1	INDEX
2	PAGE
3	Appearances 2
4	Stipulations4
5 6	Witness: ELON MUSK Examination by Mr. Bankson 5
7	Witness Changes and/or Amendments Page 112
8	Witness Signature Page 113
9	Reporter's Certificate Page 114
10	
11	EXHIBITS
12	EXHIBIT 1 - 6-24-23 Musk Psyop Tweet 12
	EXHIBIT 2 - 6-25-23 Musk sees Dr. Frensor Tweet 21
14 15	EXHIBIT 3 - 6-26-23 Musk Replies to Wallace About Brody 26
16	EXHIBIT 4 - 6-27-24 Musk Reply to Zero Hedge 28
17	EXHIBIT 5 - Tab W - Musk Quote 1 55
18	EXHIBIT 6 - Tab X - Musk Quote 2 58
19	EXHIBIT 7 - Tab Y - Musk Quote 3 59
20	EXHIBIT 8 - Tab Z - Musk Quote 4 71
	EXHIBIT 9 - Tab M - 6-25-23 UN Antisemetic Meme 78
	EXHIBIT 10 - 6-25-23 Dr. Frensor Obamas Transphobia 79
24	EXHIBIT 11 - Tab I - 1-20-24 Patriot Front 1 83
25	FXHIRIT 12 - Tab .I - 1-20-24 Patriot Front 2 86

1	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are on the record.
2	Today's date is March 27th, 2024, and the time is 1:05
3	p.m. This is the remote video-recorded deposition of
4	Elon Musk. This deposition is being conducted remotely
5	with the witness and all parties in their preferred
6	respective locations. It is agreed and stipulated that
7	all parties waive any objection to the physical location
8	of the presiding officer at the time the oath is
9	administered.
10	At this time will all attorneys in attendance please
11	state their appearance and who they represent for the
12	record, beginning with the attorney taking this
13	deposition.
14	MR. BANKSTON: Mark Bankston, Farrar &
15	Ball, representing the plaintiff, Ben Brody.
16	MR. SPIRO: And I guess that's then to me,
17	Alex Spiro on behalf of Mr. Musk.
18	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Will the court reporter
19	please swear in the witness.
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1 ELON MUSK, 2 having first been duly sworn to testify the truth, the 3 whole truth and nothing but the truth, testified as 4 follows: 5 DIRECT EXAMINATION 6 MR. BANKSTON: 7 Q. Hi, Mr. Musk. Can you hear me okay? A. I can. 8 Q. Okay. Do you think you did anything wrong to 9 10 Ben Brody? MR. SPIRO: Okay. This isn't a question 11 12 you're allowed to ask by the Court, so we're not going 13 to do this, Mark, or this deposition is going to be over 14 before it starts. 15 MR. BANKSTON: I'm asking about his state 16 of mind. 17 MR. SPIRO: No, no, no. 18 MR. BANKSTON: Yes, I am. MR. SPIRO: No. You're not going to ask --19 20 you're not going to ask questions like that. It doesn't 21 have --22 MR. BANKSTON: I'm going to ask --23 MR. SPIRO: No, you're not or you can go

MR. BANKSTON: Let me read something for

24 see the judge.

25

- 1 the record, all right. As you know, as the Court told
- 2 you in Unsworth vs. Musk, the defendant's subsequent
- 3 conduct can be relevant to his state of mind at the time
- 4 of the alleged defamation.
- 5 And as they say in Warner Brothers, actual
- 6 malice may be inferred from the defendant's acts, words
- 7 before, at, or after the defamation.
- 8 And if he's sitting here today and he has
- 9 opinions about whether he did something wrong, that is
- 10 relevant to the state of mind at the time that he made
- 11 the statements. Of course I can ask him do you think
- 12 you committed actual malice, do you think you were
- 13 reckless. Of course I can ask those questions. And,
- 14 yeah, we'll go to the Court over that.
- MR. SPIRO: You didn't ask if he committed
- 16 actual malice. Obviously --
- 17 MR. BANKSTON: I didn't. I asked something
- 18 that was very relevant to that. I'd like to get him
- 19 talking about things that he did wrong --
- 20 MR. SPIRO: But that's the point. That's
- 21 not what you're allowed to do in this deposition. You
- 22 can't just get him talking.
- 23 MR. BANKSTON: I disagree --
- MR. SPIRO: You just showed your cards that
- 25 this case is DOA and you can't just get him talking as

- 1 you just put it. So you've got four bullets --2 3 MR. BANKSTON: Yes, I can. Alex -- Alex --4 MR. SPIRO: -- one, two, three, and four. 5 MR. BANKSTON: Alex --6 MR. SPIRO: You've got one, two, three and 7 four --MR. BANKSTON: All right. Hold on a 8 9 second. 10 MR. SPIRO: -- so if you want to ask him 11 those bullets, you can go through those bullets and ask 12 him. 13 THE REPORTER: One at a time, please. 14 MR. BANKSTON: Yeah, let's go ahead and 15 take a breath, Alex. First of all, I know you're not a 16 Texas attorney. I know you don't know Rule 199.5, 17 right? I know you're not even pro hac in this case --MR. SPIRO: This isn't -- this isn't 18 19 productive. You want to go ask another question, go ask 20 another question. You're lecturing --MR. BANKSTON: Are you instructing him not 21 22 to answer? 23 MR. SPIRO: You can try to ask the question
- 25 MR. BANKSTON: Are you going to instruct

24 again and I'll listen to it again.

- 1 him not to answer?
- 2 MR. SPIRO: I don't know. I'll hear the
- 3 question and tell you.
- 4 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. Mr. Musk, do you
- 5 think you did anything wrong to Ben Brody?
- 6 MR. SPIRO: Did anything wrong to Ben
- 7 Brody? Okay. You can ask that question.
- 8 A. I don't know Ben Body.
- 9 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) You're aware Ben Brody is
- 10 somebody who's sued you, right?
- 11 A. I -- I think you're the one suing.
- 12 Q. Actually, Mr. Musk, I'm an attorney. Did you
- 13 know that? I'm an attorney representing Mr. Brody.
- 14 A. Yes, but many times I found that the actual
- 15 plaintiff is the attorney.
- 16 Q. Okay. But that's just an assumption you're
- 17 making, right? Like you don't know anything about Ben
- 18 Brody?
- 19 A. I don't.
- 20 Q. Okay. You understand Ben Brody has filed a
- 21 lawsuit against you?
- 22 A. I -- in my opinion, you're the one filing the
- 23 lawsuit.
- Q. Okay. You understand -- let's try to make this
- 25 an easier way.

- 1 You understand that there's a piece of
- 2 paper on which there's a lawsuit written. And at the
- 3 top of the lawsuit it says Ben Brody, plaintiff, versus
- 4 Elon Musk, defendant; do you understand that?
- 5 A. I understand that but I view many cases and
- 6 probably this one too that the real plaintiff is the
- 7 lawyer seeking money like you.
- 8 Q. Okay. I'd like to know though, are you aware
- 9 that there's a piece of paper that has a lawsuit on it
- 10 that says Ben Brody vs. Elon Musk? That's actually what
- 11 I'm wanting to know.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. Technically.
- 15 Q. Do you feel like you have an understanding of
- 16 what that lawsuit alleges you did wrong?
- 17 A. I -- I have a limited understanding of that --
- 18 of what the lawsuit is about.
- 19 Q. Okay. Let's start --
- 20 A. My -- what I want to think it's really about is
- 21 about you getting a lot of money.
- 22 Q. Okay. All right. Let's start with the
- 23 incident that this lawsuit is based on. You understand
- 24 that this case involves a brawl in Oregon between some
- 25 right-wing extremists?

- 1 A. I -- I don't know much about -- you're
- 2 referring to a handful of posts on the X platform?
- 3 Q. No. Actually, Mr. Musk, I'm referring to the
- 4 fact that on June 24th, 2023, as described in plaintiff,
- 5 Ben Brody's lawsuit, there was a brawl in Oregon between
- 6 right-wing extremists. Were you aware that that was the
- 7 subject matter of the lawsuit?
- 8 MR. SPIRO: I don't know if that's the
- 9 subject matter of the lawsuit. I think the subject
- 10 matter of the --
- 11 MR. BANKSTON: A subject matter of the
- 12 lawsuit. And, Mr. Spiro, again, your objections to
- 13 questions in an oral deposition under Rule 195 are
- 14 limited to objection; leading and objection; form, or
- 15 objection; nonresponsive.
- 16 Those objections are waived if not stated
- 17 as phrased. All other objections need not be made or
- 18 recorded during the oral deposition to be raised to the
- 19 Court. You must not give any suggestive or
- 20 argumentative or any explanations during the deposition.
- 21 MR. SPIRO: Well, then don't say things
- 22 that are misleading and I won't --
- 23 MR. BANKSTON: No. That's not -- that's
- 24 why you should object to the form of the question.
- 25 MR. SPIRO: No, no, it's not --

- 1 MR. BANKSTON: That's misleading. Mr.
- 2 Spiro, you know -- Mr. Spiro --
- 3 MR. SPIRO: Listen, if you want to go back
- 4 and forth with me and waste your time, you can. Go on
- 5 to your next question.
- 6 MR. BANKSTON: Oh, we're going to get more
- 7 time if you keep doing this.
- 8 MR. SPIRO: No, you're not. No, you're
- 9 not. Go to the judge --
- 10 MR. BANKSTON: You're violating Rule 199,
- 11 you're not even pro hac admitted.
- 12 MR. SPIRO: Okay. Okay. You're just
- 13 giving speeches that nobody's listening to but you.
- 14 You're just doing them for yourself.
- MR. BANKSTON: Oh, they're for the record.
- 16 Mr. Spiro, they're for the Court to listen to.
- 17 MR. SPIRO: Okay. So keep --
- 18 MR. BANKSTON: And I would appreciate it --
- 19 I'm going to give you an instruction. I would
- 20 appreciate it if you would abide by Rule 199.5 of the
- 21 Texas Rules --
- MR. SPIRO: I heard you the first three
- 23 times.
- 24 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Spiro, please do not
- 25 interrupt me.

- 1 MR. SPIRO: I heard you the first three
- 2 times.
- 3 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Spiro, please do not
- 4 interrupt me. I'm asking you on the record to obey Rule
- 5 199.5. If you continue to violate Rule 199.5, I will
- 6 move for sanctions against you. So I please ask you to
- 7 obey the rules in the remainder of this deposition.
- 8 (EXHIBIT 1 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 9 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Mr. Musk, I want to show you
- 10 a tweet that you posted on the day of the brawl, which
- 11 is June 24th, 2023. Can we bring up Tab A?
- We're going to mark this as Exhibit 1. Mr.
- 13 Musk, this is a meme that you shared about psyops,
- 14 correct?
- 15 A. Yes. It's a joke.
- 16 Q. A psyop is a psychological operation, right?
- 17 A. It's -- yes, I believe that is what it refers
- 18 to, yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. And this meme jokes that there are
- 20 almost daily psyops --
- 21 MR. SPIRO: I am going to interrupt again,
- 22 and I don't really care that rule that you keep reading
- 23 because it has nothing to do with --
- 24 MR. BANKSTON: I know you don't --
- 25 MR. SPIRO: Good. The Court --

- 1 THE WITNESS: -- to the judge.
- 2 MR. SPIRO: How is this relevant to the
- 3 court order?
- 4 MR. BANKSTON: Because I'm getting to --
- 5 MR. SPIRO: This isn't a regular deposition
- 6 --
- 7 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Spiro --
- 8 MR. SPIRO: Now I'm talking so don't
- 9 interrupt me. How is -- this is a deposition governed
- 10 by a limited court order --
- 11 MR. BANKSTON: Correct.
- 12 MR. SPIRO: -- because he gave you a
- 13 limited court order on this case, so I have every right
- 14 to ask and to stop -- I'm not going to just let you do
- 15 two hours about Mr. Musk's upbringing.
- How is this tweet that is nothing -- that
- 17 is not a tweet in this case, how is this relevant under
- 18 the Court's order?
- 19 MR. BANKSTON: This is very much -- Mr.
- 20 Spiro, I don't know if you were listening to me. This
- 21 is what he posted on the day of the brawl, and this case
- 22 is about whether this brawl was being accused to be a
- 23 psyop. This is absolutely relevant to his state of mind
- 24 on -- when he calls this brawl a psyop.
- 25 I'm really -- Mr. Spiro, I really have to

- 1 ask you to please get yourself up to speed on the facts
- 2 of this case. I'm definitely going to ask him --
- 3 MR. SPIRO: Again, this isn't a real -- you
- 4 keep lecturing me like get up to speed on the facts of
- 5 this case. This isn't like a real case. This is just
- 6 some stupid --
- 7 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Spiro.
- 8 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, so --
- 9 MR. BANKSTON: Lawyers do not -- it is not
- 10 in accordance with the lawyer's creed to just start
- 11 making random statements about the alleged frivolity of
- 12 a case to another lawyer in a deposition. You know
- 13 that's not proper. You know that.
- MR. SPIRO: Do you give these lectures at
- 15 all of your depositions?
- MR. BANKSTON: I do and you can watch them.
- MR. SPIRO: In any event, this is not --
- 18 this is not a tweet that's alleged -- if you're alleging
- 19 that this tweet is directly related to the brawl, ask --
- 20 MR. BANKSTON: That's what I'm asking him,
- 21 Mr. Spiro.
- MR. SPIRO: Oh, okay. Is there some code
- 23 in Texas that you don't yell and raise your voice in
- 24 depositions?
- THE WITNESS: Why are you yelling? Calm

- 1 yourself.
- 2 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, why are you yelling?
- THE WITNESS: Calm yourself. Calm
- 4 yourself.
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: I'm very, very disturbed by
- 6 what you're doing.
- 7 THE WITNESS: You're yelling at everyone.
- 8 MR. BANKSTON: I'm very disturbed that
- 9 you're instructing the witness --
- THE WITNESS: I mean, show some decorum.
- 11 MR. SPIRO: I'm not instructing the
- 12 witness. I'm not instructing the question. Ask your
- 13 question.
- 14 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. Now that I've got you
- 15 up to speed, I can ask my question?
- 16 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, I asked you for the
- 17 relevance of how this relates to the court order. You
- 18 gave me an answer. I'm not preventing him from
- 19 answering, so ask your question.
- 20 MR. BANKSTON: All right. Let's keep
- 21 moving.
- Mr. Musk, this meme -- the question that I
- 23 had, was this meme jokes that there are almost daily
- 24 psyops, correct?
- 25 A. This is a joke about psyops.

- 1 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. But psyops for you are
- 2 not always a laughing matter, right?
- 3 A. I mean, I don't -- I don't think there are
- 4 actually daily psyops. This is --
- 5 Q. No, I get that. I understand --
- 6 A. -- a tin foil hat --
- 7 Q. Right. I get this is a joke. I understand
- 8 that.
- 9 A. It's a joke obviously --
- 10 Q. What I'm asking though --
- 11 A. -- if somebody puts -- may I finish?
- 12 Q. Sure.
- 13 A. Do you feel you need to yell again?
- 14 Q. I might.
- 15 A. Yeah. I've rarely met a lawyer with less
- 16 decorum than you, if you could be called a lawyer.
- 17 So this is a joke. Obviously --
- 18 Q. Right.
- 19 A. -- this is just a kitten with a tin foil hat.
- 20 Q. Uh-huh.
- A. And, in fact, it is making fun of the fact that
- 22 there are -- people claim psyops when often there is not
- 23 a psyop.
- 24 Q. Okay. But what I want to ask you about is for
- 25 you, this is a joke, but there are other times in which

- 1 for you, psyops are not a joke?
- 2 A. I think the vast majority of time people think
- 3 there's a psyop and there is not a psyop.
- 4 Q. Okay. That's -- okay. But let's talk about --
- 5 let's talk about that tin foil hat for a second. I want
- 6 to try to get to the symbolism of that, all right?
- 7 And if I'm -- tell me if I'm summarizing
- 8 this joke correctly: That the idea of something being a
- 9 psyop might be -- sound a little crazy, but sometimes
- 10 you see evidence or facts that make you think there is a
- 11 psyop. And, wow, that makes you want to put on a tin
- 12 foil hat like the conspiracy people do. That's kind of
- 13 the joke there? Am I interpreting that correctly?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Okay. So let me pull it back a little bit.
- 16 Would you agree with me that the idea that any given
- 17 event is a psyop is something that is improbable but not
- 18 impossible?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. Do you remember just a couple of weeks
- 21 before this meme in the -- when the Allen, Texas,
- 22 neo-Nazi shooting happened, about you using the term
- 23 "psyop" for that event?
- 24 MR. SPIRO: I'm -- I think this is outside
- 25 the court order, so I'm not going to allow you to answer

- 1 this question. You can keep going.
- 2 MR. BANKSTON: So you're going to instruct
- 3 him not to answer it?
- 4 MR. SPIRO: You heard me the first time.
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: I didn't -- I'm not sure
- 6 what that meant actually.
- 7 MR. SPIRO: He's -- he's not answering that
- 8 question. You're on I think what the judge -- the judge
- 9 would maybe let you ask some of the questions you're
- 10 asking, maybe. There's no chance in my view that the
- 11 judge would have let you go back two weeks to some other
- 12 incident. I don't think that's what the judge intended.
- 13 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Spiro, I just need your
- 14 instruction. I don't need your comments.
- 15 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, I gave my instruction and
- 16 then you started talking so I'm responding.
- 17 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. All I said is --
- 18 MR. SPIRO: And I'll make whatever record I
- 19 want to make, okay?
- 20 MR. BANKSTON: Please do.
- 21 Mr. Musk, are you going to obey -- you're
- 22 going to abide by your counsel's instruction not to
- 23 answer that question?
- 24 A. It sounds like it's outside the judge's
- 25 instructions.

- 1 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) So "yes"?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. A false flag, that's a type of psyop?
- 4 A. I'm no expert on psyops, but, yes, that would
- 5 be a type of psyop I believe.
- 6 Q. Okay. Now, a false flag, for people who may
- 7 not understand that term, that's a form of deception,
- 8 right?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. In other words, a false flag requires
- 11 dishonesty, you're falsely portraying something?
- 12 A. I believe it's in the name. If it's not a true
- 13 flag, it would be a false flag.
- 14 Q. Correct. Okay. Thank you, Mr. Musk. Let's
- 15 talk a little bit about your tweets about the brawl.
- 16 So, okay, as far as what your understanding
- 17 of this suit is, do you understand that this lawsuit
- 18 takes issue with a tweet that you posted on June 27th?
- 19 A. I don't quote exactly, but that sounds correct.
- 20 Q. Can I ask you, have you read the lawsuit?
- 21 A. I've read a summary of the lawsuit.
- 22 Q. A summary of the lawsuit?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Okay. All right. Let's see what we can do
- 25 here. You do understand that on the previous two dates,

- 1 June 25th and June 26th, you interacted with two tweets
- 2 about one of the unmasked brawlers in that brawl?
- 3 A. That is -- that is what I have read in the
- 4 lawsuit, yeah.
- 5 Q. Okay. We're going to talk about those tweets,
- 6 but first I want to verify: You were ordered to answer
- 7 some discovery, and it appears from your answers that
- 8 before your tweet on June 27th, you did not do any
- 9 searches on Twitter or any web searches like on a search
- 10 engine for information about the identity of this
- 11 unmasked brawler; is that correct?
- 12 A. That's correct.
- 13 Q. Okay. Would it be fair for me to say that
- 14 other than the tweets that you interacted with, you did
- 15 not secure other information about this unmasked
- 16 brawler?
- 17 A. I don't recall securing other information.
- 18 Q. In other words, you didn't get any information
- 19 by text or email or any other sort of communication with
- 20 anybody else about the brawler?
- 21 A. I don't recall. Not that I -- not that I
- 22 recall, no.
- 23 Q. Okay. And did you ask anybody to go get you --
- 24 let me start that again.
- 25 Did you ask anyone to go get you any

- 1 information on this unmasked brawler?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. Okay. So it'd be fair to say that the
- 4 information that you acquired about the brawler was from
- 5 the tweets that you interacted with?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 (EXHIBIT 2 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 8 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. I want to talk about
- 9 those tweets right now. So we're going to pull up Tab B
- 10 and we'll mark this as Exhibit 2.
- 11 All right. Mr. Musk, on your screen, are
- 12 you able to read that or do I need to zoom in a little
- 13 bit?
- 14 A. It's small, but I'm able to read it.
- 15 Q. Okay. So you'll see -- I'm going to kind of go
- 16 through it and we'll go through it tweet by tweet so
- 17 that we can read it together. You'll see the first is a
- 18 post from a suspended account so we can't see it, right?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 Q. And then the second is your tweet and you asked
- 21 who were the unmasked individuals, right?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And then an account called AcceptDoge tells you
- 24 -- and I think there's a typo, but it's "here's one of
- 25 them"?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Does that look right to you?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Okay. And then there's a tweet from a Dr.
- 5 Frensor, and it says, "OMFG, they are so busted. A
- 6 member of Patriot Front is actually a political science
- 7 student at a liberal school on a career path towards the
- 8 feds"; do you see that?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. And then you'll see that there are two
- 11 images from the brawl in Portland that day along with
- 12 two screenshots from Ben Brody's social media
- 13 information. Do you see their pictures of Ben Brody and
- 14 the information about him?
- 15 A. You need to zoom in, I think.
- MR. BANKSTON: A.J., can you zoom in on the
- 17 part there with the Ben Brody pictures?
- 18 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I see it.
- 19 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. So you now see that we
- 20 have pictures from the brawl as well as pictures showing
- 21 and describing Ben Brody, correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Okay. And then scroll down, your response to
- 24 that we have -- it just says, "very odd," correct?
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Okay. This was the first time you became aware
- 2 of this allegation about Ben Brody?
- A. I think so.
- 4 Q. Okay. On the quote tweet of Dr. Frensor -- can
- 5 you scroll up just a little bit? Okay. On this quote
- 6 tweet, do you see how it says -- we can see that it's
- 7 part of a thread because it says, "Replying to Dr.
- 8 Frensor." Do you see where that is?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. And then do you see below the text it
- 11 says "Show more," right?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Do you know if you clicked on the Dr. Frensor
- 14 tweet and read any of the other tweets in that thread?
- 15 A. I -- I don't recall doing so.
- 16 Q. And do you know if you clicked on Dr. Frensor's
- 17 profile to bring up their timeline and bio?
- 18 A. Not that I recall.
- 19 Q. Okay. And if you didn't do that, there was no
- 20 way for you to assess this person's credibility, right?
- 21 A. I wasn't trying to assess their credibility.
- Q. I'm not asking if you were trying to. I
- 23 actually don't think you were at all. But I'm asking
- 24 you, the only method that you had in front of you right
- 25 here to assess credibility to learn anything about this

- 1 person was to click on their profile, right? There was
- 2 no information about them in this tweet?
- 3 A. I don't think clicking on someone's profile is
- 4 an effective way of assessing their credibility.
- 5 Q. Well, couldn't you click on their profile and
- 6 take a quick look at their timeline and see if the
- 7 things that they had been saying were things that might
- 8 give red flags about reliability? Isn't that something
- 9 you could do?
- 10 A. Possibly, and that's sort of not a very
- 11 reliable way.
- 12 Q. Sure. But I'm asking that is something you
- 13 could do. If, for instance, let's say you clicked on
- 14 Dr. Frensor's account and you saw that they were
- 15 tweeting a bunch of really wacky, obviously false
- 16 things. That might give someone pause about whether
- 17 this person was reliable, correct?
- 18 A. Yeah, you'd say that perhaps that would affect
- 19 things.
- 20 Q. Do you know --
- 21 A. It is possible for people who are -- nobody's
- 22 right all the time. Nobody's wrong all the time --
- 23 Q. Sure.
- 24 A. -- so it's possible for some people to -- you
- 25 know, like once in a while, a conspiracy theorist is

- 1 going to be right.
- 2 Q. Yeah, yeah, somebody who's really, really
- 3 unreliable most of the time could be right some of the
- 4 time, right?
- 5 A. Yes. And people who are -- and people who are
- 6 reliable, could be wrong some of the time.
- 7 Q. And so, in other words, somebody who's
- 8 unreliable, if you did some homework and checking, you
- 9 might actually discover, hey, this unreliable person is
- 10 correct, right?
- 11 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 12 A. I think everyone is wrong to some degree and
- 13 everyone is right -- usually right to some degree.
- 14 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Do you know --
- MR. SPIRO: Mark, Mark, you've got to let
- 16 him answer the questions. You're cutting him off at the
- 17 end of every -- every answer.
- 18 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Musk, do you have
- 19 anything else you want to add?
- 20 A. I was saying that even if somebody is wrong
- 21 most of the time, they will still be right some of the
- 22 time, and if somebody is right most of the time, they
- 23 will be wrong some of the time.
- 24 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Agreed. Do you know if you
- 25 saw any other tweets from Dr. Frensor that day or in the

- 1 few days before that?
- 2 A. I don't know Dr. Frensor or that account.
- 3 Q. Do you -- I'm saying so you don't know if you
- 4 saw tweets from them or not either that day or in the
- 5 days prior?
- 6 A. I don't think I did.
- 7 Q. Okay. I mean, I'm asking you have you -- do
- 8 you know? Did you go and check, do you know, or is that
- 9 still an open question?
- 10 A. I don't -- I don't recall looking at Dr.
- 11 Frensor's account.
- 12 Q. There is a possibility you have seen tweets
- 13 from Dr. Frensor before?
- 14 A. It's possible, yeah.
- 15 (EXHIBIT 3 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 16 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. Let's talk about the
- 17 second tweet that you interacted with, okay? So let's
- 18 go ahead and bring up Tab C and we'll mark this as
- 19 Exhibit 3.
- So here we see, this is the following day,
- 21 June 26th, and as you see, your tweet at the bottom was
- 22 at 5:34 a.m., okay? So we're now on the second day,
- 23 June 26th. You'll see at the top there's a tweet from
- 24 Matt Wallace 888, okay? And that tweet reads, "Remember
- 25 when they called us conspiracy theorists for saying the

- 1 feds were planting fake Nazis at rallies?" And then it
- 2 has a crying laughing emoji; do you see that?
- 3 A. Uh-huh.
- 4 Q. Okay. And then in the tweet we see the same
- 5 pictures that we saw in the Dr. Frensor tweet, correct?
- 6 A. They look like the same pictures.
- 7 Q. Yeah, it's the same set of images that Dr.
- 8 Frensor had attached to their tweet, right?
- 9 A. They look like the same images.
- 10 Q. And then you replied, "Always remove their
- 11 masks," correct?
- 12 A. Yes, I think we want to shine a light on
- 13 whoever's doing these things.
- 14 Q. Okay. All right. So I want to move past these
- 15 two tweets that you saw on June 25th and June 26th. And
- 16 now I want to move to June 27th, which this is the date
- 17 that the lawsuit focuses on, the tweet that it takes
- 18 issue with, all right?
- 19 So on June 27th, you understood there was
- 20 an existing allegation you had seen on Twitter about
- 21 this Ben Brody person, the college student who wanted to
- 22 join the government?
- 23 A. I'm sorry. Are you going to show this --
- 24 Q. No. I'm asking you a question actually so
- 25 listen again and I'll ask it again, okay?

- 1 On June 27th, you understood there was an
- 2 existing allegation you had seen on Twitter about this
- 3 Ben Brody person, this college student who wanted to
- 4 join the government, correct?
- 5 A. I guess I would have been aware at the time
- 6 that there were some posts the prior day. I mean, I'm
- 7 on the platform a lot, so there are -- I mean, I see
- 8 sometimes several thousand posts per day.
- 9 Q. Sure. But what I'm saying is -- all I'm saying
- 10 is now that we're on June 27th, we know that in the
- 11 prior two days, you had become aware that there was this
- 12 existing allegation about Ben Brody?
- 13 A. Yes, I'm not -- it would not have been top of
- 14 mind, but certainly I think I probably would have
- 15 vaguely recalled it, yeah.
- 16 (EXHIBIT 4 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 17 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. Well, let's talk about
- 18 that morning. Let's bring up Tab D. All right. This
- 19 is going to be Exhibit 4. This is the exchange that the
- 20 lawsuit takes issue with, okay?
- 21 A. Uh-huh.
- Q. And we see here at the top is Zero Hedge; do
- 23 you see that?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. You know Zero Hedge is a blog with

- 1 anonymous contributors, right?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. At this time, did you -- were you -- did
- 4 you -- did you -- were you aware of Zero Hedge before
- 5 you responded to this tweet?
- 6 A. I've seen posts from Zero Hedge before.
- 7 Q. Okay. Do you feel like they're a media
- 8 organization that you're familiar with, or is this
- 9 something you just every now and then see tweets from?
- 10 And could you describe for me your level of familiarity
- 11 with them?
- 12 A. I see a lot of their posts. I don't know the
- 13 people behind it.
- 14 Q. Okay. Got you. Now, in this tweet, Zero Hedge
- 15 says, "Patriot Front white supremacist unmasked as
- 16 suspected fed"; do you see that?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. Now, based on what you'd seen at this
- 19 time, you did not contend that this unmasked person was
- 20 a federal law enforcement member, but instead was that
- 21 it was a college student; is that right?
- A. My post simply says, "Looks like one is a
- 23 college student who wants to join the government and
- 24 another is maybe an Antifa member but it's a probable
- 25 false flag situation." I also put @community notes,

- 1 which is the fact-checking system on the X Twitter
- 2 platform. So the reason I put @community notes there is
- 3 so that Community Notes can assess the accuracy of the
- 4 statement.
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. Objection;
- 6 nonresponsive.
- 7 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Do you remember what my
- 8 question was, Mr. Musk?
- A. Please restate.
- 10 Q. Okay. I'll do it again. All right. What I'm
- 11 trying to understand is, based on what you had seen at
- 12 this point before you posted this tweet, like when you
- 13 see the Zero Hedge tweet, based on what you had already
- 14 seen, you did not contend that this unmasked person was
- 15 a member of federal law enforcement and instead
- 16 contended that they were a college student; is that
- 17 correct?
- 18 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 19 A. I mean, I think my post speaks for itself.
- 20 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) No. Actually that's kind of
- 21 why I have to ask you is because I really would like an
- 22 answer.
- 23 A. I think my post is being very -- very literal.
- 24 Q. Okay. What I'm trying to figure out is it
- 25 seems to me that the Zero Hedge tweet is essentially

- 1 floating the idea that this unmasked person is a member
- 2 of federal law enforcement. And I just want to get to
- 3 the idea of that's not what you were contending.
- 4 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form. I can't
- 5 understand you.
- 6 A. I don't understand what you're --
- 7 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Let's try it this way: Were
- 8 you contending he was a member of federal law
- 9 enforcement?
- 10 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 11 A. No, because I say he looks like someone who
- 12 wants to join the government --
- 13 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Thank you.
- 14 A. -- based on the prior things -- the prior post
- 15 and -- and another may be -- you know, a probable false
- 16 flag situation. (Internet disruption)
- 17 And the reason I put @community notes is so
- 18 that Community Notes is the fact-checking system on the
- 19 platform and they can -- I'm calling on them to
- 20 fact-check the situation.
- 21 Q. Sure. We're going to talk about that too. In
- 22 fact, let's talk about that. You tagged Community
- 23 notes, which, okay, not everybody I think understands
- 24 what Community Notes is so let me try to see if I can
- 25 summarize it fairly.

- 1 By tagging Community Notes, Community
- 2 Notes, through a system of voting, had the ability to
- 3 add a note correcting the Zero Hedge tweet; is that
- 4 right?
- 5 A. That's not how Community Notes works.
- 6 Q. I thought there was a voting system that notes
- 7 are voted on, and if they get enough votes from people
- 8 of differing political beliefs and backgrounds, that it
- 9 can be displayed on a tweet. Is that not how it works?
- 10 A. That is -- the latter part of your explanation
- 11 is correct. The --
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. -- a Community Note to be surfaced, people who
- 14 have historically disagreed must agree in order for a
- 15 note to be displayed.
- 16 Q. Okay. So let's make it really simple so people
- 17 can understand what Community Notes is. Community Notes
- 18 is a system where notes are proposed by Twitter users,
- 19 and if those notes get enough votes by members of the
- 20 Community Notes community, they can be displayed on
- 21 tweets to correct them?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. It requires people who historically have
- 25 disagreed to agree. It's not simply a popularity

- 1 contest.
- 2 Q. And so if -- if a consensus among those folks
- 3 developed that said, you know what, Mr. Musk is right,
- 4 Zero Hedge is wrong, this isn't a law enforcement
- 5 person. Community Notes, if a consensus developed, had
- 6 the ability to put a note on Zero Hedge's tweet?
- 7 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 8 A. Or mine.
- 9 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Or yours or anyone's, right?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. Okay. When you said looks like one is a
- 12 college student who wants to join the government, you
- 13 were referring to the person in the screenshots we saw
- 14 earlier in the tweets from Dr. Frensor and Matt Wallace
- 15 888, correct?
- 16 A. I assume so. Those were -- I think there were
- 17 two people I referred to previously and that's what I'm
- 18 referring to here. And I'm speculating here and saying
- 19 it looks like one is a college student and maybe another
- 20 is an Antifa member, and it's a probable but not certain
- 21 false flag situation. And I'm requesting Community
- 22 Notes to dig into this and assess the veracity of the
- 23 situation.
- 24 Q. When you posted your tweet, you weren't certain
- 25 that this college student was actually one of the

- 1 brawlers?
- 2 A. That's why -- I'm not certain, that's why I say
- 3 it looks like instead of it -- you know --
- 4 Q. And, in fact, so when you said looks like, your
- 5 message was not to tell everybody, hey, I'm sure he's
- 6 one of the brawlers, but just that you had seen
- 7 information suggesting that he was one of the brawlers;
- 8 is that fair?
- 9 A. Yeah, "it looks like" means that he may be a
- 10 college student --
- 11 Q. And that would be -- excuse me. Keep going.
- 12 A. That's just -- just a literal sort of statement
- 13 of -- of my impression, which is --
- 14 Q. Right.
- 15 A. -- that it looks like just -- you know, if I
- 16 said something looks like a donut, and it doesn't mean
- 17 it is a donut; it could be a bagel.
- 18 Q. Let me try to give you an example: If you said
- 19 looks like a donut, that would mean that you had seen
- 20 information or in some way gathered data that would
- 21 support the idea that maybe that's a donut; is that
- 22 fair?
- 23 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 24 A. I think it's -- this is a very simple post and
- 25 just, you know, if you said someone -- that person looks

- 1 like my brother, doesn't mean that they are your
- 2 brother.
- 3 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Right. But you're saying
- 4 looks like one is a college student. What I would take
- 5 to mean that you -- from what we'd seen before from
- 6 these tweets, you had seen information that suggested
- 7 that this college student was the brawler, but you
- 8 weren't sure of that?
- 9 MR. SPIRO: Objection as to form.
- 10 A. I'm just literally saying this looks like. I
- 11 mean, I can see a picture of my brother and say that
- 12 looks like my brother but it might not be my brother.
- 13 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Right. But you had been
- 14 given information in the previous days that -- you know,
- 15 we saw tweets from Dr. Frensor and from Matt Wallace
- 16 saying it was this person. You weren't saying that,
- 17 right? You were just saying you had seen information;
- 18 not that you were sure? Am I fair about that?
- 19 A. I'm literally just saying that it looks like
- 20 one is a college student and maybe another is an Antifa
- 21 member, and I'm asking Community Notes to sort of
- 22 fact-check this.
- 23 Q. Let me try it this way: The reason -- the
- 24 reason that you're saying that it looks like one is a
- 25 college student is because of the posts that we had just

- 1 talked about, because you had seen those posts. That's
- 2 why you're saying this tweet, right?
- 3 A. That's probably why I'm saying this.
- 4 Q. Okay. You knew when posting your tweet that
- 5 readers would not know what information you saw to reach
- 6 this conclusion, right?
- 7 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 8 A. Well, not necessarily because what tends to
- 9 happen is there will be a sequence of replies where --
- 10 even in the absence of Community Notes, if something is
- 11 inaccurate on the system or it's a debatable issue,
- 12 there will be a series of replies that argue about the
- 13 substance of a post.
- 14 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. But let's assume I'm
- 15 the first person to read this tweet. Let's assume --
- 16 you see how here it says it was posted 30 minutes from
- 17 when the screenshot was taken and there were already 384
- 18 replies; do you see that?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Let's assume I'm reply number one. Let's
- 21 assume I saw your post one second after it was posted.
- 22 You understood when posting that tweet that if I'm that
- 23 number one reply, I would not know what information you
- 24 saw to reach your conclusion; do you agree with that?
- 25 MR. SPIRO: Objection; form.

- 1 A. Or you may.
- 2 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Or may not, right?
- 3 A. If you're the very first one, no.
- 4 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 5 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Right. And so what I guess
- 6 I'm saying here is there's nothing in the text of your
- 7 tweet that would tell me what information you relied on
- 8 to say that it looks like one is a college student; do
- 9 you agree with that?
- 10 A. In my -- in my text?
- 11 Q. Yes.
- 12 A. It does not have -- it does not have that
- 13 context.
- 14 Q. Okay. So if I'm the first reader of this
- 15 tweet, I wouldn't know if you saw something from Dr.
- 16 Frensor or Matt Wallace or somebody else? I wouldn't
- 17 know, would I?
- 18 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form. It's not a
- 19 proper question.
- 20 A. I guess I decline to answer on advice of
- 21 counsel.
- MR. BANKSTON: Are you instructing him not
- 23 to answer?
- 24 MR. SPIRO: No. I mean, if he understands
- 25 the question, he can answer it. It's not a proper

- 1 question -- (Internet interruption.)
- 2 MR. BANKSTON: Look, there's no need for
- 3 the commentary about if questions are proper or if
- 4 they're not. That's not necessary. You know it's not
- 5 necessary. You know the only reason to do it would be
- 6 to influence the witness.
- 7 So if you have an instruction not to
- 8 answer, go ahead and give it. If you have an objection,
- 9 go ahead and give it, but as far as commentary to the
- 10 witness, it's not necessary.
- 11 MR. SPIRO: No, sir. It's not -- I just
- 12 told the witness he can answer. There's nothing about
- 13 me commenting that all of these hypothetical what if I
- 14 saw this, what if I saw that questions are not proper
- 15 questions. I'm surprised you don't know they're not
- 16 proper questions so --
- 17 MR. BANKSTON: Everything you're saying --
- 18 MR. SPIRO: Can I finish? I'm making my
- 19 record. So the reason I'm making that comment is to
- 20 sort of try to signal to you that if you ask nine out of
- 21 10 improper questions, eventually you're going to get an
- 22 objection from me, and maybe just ask proper questions.
- 23 There's nothing about me saying that that
- 24 changes what he's going to answer. That's not how
- 25 witness coaching works. I'm surprised you don't know

1 that.

- 2 So in any event, all I said was that's not
- 3 a proper question. It's not a proper question. Any
- 4 judge reviewing this will tell you it's not a proper
- 5 question, and if he can answer, he can answer.
- 6 MR. BANKSTON: All right. Again, I'm going
- 7 to ask you again to obey Rule 199.5 because nothing
- 8 about what you're doing is proper and you know that.
- 9 So I'm going to ask him the guestion again
- 10 --
- 11 MR. SPIRO: We disagree.
- 12 MR. BANKSTON: -- and if he can understand
- 13 it, then he'll answer it, okay?
- 14 You knew that a reader of your tweet when
- 15 posting your tweet, your state of mind when posting this
- 16 tweet, you knew that a reader of this tweet would not
- 17 know from your tweet whether you saw information from
- 18 Dr. Frensor or Matt Wallace or anybody else? They
- 19 wouldn't know, right?
- A. They may not know immediately, but they would
- 21 know it soon after. And they would also know that there
- 22 would be many future comments -- and there would
- 23 probably be a Community Note to figure out the veracity
- 24 of what I'm saying or the probable accuracy of what I'm
- 25 saying. Anyone who uses the system would know that

- 1 there's going to be a vigorous debate about something
- 2 like this, and they would know that they could look at a
- 3 Community Note in the future to understand the -- what
- 4 -- whether this is accurate or not accurate.
- 5 And I think -- I think I really did this in
- 6 good faith, because I would not ask for a fact-check,
- 7 which is what I do by adding Community Notes. That's
- 8 asking for a fact-check on my own -- on my own post.
- 9 Q. Well, you're asking for it on Zero Hedge's
- 10 post, aren't you?
- 11 A. No. I'm asking it on my post and his post.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. People who've used the system know if you
- 14 @communitynotes, this is requesting fact-check Community
- 15 Notes, that's what it means, and people know that.
- 16 Q. All right. So let's say again that I'm the
- 17 first person who reads this. You're saying that if I'm
- 18 a sophisticated user, I would know to come back at some
- 19 later time and see how the debate has developed; is that
- 20 right?
- 21 A. No. I think that's any user who's on the
- 22 system for any period of time.
- 23 Q. Well, I don't do that. I mean, I'm a casual
- 24 user of Twitter, right --
- 25 A. That's how it works though.

- 1 Q. -- and so you would agree with me that if I was
- 2 the first person who saw this tweet and then I saw it
- 3 and I digested it and then I never cared to come back
- 4 and look again, I wouldn't see any of that information,
- 5 right?
- 6 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 7 A. I think that is -- that is basically no one on
- 8 the -- on the system, and I don't think -- I think
- 9 you're being disingenuous about what you're saying. I
- 10 don't think that's how you use the system.
- 11 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. You understand that
- 12 Ben wanted --
- 13 A. I'm very clear here and people understand that
- 14 when you @communitynotes, you're literally asking for
- 15 please check the accuracy of this statement, and would
- 16 include the -- the post that I'm replying to.
- 17 Q. Did they?
- 18 A. I don't know.
- 19 Q. You understand that Ben wanted you to delete
- 20 your tweet and make a retraction?
- 21 A. I don't recall that.
- 22 Q. You don't recall that? That's interesting.
- 23 Okay. Well, I was going to ask you why you refused
- 24 that, but if you're not -- you're not aware that a
- 25 request was made to apologize and delete this and make a

- 1 retraction?
- 2 MR. SPIRO: Objection; asked and answered,
- 3 form.
- 4 A. I don't recall that, no.
- 5 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. If you knew right now
- 6 -- knowing right now Ben is really upset that this tweet
- 7 is still up and that he wanted there to be a retraction,
- 8 how do you feel about that?
- 9 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form. How you
- 10 feel about it? How is that -- how you feel about it,
- 11 how is that relevant --
- 12 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Spiro --
- MR. SPIRO: -- now to the four deposition
- 14 topics? We're on, I guess, topic four. We've addressed
- 15 one through three. How is that relevant to four?
- MR. BANKSTON: Because in Gonzalez vs.
- 17 Hearst Corp., 930 S.W.2nd 275, a refusal to print a
- 18 retraction is evidence of an action after the
- 19 publication, but it can lend support to a claim that
- 20 reckless disregard or knowledge existed at the time of
- 21 publication.
- 22 Similarly, in New Times vs. Issacks, Texas
- 23 Supreme Court 2004, 146 S.W.3rd 144, refusal to retract
- 24 an exposed error tends to support a finding of actual
- 25 malice, and conversely, a readiness to retract tends to

- 1 negate actual malice.
- So again, I'll pose my question --
- 3 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, I'll look at those cases
- 4 but he's not answering that right now. I don't see the
- 5 relevance. I don't think those cases -- I'm pretty
- 6 confident those cases are not directly on point so I'll
- 7 review the cases so we can respond further.
- 8 MR. BANKSTON: All right. Next time I'd
- 9 appreciate it if you showed up in a deposition with a
- 10 Texas lawyer who had an understanding of Texas law of
- 11 actual malice.
- 12 MR. SPIRO: Okay. You keep filing these
- 13 silly, frivolous shake-down cases, I'll -- I'll keep
- 14 trying to think of Texas lawyers to bring to your
- 15 depositions.
- 16 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Musk, I will tell you
- 17 I'm trying to be as civil as I can in this deposition
- 18 with you and your attorney. I'd appreciate it -- these
- 19 random, insulting, professionally demeaning really have
- 20 no place here.
- 21 MR. SPIRO: You just did the same thing and
- 22 I responded in kind, so keep moving with the deposition.
- 23 You're running out of time.
- 24 MR. BANKSTON: You think that's what
- 25 happened here.

- 1 MR. SPIRO: I know this is your big day in
- 2 the sun. You're running out of time.
- 3 MR. BANKSTON: Talk about big days in the
- 4 sun, Mr. Musk, I want to talk about how you browse and
- 5 see information on Twitter. You have an account called
- 6 @elonmusk where you browse and interact on Twitter,
- 7 correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Can we bring up Tab E. All right. Is this
- 10 another account that you use to see tweets on Twitter?
- 11 A. I don't use that account. I think I briefly
- 12 had it as a test account.
- 13 Q. Well, that's what I'm asking. In the summer of
- 14 2023, right, which is when I'm seeing this post on here,
- 15 was this an account that you would use where you would
- 16 see tweets on Twitter?
- 17 A. No, I would not use this account. It was just
- 18 used for -- for testing.
- 19 Q. I mean, look, there's a tweet I see. There's
- 20 more tweets on this account, right? Were you -- like
- 21 you were posting and viewing tweets with this account.
- MR. SPIRO: Objection; asked and answered.
- 23 I don't see the relevance to the fourth question. Move
- 24 on.
- 25 MR. BANKSTON: I need to know what --

- 1 MR. SPIRO: He's not answering -- he just
- 2 answered you twice. He's not answering any more
- 3 questions about this account.
- 4 MR. BANKSTON: Well, I'm going to put on
- 5 the record why I'm asking this question in case I need
- 6 to put it in a motion, which is I need to know all the
- 7 accounts that you've used to view tweets on Twitter
- 8 during this time period so that I can tell what else
- 9 you've interacted with on Twitter.
- 10 MR. SPIRO: Well, he just told you he
- 11 didn't use this account. He already answered that
- 12 question.
- 13 MR. BANKSTON: Right. And I was asking a
- 14 follow-up about that. Because the tweet has posts on it
- 15 does not mean that you used it and used it to view
- 16 tweets at this time or am I wrong about that?
- 17 A. I briefly used this account as a test account.
- 18 There are only two accounts that I use on a regular
- 19 basis. One is my main account and the other is baby
- 20 smoke 9,000.
- 21 Q. Okay. And then you said on a regular basis.
- 22 Are there any other alt accounts that you were using to
- 23 view tweets in the summer of 2023?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. Okay. I was looking at the Twitter rules you

- 1 had in effect in the summer of 2023, and it looked like
- 2 Twitter employed people who enforced platform integrity
- 3 and authenticity, including things like crisis
- 4 misinformation; is that correct?
- 5 MR. SPIRO: I'm going to object and I'd
- 6 like an explanation as to the relevance of this.
- 7 MR. BANKSTON: Because I need to know what
- 8 kind of information he had access to. I need to know at
- 9 that time what investigations he could have had capable
- 10 and which ones he might have ignored deliberately.
- 11 MR. SPIRO: I don't see the relevance, but
- 12 I'll let you ask the question.
- 13 A. I mean, we have a team in this regard. I don't
- 14 delve into what the team does.
- 15 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Well, all I'm asking at this
- 16 point is there are people employed at Twitter who
- 17 enforce things like platform integrity and authenticity?
- 18 That exists?
- 19 A. There is -- there is -- by "authenticity," that
- 20 means essentially people who -- who do impersonation so
- 21 it's stopping people from impersonating public figures.
- 22 Q. Sure.
- 23 A. There is a sort of enforcement of the law, so
- 24 if somebody's posting something illegal, that needs to
- 25 be taken down. That would be -- if something is illegal

- 1 or, you know, in some form essentially, then that team
- 2 would take it down.
- 3 Q. I noticed there was a note for crisis
- 4 misinformation. I imagine if there's a huge public
- 5 crisis, a storm, a bomb, and somebody's spreading
- 6 information that could get people hurt, that's something
- 7 that is meant by crisis misinformation?
- 8 A. The primary system we rely on is Community
- 9 Notes, which we found to be far better than the
- 10 so-called misinformation experts.
- 11 Q. Okay. But as Elon Musk, are you allowed at
- 12 Twitter to just grab one of these employees who is
- 13 involved in platform integrity, and say, hey, can you
- 14 help me figure out if something I saw is legit? Are you
- 15 allowed to do that or is that misappropriating the
- 16 company's property?
- 17 A. That is in theory something that I could do,
- 18 but I don't. I rely upon Community Notes for
- 19 fact-checking. I find it to be the best system on the
- 20 internet.
- 21 Q. Right. What I'm just saying is are you allowed
- 22 to do that? If you were to grab an employee at Twitter
- 23 and say, hey, could you help me figure something out?
- 24 Are you going to get in trouble? Is somebody going to
- 25 come tell you, Elon Musk, you are not allowed to do

- 1 that?
- 2 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 3 A. I mean, I could ask someone --
- 4 Q. Okay.
- 5 A. -- but this is -- but the nature of our
- 6 enforcement is to enforce what is in accordance with the
- 7 law.
- 8 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) These people who are doing
- 9 their jobs, do they have access to internal Twitter
- 10 tools to help them do their job?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 MR. SPIRO: Object to form.
- 13 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) The data they have access to,
- 14 are you allowed to have access to it?
- 15 A. In theory, yes, but I've never requested access
- 16 to it.
- 17 Q. Is there anyone with the authority to say about
- 18 a piece of data at Twitter, to say to you, no, Mr. Musk,
- 19 you can't have that or you can't share that with anyone?
- 20 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form. And, again,
- 21 I'm going to ask again, what is the possible relevance
- 22 of this to the single tweet that we're here on in a
- 23 defamation case? Can you just explain that to me?
- 24 MR. BANKSTON: Sure. Because when he was
- 25 confronted with -- again, this is kind of bizarre that

- 1 I'm explaining this in front of your witness, but if he
- 2 was confronted with information that made him maybe want
- 3 to go suggest that, hey, maybe this college student was
- 4 involved in this brawl, if he had access to people who
- 5 were able to tell him or give him more data about this
- 6 and he has that authority, I need to know what --
- 7 MR. SPIRO: You're saying that if he --
- 8 your point is that he had other avenues to investigate
- 9 this?
- 10 MR. BANKSTON: That he deliberately
- 11 ignored, correct.
- 12 MR. SPIRO: I think it's an objectionable
- 13 question, but I'll let him answer it.
- 14 MR. BANKSTON: Thank you. Is there -- let
- 15 me repeat the question for you just because there was a
- 16 long objection so I want to make sure you understand the
- 17 question.
- 18 Is there anyone with the authority to say
- 19 about a piece of data at Twitter, no, Mr. Musk, you
- 20 cannot see that or you cannot share that with anyone?
- 21 A. I mean, I regard privacy as being very
- 22 important so I've never asked for the private
- 23 information of any -- any user. And as you saw in that
- 24 post, I requested Community Notes to investigate.
- 25 Community Notes I find is far better than the so-called

- 1 professional misinformation experts, and that has been
- 2 proven time and again.
- 3 Q. Well, I'm confused by your answer because I
- 4 still don't know if there's anyone with the authority at
- 5 Twitter to tell you about a piece of data at Twitter
- 6 that you cannot have access to it or you cannot share
- 7 it.
- 8 Is there anybody who can do that or like
- 9 with the Twitter files, you're pretty much allowed to do
- 10 what you want?
- 11 A. I think there would be --
- MR. SPIRO: Objection to the form.
- 13 THE WITNESS: -- it would be illegal for me
- 14 to access private information of individuals.
- 15 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. Well, I'm not talking
- 16 necessarily about private information about individuals,
- 17 but I'm talking about anything that is used by the
- 18 platform integrity team about data from the platform
- 19 itself. How they analyze the public data on the
- 20 platform. Are you allowed to see that?
- 21 A. The platform integrity is simply trying to
- 22 assess if something that is posted is illegal or not.
- 23 MR. BANKSTON: Madam Court Reporter, do you
- 24 have a count for me on how long we've been on the
- 25 record?

- 1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This is Robie. We've
- 2 been on the record for 47 and a half minutes.
- 3 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. We're going to go
- 4 just a little bit and then we'll take a quick break.
- 5 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) All right. I want to talk to
- 6 you about just a couple of weeks before the tweet, okay?
- 7 You had given an interview on CNBC talking about your
- 8 sort of state of mind and feeling about the way you
- 9 tweet; do you remember giving --
- 10 MR. SPIRO: No. I didn't hear -- Mark, I
- 11 didn't hear about the last word. I couldn't catch it.
- MR. BANKSTON: Well, let me try it again
- 13 because I'm not sure what my last word was.
- But I was describing to you how in a couple
- 15 of weeks before you made the tweet in this case, you had
- 16 given an interview on CNBC where you were talking about
- 17 your state of mind and your tweeting, about how you
- 18 approach your tweeting with an interview with David
- 19 Faber. Do you remember giving that interview?
- A. I don't remember everything about that
- 21 interview, but I remember there was such an interview.
- 22 Q. Okay. Ben Brody's lawsuit has a quote from
- 23 that interview and I wanted to get your reaction to it
- 24 to see if this is a genuine thing how you felt, right?
- 25 Mr. Faber was asking you about whether you

- 1 felt the need to restrain yourself tweeting. And the
- 2 comment that's quoted in Ben Brody's lawsuit is, "I'll
- 3 say what I want to say and if the consequences of that
- 4 is losing money, so be it." Do you feel that that
- 5 statement is a true assessment of your opinions in the
- 6 summer of 2023?
- 7 A. Well, what I'm saying is that sometimes I'll
- 8 say things that I believe to be accurate in exercising
- 9 of my freedom of speech rights, and if that means we
- 10 lose advertisers as a result, then so be it.
- 11 Q. Okay. I want to ask you about another
- 12 statement. I want to ask you about some statements that
- 13 are quoted to you or attributed to you in Walter
- 14 Issacson's book because I want to make sure that they're
- 15 accurately attributed to you. And so I want to take a
- 16 look at a couple of things that were said in Issacson's
- 17 book. Can we bring up Tab W?
- 18 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, I'm -- again, I'm going
- 19 to not allow this. This is -- how this has to do with
- 20 state of mind on June 27th, 2023, I'm not going to allow
- 21 this.
- 22 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Spiro --
- 23 MR. WALTERS: Move on to another subject.
- 24 MR. BANKSTON: -- it's literally him
- 25 describing his state of mind for how he approaches these

- 1 tweets. I don't understand why this quote that we have
- 2 here in front of us --
- 3 MR. SPIRO: Okay. You want to ask him if
- 4 he said this?
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: Yes, that's all I'm asking.
- 6 Yea, that's it. I mean, I'm not -- it's about his state
- 7 of mind in tweeting.
- 8 MR. SPIRO: Well, I'm not so sure. The
- 9 state of mind cases, I don't know in every count in
- 10 Texas, but typically do not allow things that happen
- 11 nontemporarily.
- 12 MR. BANKSTON: I mean, I just quoted you
- 13 the law that says that's not true and you can
- 14 absolutely --
- 15 MR. SPIRO: Okay. Ask him the question.
- 16 MR. BANKSTON: Yeah, let's just go --
- 17 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Excuse me. Mr. Musk
- 18 just logged off or got kicked off or something. He's no
- 19 longer on the Zoom.
- MR. BANKSTON: Do you want to take a break
- 21 real quick and see if we can get him back on?
- MR. SPIRO: Yeah, Mark. That's fine.
- MR. BANKSTON: I was going to take a break
- 24 in an hour but I figured we can just take a break right
- 25 now if you want to do that. Do you want to take 20

- 1 minutes?
- 2 MR. SPIRO: No. I mean, I don't think we
- 3 need 20 minutes, Mark. I mean, we're almost done.
- 4 MR. BANKSTON: The problem is I'm not
- 5 trying to be difficult here. I'm really not. The water
- 6 main broke in our building today so to go use the
- 7 restroom, I have to walk down the street.
- 8 MR. SPIRO: Well, okay. That's a real
- 9 thing. We'll be back in 10. Hopefully you're back in
- 10 10. If you are back in 13, no one's going to be
- 11 alarmed, but I'm going to try to make it a 10 minute
- 12 break.
- 13 MR. BANKSTON: I understand. You don't
- 14 need to keep communicating your feelings on the
- 15 ridiculousness of the endeavor I'm currently engaged in.
- 16 MR. SPIRO: Well, it's also a short
- 17 deposition so whether even needing a break is -- I don't
- 18 know it's necessary but okay, let's do it. 10 minutes.
- MR. BANKSTON: Okay.
- MR. SPIRO: Thanks.
- 21 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record at
- 22 1:56 p.m.
- 23 (OFF RECORD)
- 24 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're back on the record
- 25 at 2:14 p.m.

- 1 (EXHIBIT 5 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 2 MR. BANKSTON: All right. Let's go ahead
- 3 and put up Tab W. What exhibit number are we on?
- 4 MR. GRANT: Mark, we're on Exhibit 5 would
- 5 be our next one.
- 6 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. Let's go -- we'll go
- 7 ahead and mark this as 5.
- 8 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) All right. What I want to
- 9 ask you about, Mr. Musk, is some quotes from
- 10 Mr. Isaacson's book. And what we have here in front of
- 11 us is "I've shot myself in the foot so often, I ought to
- 12 buy some Kevlar boots," Musk joked. Perhaps he
- 13 ruminated Twitter should have an impulse delay button.
- 14 Did Mr. Isaacson -- was that an accurate
- 15 representation he made of an exchange that y'all had?
- 16 A. I don't recall that exact exchange.
- 17 Q. Okay. Do you feel like this statement is a
- 18 genuine reflection of your feelings back in the summer
- 19 of 2023 when you were participating with Mr. Isaacson?
- 20 A. I certainly -- I would say that I -- you know,
- 21 I'm guilty of many self-inflicted wounds.
- 22 Q. Okay. Would you say that as of last summer
- 23 that you knew that you had had some difficulties
- 24 restraining your impulses on Twitter?
- A. No, I wouldn't say that.

- 1 Q. Can I -- I'm sorry.
- 2 A. I do believe that the bedrock of democracy is
- 3 freedom of speech and that people should have -- we
- 4 should have freedom of speech if we are to have a
- 5 functioning democracy and that, you know, actions that
- 6 result -- that have a chilling effect on freedom of
- 7 speech, like this lawsuit, I think are contrary to the
- 8 public good.
- 9 Q. I'm wondering if you didn't think that you were
- 10 having difficulties restraining your impulses on
- 11 Twitter, why did you believe that maybe Twitter should
- 12 have an impulse control delay button?
- 13 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 14 A. That's what I said. I think that's Isaacson's
- 15 -- those -- that's not a quote. That's Isaacson --
- 16 those are Isaacson's words; not a quote.
- 17 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. Well, what I was going
- 18 to -- I was asking you about that, maybe you
- 19 misunderstood my question is was this statement that we
- 20 see here on the screen, is that consistent with what
- 21 your feelings were in 2023?
- 22 I'm sorry. Hold on. Before we go on,
- 23 there's something here in the background.
- 24 A. Let me take my -- my son just came into the
- 25 room.

- 1 (CONVERSATION WITH REPORTER)
- 2 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Mark, do you want to go
- 3 off the record?
- 4 MR. BANKSTON: Do we need to? I guess just
- 5 for a minute, yeah.
- 6 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record at
- 7 2:17 p.m.
- 8 (OFF RECORD)
- 9 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are back on the
- 10 record at 2:18 p.m.
- 11 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) My question to you, Mr. Musk,
- 12 was -- in this statement that we see on the screen was
- 13 whether the entire thing reflected your feelings back in
- 14 2023. And from what I think I understand from your
- 15 answer about the second half being Isaacson, is that
- 16 that second statement does not -- that's not an accurate
- 17 reflection of your beliefs in 2023?
- 18 A. Well, it doesn't -- it doesn't make sense
- 19 because we actually do have the ability to edit tweets
- 20 and put a time delay on tweets.
- 21 Q. Okay. So this is something Isaacson may have
- 22 gotten wrong?
- 23 A. That's -- that's just Isaacson's impression.
- 24 I'm simply saying that I -- I am -- you know, I've
- 25 certainly done a lot of things that are self-inflicted

- 1 wounds.
- 2 (EXHIBIT 6 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 3 MR. BANKSTON: All right. Let's go ahead
- 4 and put up Tab X. We'll mark that as Exhibit 6.
- 5 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) And I want to ask you about
- 6 this quote. It says, "When asked why he doesn't
- 7 restrain himself, Musk merrily admits that he too often
- 8 shoots himself in the foot or digs his own grave, but
- 9 'life needs to be interesting and edgy' he says, and
- 10 then he quotes his favorite line from the 2000 movie
- 11 Gladiator, 'Are you not entertained? Is that not why
- 12 you are here?"
- 13 In this quote, did Isaacson accurately
- 14 relay the things that you were saying?
- 15 A. I -- you have to -- I've not read the Isaacson
- 16 book. In fact, I asked Isaacson if I should read it and
- 17 he recommended that I not. Any biography is going to be
- 18 not the actual person but the actual person as viewed
- 19 through the lens of the biographer. So I wouldn't say
- 20 this accurately represents me.
- 21 Q. Okay. Have you used that quote before from the
- 22 2000 movie Gladiator, the "Are you not entertained? Is
- 23 that not why you are here" to describe your tweeting?
- A. In a joking way, but not in a serious way.
- 25 Q. Sure. Because the line here, "Are you not

- 1 entertained? Is that not why you're here," am I correct
- 2 that that describes the entertainment value of the
- 3 controversy that tweets can sometimes create?
- 4 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 5 A. Well, I think the -- you know, any medium which
- 6 is not informative or entertaining or just does not
- 7 capture the interest of the audience will fail to --
- 8 people will not tune in.
- 9 (EXHIBIT 7 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 10 MR. BANKSTON: Sure. Let's move to Tab Y.
- 11 All right. We're going to mark this as
- 12 Exhibit 7.
- 13 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) And this quote says from the
- 14 Isaacson book, "My tweets are like Niagara Falls
- 15 sometimes and they come too fast," Musk says. "Just dip
- 16 a cup in there and try to avoid the random turds." Do
- 17 you think that's an accurate quotation from you?
- 18 A. That is actually not -- not accurate. What I'm
- 19 referring to is that the things that I see on Twitter,
- 20 not the -- not the posts that I make, are like Niagara
- 21 Falls. Like -- meaning like it's the -- if you look at
- 22 the sheer number of comments, likes, interactions of
- 23 various kinds, my account is the most interacted with in
- 24 the world I believe.
- 25 It is physically impossible for, you know,

- 1 any one person to see all of the interactions that
- 2 happen. So the only way I can really gauge the
- 3 interactions is by sampling them essentially.
- 4 Q. Got you. So would it be fair to say that
- 5 Isaacson made a mistake here and that what this really
- 6 should say is not my tweets are like Niagara Falls, but
- 7 everyone else's tweets are like Niagara Falls?
- 8 A. Not exactly. It means all of the -- all of the
- 9 -- all of what I see when I use the X app are -- all the
- 10 posts that I see and all of the interactions that happen
- 11 with those posts are far too numerous to -- for any
- 12 human being to consume.
- 13 Q. Okay. So when this quote talks about the
- 14 random turds, those aren't your random turds; those are
- 15 other people's random turds?
- 16 A. I mean, I suppose I -- I could be guilty of a
- 17 random turd too, but it's -- what I'm really referring
- 18 to is that the only way for me to actually get an
- 19 understanding of what is happening on the system is to
- 20 sample it.
- 21 Like try to do -- just like in statistics,
- 22 you don't -- you do -- try to do -- you sample a
- 23 distribution in order to understand what's going on, but
- 24 you cannot look at every single data point.
- 25 Q. Okay. I just want to make sure that you're

- 1 testifying under oath that this quote was misattributed
- 2 and that you weren't talking about your own tweets and
- 3 your own tweets being random turds?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 Q. Okay.
- 6 A. This is -- this is -- this is not accurate.
- 7 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. You can take that
- 8 down.
- 9 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) In general, when thinking
- 10 about -- well, let's start this way: You use your
- 11 Twitter account to talk about news and current events,
- 12 right?
- 13 A. Yeah.
- 14 Q. And --
- 15 A. Among other things.
- 16 Q. And in doing that, you are thus a consumer of
- 17 news information, a person -- like as a person, you
- 18 consume news information, right?
- 19 A. I contribute content and I consume content on
- 20 the X platform.
- 21 Q. Now, when consuming news content, you believe
- 22 that Twitter is a better source of information than say
- 23 traditional news, right?
- 24 A. I do.
- 25 Q. Okay. You think one problem with traditional

- 1 news is they're too slow, correct?
- 2 A. Their latency, yes, they will often take
- 3 several days to write an article and then still be
- 4 incorrect in what they write.
- 5 Q. Okay. Let's look at Tab G. I want to show you
- 6 this tweet from the day of the brawl, okay? And you
- 7 will see that there's someone complaining about using
- 8 Google News and their complaints about it. And your
- 9 response is "The thing about traditional news is by the
- 10 time they actually publish anything, it's not news
- 11 anymore." That's consistent with what we've just been
- 12 talking about, right?
- 13 A. The -- yes, the -- the traditional -- the
- 14 legacy news industry is slow to publish and nonetheless
- 15 wrong in what they publish and with no one to correct
- 16 them. Whereas when things are published on Twitter,
- 17 they may be incorrect but they are swiftly corrected.
- 18 Q. Well, for instance, this tweet about Ben Brody,
- 19 it wasn't swiftly corrected, was it?
- 20 A. I suspect that in the comment -- comments that
- 21 followed there were -- while I did not see them, there
- 22 were many rebuttals to what I said.
- 23 Q. Right. But isn't it --
- 24 A. And there may be a Community Note -- since I
- 25 asked -- since I did tag Community Notes to assess the

- 1 accuracy of the post, that there may be a Community Note
- 2 on that as well.
- 3 Q. But you don't know that, right?
- 4 A. I don't know that.
- 5 Q. Right. I mean, there's not, I can tell you,
- 6 but -- let me try it this way: Traditional news takes
- 7 time to publish things whereas on Twitter, you're
- 8 reading about events before the news can even cover
- 9 them. Is that right?
- 10 MR. SPIRO: What's the relevance of this
- 11 question to the fourth --
- MR. BANKSTON: His state of mind upon the
- 13 information he relied on it and why he relied on it.
- MR. SPIRO: No, I don't see that. I don't
- 15 see the relevance of this question. Don't answer that.
- MR. BANKSTON: I need you to give him an
- 17 instruction.
- 18 MR. SPIRO: I'm instructing you not to --
- 19 not to answer.
- MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Musk, are you going to
- 21 obey that instruction from your attorney?
- A. I think I should listen to what my attorney
- 23 says.
- 24 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. You've called yourself
- 25 a citizen journalist, right?

- 1 A. I encourage everyone to be a citizen
- 2 journalist.
- 3 Q. Right. And, in fact, you advocate getting
- 4 information about news and events from anonymous people
- 5 on Twitter.
- 6 A. I think it's important to allow people to be
- 7 anonymous so that they are able to report things
- 8 accurately and not face repercussions from their
- 9 employer or from others.
- 10 Q. Okay. You can and do use your Twitter account
- 11 to promote the company's interest, the company being X
- 12 Corp?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. The engagement -- well, let's talk about it
- 15 this way: Before you ever purchased Twitter, you were a
- 16 popular user on the platform, right?
- 17 A. Yeah, I believe I -- I may have been -- I think
- 18 I was either the first or second most interacted with
- 19 account on the platform before the acquisition.
- 20 Q. Now, before the acquisition, Twitter was
- 21 getting a free benefit from the user engagement that you
- 22 created, correct?
- 23 A. Essentially, yes.
- Q. And then now after the acquisition, that's no
- 25 longer true; you personally benefit from the engagement

- 1 you create because it's your company, right?
- 2 MR. SPIRO: Objection. Instruct you not to
- 3 answer. You can tell me the relevance of -- of these
- 4 questions --
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: I need to -- I need to
- 6 establish the level of care that he was required to have
- 7 and I need to determine whether this is purely a
- 8 personal Twitter account or whether this Twitter account
- 9 is intended to do something else.
- 10 MR. SPIRO: I don't see the relevance of
- 11 the question. I'm going to instruct him --
- MR. BANKSTON: Well, it's going to affect
- 13 his level of care.
- 14 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, I disagree so I'm going
- 15 to instruct him not to answer.
- MR. BANKSTON: Okay. So I'm just going to
- 17 make it clear for the record, that in order to establish
- 18 under scripts the requisite level of care that I'll need
- 19 to be proving in this case, I've been unable to ask
- 20 questions that will help me ascertain --
- 21 MR. SPIRO: Well, what question are you
- 22 trying to ask that goes to level of care as in the case
- 23 law?
- MR. BANKSTON: I'm trying -- because the
- 25 level of care will depend on the purpose of the speech

- 1 itself, whether it has a commercial or noncommercial
- 2 basis, whether it is a purely private communication,
- 3 whether it is a communication made by one who is engaged
- 4 in spreading media for profit. All of these things and
- 5 whether it has a commercial character is all relevant --
- 6 MR. SPIRO: But you -- but it's in the
- 7 record, he owns Twitter. He owns X.
- 8 A. I think I can answer this question --
- 9 MR. BANKSTON: Hold on. You may be right.
- 10 Hold on. Mr. Musk, hold on. There's no question to
- 11 you.
- 12 Alex, you may be right about that. If
- 13 you're willing to just go ahead and stipulate he is the
- 14 owner of Twitter, that is not a purely personal account,
- 15 that account also advances the interest of the company,
- 16 we're done and I won't have to ask any more questions.
- MR. SPIRO: Well, Mr. Musk said he wants to
- 18 -- I'll let him answer the question if you want to
- 19 rephrase it.
- 20 MR. BANKSTON: Sure.
- 21 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. So let's go back to
- 22 the question that we had, which was now that you've
- 23 acquired the company, Twitter is no longer getting a
- 24 free benefit. I mean, this benefits you as well, your
- 25 engagement that you create for the company; is that

- 1 correct?
- 2 A. Not necessarily. So I -- I believe my posting
- 3 has really remained unchanged before and after the
- 4 acquisition.
- 5 The -- and going back to the sort of
- 6 self-inflected wounds, the Kevlar shoes, I think there's
- 7 -- I've probably done -- I may have done more to
- 8 financially impair the company than to help it, but
- 9 certainly I -- I do not guide my posts by what is
- 10 financially beneficial but what I believe is interesting
- 11 or important or entertaining to the public.
- 12 So that's, you know, if -- in this specific
- 13 case, if I wanted to have it be -- receive a lot of
- 14 distribution, I would have made it a primary tweet or a
- 15 quoted tweet, which I did not. It was simply a reply.
- 16 The replies get 100 times less attention than a primary
- 17 tweet. So this was certainly not any attempt to
- 18 generate advertising revenue. In fact, generally
- 19 advertisers will not want to advertise with content that
- 20 is contentious.
- 21 Q. Well, I understand you said that this was a
- 22 reply and that less people saw it but --
- 23 A. By 100, yes.
- Q. You do understand that the amount of people who
- 25 saw this, who have viewed this tweet is equivalent to

- 1 all 30 major league baseball stadiums filled to
- 2 capacity? You wouldn't dispute that? I mean, we're
- 3 talking over a million people.
- 4 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 5 A. Yeah, that's actually -- that may seem like a
- 6 large number, but it is not compared to the fact -- I
- 7 believe there are something on the order of five to
- 8 eight trillion views per year so a million is really --
- 9 Q. Not a big deal?
- 10 A. -- hit or miss, yeah.
- 11 Q. Not a big deal that this went out to that many
- 12 people?
- 13 A. Correct. And more of a -- this is the kind of
- 14 thing where advertisers, when it's contentious, will not
- 15 advertise, which means we do not get revenue from it.
- 16 Q. After you took over the company, have you ever
- 17 given any instructions or taken any steps to have users
- 18 see your tweets in particular more often?
- 19 A. No. There was an error at one point that
- 20 caused for one day people to see my posts, but the rules
- 21 apply to me otherwise as they do to everyone else.
- 22 There are no special rules for me.
- 23 Q. Okay. I want to talk about --
- 24 A. I should mention that our algorithm is open
- 25 source as is the -- meaning anyone can see the code for

- 1 the recommendation algorithm. They can see that there's
- 2 nothing special for me, and the Community Notes, which
- 3 is I think the best fact-checking system on the internet
- 4 also is open source as is all the data.
- 5 Q. Okay. I want to talk about on the day you had
- 6 this tweet, on June 27th, I want to talk about if in
- 7 your mind you were aware or considering any warnings you
- 8 had been given say in the past few months about the
- 9 level of care you were showing in your tweets.
- 10 So I want to ask you some specific things
- 11 about that, okay? And so the time period I want you to
- 12 concentrate on is the approximately six months leading
- 13 up to this tweet, okay? So the end of 2022 up to mid
- 14 2023.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And during that time, I want to ask you about
- 17 some situations, if people have ever voiced concern
- 18 about the level of care you were showing when tweeting
- 19 about factual events.
- 20 And the first one I want to ask you about
- 21 is do you remember tweeting a conspiracy theory about
- 22 the attack on Paul Pelosi?
- 23 A. I do remember replying, again, not -- a reply
- 24 is -- if you want something to get attention, you do it
- 25 as a primary post. A reply will get actually somewhere

- 1 between 100 and 1,000 times less attention. And I -- I
- 2 read an article in a newspaper or what claimed to be a
- 3 newspaper which seemed to be odd, and I did that as a
- 4 reply, which is a low visibility post.
- 5 Q. Okay. All I just need to know is if you
- 6 remembered that event happening, because my question to
- 7 you is --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. -- do you remember, was there anybody in your
- 10 life -- and let me preface this, not your lawyers. I
- 11 don't want to know if your lawyers talked to you about
- 12 anything. Any conversations you had with your lawyers
- 13 are totally private, okay?
- 14 But are there any conversations you had
- 15 with anybody in your life where they warned you about
- 16 the level of care you were showing when tweeting about
- 17 factual events relating to that Pelosi tweet?
- 18 A. I don't recall anything relating -- anyone
- 19 saying anything related to that Pelosi post. But that
- 20 was -- that was the reply post I think just wondering if
- 21 there's more to this picture than met the eye. And
- 22 based on a -- what I thought was I think the Santa
- 23 Monica Times or something like that. That turned out to
- 24 be somewhat of a bogus publication and I deleted the
- 25 post shortly thereafter, like within a few hours.

- 1 (EXHIBIT 8 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 2 MR. BANKSTON: All right. Can we bring up
- 3 Tab Z. We're going to be marking this -- I believe this
- 4 is Exhibit 8. This is another quote from Mr. Isaacson's
- 5 book I want to ask you about, and it's referring to the
- 6 Pelosi tweet.
- 7 And it states Musk's tweet showed his
- 8 growing tendency like his father to read wacky fake news
- 9 sites purveying conspiracy theories, a problem that
- 10 Twitter had writ large. He quickly deleted the tweet,
- 11 apologized, and later said privately it was one of his
- 12 dumbest mistakes. It was also a costly one.
- Now, I understand some of this is
- 14 Mr. Isaacson's opinion, but in terms of the facts he
- 15 described, I believe you've already confirmed for me
- 16 this is correct, that you deleted the tweet and
- 17 apologized for it; is that right?
- 18 A. I don't think I have a growing tendency to read
- 19 fake news sites. I aspire to read the most accurate
- 20 information possible.
- 21 Q. Sure. I'm just asking you about these -- I
- 22 understand that Isaacson's going to characterize it and
- 23 other people are going to have their opinions too. What
- 24 I'm asking is the factual information in this tweet,
- 25 that you deleted it and you apologized, that's correct?

- 1 A. That is correct.
- Q. Did you later say privately it was one of your
- 3 dumbest mistakes?
- 4 A. I don't recall -- I've made some pretty dumb
- 5 mistakes. I'm not sure this would qualify as one of the
- 6 dumbest.
- 7 Q. Okay. Would you say it's a mistake?
- 8 A. Yes, that's why I deleted it --
- 9 Q. Okay.
- 10 A. -- and apologized.
- 11 Q. Okay. If -- you can take that down.
- 12 If tweeting of false conspiracy theories
- 13 about the Pelosis, who are public figures, is a mistake,
- 14 isn't tweeting a false conspiracy theory about a
- 15 noncelebrity, powerless guy like Ben Brody, isn't that
- 16 even worse?
- MR. SPIRO: Objection. And can you explain
- 18 to me what the relevance of that is?
- MR. BANKSTON: Yeah, because he's going to
- 20 give me an answer which is really relevant to his
- 21 feelings on actual malice.
- 22 A. Well, the post that you're referring where I
- 23 actually asked for it to be fact-checked, you know, I
- 24 think that is -- I don't -- I don't -- I actually don't
- 25 state that anything is anything, but simply that -- you

- 1 know, from that post that it looks like it could be.
- 2 And then I request Community Notes to fact-check.
- 3 Q. But wait, in your Pelosi tweet, didn't you say
- 4 there's a tiny possibility that this could be more than
- 5 it seems and that was a mistake, so why isn't it a
- 6 mistake to say this is probably the case with this kid?
- 7 Why is that different?
- 8 MR. SPIRO: Objection; improper question.
- 9 A. Well, I asked for it to be fact-checked by
- 10 Community Notes.
- 11 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Right. So I mean basically
- 12 your thesis is that -- you're depending on someone to
- 13 come along after the fact and determine whether you said
- 14 is true or false; is that right?
- 15 A. I'm asking to be corrected.
- 16 Q. Right. After the fact. After it's already
- 17 been said and out to the world, right?
- 18 A. Well, how are you supposed to be corrected if
- 19 it's not already said?
- 20 Q. Thank you, Mr. Musk. I think you already
- 21 answered this, but let me make sure I -- I heard you
- 22 correctly.
- 23 Did you recognize in the summer of 2023
- 24 that you had a tendency to read wacky fake news?
- A. I don't think -- I have a tendency to try to

- 1 find -- I aspire to be as truthful and accurate as
- 2 possible and -- and to that -- that is actually the goal
- 3 of the X, formerly known as Twitter system, is to be the
- 4 most accurate and timely source of information on the
- 5 internet. That's why we put so much effort into
- 6 Community Notes, which I'm confident is the best
- 7 fact-checking system on the internet.
- 8 Q. Did you have anybody in your life who
- 9 approached you to give you any warnings about the level
- 10 of care you were showing while tweeting about factual
- 11 events concerning the tweets that you were making about
- 12 Yoel Roth?
- 13 A. No, I don't recall that.
- 14 Q. Nobody talked to you about that?
- 15 A. Not that I recall.
- 16 Q. Okay. What about -- same question --
- 17 A. Is there something specific about Yoel Roth
- 18 that you want -- you want to ask about?
- 19 Q. Yes, very specific.
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 Q. Very specifically, were there people in your
- 22 life -- in your life at all who approached you to warn
- 23 you about the level of care you were showing when
- 24 tweeting about Yoel Roth?
- 25 A. I don't recall anyone doing that.

- 1 Q. Okay. Same question for Haraldur Thorleifsson.
- 2 Do you remember who that is?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Okay. Did anybody warn you about your tweets
- 5 about him and the level of care you were showing?
- 6 A. Well, he -- he actually responded to me
- 7 directly and I corrected myself, and I would say that at
- 8 this point he and I are friends.
- 9 Q. Okay. Apart from Mr. Thorleifsson, did anybody
- 10 bring their concerns to you about those tweets?
- 11 A. Not that I recall. I mean, if there were -- I
- 12 think there was some people that replied that they
- 13 thought he was a great guy, and I was like, okay, I'll
- 14 take that under consideration, and I think he is a great
- 15 guy.
- 16 Q. A month before the events of this case with the
- 17 neo-Nazi mass shooting in Allen, Texas --
- 18 MR. SPIRO: Look, I'm going to object
- 19 again. I was going to let you do a couple of these
- 20 because it's not worth necessarily arguing about each
- 21 and every one, even though I don't think it's relevant.
- 22 But you're now backdooring all this stuff in through the
- 23 fourth category that the judge proposed when in the
- 24 judge's instructions they very much limit the tweets in
- 25 question in this case. And so we're not going to do any

1 more on it.

- 2 So I'm instructing him not to answer any
- 3 more questions about any other tweets in this case for
- 4 the rest of this deposition. You can go to the judge if
- 5 you don't like that instruction.
- 6 MR. BANKSTON: Let's put it on the record
- 7 that your statement is just incorrect. The order does
- 8 not limit me to the tweets in this case --
- 9 MR. SPIRO: We disagree. We disagree
- 10 whether -- whether the judge is sitting here -- we
- 11 disagree whether if the judge was sitting here would
- 12 allow you to go through each and every tweet so.
- 13 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. I'm going to start
- 14 over before you interrupted me, and I am going to go
- 15 ahead and state what I said I need to put on the record.
- 16 Again, this is not for you; this is for the judge,
- 17 right?
- 18 I am now being told that there are events
- 19 that I want to talk to him about about whether he's been
- 20 given warnings about his level of care. These are not
- 21 about tweets in the case. These are about the topic on
- 22 his state of mind at the time the alleged defamatory
- 23 statement was allegedly published, and warnings he may
- 24 have received in advance of that tweet about the level
- 25 of care that he was habitually showing are clearly

- 1 relevant.
- 2 I've now been told I'm not going to be
- 3 allowed to ask any more questions about that, so I'm
- 4 going to have to move on.
- 5 Madam Court Reporter, can you let me know
- 6 where we are on time -- or videographer?
- 7 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Yes. You're at one hour
- 8 and 20 minutes exactly.
- 9 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) All right. So one thing I
- 10 want to talk to you about is that we had mentioned
- 11 before these tweets from Dr. Frensor and Matt Wallace
- 12 888. Do you remember talking about those?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Okay. I know that we're not sure -- like I
- 15 know that you don't have knowledge sitting here today
- 16 whether or not you saw additional tweets from these
- 17 people, whether you saw their profiles, so I know that's
- 18 not something you have personal knowledge of today.
- 19 But what I wanted to do -- well, first let
- 20 me start this way: When you click a user's profile, a
- 21 timeline comes up and it loads the first several tweets
- 22 that they have on their page, correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Okay. And then you can either scroll down and
- 25 you can just keep going on their tweets, right?

- 1 A. You -- yes.
- 2 Q. Okay. But when you first load it up, it just
- 3 loads the first several from, you know, the past several
- 4 that they've had, right?
- 5 A. The most recent, yes.
- 6 Q. In chronologic order, right. Okay. So what I
- 7 want to do is I know you don't know -- I want to show
- 8 you some tweets from that -- from that timeline and you
- 9 can tell me if you've seen these tweets or not. Does
- 10 that sound okay? Are we able to do that?
- 11 A. Yeah.
- 12 (EXHIBIT 9 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 13 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) All right. So first I want
- 14 to talk about Dr. Frensor, okay? And so I want to show
- 15 you the tweets that are on the timeline on the date that
- 16 you saw the tweet.
- 17 So can we first bring up Tab M. Okay. Mr.
- 18 Musk, this as you see is a tweet from June 25th, 2023,
- 19 at 12:06 p.m., okay?
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 Q. And here it says at the top, "Is this meme
- 22 insensitive to Jewish persons?" And then there's a meme
- 23 of the United Nations' logo that says, "Founded in 1945
- 24 to end all wars, the United Nations. The world has been
- 25 at war ever since." Do you know if you saw this?

- 1 A. I have not seen this.
- Q. Okay. Would this have triggered a red flag as
- 3 to this person's credibility?
- 4 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 5 A. I mean, I think it's a dubious post, but it
- 6 suggests anti-Semitism.
- 7 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Correct. So what I'm asking
- 8 you though, not whether -- I think we all know it
- 9 reflects anti-Semitism. I'm asking does this trigger
- 10 red flags as to this person's reliability?
- 11 A. I would say, yes, it probably does.
- 12 Q. Let's go ahead and look at Tab M.
- 13 A. But if you're suggesting that in order to reply
- 14 to anyone, you have to scroll through all of their
- 15 posts, that would make it impossible to use the system.
- 16 Q. All right. We're looking now at Tab M. We're
- 17 going to mark this as -- I'm sorry. I don't believe we
- 18 marked that last exhibit. So Tab M, the meme we just
- 19 looked at, that would be Exhibit 9, correct?
- 20 MR. GRANT: Correct.
- 21 (EXHIBIT 10 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- MR. BANKSTON: Correct. There we go. So
- 23 this Tab N we're going to mark as Exhibit 10. This is a
- 24 picture of a photoshopped meme of the president and
- 25 former first lady Obama where it has a shirt that was --

- 1 on Michelle Obama's shirt it says, I come in peace, and
- 2 the Barack Obama T-shirt says I'm peace.
- 3 You would agree with me this is a joke
- 4 based on the lie that Michelle Obama is transgender?
- 5 A. I'm not sure I'd read that much into it, but
- 6 it's -- it's clearly -- this account is not a fan of
- 7 Barack Obama.
- 8 Q. Would you have taken -- if you had seen --
- 9 first of all, have you seen this tweet? Did you see
- 10 this tweet?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Okay. Would you have -- would this have
- 13 triggered a red flag as to this person's reliability?
- 14 A. It would've simply I think indicated that they
- 15 are a -- probably not a supporter of Barack Obama.
- 16 Q. Right. But would you think that they're a
- 17 reasonable person who is reliable? Would that trigger
- 18 any flags for you?
- 19 A. Well, I think one has to give some allowance
- 20 for a sense of humor and satire and parody.
- 21 Q. Is that what this is to you or is this just
- 22 bigotry?
- 23 MR. SPIRO: Objection. This has nothing to
- 24 do with this case. And we're not going to do any more
- 25 hypothetical, if you had seen these tweets, what would

- 1 your reaction have been, or if you had seen this, what
- 2 would in this hypothetical world.
- 3 I understand your point that if he had
- 4 checked, he could have seen these things. The point has
- 5 been made. It's clear. We're not doing any more
- 6 questions on this.
- 7 MR. BANKSTON: So you're going to instruct
- 8 him not to answer on something that you think the point
- 9 is clear and is relevant? That's your --
- 10 MR. SPIRO: No, no, I don't think any of
- 11 this is relevant at all.
- 12 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. So let's go ahead --
- 13 MR. SPIRO: In fact, I know it's not -- I
- 14 know it's not relevant and I know it's not -- and it
- 15 violates the Court's order. So no, I let you answer --
- 16 ask a couple of questions on it simply because I know
- 17 that you want to and I'm not trying to interrupt this
- 18 and get this over with.
- 19 But at the same time, you're just harassing
- 20 him about unrelated things and you're doing it on
- 21 purpose and it has nothing to do with anything --
- MR. BANKSTON: No, I'm not.
- 23 MR. SPIRO: -- so we're doing -- we're done
- 24 on that.
- MR. BANKSTON: Here's the thing. I'm going

- 1 to go ahead and make this record again for the Court
- 2 because, once again, I've been shut down in the relevant
- 3 topic area.
- 4 I am facing a situation where I must prove
- 5 certain facts which may have triggered different duties
- 6 in this case. One of those is not a subjective analysis
- 7 of whether the source is reliable, but an objective
- 8 analysis of the source is reliable.
- 9 And if that source is unreliable, there is
- 10 an arguable basis that a defendant will have to exercise
- 11 greater care, and that that could reflect more actual
- 12 malice if the person purposefully avoided any
- 13 investigation into the credibility of an unreliable
- 14 person.
- 15 I would like to establish (a) whether he
- 16 has seen these tweets as though he has already said he
- 17 does not know and cannot tell me what tweets from these
- 18 people he has seen. And (2) I would like to establish
- 19 these people are unreliable.
- 20 I understand that you're instructing the
- 21 witness not to answer it, and so I will have to add that
- 22 to whatever relief we're going to seek from the Court.
- 23 All right, Mr. Musk, let's go ahead and
- 24 take that down.
- You would agree with me that even after

- 1 this suit, you're still promoting the idea that there
- 2 may be a conspiracy or false flag behind neo-Nazi
- 3 demonstrators that we're seeing in the streets?
- 4 A. I think we have to consider that that is a
- 5 possibility. Do I think it is likely? No. But do I
- 6 think it is impossible? I think it's also not
- 7 impossible.
- 8 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. Let's take a look at
- 9 Tab I. I believe we will be marking this as Exhibit 9.
- 10 MR. GRANT: 11, Mark.
- 11 MR. BANKSTON: Wow, we're getting up there.
- 12 (EXHIBIT 11 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- 13 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) This is Exhibit 11. Let's go
- 14 ahead and scroll out of this so you can see the whole
- 15 tweet. We might need to be a little more than that.
- 16 Yeah, we're going to have to go up from top to down.
- 17 So I want to ask you first, do you remember
- 18 in January that there was another event, another white
- 19 supremacist demonstration that involved masked white
- 20 supremacist protestors; do you remember that?
- 21 A. I vaguely remember that -- something like that.
- 22 Q. Okay. So I want to go down these tweets really
- 23 quick. We have first embedded in the quote tweet, I'm
- 24 going to start there, with Ian Miles Cheong. All right.
- 25 He says "What's the deal with these Patriot Front guys'

- 1 vehicles? Their license plates are completely blank."
- 2 And then we have an account called Wall
- 3 Street Silver who quotes that tweet and says, "The fact
- 4 that the legacy media shows zero curiosity about
- 5 unmasking these guys tells us 100 percent these are
- 6 federal agents or paid stooges of one of the agencies.
- 7 The media has been instructed by the FBI to just report
- 8 that Patriot Front exists, white supremacy group, and
- 9 don't dig any deeper." Let's go ahead and scroll down.
- 10 A. Yeah, I wouldn't agree with that statement.
- 11 Q. The next tweet from Wall Street Silver says,
- 12 "If Patriot Front was actually a real organic white
- 13 supremacy group, the media would be all over this story
- 14 to expose every member and ruin their lives. The fact
- 15 that this is not happening confirms they are feds."
- Then there's a response to these tweets from
- 17 you, and it says, "Seems like they should be followed
- 18 and unmasked. Why doesn't the media or government care
- 19 about their identities," correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Okay. So this I think again is reflecting the
- 22 concern that you were stating earlier that you think it
- 23 is a possibility, though unlikely, that these people
- 24 could be involved in some sort of false flag?
- 25 A. Yes, and I believe -- I mean the FBI has

- 1 testified that there have been FBI agents in some of
- 2 these -- some of these demonstrations but he would not
- 3 speak to the number -- which specific demonstrations and
- 4 how many there were. So the FBI director is on record
- 5 as saying that there are at least some FBI agents that
- 6 are embedded in these organizations.
- 7 Q. I'm wondering -- having you brought that up,
- 8 are you aware of, sitting here today -- or actually let
- 9 me rephrase that.
- Were you aware of any information as of
- 11 June 27th, 2023, similar information that would suggest
- 12 that it has been confirmed that college students or
- 13 Antifa members were impersonating white supremacist
- 14 members?
- 15 A. I don't know confirmed, but I think this is
- 16 certainly a possibility. I mean, and my post there I
- 17 think is quite reasonable, which is that we should try
- 18 to find out -- we should try to get to the bottom of
- 19 this and we should try to figure out who these people
- 20 are, and if they are neo-Nazis, we should know who they
- 21 are.
- 22 Q. Right.
- 23 A. And there should be greater curiosity about
- 24 tracking them down and understanding, you know, the role
- 25 of the government here. As I mentioned, the director of

- 1 the FBI has testified that there have been FBI members
- 2 in a number of these events, but he will not say -- he
- 3 refused to answer to what degree -- how many were there.
- 4 Was it one -- was it one percent? Five percent? 10
- 5 percent? It's uncertain.
- 6 So I think we want to get to the bottom of
- 7 this, because I think if we get to the bottom of this,
- 8 we can actually -- if it turns out everything -- you
- 9 know, that there aren't any FBI members or other
- 10 government members, then we can do away with this
- 11 conspiracy theory. And -- but if there are an unusual
- 12 number of government members present, then that bears
- 13 further questioning of why there were, you know, a large
- 14 number of government employees of one kind or another
- 15 present at these gatherings.
- 16 Q. And if the government and the media were
- 17 uninterested in finding out who these people were, that
- 18 would be concerning, wouldn't it?
- 19 A. Yes, it does seem odd that the media would not
- 20 want to track down who these people are.
- 21 (EXHIBIT 12 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD)
- MR. BANKSTON: Definitely. It seems very
- 23 odd. Can we bring up Tab J. All right. This is going
- 24 to be Exhibit 12.
- 25 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) All right. I want to show

- 1 you another tweet --
- 2 MR. SPIRO: Is this another unrelated to
- 3 the tweet in the case?
- 4 MR. BANKSTON: It's not unrelated at all.
- 5 It's not the same --
- 6 MR. SPIRO: We're not -- we're not doing
- 7 this. He's not answering this question. We're not
- 8 talking about this. You're exceeding the judge's
- 9 orders.
- 10 MR. BANKSTON: You can just give your
- 11 instruction. All you've got to do is give your
- 12 instruction. That's all you've got to do.
- 13 MR. SPIRO: He's not answering this
- 14 question.
- 15 MR. BANKSTON: All right. So here we
- 16 are --
- 17 MR. SPIRO: -- asked about every tweet.
- 18 A. I mean, it may make sense --
- 19 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Mr. Musk, there's not a
- 20 question posed to you right now.
- 21 A. Okay.
- MR. BANKSTON: There's no question posed to
- 23 you right now.
- 24 I'm going to go ahead and make a record on
- 25 this document because what we are looking at is a -- the

- 1 exact same type of event that was in this case: A group
- 2 of Patriot Front white supremacists who have been
- 3 rounded up and are in masks. The exact MO of the people
- 4 engaged in this tweet accusing these people of not being
- 5 real, of accusing the media of not removing their masks,
- 6 we have Community Notes both on the tweet and Mr. Musk's
- 7 tweet that say their masks actually were removed after
- 8 arrest. Their names and faces --
- 9 MR. SPIRO: Can you blow this up? We can't
- 10 know what you're making a record of because we can't see
- 11 it.
- 12 MR. BANKSTON: Sure. A.J., why don't you
- 13 --
- 14 THE WITNESS: I can see it.
- 15 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Musk can see it and I
- 16 can see it.
- 17 MR. SPIRO: But I'm the lawyer and I can't
- 18 see it.
- 19 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Musk, there's not any
- 20 question to you. Go ahead and zoom it in because
- 21 Mr. Spiro is having some trouble seeing it --
- MR. SPIRO: It's just not big enough for me
- 23 to see it.
- 24 MR. BANKSTON: -- and you might want to
- 25 scroll it over so he can see it very well.

- 1 THE WITNESS: This is a clear example of2 Community Notes --
- 3 MR. BANKSTON: Mr. Musk, there is not a
- 4 question --
- 5 THE WITNESS: Please don't interrupt me.
- 6 Please don't interrupt me.
- 7 MR. BANKSTON: I am going to interrupt you,
- 8 Mr. Musk, because there's not a question on the --
- 9 MR. SPIRO: You shouldn't interrupt him,
- 10 Mark. He's --
- 11 MR. BANKSTON: There's not a question,
- 12 Alex.
- 13 MR. SPIRO: Okay. He's talking so you
- 14 shouldn't interrupt him --
- 15 MR. BANKSTON: But he's not -- that's not
- 16 responding -- witnesses cannot just start talking in
- 17 court.
- 18 MR. SPIRO: If you're going to yell -- if
- 19 you're going to yell, Mark, we're going to cut off the
- 20 deposition. Mr. Musk, you can continue finishing your
- 21 --
- MR. BANKSTON: He actually can't, Alex. He
- 23 has no question posed to him.
- 24 MR. SPIRO: Actually he can. I told him he
- 25 can.

- 1 MR. BANKSTON: All right. So Mr. Spiro has
- 2 just instructed the witness --
- 3 MR. SPIRO: I can't see the date on this --
- 4 what is the date on this document? I still can't -- I
- 5 can't see the picture.
- 6 MR. BANKSTON: Scroll down, scroll down,
- 7 scroll down.
- 8 THE WITNESS: What is your question?
- 9 MR. BANKSTON: February 20th, 2024, just
- 10 like we've been talking about, this event that happened
- 11 in January 2024.
- 12 Again, I know you're not going to ask him
- 13 -- let him answer these questions so please just let me
- 14 make my record on this document.
- 15 I'm asking him about these documents for
- 16 the reasons stated above that as we have discussed, with
- 17 the exact same type of event with the exact same
- 18 allegations with Mr. Musk promoting the exact same types
- 19 of ideas except we have Community Notes here showing
- 20 that their masks were removed and the media were
- 21 actually interested in their identities.
- We believe that these tweets and inquiry
- 23 about them is extremely relevant to the exact type of
- 24 state of mind when he made the exact type of same
- 25 statements about the exact same type of event.

- 1 Obviously we're being told that we're not
- 2 going to be able to ask these questions. We do not feel
- 3 that is proper. We will move on to the next topic.
- 4 THE WITNESS: Ask your question.
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: No, Mr. Musk. Your attorney
- 6 gets to decide --
- 7 MR. SPIRO: No. Mr. Musk wants to answer
- 8 your question. Ask your question.
- 9 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay. So let's zoom back out
- 10 so we can ask you about this.
- Okay. Now, let's go back up to the top
- 12 tweet. And go ahead and zoom in a little bit on that
- 13 top tweet so everybody can see it.
- 14 And what we have here is a person named
- 15 Champagne Joshi -- Joshi maybe. And let me move my
- 16 window so I can see that.
- 17 He says, "Fed front. How many times have
- 18 you seen a group of masked men dressed exactly the same,
- 19 handcuffed where not one mask pulled off to reveal their
- 20 identity."
- You see in the picture below we have a
- 22 bunch of masked individuals and none of them have their
- 23 masks removed. Do you see that, Mr. Musk?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. And now below there's a Community Note

- 1 that says their masks were removed in public and their
- 2 names and faces from arrest records are here. And it
- 3 has a link to a news story in Spokesman.com.
- 4 Now, below that is a tweet from you. And I
- 5 am going to assume I'm correct when I make this
- 6 assumption that when you made this tweet, the Community
- 7 Note had not yet been applied to the tweet above your
- 8 tweet?
- A. That's correct.
- 10 Q. Okay. And so after you tweeted, then Community
- 11 Notes came along and corrected both you and the person
- 12 who were tweeting in this case, correct?
- 13 A. Yes, which is exactly what Community Notes --
- 14 please let me finish my answer.
- 15 This is exactly what Community Notes is
- 16 intended to do. And I'm -- I am the one who has pushed
- 17 Community Notes heavily on this system. It was a tiny
- 18 backorder thing called Bird Watch. And I said Community
- 19 Notes seems to me to have the potential to be the best
- 20 fact-checking system on the internet.
- 21 And I insist that anyone be fact-checked,
- 22 including myself. So there are no limits on who gets
- 23 fact-checked, whether they are presidents of countries,
- 24 whether they are advertisers -- in fact, this has caused
- 25 us to lose advertising revenue because advertisers have

- 1 been community noted. I have been community noted, and
- 2 the Community Notes code is all open source and the data
- 3 is open source, so any third party can confirm exactly
- 4 how Community Notes works.
- 5 So this is a very good example of Community
- 6 Notes correcting something that -- that is incorrect.
- 7 Q. Now --
- 8 A. And this is an example of the system working
- 9 well.
- 10 Q. Now, you would agree with me that everybody who
- 11 saw these tweets before the notes were added, each of
- 12 those people may have been provided incorrect
- 13 information?
- 14 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 15 A. There would have been, absent initial
- 16 misimpression, however Community Notes also goes and any
- 17 interaction with -- if you interact at all with the post
- 18 that is community noted, you're subsequently informed
- 19 that a Community Note was placed on that post and you're
- 20 notified about the community note.
- 21 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) You mean if I viewed the
- 22 tweet, I'm given a notice?
- 23 A. If you have any interaction with the tweet.
- 24 Q. What does an interaction mean?
- 25 A. Comment like a bookmark, a favorite, any kind

- 1 of interaction.
- 2 Q. So if I saw these tweets before the Community
- 3 Notes and I did not like, bookmark them, or physically
- 4 interact with them in some way, I'm not notified when
- 5 they're corrected?
- 6 A. Not -- not in that case, but we also -- we also
- 7 post -- all Community Notes are publically available so
- 8 -- and we have a -- helpful notes so helpful notes have
- 9 surfaced.
- 10 Q. But I'd have to go look for that though, right?
- 11 A. You -- yes, if you care about the truth, you
- 12 would need to go look about it, yeah.
- 13 Q. That's an interesting point. If you care about
- 14 the truth, you need to go look for the truth, right?
- 15 You need to make an effort; would you agree with that?
- 16 A. Not much of an effort.
- 17 Q. Not much of an effort? I got you.
- 18 A. It is also the case that all the people that
- 19 viewed this post, probably the vast majority of them did
- 20 in fact see the note.
- 21 Q. How are you able to say that? What data are
- 22 you relying on to say that?
- 23 A. The note is applied within a few hours,
- 24 sometimes less than that --
- 25 Q. How do you know that?

- 1 A. That is how the notes work.
- 2 Q. Wait, wait, wait. You're saying that -- you're
- 3 testifying that these notes appeared on these tweets
- 4 within hours?
- 5 A. That is -- sometimes less than that.
- 6 Q. And sometimes a lot more, sometimes days,
- 7 right?
- 8 A. Days, no. That's --
- 9 Q. No? I'm wrong about that?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. All right, Mr. Musk. You can take that
- 12 down. Through your businesses, I presume you are
- 13 familiar with the concept of due diligence?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Okay. Before making a major decision in your
- 16 businesses that could affect a lot of people, you
- 17 practice due diligence as a matter of principle?
- 18 MR. SPIRO: Objection to form.
- 19 A. In acquiring a company? What are you talking
- 20 about here?
- 21 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) No, no, no, not acquiring a
- 22 company, no. I'm talking about before making a major
- 23 decision in your businesses that could affect a lot of
- 24 people, you practice due diligence as a matter of
- 25 principle?

- 1 A. Due diligence is a legal term. If -- I'm not
- 2 sure I understand your question, because you've
- 3 conflated a legal term with something that is in the
- 4 common vernacular.
- 5 Q. Let's take out the legal term then. I think we
- 6 can make it easier if we just take out the legal term.
- 7 Before making a major decision in your
- 8 business that could affect a lot of people, you take
- 9 care before making those decisions. You put a lot of
- 10 care into your business decisions; is that right?
- 11 A. I aspire to apply the amount of care -- I mean,
- 12 there's only so many hours in the day. One cannot do
- 13 everything, so -- I'm only human. So I aspire to be
- 14 diligent and accurate --
- 15 Q. Okay.
- 16 A. -- to the best of my ability.
- 17 Q. Okay. And because I think you understand that
- 18 when you make major decisions in your businesses, that
- 19 could affect a lot of people, right?
- 20 A. Of course.
- 21 Q. And it's important to be very careful in
- 22 decisions that affect a lot of people?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. You understood in the summer of 2023
- 25 that any time you say something on Twitter, a very large

- 1 number of people will see it?
- 2 A. That number varies tremendously.
- 3 Q. But it's always very large?
- 4 A. It depends on what your definition of "very
- 5 large" is.
- 6 Q. Would you agree me with me that say over half a
- 7 million people is a pretty big group of people?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And pretty much any time you press tweet, it's
- 10 going to be more than half a million people?
- 11 MR. SPIRO: Mark, you're interrupting him
- 12 --
- 13 A. No, that's not true.
- MR. SPIRO: Mark, you're interrupting him
- 15 at the end of his answers again so please don't do it.
- 16 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) So you don't think -- you
- 17 think there may have been times where you tweeted and
- 18 half a million people -- there weren't half a million
- 19 views on that?
- A. You can look at my feed and see that that is
- 21 obviously true.
- 22 Q. Okay. But you would agree with me that the
- 23 vast majority of the time your tweets are going to be
- 24 seen by more than half a million people?
- A. Only if it's a primary -- if I do a primary

- 1 post, meaning not a reply, then certainly more than half
- 2 a million people will see it.
- 3 Q. A lot --
- 4 A. -- but as a reply, sometimes it may be 10 or
- 5 20,000. And that doesn't necessarily mean that people
- 6 read it; it just means it got -- it was sent to their
- 7 device or their computer.
- 8 Q. All right. Let's put it this way: You know
- 9 that every time you press tweet, there is a reasonable
- 10 possibility that a very large number of people could see
- 11 it?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And you understood in the summer of 2023 that
- 14 as a general concept, false information can be damaging
- 15 to people and their lives?
- 16 A. There is -- it is certainly -- it is possible
- 17 for false information to be damaging to people and their
- 18 lives, yes.
- 19 Q. So you also knew in the summer of 2023 that any
- 20 time you tweeted and that tweet contained false
- 21 information about a specific individual, that there was
- 22 the chance that that tweet could damage or harm them?
- 23 You knew that?
- 24 A. If there's -- I do my best to be as accurate
- 25 and truthful as possible and to seek Community Notes or

- 1 other fact-checking when publishing something.
- 2 It is also true that there -- that
- 3 newspapers print things that are false or misleading or
- 4 that they fail to print things that are, in fact, true.
- 5 Q. Definitely. That's a big part of my business.
- 6 Absolutely you're right 1,000 percent. And I think you
- 7 would agree that newspapers often don't meet their
- 8 responsibilities, do they? They're not as diligent as
- 9 they could be, are they?
- A. Newspapers I think have a fundamental flaw
- 11 relative to a system like the X platform where there's
- 12 not an easy way for people to rebut a statement, where
- 13 there's -- it's extremely easy to rebut any statement,
- 14 even in the absence of Community Notes, simply by
- 15 replying.
- 16 Q. Sure. Let's go back to my foundation here that
- 17 I want to ask you about, which is that in June 2023, you
- 18 knew that if you pressed tweet on a tweet and it
- 19 contained false information about a specific individual,
- 20 that it was very likely, a reasonable possibility that a
- 21 lot of people would see it and therefore there would be
- 22 harm done to the person with false information. You
- 23 knew that was a risk anytime you pressed tweet, correct?
- 24 A. There's some risk that what I say is incorrect,
- 25 but one has to balance that against having a chilling

- 1 effect on free speech in general, which would undermine
- 2 the entire foundation of our democracy.
- 3 Q. Got you. So --
- 4 A. And if I were to take issue with you, Mr.
- 5 Bankston, that would be my concern about you.
- 6 Q. Okay. I know you do. I know we have very
- 7 opposite concerns that are very much in each other's
- 8 face, and I understand.
- 9 What I want to know is did you think -- did
- 10 you think in your state of mind on June 27th, 2023, that
- 11 it was allowable, it was okay for you to take a risk
- 12 with false information because the alternative means
- 13 restraining yourself and doing damage to the concept of
- 14 free speech? Is that what you thought?
- 15 A. I believe it's important to try to find the
- 16 truth of things --
- 17 Q. I do too.
- 18 A. -- and sometimes when I -- in questioning
- 19 things, one -- I'm simply trying to find what is true at
- 20 any given point in time.
- 21 Q. Do you think you owed it to Ben Brody to be
- 22 accurate as you could?
- 23 MR. SPIRO: Objection.
- 24 A. I aspire to be accurate no matter who the
- 25 person is.

- 1 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Do you think you lived up to
- 2 that duty to Ben Brody or do you think you failed him?
- 3 A. I don't think -- I don't think -- I don't think
- 4 he has been meaningfully harmed by this.
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: Wow. Okay. Let's put up
- 6 Tab L. Hold on. Actually take that down for a second.
- 7 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Why don't you think Ben Brody
- 8 has been meaningfully harmed by this?
- 9 MR. SPIRO: Yeah, the harm to Ben Brody,
- 10 how is that relevant to --
- 11 MR. BANKSTON: No. He might have some
- 12 really malicious ideas coming out from him right now
- 13 about this. I need to know what his feelings about Ben
- 14 Brody are.
- 15 Why do you think Ben Brody --
- MR. SPIRO: What is your -- which category
- 17 is this under and how is this relevant?
- 18 MR. BANKSTON: His state of mind. Does he
- 19 have ill will towards Ben Brody.
- MR. SPIRO: You can answer that. Do you
- 21 have any ill will toward Ben Brody? You can answer that
- 22 question.
- 23 MR. BANKSTON: Well, then I think -- no, I
- 24 want him to answer my question.
- 25 A. I have -- I have no ill will to Ben Brody. I

- 1 don't know Ben Brody --
- 2 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) Okay.
- 3 A. -- and I have no ill will to him. I do seek to
- 4 -- I mean, my goal is simply to have the X platform be
- 5 the best source of truth on the internet. And when you
- 6 try to figure out the truth of things, you -- there's a
- 7 debate. That debate, you know, goes one way or the
- 8 other, but it is a vigorous debate.
- 9 There is -- there are a number of replies
- 10 to -- you make a statement, people will reply and reply
- 11 immediately. This is the advantage -- fundamental
- 12 advantage relative to the legacy newspapers where -- you
- 13 can say whatever you want but -- and people can
- 14 immediately rebut that and then Community Notes can
- 15 attach a correction to your original post.
- 16 I think this is what enables the X platform
- 17 to have the potential to be -- and I think is the -- the
- 18 most accurate, timely, and truthful place on the
- 19 internet.
- 20 Q. Tell me why you said you don't think Ben Brody
- 21 was harmed.
- MR. SPIRO: No, no, no. Why -- whether he
- 23 was ultimately harmed or not or what his damages are and
- 24 things like that is not relevant. He's not going to get
- 25 into that. You can move on. I'm instructing him not to

- 1 answer.
- 2 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. So, again, I want to
- 3 know, Mr. Musk seems to have personal feelings about Ben
- 4 Brody and whether he's been harmed or not. And in fact,
- 5 seems to have the affirmative belief that he has not
- 6 been meaningfully harmed, which tells me that Mr. Musk
- 7 may know something more about Ben Brody than I think he
- 8 does, because I don't think he knows anything about Ben
- 9 Brody. And so I want to ask him why do you not think he
- 10 has been meaningfully harmed.
- 11 MR. SPIRO: Yeah. Again --
- 12 MR. BANKSTON: If he possesses that
- 13 information, I'm definitely entitled to know.
- 14 MR. SPIRO: Okay. Well, I definitely think
- 15 you're wrong and you're trying to backdoor everything
- 16 and you know that and so you can move on.
- MR. BANKSTON: Okay. You're not going to
- 18 answer that, Mr. Musk? Are you going to --
- MR. SPIRO: He's not answering that. He's
- 20 not --
- 21 MR. BANKSTON: I didn't ask you anything.
- MR. SPIRO: You know that he doesn't know
- 23 anything about Ben Brody and he already told you he
- 24 doesn't think he's been harmed.
- MR. BANKSTON: I don't know that. Wait,

- 1 hold on --
- 2 MR. SPIRO: You teased him -- you just said
- 3 it into the record. You teased out the fact that he
- 4 doesn't have any ill will towards him. That's that.
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: No. I'm at an impasse
- 6 because I have two contradictory answers. I have Mr.
- 7 Musk saying he doesn't know anything about Ben Brody,
- 8 and I have Mr. Musk testifying under oath that Ben Brody
- 9 was not meaningfully harmed. Those two things don't go
- 10 together so I've got to figure out --
- 11 MR. SPIRO: We disagree, but if Mr. Musk
- 12 wants to explain why they're not inconsistent if you
- 13 don't -- if you genuinely don't understand that, he can
- 14 explain why those aren't inconsistent. I don't think --
- 15 I think this is nonsense and you know it, but that's
- 16 fine.
- 17 A. People are attacked all the time in the media,
- 18 online media, social media, but it is rare that that
- 19 actually has a meaningful negative impact on their life.
- 20 MR. BANKSTON: Okay. Let's go to Tab L.
- 21 Q. (BY MR. BANKSTON) I want to show you another
- 22 tweet that you tweeted on June 27th, all right, just
- 23 after you tweeted about Ben Brody. And this tweet has
- 24 somebody who is named -- hold on -- this is a tweet from
- 25 somebody named Ava Fox Claudis Nero's Legion. That says

- 1 a quote from Dale Carnegie, 99 times out of 100, people
- 2 don't criticize themselves for anything, no matter how
- 3 wrong it might be maybe.
- 4 And then you replied "Always err on the
- 5 side of internalizing -- " "always err on the side of
- 6 internalizing responsibility." Do you see that?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. All right. Is that -- would you consider that
- 9 you were being truthful here in terms of that being
- 10 something you believe; is that right?
- 11 A. Yes, I think one should err on the side of
- 12 internalizing responsibility.
- 13 Q. All right. So to bring it back to Ben Brody,
- 14 do you think that maybe you acted recklessly and should
- 15 acknowledge responsibility for that?
- 16 A. Are you referring to -- which post are you
- 17 referring to?
- 18 Q. To the post you made about Ben Brody. When you
- 19 said based off of Dr. Frensor and Matt Wallace, when you
- 20 said "It looks like one of the college students who
- 21 wants to join the government." Do you think you have
- 22 any sense of acting recklessly or need to take
- 23 responsibility for that?
- 24 MR. SPIRO: Objection. He already answered
- 25 -- he already answered this question. You can't

- 1 backdoor it through some unrelated tweet when the judge
- 2 told you which tweets were at issue.
- 3 MR. BANKSTON: Wait. Where does the --
- 4 MR. SPIRO: I don't understand why you're
- 5 doing this. You're just wasting everybody's time.
- 6 MR. BANKSTON: I'm sorry. Where is this --
- 7 if you have it, please send it to me. Do you have a
- 8 list of the tweets that I'm allowed to talk about?
- 9 MR. SPIRO: Yes, there -- it's in the
- 10 order -- the order said -- that it refers to tweets on a
- 11 certain day and a certain time. It's not -- if the
- 12 order --
- 13 THE REPORTER: Mr. Spiro, your internet is
- 14 cutting in and out.
- MR. SPIRO: Can you hear me now?
- 16 THE REPORTER: Yes, sir.
- MR. SPIRO: Okay. Yes, the order does
- 18 refer to certain tweets within a time frame relating to
- 19 -- this is in topic two, so the way I read the order and
- 20 the spirit of this was not for you to have a
- 21 free-for-all into every tweet Mr. Musk made or saw.
- 22 Your case is based on one tweet where he says "looks
- 23 like."
- 24 MR. BANKSTON: Right. So here I am asking
- 25 about another tweet on the same day about Mr. Musk's

- 1 state of mind on that very day.
- 2 And your state of mind, Mr. Musk, on that
- 3 very day was that a person should always err on the side
- 4 of internalizing responsibility. That was your state of
- 5 mind on June 27th, 2023?
- 6 A. That is a general principle that I believe in.
- 7 MR. BANKSTON: All right. Mr. Musk, I
- 8 don't have anything more for you today.
- 9 MR. SPIRO: Okay. Thank you.
- 10 THE REPORTER: Mr. Spiro, I need to have
- 11 you say on the record whether you want a copy of the
- 12 transcript.
- 13 MR. SPIRO: Yes, and please mark it
- 14 confidential.
- 15 MR. BANKSTON: I'm sorry. What? There's
- 16 no PO in this case.
- 17 MR. SPIRO: We're asking for it to be
- 18 deemed marked confidential until we address --
- MR. BANKSTON: Under what authority? No.
- 20 There's no PO.
- 21 MR. SPIRO: Well, that's what I'm asking
- 22 for. You want to release it --
- 23 MR. BANKSTON: Then you need to move -- you
- 24 need to move for a PO. I don't -- no --
- 25 MR. SPIRO: Okay. Then we will move for a

- 1 PO.
- 2 MR. BANKSTON: Right. Over discovery
- 3 that's already happened?
- 4 MR. SPIRO: Yeah. Okay.
- 5 MR. BANKSTON: I'm absolutely positive
- 6 there's not --
- 7 MR. SPIRO: I'm asking -- Mark, don't
- 8 interrupt me, okay? Mark, don't interrupt me.
- 9 MR. BANKSTON: All right.
- 10 MR. SPIRO: I'm asking that this transcript
- 11 be marked as confidential. That's what I'm asking for,
- 12 okay?
- 13 MR. BANKSTON: I don't agree.
- 14 THE REPORTER: Mr. Spiro --
- 15 MR. BANKSTON: Yeah, he jumped off the
- 16 record, but we're not off the record yet.
- 17 THE REPORTER: I need to find out if Mr.
- 18 Musk wanted to read and sign his transcript.
- MR. BANKSTON: Well, we're not going to
- 20 find that out either because he just left.
- 21 I do need to make a record on what just
- 22 happened for the Court. Parties must obviously move for
- 23 a protective order over discovery before it occurs. I
- 24 am in no way bound to treat anything confidential.
- 25 There is no confidential order in place. There is a

- 1 method in which to do that.
- 2 Attorneys from Quinn Emanuel should know
- 3 very well how to do that. In fact, even Alex Jones'
- 4 attorneys knew how to do that. Apart from that, there's
- 5 not a single trade secret or anything confidential ever
- 6 mentioned anywhere throughout this deposition. I'm very
- 7 concerned that Mr. Spiro, a non-Texas lawyer who is --
- 8 came to this deposition to practice law in violation of
- 9 Texas law with no pro hac admission completely shut down
- 10 many segments of the deposition, issued several
- 11 instructions not to answer that were wholly
- 12 inappropriate, completely interrupted and made
- 13 objections outside of Rule 199.5. And then at the end
- 14 of the deposition demands that it be treated
- 15 confidential.
- 16 Mr. Spiro is clearly not following any of
- 17 the procedures that would need to happen here. Given
- 18 what he's said, we will not discuss what happened here
- 19 in this deposition with third parties until we talk to
- 20 the Court about it obviously. But we will make sure for
- 21 the record -- we do not see any method on which to
- 22 designate things as confidential, so we don't -- we
- 23 don't recognize that request as anything valid.
- 24 If they want to pursue a Rule 76 at a
- 25 future time, I mean, I guess they're welcome to try to

1 do that. But, again, just to state for the record, we 2 are not -- we are not under protective order. We have 3 no obligation to abide by any confidentiality, and we 4 reject wholeheartedly Mr. Spiro's unilateral attempts to 5 place us under some sort of legal obligation. We do not 6 recognize it whatsoever. And with that, we conclude the 7 deposition today. THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This concludes the 9 deposition at 3:19 p.m.