

118TH CONGRESS  
1ST SESSION

**S.** \_\_\_\_\_

To amend the Children’s Online Privacy Protection Act of 1998 to strengthen protections relating to the online collection, use, and disclosure of personal information of children and teens, and for other purposes.

---

IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

---

\_\_\_\_\_ introduced the following bill; which was read twice  
and referred to the Committee on \_\_\_\_\_

---

**A BILL**

To amend the Children’s Online Privacy Protection Act of 1998 to strengthen protections relating to the online collection, use, and disclosure of personal information of children and teens, and for other purposes.

1        *Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-*  
2 *tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,*

3 **SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE; TABLE OF CONTENTS.**

4        (a) **SHORT TITLE.**—This Act may be cited as the  
5 “Children and Teens’ Online Privacy Protection Act”.

6        (b) **TABLE OF CONTENTS.**—The table of contents for  
7 this Act is as follows:

- Sec. 1. Short title; table of contents.
- Sec. 2. Definitions.

- Sec. 3. Online collection, use, and disclosure of personal information of children and teens.
- Sec. 4. Fair Information Practices Principles.
- Sec. 5. Digital Marketing Bill of Rights for Teens.
- Sec. 6. Targeted marketing to children or teens.
- Sec. 7. Removal of content.
- Sec. 8. Rule for treatment of users of websites, services, and applications directed to children or teens.
- Sec. 9. Study of mobile and online application oversight.
- Sec. 10. Youth Privacy and Marketing Division.
- Sec. 11. Enforcement and applicability.
- Sec. 12. GAO study.

**1 SEC. 2. DEFINITIONS.**

2 (a) IN GENERAL.—In this Act:

3 (1) COMMISSION.—The term “Commission”  
4 means the Federal Trade Commission.

5 (2) STANDARDS.—The term “standards” means  
6 benchmarks, guidelines, best practices, methodolo-  
7 gies, procedures, and processes.

8 (b) OTHER DEFINITIONS.—The definitions set forth  
9 in section 1302 of the Children’s Online Privacy Protec-  
10 tion Act of 1998 (15 U.S.C. 6501), as amended by section  
11 3(a) of this Act, shall apply in this Act, except to the ex-  
12 tent the Commission provides otherwise by regulations  
13 issued under section 553 of title 5, United States Code.

**14 SEC. 3. ONLINE COLLECTION, USE, AND DISCLOSURE OF**  
**15 PERSONAL INFORMATION OF CHILDREN AND**  
**16 TEENS.**

17 (a) DEFINITIONS.—Section 1302 of the Children’s  
18 Online Privacy Protection Act of 1998 (15 U.S.C. 6501)  
19 is amended—



1 operator is deemed to have collected  
2 the information); and

3 “(B) does not include any nonprofit entity  
4 that would otherwise be exempt from coverage  
5 under section 5 of the Federal Trade Commis-  
6 sion Act (15 U.S.C. 45).”;

7 (2) in paragraph (4)—

8 (A) by amending subparagraph (A) to read  
9 as follows:

10 “(A) the release of personal information  
11 collected from a child or teen for any purpose,  
12 except where the personal information is pro-  
13 vided to a person other than an operator who—

14 “(i) provides support for the internal  
15 operations of the website, online service,  
16 online application, mobile application, or  
17 connected device of the operator, excluding  
18 any activity relating to targeted marketing  
19 directed to children, teens, or connected  
20 devices; and

21 “(ii) does not disclose or use that per-  
22 sonal information for any other purpose;  
23 and”;

24 (B) in subparagraph (B)—

1 (i) by inserting “or teen” after  
2 “child” each place the term appears;

3 (ii) by inserting “or teens” after  
4 “children”; and

5 (iii) by striking “website or online  
6 service” and inserting “website, online  
7 service, online application, mobile applica-  
8 tion, or connected device”;

9 (3) in paragraph (8), by striking subparagraphs  
10 (F) and (G) and inserting the following:

11 “(F) geolocation information;

12 “(G) information generated from the meas-  
13 urement or technological processing of an indi-  
14 vidual’s biological, physical, or physiological  
15 characteristics, including—

16 “(i) fingerprints;

17 “(ii) voice prints;

18 “(iii) iris or retina imagery scans;

19 “(iv) facial imagery or templates;

20 “(v) deoxyribonucleic acid (DNA) in-  
21 formation; or

22 “(vi) gait;

23 “(H) information reasonably associated  
24 with or attributed to a child or teen;

1           “(I) information (including an internet  
2           protocol address) that permits the identification  
3           of—

4                   “(i) an individual; or

5                   “(ii) any device used by an individual  
6           to directly or indirectly access the internet  
7           or an online service, online application, mo-  
8           bile application, or connected device; or

9           “(J) information concerning a child or teen  
10          or the parents of that child or teen (including  
11          any unique or substantially unique identifier,  
12          such as a customer number) that an operator  
13          collects online from the child or teen and com-  
14          bines with an identifier described in this para-  
15          graph.”;

16          (4) by amending paragraph (9) to read as fol-  
17          lows:

18               “(9) VERIFIABLE CONSENT.—The term  
19          ‘verifiable consent’ means any reasonable effort (tak-  
20          ing into consideration available technology), includ-  
21          ing a request for authorization for future collection,  
22          use, and disclosure described in the notice, to ensure  
23          that, in the case of a child, a parent of the child,  
24          or, in the case of a teen, the teen—

1           “(A) receives specific notice of the personal  
2 information collection, use, and disclosure prac-  
3 tices of the operator; and

4           “(B) before the personal information of the  
5 child or teen is collected, freely and unambig-  
6 uously authorizes—

7                 “(i) the collection, use, and disclosure,  
8 as applicable, of that personal information;  
9 and

10                “(ii) any subsequent use of that per-  
11 sonal information.”;

12           (5) by striking paragraph (10) and redesign-  
13 ating paragraphs (11) and (12) as paragraphs (10)  
14 and (11), respectively; and

15           (6) by adding at the end the following:

16           “(12) CONNECTED DEVICE.—The term ‘con-  
17 nected device’ means a device that is capable of con-  
18 necting to the internet, directly or indirectly, or to  
19 another connected device.

20           “(13) ONLINE APPLICATION.—The term ‘online  
21 application’—

22                 “(A) means an internet-connected software  
23 program; and

24                 “(B) includes a service or application of-  
25 fered via a connected device.

1 “(14) ONLINE SERVICE.—

2 “(A) IN GENERAL.—The term ‘online serv-  
3 ice’ means a mass-market retail service by wire  
4 or radio that provides the capability to transmit  
5 data and receive data from all or substantially  
6 all Internet endpoints, including any capabilities  
7 that are incidental to and enable the operation  
8 of a communications service, but excluding dial-  
9 up Internet service.

10 “(B) SCOPE.—Such term includes—

11 “(i) any service that the Federal Com-  
12 munications Commission finds to be pro-  
13 viding a functionally equivalent service to a  
14 service described in subparagraph (A); and

15 “(ii) a service or application offered  
16 via a connected device.

17 “(15) DIRECTED TO CHILDREN OR TEENS.—

18 “(A) IN GENERAL.—The terms ‘directed to  
19 children’, ‘directed to teens’, and ‘directed to  
20 children or teens’ mean, with respect to a  
21 website, online service, online application, mo-  
22 bile application, or connected device, that the  
23 website, online service, online application, mo-  
24 bile application, or connected device, or a por-



1           tion thereof, is targeted to children or teens, as  
2           the case may be, as demonstrated by—

3                   “(i) the subject matter of the website,  
4                   online service, online application, mobile  
5                   application, or connected device;

6                   “(ii) the visual content of the website,  
7                   online service, online application, mobile  
8                   application, or connected device;

9                   “(iii) the use of animated characters  
10                  or child-oriented activities for children, or  
11                  the use of teen-oriented characters or teen-  
12                  oriented activities for teens, and related in-  
13                  centives on the website, online service, on-  
14                  line application, mobile application, or con-  
15                  nected device;

16                  “(iv) the music or other audio content  
17                  on the website, online service, online appli-  
18                  cation, mobile application, or connected de-  
19                  vice;

20                  “(v) the age of models on the website,  
21                  online service, online application, mobile  
22                  application, or connected device;

23                  “(vi) the presence, on the website, on-  
24                  line service, online application, mobile ap-  
25                  plication, or connected device, of—

1 “(I) child celebrities;

2 “(II) celebrities who appeal to  
3 children;

4 “(III) teen celebrities; or

5 “(IV) celebrities who appeal to  
6 teens;

7 “(vii) the language used on the  
8 website, online service, online application,  
9 mobile application, or connected device;

10 “(viii) advertising content used on, or  
11 used to advertise, the website, online serv-  
12 ice, online application, mobile application,  
13 or connected device; or

14 “(ix) reliable empirical evidence relat-  
15 ing to—

16 “(I) the composition of the audi-  
17 ence of the website, online service, on-  
18 line application, mobile application, or  
19 connected device; and

20 “(II) the intended audience of  
21 the website, online service, online ap-  
22 plication, mobile application, or con-  
23 nected device.

24 “(B) RULES OF CONSTRUCTION.—

1                   “(i) SERVICES DEEMED DIRECTED TO  
2 CHILDREN OR TEENS.—For the purposes  
3 of this title, a website, online service, on-  
4 line application, mobile application, or con-  
5 nected device, or a portion thereof, shall be  
6 deemed to be directed to children or teens  
7 if it collects personal information directly  
8 from users of any other website, online  
9 service, online application, mobile applica-  
10 tion, or connected device that is—

11                   “(I) directed to children or teens  
12 under the criteria described in sub-  
13 paragraph (A); or

14                   “(II) used or reasonably likely to  
15 be used by children or teens.

16                   “(ii) SERVICES DEEMED DIRECTED TO  
17 MIXED AUDIENCES.—

18                   “(I) IN GENERAL.—A website,  
19 online service, online application, mo-  
20 bile application, or connected device  
21 that is directed to children or teens  
22 under the criteria described in sub-  
23 paragraph (A), but that does not tar-  
24 get children or teens as the primary  
25 audience of the website, online service,

1 online application, mobile application,  
2 or connected device shall not be  
3 deemed to be directed to children or  
4 teens for purposes of this title if the  
5 website, online service, online applica-  
6 tion, mobile application, or connected  
7 device—

8 “(aa) does not collect per-  
9 sonal information from any user  
10 of the website, online service, on-  
11 line application, mobile applica-  
12 tion, or connected device before  
13 verifying age information of the  
14 user; and

15 “(bb) does not, without first  
16 complying with any relevant no-  
17 tice and consent provision under  
18 this title, collect, use, or disclose  
19 personal information of any user  
20 who identifies themselves to the  
21 website, online service, online ap-  
22 plication, mobile application, or  
23 connected device as an individual  
24 who is age 16 or younger.





1 the product or service is mar-  
2 keted;

3 “(II) psychological profiling of an  
4 individual or group of individuals; or

5 “(III) a unique identifier of the  
6 device; or

7 “(ii) as a result of use by the indi-  
8 vidual, access by any device of the indi-  
9 vidual, or use by a group of individuals  
10 who are similar to the specific individual,  
11 of more than a single—

12 “(I) website;

13 “(II) online service;

14 “(III) online application;

15 “(IV) mobile application;

16 “(V) connected device; or

17 “(VI) operating system.

18 “(B) EXCLUSIONS.—The term ‘targeted  
19 marketing’ shall not include—

20 “(i) advertising or marketing to an in-  
21 dividual or the device of an individual in  
22 response to the individual’s specific request  
23 for information or feedback;

24 “(ii) contextual advertising, such as  
25 when an advertisement is displayed based

1 on the context in which the advertisement  
2 appears and does not vary based on who is  
3 viewing the advertisement; or

4 “(iii) processing personal information  
5 solely for measuring or reporting adver-  
6 tising or content performance, reach, or  
7 frequency, including independent measure-  
8 ment.

9 “(C) AUTHORITY TO FURTHER DEFINE.—

10 The Commission may promulgate rules under  
11 section 553 of title 5, United State Code, to  
12 further define the term ‘targeted marketing’  
13 but only as necessary to address changes to or  
14 innovations of technology, changes in how per-  
15 sonal information is used or transferred,  
16 changes to the means and manners by which  
17 children or teens interact with a website, online  
18 service, online application, mobile application,  
19 or connected device, or evolving concerns re-  
20 garding the privacy of children or teens .

21 “(20) REASONABLY LIKELY TO BE USED.—The  
22 Commission may promulgate rules under section 553  
23 of title 5, United States Code, or issue guidance to  
24 establish factors that should be considered in apply-



1 ing the term ‘reasonably likely to be used’ for the  
2 purposes of this title.

3 “(21) REASONABLY LIKELY TO BE A CHILD OR  
4 TEEN.—The Commission may promulgate rules  
5 under section 553 of title 5, United States Code, or  
6 issue guidance to establish factors that should be  
7 considered in applying the term ‘reasonably likely to  
8 be a child or teen’ for the purposes of this title.”.

9 (b) ONLINE COLLECTION, USE, AND DISCLOSURE OF  
10 PERSONAL INFORMATION OF CHILDREN AND TEENS.—  
11 Section 1303 of the Children’s Online Privacy Protection  
12 Act of 1998 (15 U.S.C. 6502) is amended—

13 (1) by striking the heading and inserting the  
14 following: “**ONLINE COLLECTION, USE, AND DIS-**  
15 **CLOSURE OF PERSONAL INFORMATION OF**  
16 **CHILDREN AND TEENS.**”;

17 (2) in subsection (a)—

18 (A) by amending paragraph (1) to read as  
19 follows:

20 “(1) IN GENERAL.—It is unlawful for an oper-  
21 ator of a website, online service, online application,  
22 mobile application, or connected device that is di-  
23 rected to children or teens or is used or reasonably  
24 likely to be used by children or teens in a manner  
25 that involves the collection of personal information,

1 to collect personal information from a child or teen  
2 in a manner that violates the regulations prescribed  
3 under subsection (b).”; and

4 (B) in paragraph (2)—

5 (i) by striking “of such a website or  
6 online service”; and

7 (ii) by striking “subsection  
8 (b)(1)(B)(iii) to the parent of a child” and  
9 inserting “subsection (b)(1)(A)(iii) to the  
10 parent of a child or under subsection  
11 (b)(1)(A)(iv) to a teen”; and

12 (3) in subsection (b)—

13 (A) in paragraph (1)—

14 (i) by striking “this Act” and insert-  
15 ing “the Children and Teens’ Online Pri-  
16 vacy Protection Act”;

17 (ii) in subparagraph (A)—

18 (I) by striking “operator of any  
19 website” and all that follows through  
20 “from a child” and inserting “oper-  
21 ator of a website, online service, on-  
22 line application, mobile application, or  
23 connected device that is directed to  
24 children or teens or is used or is rea-  
25 sonably likely to be used by children

1 or teens in a manner that involves the  
2 collection of their personal informa-  
3 tion”;

4 (II) in clause (i)—

5 (aa) by striking “notice on  
6 the website” and inserting “clear  
7 and conspicuous notice”;

8 (bb) by inserting “or teens”  
9 after “children”;

10 (cc) by striking “, and the  
11 operator’s” and inserting “, the  
12 operator’s”; and

13 (dd) by striking “; and” and  
14 inserting “, and the procedures  
15 or mechanisms the operator uses  
16 to ensure that personal informa-  
17 tion is not collected from children  
18 or teens except in accordance  
19 with the regulations promulgated  
20 under this paragraph;”; and

21 (III) in clause (ii)—

22 (aa) by striking “parental”;  
23 and

24 (bb) by inserting “or teens”  
25 after “children”;

- 1 (iii) in subparagraph (B)—
- 2 (I) in the matter preceding clause
- 3 (i), by striking “website or online
- 4 service” and inserting “operator”;
- 5 (II) in clause (ii), by inserting
- 6 “to delete personal information col-
- 7 lected from the child or” after “the
- 8 opportunity at any time”; and
- 9 (III) in clause (iii), by inserting
- 10 “, if such information is available to
- 11 the operator at the time the parent
- 12 makes the request” before the semi-
- 13 colon;
- 14 (iv) by redesignating subparagraphs
- 15 (C) and (D) as subparagraphs (D) and
- 16 (E), respectively;
- 17 (v) by inserting after subparagraph
- 18 (B) the following new subparagraph:
- 19 “(C) require the operator to provide, upon
- 20 the request of a teen under this subparagraph
- 21 who has provided personal information to the
- 22 operator, upon proper identification of that
- 23 teen—

1                   “(i) a description of the specific types  
2 of personal information collected from the  
3 teen by the operator;

4                   “(ii) the opportunity at any time to  
5 delete personal information collected from  
6 the teen and refuse further use or collec-  
7 tion of personal information from the teen;  
8 and

9                   “(iii) a means that is reasonable  
10 under the circumstances for the teen to ob-  
11 tain any personal information collected  
12 from the teen, if such information is avail-  
13 able to the operator at the time the teen  
14 makes the request;”;

15                   (vi) in subparagraph (D), as so redes-  
16 igned, by striking “conditioning” and all  
17 that follows through “such activity” and  
18 inserting the following: “ the collection  
19 from a child or teen of more personal in-  
20 formation that is reasonably required to  
21 use the website, online service, online ap-  
22 plication, mobile application, or connected  
23 device”;

24                   (vii) in subparagraph (E), as so redes-  
25 igned—

1 (I) by striking “of such a website  
2 or online service”; and

3 (II) by inserting “and teens”  
4 after “children”; and

5 (viii) by adding at the end the fol-  
6 lowing flush text:

7 “The Commission shall review and update the regu-  
8 lations promulgated under this paragraph as nec-  
9 essary.”;

10 (B) in paragraph (2)—

11 (i) in the matter preceding subpara-  
12 graph (A), by striking “verifiable parental  
13 consent” and inserting “verifiable con-  
14 sent”;

15 (ii) in subparagraph (A)—

16 (I) by inserting “or teen” after  
17 “collected from a child”;

18 (II) by inserting “or teen” after  
19 “request from the child”; and

20 (III) by inserting “or teen or to  
21 contact another child or teen” after  
22 “to recontact the child”;

23 (iii) in subparagraph (B)—

24 (I) by striking “parent or child”  
25 and inserting “parent or teen”; and

1 (II) by striking “parental con-  
2 sent” each place the term appears and  
3 inserting “verifiable consent”;  
4 (iv) in subparagraph (C)—  
5 (I) in the matter preceding clause  
6 (i), by inserting “or teen” after  
7 “child” each place the term appears;  
8 (II) in clause (i)—  
9 (aa) by inserting “or teen”  
10 after “child” each place the term  
11 appears; and  
12 (bb) by inserting “or teen,  
13 as applicable,” after “parent”  
14 each place the term appears; and  
15 (III) in clause (ii)—  
16 (aa) by inserting “or teen,  
17 as applicable,” after “parent”;  
18 and  
19 (bb) by inserting “or teen”  
20 after “child” each place the term  
21 appears; and  
22 (v) in subparagraph (D)—  
23 (I) in the matter preceding clause  
24 (i), by inserting “or teen” after  
25 “child” each place the term appears;

1 (II) in clause (ii), by inserting  
2 “or teen” after “child”; and

3 (III) in the flush text following  
4 clause (iii)—

5 (aa) by inserting “or teen,  
6 as applicable,” after “parent”  
7 each place the term appears; and

8 (bb) by inserting “or teen”  
9 after “child”; and

10 (C) by amending paragraph (3) to read as  
11 follows:

12 “(3) CONTINUATION OF SERVICE.—The regula-  
13 tions shall prohibit an operator from discontinuing  
14 service provided to a child or teen on the basis of  
15 a request by the parent of the child or by the teen,  
16 under the regulations prescribed under subpara-  
17 graph (B) or (C) of paragraph (1), respectively, to  
18 delete personal information collected from the child  
19 or teen, to the extent that the operator is capable of  
20 providing such service without such information.”.

21 (c) SAFE HARBORS.—Section 1304 of the Children’s  
22 Online Privacy Protection Act of 1998 (15 U.S.C. 6503)  
23 is amended—

24 (1) in subsection (b)(1), by inserting “and  
25 teens” after “children”; and



1 (2) by adding at the end the following:

2 “(d) PUBLICATION.—

3 “(1) IN GENERAL.—The Commission shall pub-  
4 lish on the internet website of the Commission any  
5 report or documentation required by regulation to be  
6 submitted to the Commission to carry out this sec-  
7 tion.

8 “(2) RESTRICTIONS ON PUBLICATION.—The re-  
9 strictions described in subsection (f) of section 6 of  
10 the Federal Trade Commission Act (15 U.S.C.  
11 46(f)) applicable to the publication of information  
12 obtained by the Commission through investigations  
13 conducted under such section shall apply in same  
14 manner to the publication under this subsection of  
15 information obtained by the Commission from a re-  
16 port or documentation described in paragraph (1).”.

17 (d) ADMINISTRATION AND APPLICABILITY OF ACT.—  
18 Section 1306 of the Children’s Online Privacy Protection  
19 Act of 1998 (15 U.S.C. 6505) is amended—

20 (1) in subsection (b)—

21 (A) in paragraph (1), by striking “, in the  
22 case of” and all that follows through “the  
23 Board of Directors of the Federal Deposit In-  
24 surance Corporation;” and inserting the fol-  
25 lowing: “by the appropriate Federal banking

1 agency, with respect to any insured depository  
2 institution (as those terms are defined in sec-  
3 tion 3 of that Act (12 U.S.C. 1813));” and

4 (B) by striking paragraph (2) and redesi-  
5 gnating paragraphs (3) through (6) as para-  
6 graphs (2) through (5), respectively; and

7 (2) by adding at the end the following new sub-  
8 section:

9 “(f) TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIERS AND CABLE  
10 OPERATORS.—

11 “(1) ENFORCEMENT BY COMMISSION.—Not-  
12 withstanding sections 4, 5(a)(2), or 6 of the Federal  
13 Trade Commission Act (15 U.S.C. 44, 45(a)(2), 46),  
14 or any jurisdictional limitation of the Commission,  
15 the Commission shall also enforce this Act and the  
16 regulations promulgated under this Act, in the same  
17 manner provided in subsection (d), with respect to  
18 common carriers subject to the Communications Act  
19 of 1934 (47 U.S.C. 151 et seq.) and Acts amend-  
20 atory thereof and supplementary thereto.

21 “(2) RELATIONSHIP TO OTHER LAW.—To the  
22 extent that section 222, 338(i), or 631 of the Com-  
23 munications Act of 1934 (47 U.S.C. 222, 338(i),  
24 551) is inconsistent with this title, this title con-  
25 trols.”.

1 **SEC. 4. FAIR INFORMATION PRACTICES PRINCIPLES.**

2 (a) IN GENERAL.—The Fair Information Practices  
3 Principles described in this section are the following:

4 (1) COLLECTION LIMITATION PRINCIPLE.—Ex-  
5 cept as provided in paragraph (3), personal informa-  
6 tion should be collected from a child or teen only  
7 when collection of the personal information is—

8 (A) consistent with the context of a par-  
9 ticular transaction or service or the relationship  
10 of the child or teen with the operator, including  
11 collection necessary to fulfill a transaction or  
12 provide a service requested by the child or teen;  
13 or

14 (B) required or specifically authorized by  
15 law.

16 (2) DATA QUALITY PRINCIPLE.—The personal  
17 information of a child or teen should be accurate,  
18 complete, and kept up-to-date to the extent nec-  
19 essary to fulfill the purposes described in subpara-  
20 graphs (A) through (D) of paragraph (3).

21 (3) PURPOSE SPECIFICATION PRINCIPLE.—The  
22 purposes for which personal information is collected  
23 and used should be specified to the parent of a child  
24 or to a teen not later than at the time of the collec-  
25 tion of the information. The subsequent use or dis-  
26 closure of the information should be limited to—

1 (A) fulfillment of the transaction or service  
2 requested by the teen or parent of the child;

3 (B) support for the internal operations of  
4 the website, service, or application, as described  
5 in section 312.2 of title 16, Code of Federal  
6 Regulations (as in effect on the date of enact-  
7 ment of this Act), excluding any activity relat-  
8 ing to targeted marketing directed to children,  
9 teens, or a device of a child or teen if the sup-  
10 port for internal operations is consistent with  
11 the interest of the child or teen;

12 (C) compliance with legal process or other  
13 purposes expressly authorized under specific  
14 legal authority; or

15 (D) other purposes—

16 (i) that are specified in a notice to the  
17 teen or parent of the child; and

18 (ii) to which the teen or parent of the  
19 child has consented under paragraph (7)  
20 before the information is used or disclosed  
21 for such other purposes.

22 (4) RETENTION LIMITATION PRINCIPLE.—

23 (A) IN GENERAL.—The personal informa-  
24 tion of a child or teen should not be retained  
25 for longer than is necessary to fulfill a trans-

1           action or provide a service requested by the  
2           child or teen or such other purposes specified in  
3           subparagraphs (A) through (D) of paragraph  
4           (3).

5                   (B) DATA DISPOSAL.—The operator should  
6           implement a reasonable and appropriate data  
7           disposal policy based on the nature and sensi-  
8           tivity of personal information described in sub-  
9           paragraph (A).

10           (5) SECURITY SAFEGUARDS PRINCIPLE.—The  
11          personal information of a child or teen should be  
12          protected by reasonable and appropriate security  
13          safeguards against risks such as loss or unauthor-  
14          ized access, destruction, use, modification, or disclo-  
15          sure.

16           (6) TRANSPARENCY PRINCIPLE.—

17                   (A) GENERAL PRINCIPLE.—The operator  
18          should be transparent about developments,  
19          practices, and policies with respect to the per-  
20          sonal information of a child or teen.

21                   (B) PROVISION OF INFORMATION.—The  
22          operator should provide to each parent of a  
23          child, or to each teen, using the website, online  
24          service, online application, mobile application,

1 or connected device of the operator with a clear  
2 and prominent means—

3 (i) to identify and contact the oper-  
4 ator, by, at a minimum, disclosing, clearly  
5 and prominently, the identity of the oper-  
6 ator and—

7 (I) in the case of an operator  
8 who is an individual, the address of  
9 the principal residence (but not a per-  
10 sonal residence) of the operator and  
11 an email address or online contact  
12 form and telephone number for the  
13 operator; or

14 (II) in the case of any other op-  
15 erator, the address of the principal  
16 place of business of the operator and  
17 an email address or online contact  
18 form and telephone number for the  
19 operator;

20 (ii) to determine whether the operator  
21 possesses any personal information of the  
22 child or teen, the nature of any such infor-  
23 mation, and the purposes for which the in-  
24 formation was collected and is being re-  
25 tained;

1 (iii) to obtain any personal informa-  
2 tion of the child or teen that is in the pos-  
3 session of the operator from the operator,  
4 or from a person specified by the operator,  
5 within a reasonable time after making a  
6 request, at a charge (if any) that is not ex-  
7 cessive, in a reasonable manner, and in a  
8 form that is readily intelligible to the child  
9 or teen;

10 (iv) to challenge the accuracy of per-  
11 sonal information of the child or teen that  
12 is in the possession of the operator;

13 (v) to determine if the child or teen  
14 has established the inaccuracy of personal  
15 information in a challenge under clause  
16 (iv) in order to have such information  
17 erased, corrected, completed, or otherwise  
18 amended; and

19 (vi) to determine the method by which  
20 the operator obtains data relevant to the  
21 child or teen.

22 (C) LIMITATION.—Nothing in this para-  
23 graph shall be construed to permit an operator  
24 to erase or otherwise modify personal informa-

1           tion requested by a law enforcement agency  
2           pursuant to legal authority.

3           (7) INDIVIDUAL PARTICIPATION PRINCIPLE.—

4           The operator should—

5                   (A) obtain consent from a parent of a child  
6                   or from a teen before using or disclosing the  
7                   personal information of the child or teen for  
8                   any purpose other than the purposes described  
9                   in subparagraph (A) of paragraph (3); and

10                   (B) obtain affirmative express consent  
11                   from a parent of a child or from a teen before  
12                   using or disclosing previously collected personal  
13                   information of the child or teen for purposes  
14                   that constitute a material change in practice  
15                   from the original purposes specified to the child  
16                   or teen under paragraph (3).

17           (8) RACIAL AND SOCIOECONOMIC PROFILING.—

18           The personal information of a child or teen shall not  
19           be used to direct content to the child or teen, or a  
20           group of individuals similar to the child or teen, on  
21           the basis of race, socioeconomic factors, or any  
22           proxy thereof.

23           (b) RULE OF CONSTRUCTION.—Nothing in this sec-  
24           tion, including compliance with the Fair Information Prin-  
25           ciples, shall be construed to permit an operator to avoid



1 compliance with other requirements set forth in this Act  
2 or the Children’s Online Privacy Protection Act (15  
3 U.S.C. 6501 et seq.).

4 **SEC. 5. DIGITAL MARKETING BILL OF RIGHTS FOR TEENS.**

5 (a) ACTS PROHIBITED.—

6 (1) PROHIBITION.—

7 (A) IN GENERAL.—Except as provided in  
8 subparagraph (B), it shall be unlawful for an  
9 operator of a website, online service, online ap-  
10 plication, mobile application, or connected de-  
11 vice to collect personal information from a user  
12 if—

13 (i) the user is reasonably likely to be  
14 a teen; or

15 (ii) the website, online service, online  
16 application, mobile application, or con-  
17 nected device is directed to teens.

18 (B) EXCEPTION.—Subparagraph (A) shall  
19 not apply to an operator that has adopted and  
20 complies with a Digital Marketing Bill of  
21 Rights for Teens that meets the Fair Informa-  
22 tion Practices Principles described in section 4.

23 (2) EFFECTIVE DATE.—This subsection shall  
24 take effect on the date that is 180 days after the  
25 promulgation of regulations under subsection (b).

1 (b) REGULATIONS.—

2 (1) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 1 year after  
3 the date of enactment of this Act, the Commission  
4 shall promulgate, under section 553 of title 5,  
5 United States Code, regulations to implement this  
6 section, including regulations further defining the  
7 Fair Information Practices Principles described in  
8 section 4.

9 (2) UPDATES.—Not less frequently than once  
10 every 4 years after the date on which regulations are  
11 promulgated under paragraph (1), the Commission  
12 shall review and update those regulations as nec-  
13 essary.

14 **SEC. 6. TARGETED MARKETING TO CHILDREN AND TEENS.**

15 (a) PROHIBITED ACTS WITH RESPECT TO CHILDREN  
16 AND TEENS.—It shall be unlawful for an operator of a  
17 website, online service, online application, mobile applica-  
18 tion, or connected device to collect, use, disclose to third  
19 parties, or compile personal information of a user for pur-  
20 poses of targeted marketing (or to allow another person  
21 to collect, use, disclose, or compile such information for  
22 such purpose) if—

23 (1) such use, disclosure, or compiling of per-  
24 sonal information involves or is reasonably likely to

1 involve collection of personal information from a  
2 child or teen; or

3 (2) the website, online service, online applica-  
4 tion, mobile application, or connected device is di-  
5 rected to children or teens.

6 (b) EFFECTIVE DATE.—This section shall take effect  
7 on the date that is 180 days after the date of enactment  
8 of this Act.

9 **SEC. 7. REMOVAL OF CONTENT.**

10 (a) ACTS PROHIBITED.—It is unlawful for an oper-  
11 ator to make, or enable a child or teen to make, publicly  
12 available through a website, online service, online applica-  
13 tion, mobile application, or connected device content or in-  
14 formation that contains or displays personal information  
15 of children or teens in a manner that violates subsection  
16 (b).

17 (b) REQUIREMENT.—

18 (1) IN GENERAL.—An operator, to the extent  
19 technologically feasible, shall—

20 (A) implement mechanisms that permit a  
21 user of the website, online service, online applica-  
22 tion, mobile application, or connected device  
23 of the operator (and, in the case of a user that  
24 is a child, a parent of that user) to erase or

1 otherwise eliminate content or information that  
2 is—

3 (i) submitted to the website, online  
4 service, online application, mobile applica-  
5 tion, or connected device by that user;

6 (ii) publicly available through the  
7 website, online service, online application,  
8 mobile application, or connected device;  
9 and

10 (iii) contains or displays personal in-  
11 formation of children or teens; and

12 (B) take appropriate steps to—

13 (i) make users and parents of users  
14 who are children aware of the mechanisms  
15 described in subparagraph (A); and

16 (ii) provide notice to users and par-  
17 ents of users who are children that the  
18 mechanisms described in subparagraph (A)  
19 do not necessarily provide comprehensive  
20 removal of the content or information sub-  
21 mitted by users.

22 (2) EXCEPTIONS.—Paragraph (1) shall not be  
23 construed to require an operator or third party to  
24 erase or otherwise eliminate content or information  
25 that—

1 (A) any other provision of Federal or State  
2 law requires the operator or third party to  
3 maintain; or

4 (B) was submitted to the website, online  
5 service, online application, mobile application,  
6 or connected device of the operator by any per-  
7 son other than the user who is attempting to  
8 erase or otherwise eliminate the content or in-  
9 formation, including content or information  
10 submitted by the user that was republished or  
11 resubmitted by another person.

12 (c) LIMITATION.—Nothing in this section shall be  
13 construed to limit the authority of a law enforcement  
14 agency to obtain any content or information from an oper-  
15 ator as authorized by law or pursuant to an order of a  
16 court of competent jurisdiction.

17 (d) EFFECTIVE DATE.—This section shall take effect  
18 on the date that is 180 days after the date of enactment  
19 of this Act.

20 **SEC. 8. RULE FOR TREATMENT OF USERS OF WEBSITES,**  
21 **SERVICES, AND APPLICATIONS DIRECTED TO**  
22 **CHILDREN OR TEENS.**

23 For the purposes of this Act, an operator of a  
24 website, online service, online application, mobile applica-  
25 tion, or connected device that is directed to children or

1 teens shall treat each user of that website, online service,  
2 online application, mobile application, or connected device  
3 as a child or teen, except as permitted by the Commission  
4 pursuant to a regulation promulgated under this Act, and  
5 except to the extent the website, online service, online ap-  
6 plication, mobile application, or connected device is  
7 deemed directed to mixed audiences.

8 **SEC. 9. STUDY OF MOBILE AND ONLINE APPLICATION**  
9 **OVERSIGHT.**

10 Not later than 3 years after the date of enactment  
11 of this Act, the Commission shall submit to each com-  
12 mittee of the Senate and each committee of the House  
13 of Representatives that has jurisdiction over the Commis-  
14 sion a report on the processes of platforms that offer mo-  
15 bile and online applications for ensuring that, of those ap-  
16 plications that are directed to children or teens, the appli-  
17 cations operate in accordance with—

18 (1) this Act, the amendments made by this Act,  
19 and rules promulgated under this Act; and

20 (2) rules promulgated by the Commission under  
21 section 5 of the Federal Trade Commission Act (15  
22 U.S.C. 45) relating to unfair or deceptive acts or  
23 practices in marketing.

1 **SEC. 10. YOUTH PRIVACY AND MARKETING DIVISION.**

2 (a) ESTABLISHMENT.—There is established within  
3 the Commission a division to be known as the Youth Pri-  
4 vacy and Marketing Division.

5 (b) DIRECTOR.—The Youth Privacy and Marketing  
6 Division shall be headed by a Director.

7 (c) DUTIES.—The Youth Privacy and Marketing Di-  
8 vision established under subsection (a) shall be responsible  
9 for assisting the Commission to address, as it relates to  
10 this Act and the amendments made by this Act—

11 (1) the privacy of children and teens; and

12 (2) marketing directed at children and teens.

13 (d) STAFF.—The Director of the Youth Privacy and  
14 Marketing Division shall hire adequate staff to carry out  
15 the duties under subsection (c), including individuals who  
16 are experts in data protection, digital advertising, data  
17 analytics, and youth development.

18 (e) REPORTS.—Not later than 1 year after the date  
19 of enactment of this Act, and each year thereafter, the  
20 Director of the Youth and Privacy Marketing Division  
21 shall submit to the Committee on Commerce, Science, and  
22 Transportation of the Senate and the Committee on En-  
23 ergy and Commerce of the House of Representatives a re-  
24 port that includes—

25 (1) a description of the work of the Youth Pri-  
26 vacy and Marketing Division on emerging concerns

1 relating to youth privacy and marketing practices;  
2 and

3 (2) an assessment of how effectively the Com-  
4 mission has, during the period for which the report  
5 is submitted, addressed youth privacy and marketing  
6 practices.

7 **SEC. 11. ENFORCEMENT AND APPLICABILITY.**

8 (a) ENFORCEMENT BY THE COMMISSION.—

9 (1) IN GENERAL.—Except as otherwise pro-  
10 vided, this Act and the regulations prescribed under  
11 this Act shall be enforced by the Commission under  
12 the Federal Trade Commission Act (15 U.S.C. 41 et  
13 seq.).

14 (2) UNFAIR OR DECEPTIVE ACTS OR PRAC-  
15 TICES.—Subject to subsection (b), a violation of this  
16 Act or a regulation prescribed under this Act shall  
17 be treated as a violation of a rule defining an unfair  
18 or deceptive act or practice prescribed under section  
19 18(a)(1)(B) of the Federal Trade Commission Act  
20 (15 U.S.C. 57a(a)(1)(B)).

21 (3) ACTIONS BY THE COMMISSION.—

22 (A) IN GENERAL.—Subject to subsection  
23 (b), and except as provided in subsection (d)(1),  
24 the Commission shall prevent any person from  
25 violating this Act or a regulation prescribed



1 under this Act in the same manner, by the  
2 same means, and with the same jurisdiction,  
3 powers, and duties as though all applicable  
4 terms and provisions of the Federal Trade  
5 Commission Act (15 U.S.C. 41 et seq.) were in-  
6 corporated into and made a part of this Act,  
7 and any person who violates this Act or such  
8 regulation shall be subject to the penalties and  
9 entitled to the privileges and immunities pro-  
10 vided in the Federal Trade Commission Act.

11 (B) VIOLATIONS.—Notwithstanding sec-  
12 tion 5(m) of the Federal Trade Commission Act  
13 (15 U.S.C. 45(m)), a civil penalty recovered for  
14 a violation of this Act or a regulation prescribed  
15 under this Act may be in excess of the amounts  
16 provided for in that section as the court finds  
17 appropriate to deter violations of this Act and  
18 regulations prescribed under this Act.

19 (b) ENFORCEMENT BY CERTAIN OTHER AGEN-  
20 CIES.—Notwithstanding subsection (a), compliance with  
21 the requirements imposed under this Act shall be enforced  
22 as follows:

23 (1) Under section 8 of the Federal Deposit In-  
24 surance Act (12 U.S.C. 1818) by the appropriate  
25 Federal banking agency, with respect to an insured

1 depository institution (as such terms are defined in  
2 section 3 of such Act (12 U.S.C. 1813)).

3 (2) Under the Federal Credit Union Act (12  
4 U.S.C. 1751 et seq.) by the National Credit Union  
5 Administration Board, with respect to any Federal  
6 credit union.

7 (3) Under part A of subtitle VII of title 49,  
8 United States Code, by the Secretary of Transpor-  
9 tation, with respect to any air carrier or foreign air  
10 carrier subject to such part.

11 (4) Under the Packers and Stockyards Act,  
12 1921 (7 U.S.C. 181 et seq.) (except as provided in  
13 section 406 of that Act (7 U.S.C. 226, 227)) by the  
14 Secretary of Agriculture, with respect to any activi-  
15 ties subject to that Act.

16 (5) Under the Farm Credit Act of 1971 (12  
17 U.S.C. 2001 et seq.) by the Farm Credit Adminis-  
18 tration, with respect to any Federal land bank, Fed-  
19 eral land bank association, Federal intermediate  
20 credit bank, or production credit association.

21 (c) ENFORCEMENT BY STATE ATTORNEYS GEN-  
22 ERAL.—

23 (1) IN GENERAL.—

24 (A) CIVIL ACTIONS.—In any case in which  
25 the attorney general of a State has reason to

1 believe that an interest of the residents of that  
2 State has been or is threatened or adversely af-  
3 fected by the engagement of any person in a  
4 practice that violates this Act or a regulation  
5 prescribed under this Act, the State, as *parens*  
6 *patriae*, may bring a civil action on behalf of  
7 the residents of the State in a district court of  
8 the United States of appropriate jurisdiction  
9 to—

10 (i) enjoin that practice;

11 (ii) enforce compliance with this Act  
12 or such regulation;

13 (iii) obtain damages, restitution, or  
14 other compensation on behalf of residents  
15 of the State; or

16 (iv) obtain such other relief as the  
17 court may consider to be appropriate.

18 (B) NOTICE.—

19 (i) IN GENERAL.—Before filing an ac-  
20 tion under subparagraph (A), the attorney  
21 general of the State involved shall provide  
22 to the Commission—

23 (I) written notice of that action;

24 and

1 (II) a copy of the complaint for  
2 that action.

3 (ii) EXEMPTION.—

4 (I) IN GENERAL.—Clause (i)  
5 shall not apply with respect to the fil-  
6 ing of an action by an attorney gen-  
7 eral of a State under this paragraph  
8 if the attorney general of the State  
9 determines that it is not feasible to  
10 provide the notice described in that  
11 clause before the filing of the action.

12 (II) NOTIFICATION.—In an ac-  
13 tion described in subclause (I), the at-  
14 torney general of a State shall provide  
15 notice and a copy of the complaint to  
16 the Commission at the same time as  
17 the attorney general files the action.

18 (2) INTERVENTION.—

19 (A) IN GENERAL.—On receiving notice  
20 under paragraph (1)(B), the Commission shall  
21 have the right to intervene in the action that is  
22 the subject of the notice.

23 (B) EFFECT OF INTERVENTION.—If the  
24 Commission intervenes in an action under para-  
25 graph (1), it shall have the right—

1 (i) to be heard with respect to any  
2 matter that arises in that action; and

3 (ii) to file a petition for appeal.

4 (3) CONSTRUCTION.—For purposes of bringing  
5 any civil action under paragraph (1), nothing in this  
6 Act shall be construed to prevent an attorney gen-  
7 eral of a State from exercising the powers conferred  
8 on the attorney general by the laws of that State  
9 to—

10 (A) conduct investigations;

11 (B) administer oaths or affirmations; or

12 (C) compel the attendance of witnesses or  
13 the production of documentary and other evi-  
14 dence.

15 (4) ACTIONS BY THE COMMISSION.—In any  
16 case in which an action is instituted by or on behalf  
17 of the Commission for violation of this Act or a reg-  
18 ulation prescribed under this Act, no State may,  
19 during the pendency of that action, institute a sepa-  
20 rate action under paragraph (1) against any defend-  
21 ant named in the complaint in the action instituted  
22 by or on behalf of the Commission for that violation.

23 (5) VENUE; SERVICE OF PROCESS.—

24 (A) VENUE.—Any action brought under  
25 paragraph (1) may be brought in the district

1 court of the United States that meets applicable  
2 requirements relating to venue under section  
3 1391 of title 28, United States Code.

4 (B) SERVICE OF PROCESS.—In an action  
5 brought under paragraph (1), process may be  
6 served in any district in which the defendant—

7 (i) is an inhabitant; or

8 (ii) may be found.

9 (d) TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIERS AND CABLE  
10 OPERATORS.—

11 (1) ENFORCEMENT BY COMMISSION.—Notwith-  
12 standing section 4, 5(a)(2), or 6 of the Federal  
13 Trade Commission Act (15 U.S.C. 44, 45(a)(2), 46)  
14 or any jurisdictional limitation of the Commission,  
15 the Commission shall also enforce this Act and regu-  
16 lations promulgated under this Act, in the same  
17 manner provided in paragraph (a), with respect to  
18 common carriers subject to the Communications Act  
19 of 1934 (47 U.S.C. 151 et seq.) and Acts amend-  
20 atory thereof and supplementary thereto.

21 (2) RELATIONSHIP TO OTHER LAWS.—To the  
22 extent that section 222, 338(i), or 631 of the Com-  
23 munications Act of 1934 (47 U.S.C. 222, 338(i),  
24 551) is inconsistent with this Act, this Act controls.

25 (e) SAFE HARBORS.—

1 (1) DEFINITION.—In this subsection—

2 (A) the term “applicable section” means  
3 section 5, 6, 7, or 8 of this Act;

4 (B) the term “covered operator” means an  
5 operator subject to guidelines approved under  
6 paragraph (2);

7 (C) the term “requesting entity” means an  
8 entity that submits a safe harbor request to the  
9 Commission; and

10 (D) the term “safe harbor request” means  
11 a request to have self-regulatory guidelines de-  
12 scribed in paragraph (2)(A) approved under  
13 that paragraph.

14 (2) GUIDELINES.—

15 (A) IN GENERAL.—An operator may sat-  
16 isfy the requirements of regulations issued  
17 under an applicable section by following a set of  
18 self-regulatory guidelines, issued by representa-  
19 tives of the marketing or online industries, or  
20 by other persons, that, after notice and an op-  
21 portunity for comment, are approved by the  
22 Commission upon making a determination that  
23 the guidelines meet the requirements of the reg-  
24 ulations issued under that applicable section.

1           (B) EXPEDITED RESPONSE TO RE-  
2           QUESTS.—Not later than 180 days after the  
3           date on which a safe harbor request is filed  
4           under subparagraph (A), the Commission shall  
5           act upon the request set forth in writing the  
6           conclusions of the Commission with regard to  
7           the request.

8           (C) APPEALS.—A requesting entity may  
9           appeal the final action of the Commission under  
10          subparagraph (B), or a failure by the Commis-  
11          sion to act in the period described in that para-  
12          graph, to a district court of the United States  
13          of appropriate jurisdiction, as provided for in  
14          section 706 of title 5, United States Code.

15          (3) INCENTIVES.—

16          (A) SELF-REGULATORY INCENTIVES.—In  
17          prescribing regulations under an applicable sec-  
18          tion, the Commission shall provide incentives  
19          for self-regulation by covered operators to im-  
20          plement the protections afforded children and  
21          teens, as applicable, under the regulatory re-  
22          quirements described in those sections.

23          (B) DEEMED COMPLIANCE.—The incen-  
24          tives under subparagraph (A) shall include pro-  
25          visions for ensuring that a covered operator will



1 be deemed to be in compliance with the require-  
2 ments of the regulations under an applicable  
3 section if that person complies with guidelines  
4 approved under paragraph (2).

5 (4) REGULATIONS.—

6 (A) IN GENERAL.—In prescribing regula-  
7 tions relating to safe harbor guidelines under  
8 an applicable section, the Commission shall—

9 (i) establish criteria for the approval  
10 of guidelines that will ensure that a cov-  
11 ered operator provides substantially the  
12 same or greater protections for children  
13 and teens, as applicable, as those contained  
14 in the regulations issued under the applica-  
15 ble section; and

16 (ii) subject to subsection (B), require  
17 that any report or documentation required  
18 to be submitted to the Commission by a  
19 covered operator or requesting entity will  
20 be published on the internet website of the  
21 Commission.

22 (B) RESTRICTIONS ON PUBLICATION.—

23 The restrictions described in subsection (f) of  
24 section 6 of the Federal Trade Commission Act  
25 (15 U.S.C. 46(f)) applicable to the publication

1 of information obtained by the Commission  
2 through investigations conducted under such  
3 section shall apply in same manner to the publi-  
4 cation under this paragraph of information in-  
5 cluded in a report or documentation described  
6 in subparagraph (A).

7 (5) REPORT BY THE INSPECTOR GENERAL.—

8 (A) IN GENERAL.—Not later than 2 years  
9 after the date of enactment of this Act, and  
10 once each 2 years thereafter, the Inspector Gen-  
11 eral of the Commission shall submit to the  
12 Commission and each committee of the Senate  
13 and each committee of the House of Represent-  
14 atives that has jurisdiction over the Commission  
15 a report regarding the safe harbor provisions  
16 under this subparagraph, which shall include—

17 (i) an analysis of whether the safe  
18 harbor provisions are—

19 (I) operating fairly and effec-  
20 tively; and

21 (II) effectively protecting the in-  
22 terests of children and teens; and

23 (ii) proposals for policy changes that  
24 would improve the effectiveness of the safe  
25 harbor provisions.

1 (B) PUBLICATION.—Not later than 10  
2 days after the date on which a report under  
3 subparagraph (A) is submitted, the Commission  
4 shall publish the report on the internet website  
5 of the Commission.

6 (f) EFFECTIVE DATE.—This section shall take effect  
7 on the date that is 90 days after the date of enactment  
8 of this Act.

9 (g) RULE OF CONSTRUCTION.—Nothing in this Act  
10 may be construed to authorize any action by the Commis-  
11 sion that would violate section 18(h) of the Federal Trade  
12 Commission Act (15 U.S.C. 57a(h)).

13 **SEC. 12. GAO STUDY.**

14 (a) STUDY.—The Comptroller General of the United  
15 States (in this section referred to as the “Comptroller  
16 General”) shall conduct a study on the privacy of teens  
17 who use financial technology products. Such study shall—

18 (1) identify the type of financial technology  
19 products that teens are using;

20 (2) identify the potential risks to teens’ privacy  
21 from using such financial technology products; and

22 (3) determine whether existing laws are suffi-  
23 cient to address such risks to teens’ privacy.

24 (b) REPORT.—Not later than 1 year after the date  
25 of enactment of this section, the Comptroller General shall

1 submit to Congress a report containing the results of the  
2 study conducted under subsection (a), together with rec-  
3 ommendations for such legislation and administrative ac-  
4 tion as the Comptroller General determines appropriate.