

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:21-cv-02328-LAK-VF**

Safe Horizon, Inc. et al v. United States Citizenship and
Immigration Services et al
Assigned to: Judge Lewis A. Kaplan
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 03/17/2021
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

Safe Horizon, Inc.

represented by **Emil Natanson Nachman**
Gibson Dunn & Crutcher LLP
200 Park Ave
Ste FL 48
New York, NY 10166
212-351-6367
Fax: 212-817-9467
Email: enachman@gibsondunn.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Akiva Shapiro
Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher, LLP
200 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10166
(212) 351-3830
Fax: (212) 351-4035
Email: ashapiro@gibsondunn.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

ASISTA Immigration Assistance

represented by **Emil Natanson Nachman**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Akiva Shapiro
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**United States Citizenship and
Immigration Services**

represented by **Alexander James Hogan**
United States Attorney's Office
Southern District Of New York
86 Chambers Street, Third Floor
New York, NY 10007
212-637-2799
Email: alexander.hogan@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 05/19/2022
LEAD ATTORNEY

Dominika Natalia Tarczynska
United States Attorney's Office
Southern District Of New York
86 Chambers Street, Third Floor
New York, NY 10007
(212) 637-2748
Fax: (212) 637-2686
Email: dominika.tarczynska@usdoj.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**United States Department of
Homeland Security**

represented by **Alexander James Hogan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/19/2022
LEAD ATTORNEY

Dominika Natalia Tarczynska
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
03/17/2021	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. (Filing Fee \$ 402.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-24265732) Document filed by Safe Horizons, Inc., ASISTA Immigration Assistance. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – FOIA Request, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – Letter, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 – Letter, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 – Letter, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 – Letter).(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 03/17/2021)
03/17/2021	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed..(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 03/17/2021)
03/17/2021	<u>3</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizons, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 03/17/2021)
03/17/2021	<u>4</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizons, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 03/17/2021)
03/17/2021	<u>5</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – PDF ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to United States Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizons, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) Modified on 3/18/2021 (sj). (Entered: 03/17/2021)
03/18/2021		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Lewis A. Kaplan. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at https://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/district-judges . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at https://nysd.uscourts.gov/rules/ecf-related-instructions ..(sj) (Entered: 03/18/2021)
03/18/2021		Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: https://nysd.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/2018-06/AO-3.pdf . (sj) (Entered: 03/18/2021)
03/18/2021		Case Designated ECF. (sj) (Entered: 03/18/2021)
03/18/2021	<u>6</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to United States Citizenship and Immigration Services. (sj) (Entered: 03/18/2021)
03/18/2021		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney Akiva Shapiro to RE–FILE Document No. <u>5</u> Request for Issuance of Summons. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): the PDF attached to the docket entry for the issuance of summons is not correct; party as to whom the summons request is for must be listed first in the "TO" field. Re–file the document using the event type Request for Issuance of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the

		correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF. (sj) (Entered: 03/18/2021)
03/18/2021	<u>7</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to United States Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizons, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 03/18/2021)
03/19/2021	<u>8</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to United States Department of Homeland Security. (sj) (Entered: 03/19/2021)
03/23/2021	<u>9</u>	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE: Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial (includes scheduling, discovery, non-dispositive pretrial motions, and settlement) and Dispositive Motion (i.e., motion requiring a Report and Recommendation); All such motions: X. Referred to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Lewis A. Kaplan on 3/23/2021) (jca) (Entered: 03/23/2021)
04/01/2021	<u>10</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED Summons and Complaint, served. United States Citizenship and Immigration Services served on 3/19/2021, answer due 4/9/2021; United States Department of Homeland Security served on 3/19/2021, answer due 4/9/2021. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Safe Horizon, Inc.; ASISTA Immigration Assistance..(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 04/01/2021)
04/21/2021	<u>11</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Hogan, Alexander) (Entered: 04/21/2021)
04/23/2021		Set/Reset Hearings: Telephone Conference set for 5/12/2021 at 12:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman. The parties should call Toll-Free Number: 877-411-9748 and use Access Code: 9612281. (aba) (Entered: 04/29/2021)
04/27/2021	<u>12</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Emil Natanson Nachman on behalf of ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Nachman, Emil) (Entered: 04/27/2021)
05/12/2021		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman: Initial Pretrial Conference held via telephone on 5/12/2021. Joint Status Report due by 6/4/2021. (aba) (Entered: 05/12/2021)
06/04/2021	<u>13</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Akiva Shapiro dated June 4, 2021 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 06/04/2021)
06/05/2021	<u>14</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>13</u> Letter filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman on 6/5/2021) (mml) (Entered: 06/07/2021)
07/29/2021	<u>15</u>	LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Akiva Shapiro dated July 29, 2021 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 07/29/2021)
08/02/2021	<u>16</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>15</u> Letter filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to provide an updated status report regarding the progress of discovery and their settlement discussions by 9/2/2021. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman on 8/2/2021) (vfr) (Entered: 08/02/2021)
09/02/2021	<u>17</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Akiva Shapiro dated September 2, 2021 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 09/02/2021)
09/27/2021	<u>18</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>17</u> Letter filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc. ENDORSEMENT: Request that the parties submit another joint status report to the Court on October 13, 2021, to update the Court on the status of parties' discussions and to propose next steps. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman on 9/27/2021) (tg) Modified on 9/28/2021 (tg). (Entered: 09/27/2021)

10/13/2021	<u>19</u>	LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Akiva Shapiro dated October 13, 2021 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 10/13/2021)
10/14/2021	<u>20</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>19</u> Letter filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman on 10/14/2021) (ks) (Entered: 10/14/2021)
12/15/2021	<u>21</u>	LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Akiva Shapiro dated December 15, 2021 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Bach, Nathaniel) (Entered: 12/15/2021)
02/16/2022	<u>22</u>	The parties are directed to provide an updated status report no later than 2/18/2022. (HEREBY ORDERED by Magistrate Judge Debra Freeman) (Text Only Order) (Freeman, Debra) (Entered: 02/16/2022)
02/16/2022	<u>23</u>	LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Akiva Shapiro dated February 16, 2022 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 02/16/2022)
02/16/2022	<u>24</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>23</u> Letter filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman on 2/16/2022) (ks) (Entered: 02/16/2022)
04/15/2022	<u>25</u>	LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Akiva Shapiro dated April 15, 2022 re: Joint Status Report. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 04/15/2022)
04/15/2022	<u>26</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>25</u> Letter filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman on 4/15/2022) (jca) (Entered: 04/15/2022)
04/30/2022		NOTICE OF REDESIGNATION TO ANOTHER MAGISTRATE JUDGE. The above entitled action has been redesignated to Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo. Please note that this is a reassignment of the designation only. (laq) (Entered: 04/30/2022)
04/30/2022		NOTICE OF REASSIGNMENT OF A REFERRAL TO ANOTHER MAGISTRATE JUDGE. The referral in the above entitled action has been reassigned to Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo, for General Pretrial (includes scheduling, discovery, non-dispositive pretrial motions, and settlement). Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman no longer referred to the case. (laq) (Entered: 04/30/2022)
05/03/2022	<u>27</u>	ORDER: On April 30, 2022, this case was reassigned to me for general pretrial supervision and to report and recommend on any dispositive motions. The parties are ordered to file a joint status letter no later than May 10, 2022, providing the Court a brief statement of claims and defenses, the current pre-trial schedule, the status of discovery and whether the parties have had settlement talks or wish to schedule a settlement conference at this time. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 5/3/2022) (rro) (Entered: 05/03/2022)
05/10/2022	<u>28</u>	LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo from Akiva Shapiro dated May 10, 2022 re: Joint Status Letter. Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 05/10/2022)
05/18/2022	<u>29</u>	PROPOSED ORDER FOR SUBSTITUTION OF ATTORNEY. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 05/18/2022)
05/19/2022	<u>30</u>	CONSENT ORDER GRANTING SUBSTITUTION OF ATTORNEY, The substitution of attorney is hereby approved and so ORDERED. (Attorney Dominika Natalia Tarczynska for United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, Dominika Natalia Tarczynska for United States Department of Homeland Security added. Attorney Alexander James Hogan terminated.) (Signed by Judge Lewis A. Kaplan on 5/19/22) (yv) (Entered: 05/19/2022)
06/16/2022	<u>31</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/16/2022)

06/17/2022	<u>32</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>31</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. Parties are to submit another status update by October 14, 2022. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 6/17/2022) (kv) (Entered: 06/17/2022)
10/14/2022	<u>33</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 10/14/2022)
10/17/2022	<u>34</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>33</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. Parties shall submit another joint status report by December 14, 2022 (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 10/17/2022) (rro) (Entered: 10/17/2022)
12/14/2022	<u>35</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>addressed to Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo from Akiva Shapiro dated December 14, 2022 re: Joint Status Report.</i> Document filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc...(Shapiro, Akiva) (Entered: 12/14/2022)
12/19/2022	<u>36</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>35</u> Status Report filed by ASISTA Immigration Assistance, Safe Horizon, Inc. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another status update by February 1, 2023, detailing what discovery took place in the previous month and what is expected to take place in the upcoming month. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 12/19/2022) (ate) (Entered: 12/19/2022)
02/01/2023	<u>37</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 02/01/2023)
02/02/2023	<u>38</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>37</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: Parties are directed to submit another joint status report by April 1, 2023, updating the Court on proposed next steps. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 2/2/2023) (rro) (Entered: 02/02/2023)
04/03/2023	<u>39</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/03/2023)
04/04/2023	<u>40</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>39</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit a joint status report updating the Court on the status of the parties' discussions and proposing next steps, by May 17, 2023. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 4/4/2023) (rro) (Entered: 04/04/2023)
05/17/2023	<u>41</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 05/17/2023)
05/18/2023	<u>42</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>41</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT The parties are directed to submit another joint status report to the Court on June 19, 2023, to update the Court on the status of the parties' discussions and to propose next steps. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 5/18/2023) (jca) (Entered: 05/18/2023)
06/20/2023	<u>43</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Joint Status Report</i> addressed to Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo from Dominika Tarczynska dated June 20, 2023. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/20/2023)
06/21/2023	<u>44</u>	ORDER granting <u>43</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File. Application Granted. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motion at ECF No. 43. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 6/21/2023) (ate) (Entered: 06/21/2023)

06/27/2023	<u>45</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/27/2023)
06/28/2023	<u>46</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>45</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security ENDORSEMENT SO ORDERED. The parties are directed to submit another status update in 60 days, by no later than August 28, 2023. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 6/28/2023) (jca) (Entered: 06/28/2023)
08/18/2023	<u>47</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 08/18/2023)
08/22/2023	<u>48</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>47</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another joint status report by no later than Friday, October 20, 2023. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 8/22/2023) (rro) (Entered: 08/22/2023)
10/18/2023	<u>49</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 10/18/2023)
10/20/2023	<u>50</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>49</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another status update by no later than December 19, 2023. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 10/20/2023) (rro) (Entered: 10/20/2023)
12/18/2023	<u>51</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 12/18/2023)
12/20/2023	<u>52</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>51</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another status report by no later than February 16, 2024. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 12/20/2023) (rro) (Entered: 12/20/2023)
02/16/2024	<u>53</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 02/16/2024)
02/22/2024	<u>54</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>53</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another joint status report by no later than March 20, 2024. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 2/22/2024) (rro) (Entered: 02/22/2024)
03/20/2024	<u>55</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 03/20/2024)
03/21/2024	<u>56</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>55</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another status update by April 22, 2024. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 3/21/2024) (rro) (Entered: 03/21/2024)
04/22/2024	<u>57</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/22/2024)
06/21/2024	<u>58</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/21/2024)

06/24/2024	<u>59</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>58</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another status update by August 23, 2024. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 6/24/2024) (rro) (Entered: 06/24/2024)
08/23/2024	<u>60</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security..(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 08/23/2024)
08/26/2024	<u>61</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>60</u> Status Report filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, United States Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are directed to submit another status update by Friday, October 25, 2024. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Valerie Figueredo on 8/26/2024) (sgz) (Entered: 08/26/2024)