 Notice of Eligibility for Video Recording)(mbc, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/21/2022) (Entered: 12/21/2022)
12/21/2022	9	CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE ORDER IN REASSIGNED CASE. Signed by Judge Edward M. Chen on 12/21/2022.
		Joint Case Management Statement due by 3/7/2023. Initial Case Management Conference set for 3/14/2023 at 01:30 PM by Videoconference Only. This proceeding will be held via a Zoom webinar.
		Webinar Access: All counsel, members of the public, and media may access the webinar information at https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/emc
		General Order 58. Persons granted access to court proceedings held by telephone or videoconference are reminded that photographing, recording, and rebroadcasting of court proceedings, including screenshots or other visual copying of a hearing, is absolutely prohibited.
		Zoom Guidance and Setup: https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/zoom/ .
		(bxs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/21/2022) (Entered: 12/21/2022)
12/22/2022	<u>10</u>	STIPULATION <i>To Extend Time Within Which to Answer or Respond</i> filed by Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, United States Department of Justice. (Zack, Adrienne) (Filed on 12/22/2022) (Entered: 12/22/2022)
12/22/2022	11	MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee \$ 317, receipt number ACANDC–17847353.) filed by John Lindsay–Poland. (Attachments: # 1 Certificate of Good Standing)(Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 12/22/2022) (Entered: 12/22/2022)
12/22/2022	<u>12</u>	MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee \$ 317, receipt number ACANDC–17847390.) filed by John Lindsay–Poland. (Attachments: # 1 Certificate of Good Standing)(Vicens, Elizabeth) (Filed on 12/22/2022) (Entered: 12/22/2022)
12/22/2022	<u>13</u>	Order by Judge Edward M Chen granting 11 Motion for Pro Hac Vice as to Andrew Khanarian. (bxs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/22/2022) (Entered: 12/22/2022)
12/22/2022	<u>14</u>	Order by Judge Edward M Chen granting 12 Motion for Pro Hac Vice as to Elizabeth Vicens. (bxs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/22/2022) (Entered: 12/22/2022)

12/29/2022	<u>15</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Summons, Complaint for Injunctive Relief, Exhibits, Civil Cover Sheet, Attachments, Civil Standing Order, Settlement Conference Standing Order, Standing Order for All Judges, Order Settling Initial Case Management Conference and ADR Deadlines / Declaration served on Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, c/o US Attorney's Office, Northern District of California on 12/7/2022, filed by John Lindsay—Poland. (Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 12/29/2022) (Entered: 12/29/2022)
12/29/2022	<u>16</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Summons, Complaint for Injunctive Relief, Exhibits, Civil Cover Sheet, Attachments, Civil Standing Order, Settlement Conference Standing Order, Standing Order for All Judges, Order Settling Initial Case Management Conference and ADR Deadlines /Declaration served on US Department of Justice c/o US Attorney's Office, Northern District of California on 12/7/2022, filed by John Lindsay–Poland. (Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 12/29/2022) (Entered: 12/29/2022)
12/29/2022	<u>17</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Summons, Complaint and Exhibits, Civil Standing Order For Magistrate Judge Alex G. Tse, Settlement Conference Standing Order for Magistrate Alex G. Tse, Standing Order For All Judges of the Northern District of California, Order Setting Initial Case Management Conference and ADR Deadlines /Declaration served on Attorney General of the United States U.S. Department of Justice and Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives on 12/7/2022, filed by John Lindsay—Poland. (Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 12/29/2022) (Entered: 12/29/2022)
12/29/2022	<u>18</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by John Lindsay-Poland of Case Management Conference Order in Reassigned Case, Civil Standing Order on Discovery U.S. District Judge Edward M. Chen, Civil Standing Order General U.S. District Judge Edward M. Chen, and Standing Order For All Judges of the Northern District of California - Contents of Joint Case Management Statement (Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 12/29/2022) (Entered: 12/29/2022)
01/17/2023	<u>19</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by James Bickford (Bickford, James) (Filed on 1/17/2023) (Entered: 01/17/2023)
01/27/2023	<u>20</u>	ANSWER to Complaint byBureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, United States Department of Justice. (Bickford, James) (Filed on 1/27/2023) (Entered: 01/27/2023)
02/22/2023	21	ADR Clerks Notice re: Non–Compliance with Court Order. The parties have failed to file an ADR Certification as required by the Initial Case Management Scheduling Order. Counsel shall comply promptly with the requirements of ADR L.R. 3–5(b) and shall file the ADR Certification. (<i>This is a text–only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.</i>)(cmf, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/22/2023) (Entered: 02/22/2023)
02/27/2023	22	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER <i>TO EXTEND PARTIES' ADR CERTIFICATION DEADLINE</i> filed by John Lindsay–Poland. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of Andrew G. Khanarian)(Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 2/27/2023) (Entered: 02/27/2023)
02/27/2023	<u>23</u>	Certificate of Interested Entities by John Lindsay–Poland (Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 2/27/2023) (Entered: 02/27/2023)
03/01/2023	<u>24</u>	Order by Judge Edward M Chen GRANTING <u>22</u> STIPULATION TO EXTEND PARTIES' ADR CERTIFICATION DEADLINE.(vla, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/1/2023) (Entered: 03/01/2023)
03/01/2023	<u>25</u>	ADR Certification (ADR L.R. 3–5 b) of discussion of ADR options (Khanarian, Andrew) (Filed on 3/1/2023) (Entered: 03/01/2023)
03/02/2023	<u>26</u>	ADR Certification (ADR L.R. 3–5 b) of discussion of ADR options (Bickford, James) (Filed on 3/2/2023) (Entered: 03/02/2023)
03/07/2023	<u>27</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT filed by Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, United States Department of Justice. (Bickford, James) (Filed on 3/7/2023) (Entered: 03/07/2023)

ENCE
23 at I via a
ТО
e or of
ted 23)
3)
of
en (3)
s and 023
filed ent of # <u>5</u> red:
ate of
or /2023 en. sed
ary John 123)

08/03/2023	<u>37</u>	ORDER by Judge Edward M Chen GRANTING <u>34</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice as to David Pucino. (jlg, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/3/2023) (Entered: 08/03/2023)
08/07/2023	<u>38</u>	MOTION to File Amicus Curiae Brief filed by Global Action on Gun Violence. Motion Hearing set for 10/19/2023 01:30 PM in San Francisco, — Videoconference Only before Judge Edward M Chen. Responses due by 8/21/2023. Replies due by 8/28/2023. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit BRIEF OF AMICUS CURIAE GLOBAL ACTION ON GUN VIOLENCE IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT, # 2 Proposed Order [PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING MOTION OF GLOBAL ACTION ON GUN VIOLENCE FOR LEAVE TO FILE BRIEF AS AMICUS CURIAE)(Saber, Amanda) (Filed on 8/7/2023) (Entered: 08/07/2023)
08/07/2023	<u>39</u>	MOTION to File Amicus Curiae Brief <i>in Support of Plaintiff</i> filed by The Center for Investigative Reporting. Responses due by 8/21/2023. Replies due by 8/28/2023. (Attachments: # 1 Supplement Amicus Brief In Support of Plaintiff, # 2 Declaration In Support of Motion, # 3 Exhibit A, # 4 Exhibit B, # 5 Exhibit C, # 6 Exhibit D, # 7 Exhibit E)(Baranetsky, Diana) (Filed on 8/7/2023) (Entered: 08/07/2023)
08/09/2023	<u>40</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kristin J. Madigan (Madigan, Kristin) (Filed on 8/9/2023) (Entered: 08/09/2023)
08/10/2023	<u>41</u>	First MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice <i>Anuj Vohra</i> (Filing fee \$ 317, receipt number ACANDC–18531567.) filed by Global Action on Gun Violence. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing)(Vohra, Anuj) (Filed on 8/10/2023) (Entered: 08/10/2023)
08/10/2023	<u>42</u>	First MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice <i>Issac D. Schabes</i> (Filing fee \$ 317, receipt number ACANDC–18531570.) filed by Global Action on Gun Violence. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing)(Schabes, Issac) (Filed on 8/10/2023) (Entered: 08/10/2023)
08/10/2023	<u>43</u>	Order by Judge Edward M Chen granting <u>41</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice as to Anuj Vohra. (bxl, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/10/2023) (Entered: 08/10/2023)
08/10/2023	<u>44</u>	Order by Judge Edward M Chen granting <u>42</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice as to Issac D. Schabes. (bxl, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/10/2023) (Entered: 08/10/2023)
08/16/2023	<u>45</u>	STIPULATION to Extend Summary Judgment Briefing Schedule filed by Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives, United States Department of Justice. (Attachments: # 1 Declaration of James Bickford)(Bickford, James) (Filed on 8/16/2023) (Entered: 08/16/2023)
	<u>46</u>	ODDED CDANTING 45 DEFENDANTS! STIDLI ATED MOTION EOD
08/17/2023	10	ORDER GRANTING <u>45</u> DEFENDANTS' STIPULATED MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF BRIEFING SCHEDULE.
08/17/2023	10	
08/17/2023	10	EXTENSION OF BRIEFING SCHEDULE.
08/17/2023	H	EXTENSION OF BRIEFING SCHEDULE. Defendants' Opposition and Reply due by 8/25/2023.
08/17/2023	47	EXTENSION OF BRIEFING SCHEDULE. Defendants' Opposition and Reply due by 8/25/2023. Mr. Lindsay—Poland's Reply due by 9/15/2023. Signed by Judge Edward M. Chen on 8/17/2023. (vla, COURT STAFF) (Filed on
		Defendants' Opposition and Reply due by 8/25/2023. Mr. Lindsay-Poland's Reply due by 9/15/2023. Signed by Judge Edward M. Chen on 8/17/2023. (vla, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/17/2023) (Entered: 08/17/2023) ORDER by Judge Edward M. Chen granting 39 Motion to File Amicus Curiae Brief; and granting 38 Motion to File Amicus Curiae Brief; and granting 38 Motion to File Amicus Curiae Brief. The amicus briefs attached to the motions are deemed filed. The government may file a single brief in response to the two amicus briefs, no longer than twenty (20) pages total, by 8/28/2023. (This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.) (emclc2, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/21/2023)

		James) (Filed on 8/25/2023) (Entered: 08/25/2023)
08/31/2023	<u>50</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Pardis Gheibi (Gheibi, Pardis) (Filed on 8/31/2023) (Entered: 08/31/2023)
09/15/2023	<u>51</u>	***POSTED IN ERROR *** MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice (Filing fee \$ 317, receipt number ACANDC–18646355.) filed by John Lindsay–Poland. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing)(Clark, William) (Filed on 9/15/2023) Modified on 9/18/2023 (cv, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 09/15/2023)
09/15/2023	<u>52</u>	REPLY (re <u>35</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i>) filed byJohn Lindsay–Poland. (Vicens, Elizabeth) (Filed on 9/15/2023) (Entered: 09/15/2023)
09/18/2023	<u>53</u>	MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice <i>CORRECTION OF DOCKET # 51</i> (Filing fee \$ 317, receipt number ACANDC–18646355) Filing fee previously paid on 9/15/2023 filed by John Lindsay–Poland. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing)(Clark, William) (Filed on 9/18/2023) (Entered: 09/18/2023)
09/18/2023	<u>54</u>	Order by Judge Edward M Chen GRANTING <u>53</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice as to William Clark.(vla, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/18/2023) (Entered: 09/18/2023)
10/11/2023	55	CLERK'S NOTICE SETTING ZOOM HEARING.
		Motion Hearing as to <u>32</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment and <u>35</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment</i> set for 10/19/2023, at 1:30 PM in San Francisco, – Videoconference Only before Judge Edward M Chen. This proceeding will be held via a Zoom webinar.
		Webinar Access: All counsel, members of the public, and media may access the webinar information at https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/emc
		General Order 58. Persons granted access to court proceedings held by telephone or videoconference are reminded that photographing, recording, and rebroadcasting of court proceedings, including screenshots or other visual copying of a hearing, is absolutely prohibited.
		Zoom Guidance and Setup: https://www.cand.uscourts.gov/zoom/.
		(This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.)(vla, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/11/2023) (Entered: 10/11/2023)
10/18/2023	56	ORDER. For the hearing on 32, 35 the motions for summary judgment, the parties shall be prepared to address the circumstances in which it is permissible to consider evidence outside the administrative record in a FOIA case. Signed by Judge Edward M. Chen on 10/18/2023. (This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.) (emclc2, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/18/2023) (Entered: 10/18/2023)
10/19/2023	<u>57</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Edward M Chen: Motion Hearing held via Zoom on 10/19/2023 re 32 MOTION for Summary Judgment and 35 Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment. Matter taken under submission. Total Time in Court: 38 minutes. Court Reporter: Summer Fisher. (tmi, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 10/19/2023) (Entered: 10/26/2023)
12/19/2023	<u>58</u>	ORDER by Judge Edward M. Chen denying in part <u>32</u> Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment; granting in part <u>35</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment. The Court remands for further proceedings consistent with this decision. The Court also stays further proceedings in this suit pending the remand. (emclc2, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/19/2023) (Entered: 12/19/2023)
06/27/2024	<u>59</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER <i>of Voluntary Dismissal</i> filed by John Lindsay–Poland. (Vicens, Elizabeth) (Filed on 6/27/2024) (Entered: 06/27/2024)
07/01/2024	<u>60</u>	ORDER DISMISSING CASE. Signed by Judge Edward M. Chen on 7/1/2024. (vla, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/1/2024) (Entered: 07/01/2024)