

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:19-cv-01339-CJN**

AMERICAN OVERSIGHT v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF
HOMELAND SECURITY et al
Assigned to: Judge Carl J. Nichols
Demand: \$0
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 05/08/2019
Date Terminated: 11/28/2022
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

AMERICAN OVERSIGHT

represented by **Khahilia Y. Shaw**
AMERICAN OVERSIGHT
1030 15th Street, NW
Suite B255
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 539-6507
Fax: (202) 871-6523
Email: khahilia.shaw@americanoversight.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel Alexander McGrath
AMERICAN OVERSIGHT
1030 15th Street, NW
Suite B255
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 897-4213
Email: daniel.mcgrath@americanoversight.org
TERMINATED: 04/29/2021
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND
SECURITY**

represented by **Thomas Duffey**
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
555 4th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 252-2510
Email: thomas.duffey@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alan Burch
DOJ-USAO
Eousa
3 Constitution Square
175 N Street, NE
Washington, DC 20002
202-252-5875
Email: alan.burch@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 09/30/2020

Benton Gregory Peterson
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE FOR THE
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
555 Fourth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 252-2534

Fax: (202) 252-2599
Email: benton.peterson@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 10/16/2019

Diana Viggiano Valdivia
DOJ-USAO
601 D Street NW
Civil Division
Washington, DC 20530
202-252-2545
Email: diana.valdivia@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 12/20/2020

Defendant

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
TERMINATED: 09/11/2020

represented by **Thomas Duffey**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alan Burch
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/30/2020

Benton Gregory Peterson
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/16/2019

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/08/2019	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0090-6111087) filed by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>2</u> Summons, # <u>3</u> Summons, # <u>4</u> Summons, # <u>5</u> Summons)(McGrath, Daniel) (Entered: 05/08/2019)
05/08/2019	<u>2</u>	LCvR 26.1 CERTIFICATE OF DISCLOSURE of Corporate Affiliations and Financial Interests by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT (McGrath, Daniel) (Entered: 05/08/2019)
05/09/2019		Case Assigned to Judge Randolph D. Moss. (zrdj) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/09/2019	<u>3</u>	SUMMONS (4) Issued Electronically as to U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice and Consent)(zrdj) (Entered: 05/09/2019)
05/10/2019	<u>4</u>	STANDING ORDER: The parties are hereby ORDERED to comply with the directives set forth in the attached Standing Order. See document for details. Signed by Judge Randolph D. Moss on 5/10/2019. (lcrdm3,) (Entered: 05/10/2019)
05/20/2019	<u>5</u>	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed as to the United States Attorney. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney on 5/9/2019. (Answer due for ALL FEDERAL DEFENDANTS by 6/8/2019.), RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed on United States Attorney General. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney General 5/13/2019., RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY served on 5/13/2019; U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE served on 5/13/2019 (McGrath, Daniel) (Entered: 05/20/2019)
05/31/2019	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Benton Gregory Peterson on behalf of All Defendants (Peterson, Benton) (Entered: 05/31/2019)
06/10/2019	<u>7</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE.(Peterson, Benton) (Entered: 06/10/2019)
06/24/2019		Case directly reassigned to Judge Carl J. Nichols. Judge Randolph D. Moss is no longer assigned to the case. (rj) (Entered: 06/24/2019)

08/05/2019	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Khahilia Y. Shaw on behalf of AMERICAN OVERSIGHT (Shaw, Khahilia) (Main Document 8 replaced on 8/7/2019) (zjf). (Entered: 08/05/2019)
08/13/2019		MINUTE ORDER. Before the Court in this Freedom of Information Act case are a Complaint and an Answer. The requirements of Local Civil Rule 16.3 and Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(f) appear to be inapplicable. It is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall confer and file a Joint Status Report on or before September 11, 2019. The Joint Status Report shall address: (1) the status of Plaintiff's FOIA request; (2) the anticipated number of documents responsive to Plaintiff's FOIA request; (3) the anticipated date(s) for release of the documents requested by Plaintiff; (4) whether a motion for stay is likely under <i>Open America v. Watergate Special Prosecution Force</i> , 547 F.2d 605 (D.C. Cir. 1976); and (5) whether the Parties anticipate summary judgment briefing and, if so, a proposed briefing schedule. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on August 13, 2019. (lccjn1) (Entered: 08/13/2019)
08/14/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 9/11/2019. (mac) (Entered: 08/14/2019)
09/11/2019	<u>9</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 09/11/2019)
09/20/2019		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>9</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before October 17, 2019. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on September 20, 2019. (lccjn3) (Entered: 09/20/2019)
09/20/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 10/17/2019. (zcdw) (Entered: 09/22/2019)
10/16/2019	<u>10</u>	NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Alan Burch on behalf of All Defendants Substituting for attorney Benton Peterson (Burch, Alan) (Entered: 10/16/2019)
10/17/2019	<u>11</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 10/17/2019)
10/23/2019		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>11</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before November 21, 2019. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on October 23, 2019. (lccjn3) (Entered: 10/23/2019)
10/23/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 11/21/2019. (zcdw) (Entered: 10/23/2019)
11/21/2019	<u>12</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 11/21/2019)
12/11/2019		MINUTE ORDER. The Court has reviewed the Parties' <u>12</u> Joint Status Report and has noted Plaintiff's concerns about redactions in DHS's productions and Plaintiff's request that DHS produce the additional 28 pages. It is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before December 20, 2019, providing recommendations for further proceedings. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on December 11, 2019. (lccjn3) (Entered: 12/11/2019)
12/11/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 12/20/2019. (zcdw) (Entered: 12/11/2019)
12/20/2019	<u>13</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 12/20/2019)
12/23/2019		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>13</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before January 31, 2020. If by that date Defendants have not processed the 28 pages sent out by the Department of Homeland Security for consultation, the Joint Status Report shall address why the Court should not order the processing of those pages immediately. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on December 23, 2019. (lccjn3) (Entered: 12/23/2019)

12/23/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 1/31/2020. (zcdw) (Entered: 12/24/2019)
01/31/2020	<u>14</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 01/31/2020)
02/03/2020		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>14</u> Joint Status Report, is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before April 3, 2020. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on February 3, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 02/03/2020)
02/03/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 4/3/2020. (zcdw) (Entered: 02/04/2020)
04/03/2020	<u>15</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Burch, Alan) (Entered: 04/03/2020)
04/07/2020		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>15</u> Joint Status Report, is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before April 10, 2020. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on April 7, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 04/07/2020)
04/07/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 4/10/2020. (zcdw) (Entered: 04/07/2020)
04/10/2020	<u>16</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 04/10/2020)
04/15/2020		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>16</u> Joint Status Report, is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before May 29, 2020. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on April 15, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 04/15/2020)
04/15/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 5/29/2020. (zcdw) (Entered: 04/16/2020)
05/29/2020	<u>17</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Burch, Alan) (Entered: 05/29/2020)
06/01/2020		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>17</u> Joint Status Report, is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before June 30, 2020. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on June 1, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 06/01/2020)
06/01/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines/Hearings: Joint Status Report due by 6/30/2020. (zcdw) (Entered: 06/01/2020)
06/30/2020	<u>18</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Burch, Alan) (Entered: 06/30/2020)
07/07/2020		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>18</u> Joint Status Report, is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before August 7, 2020. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on July 7, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 07/07/2020)
07/07/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 8/7/2020. (zcal) (Entered: 07/08/2020)
08/07/2020	<u>19</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 08/07/2020)
08/17/2020		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the Parties' <u>19</u> Joint Status Report, is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall submit an additional Joint Status Report on or before September 11, 2020. The Court has reviewed the proposed briefing schedule between Plaintiff and Defendant DHS but notes that any summary judgment briefing should simultaneously address the DHS redactions and DOJ withholdings or redactions, if any. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on August 17, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 08/17/2020)
08/17/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 9/11/2020. (zcal) (Entered: 08/18/2020)
09/11/2020	<u>20</u>	NOTICE of Voluntary Dismissal re U.S. Department of Justice (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 09/11/2020)

09/11/2020	<u>21</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 09/11/2020)
09/18/2020		MINUTE ORDER. Upon review of the Parties' <u>21</u> Joint Status Report, the Court hereby enters the following briefing schedule: Defendant shall file its Motion for Summary Judgment by September 25, 2020 ; Plaintiff shall file its Response and its Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment by October 26, 2020 ; Defendant shall file its Reply and Response by November 16, 2020 ; and Plaintiff shall file its Reply by December 16, 2020 . It is so ORDERED. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on September 18, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 09/18/2020)
09/23/2020	<u>22</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Burch, Alan) (Entered: 09/23/2020)
09/23/2020	<u>23</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Diana Viggiano Valdivia on behalf of U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Valdivia, Diana) (Entered: 09/23/2020)
09/30/2020	<u>24</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of James V.M.L. Holzer)(Burch, Alan) (Entered: 09/30/2020)
09/30/2020	<u>25</u>	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. Attorney Alan Burch terminated. (Burch, Alan) (Entered: 09/30/2020)
10/06/2020		MINUTE ORDER. Upon review of the Parties' <u>22</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File, it is hereby ORDERED that the Motion is GRANTED. The Court thus enters the following briefing schedule: Defendant shall file its Motion for Summary Judgment by September 30, 2020 ; Plaintiff shall file its Response and its Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment by October 30, 2020 ; Defendant shall file its Reply and Response by November 23, 2020 ; and Plaintiff shall file its Reply by December 21, 2020 . Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on October 6, 2020. (lccjn3) (Entered: 10/06/2020)
10/06/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Summary Judgment motions due by 9/30/2020. Response to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 10/30/2020. Cross Motions due by 10/30/2020. Response to Cross Motions due by 11/23/2020. Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 11/23/2020. Reply to Cross Motions due by 12/21/2020. (zcal) (Entered: 10/06/2020)
10/08/2020	<u>26</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment and Opposition</i> by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 10/08/2020)
10/14/2020		MINUTE ORDER. Upon review of Plaintiff's <u>26</u> Consent Motion to Extend Time to File, it is hereby ORDERED that the Motion is GRANTED. The Court thus adopts the following amended briefing schedule: Plaintiff shall file its Response and its Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment by November 20, 2020 ; Defendant shall file its Reply and Response by January 12, 2021 ; and Plaintiff shall file its Reply by February 2, 2021 . Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on October 14, 2020. (lccjn3) Modified on 10/14/2020 to correct dates (zcal). (Entered: 10/14/2020)
10/14/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Cross Motions due by 11/20/2020. Response to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 11/20/2020. Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 1/12/2021. Response to Cross Motions due by 1/12/2021. Reply to Cross Motions due by 2/2/2021. (zcal) (Entered: 10/14/2020)
11/20/2020	<u>27</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>24</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration and Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Statement of Facts Plaintiff's Response, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 11/20/2020)
11/20/2020	<u>28</u>	Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Declaration and Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 11/20/2020)

12/20/2020	<u>29</u>	NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Thomas Duffey on behalf of U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY Substituting for attorney Diana Viggiano Valdivia (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 12/20/2020)
01/08/2021	<u>30</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 01/08/2021)
01/12/2021		MINUTE ORDER. Upon review of Defendant's <u>8</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time to File, it is hereby ORDERED that the Motion is GRANTED. Defendant shall file its Reply and Response by February 12, 2021 , and Plaintiff shall Reply by March 12, 2021 . Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on January 12, 2021. (lccjn3) (Entered: 01/12/2021)
01/12/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendant's Response and Reply due by 2/12/2021. Plaintiff's Reply due by 3/12/2021. (zcal) (Entered: 01/13/2021)
02/12/2021	<u>31</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>28</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Pavlik–Keenan Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Vaughan Index, # <u>3</u> Statement of Facts Defendant Supplemental Statement of Facts, # <u>4</u> Statement of Facts Defendant Response to)(Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 02/12/2021)
02/12/2021	<u>32</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>28</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (View Docket Entry <u>31</u> to view document). (eg) (Entered: 02/18/2021)
03/12/2021	<u>33</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>28</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Statement of Facts)(Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 03/12/2021)
04/29/2021	<u>34</u>	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF APPEARANCE as to AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. Attorney Daniel Alexander McGrath terminated. (McGrath, Daniel) (Entered: 04/29/2021)
05/13/2021		MINUTE ORDER. Upon review of the Parties' <u>24</u> <u>28</u> Motions for Summary Judgment, the government is hereby ORDERED to clarify, by May 28, 2021 , whether every external email address included in documents withheld under FOIA Exemption 5 was held by an agency employee at the time those documents were drafted and sent. The government's supplemental response shall not exceed 5 pages. The government is further ORDERED to submit unredacted copies of all documents withheld under FOIA Exemption 5 for <i>in camera</i> review by May 28, 2021 . Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on May 13, 2021. (lccjn3) (Entered: 05/13/2021)
05/13/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Supplemental Response due by 5/28/2021. (zcal) (Entered: 05/13/2021)
05/21/2021	<u>35</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Supplemental Response</i> by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 05/21/2021)
06/14/2021	<u>36</u>	NOTICE of Compliance with Order for In Camera Documents by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 06/14/2021)
06/14/2021	<u>37</u>	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM regarding Exemption 5 to <u>24</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Exhibit A Declaration of Catrina M. Pavlik–Keenan)(Duffey, Thomas) Modified docket relationship/text on 6/16/2021 (eg). (Entered: 06/14/2021)
06/22/2021	<u>38</u>	RESPONSE re <u>37</u> Supplemental Memorandum, filed by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 06/22/2021)
07/06/2021	<u>39</u>	MOTION for Leave to File SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM to file <i>Supplemental Declaration</i> filed by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration)(Duffey, Thomas) Modified docket event/text on 7/9/2021 (eg). (Entered: 07/06/2021)

07/08/2021		MINUTE ORDER. Upon review of Defendants' <u>39</u> Motion for Leave to File Supplemental Declaration, it is hereby ORDERED that the Motion is GRANTED. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on July 8, 2021. (lccjn3) (Entered: 07/08/2021)
09/17/2021	<u>40</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on September 17, 2021. (lccjn3) (Entered: 09/17/2021)
09/17/2021	<u>41</u>	ORDER. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on September 17, 2021. (lccjn3) (Entered: 09/17/2021)
09/17/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Supplemental Memorandum due by 10/11/2021. Responses due by 11/1/2021. (zcal) (Entered: 09/17/2021)
10/05/2021	<u>42</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Supplemental Submission with proposed order</i> by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 10/05/2021)
10/06/2021		Upon consideration of Defendants' <u>42</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED. Defendants shall file their supplemental memorandum by October 25, 2021. Plaintiff shall file its response by November 15, 2021. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on October 6, 2021. (lccjn3) (Entered: 10/06/2021)
10/06/2021		Set/Reset Deadlines: Supplemental Memorandum due by 10/25/2021. Responses due by 11/15/2021. (zcal) (Entered: 10/08/2021)
10/25/2021	<u>43</u>	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM to re <u>24</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Catrina Pavlik-Keenan)(Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 10/25/2021)
11/15/2021	<u>44</u>	STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 11/15/2021)
12/03/2021		ENTERED IN ERROR.....MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of Parties' <u>44</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that Plaintiffs deadline to file its Reply in support of its cross-motion for summary judgment is VACATED. It is further ORDERED that proceedings in the matter shall be held in abeyance. The Parties shall file their next Joint Status Report by January 14, 2022. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on December 3, 2021. (lccjn3) Modified on 12/13/2021 – Incorrect order filed (zcal). (Entered: 12/03/2021)
12/03/2021		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of Plaintiffs <u>44</u> Status Report, the Parties are ordered to file a Joint Status Report updating the Court on the status of production and the Parties negotiations on any remaining issues by January 7, 2022. So Ordered by Judge Carl J. Nichols on 12/3/2021. (zcal) (Entered: 12/13/2021)
12/13/2021		NOTICE OF CORRECTED DOCKET ENTRY: First Minute Order filed 12/3/2021 was entered in error and correct Minute Order has been filed.(zcal) (Entered: 12/13/2021)
01/07/2022	<u>45</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 01/07/2022)
01/10/2022		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the Parties' <u>45</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall file another joint status report by March 7, 2022. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on January 10, 2022. (lccjn3) (Entered: 01/10/2022)
01/10/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 3/7/2022. (zcal) (Entered: 01/11/2022)
03/07/2022	<u>46</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 03/07/2022)
03/09/2022		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the Parties' <u>46</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the Parties shall file another joint status report by April 18, 2022. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on March 9, 2022. (lccjn3) (Entered: 03/09/2022)

03/09/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 4/18/2022. (zcal) (Entered: 03/10/2022)
04/18/2022	<u>47</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 04/18/2022)
07/25/2022	<u>48</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 07/25/2022)
07/28/2022		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the Parties' <u>48</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the next Joint Status Report in this matter be filed on or before September 22, 2022. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on July 28, 2022. (lccjn3) (Entered: 07/28/2022)
07/28/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 9/22/2022. (zcal) (Entered: 08/01/2022)
09/22/2022	<u>49</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 09/22/2022)
10/03/2022		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the Parties' <u>49</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the next Joint Status Report in this matter be filed on or before November 7, 2022. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on October 3, 2022. (lccjn3) (Entered: 10/03/2022)
10/03/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 11/7/2022. (zcal) (Entered: 10/05/2022)
11/07/2022	<u>50</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT by DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (Duffey, Thomas) (Entered: 11/07/2022)
11/14/2022		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of the Parties' <u>50</u> Joint Status Report, it is hereby ORDERED that the next Joint Status Report in this matter be filed on or before December 7, 2022. Signed by Judge Carl J. Nichols on November 14, 2022. (lccjn3) (Entered: 11/14/2022)
11/14/2022		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 12/7/2022. (zcal) (Entered: 11/14/2022)
11/23/2022	<u>51</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal by AMERICAN OVERSIGHT. (Shaw, Khahilia) (Entered: 11/23/2022)