

**EXHIBIT 9**



U.S. Department of Justice  
Office of Information Policy  
Sixth Floor  
441 G Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20530-0001

---

Telephone: (202) 514-3642

John Shoemaker  
487 Main Street  
Suite 300  
Buffalo, NY 14203  
jdshoemaker@investigativepost.org

August 25, 2023

Re: Appeal No. A-2023-01428

Request No. 1590504-000

**VIA: Email**

Dear John Shoemaker:

You appealed from the action of the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) on your Freedom of Information Act request for access to records concerning financial transactions with Mark Gabriele, Henry Wojtaszek, as well as financial transactions between Gabriele & Berrigan PC and Henry Wojtaszek from January 1, 2010, to date of request. I note that your appeal concerns the FBI's refusal to confirm or deny the existence of responsive records.

After carefully considering your appeal, I am affirming the FBI's action on your request. The FOIA provides for disclosure of many agency records. At the same time, Congress included in the FOIA nine exemptions from disclosure that provide protection for important interests such as personal privacy, privileged communications, and certain law enforcement activities. The FBI properly refused to confirm or deny the existence of records responsive to your request. Confirming or denying the existence of such records, including law enforcement records, concerning a third-party individual would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy, and could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy. See 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6), (7)(C). Additionally, it is reasonably foreseeable that confirming or denying the existence of such records would harm the interests protected by these exemptions. See, e.g., People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals v. NIH, 745 F.3d 535, 544 (D.C. Cir. 2014) (upholding agency's refusal to confirm or deny existence of records that would confirm whether investigation of third party had occurred); see also Antonelli v. FBI, 721 F.2d 615, 618 (7th Cir. 1983) (finding that confirming whether third party has been the subject of investigation would likely constitute an invasion of that persons privacy that implicates the protections of Exemptions 6 and 7).

Please be advised that this Office's decision was made only after a full review of this matter. Your appeal was assigned to an attorney with this Office who thoroughly reviewed and analyzed your appeal, your underlying request, and the action of the FBI in response to your

request.

If you are dissatisfied with my action on your appeal, the FOIA permits you to file a lawsuit in federal district court in accordance with 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(B).

For your information, the Office of Government Information Services (OGIS) offers mediation services to resolve disputes between FOIA requesters and Federal agencies as a non-exclusive alternative to litigation. Using OGIS services does not affect your right to pursue litigation. The contact information for OGIS is as follows: Office of Government Information Services, National Archives and Records Administration, Room 2510, 8601 Adelphi Road, College Park, Maryland 20740-6001; email at [ogis@nara.gov](mailto:ogis@nara.gov); telephone at 202-741-5770; toll free at 1-877-684-6448; or facsimile at 202-741-5769. If you have any questions regarding the action this Office has taken on your appeal, you may contact this Office and speak with the undersigned agency official by calling (202) 514-3642.

Sincerely,

X Matthew Hurd  
Matthew Hurd,  
Chief, Administrative Appeals Staff