# **U.S. District Court Southern District of New York (Foley Square)** CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:21-cv-06579-JMF

Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University v.

Federal Bureau of Prisons et al Assigned to: Judge Jesse M. Furman Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act Date Filed: 08/04/2021 Date Terminated: 07/25/2022

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of

Information Act

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

## **Plaintiff**

**Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University** 

## represented by Alexander Abraham Abdo

Knight First Amendement Institute at

Columbia University 475 Riverside Drive, Suite 302

New York, NY 10115 646-745-8500

Email: alex.abdo@knightcolumbia.org ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

# **Alyssa Morones**

Knight First Amendment Institute at

Columbia University 475 Riverside Drive

Ste 302

New York, NY 10115 646-745-8500

Email: alyssa.morones@knightcolumbia.org

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### Stephanie Krent

Knight First Amendment Institute at

Columbia University 475 Riverside Drive Suite 302

New York, NY 10115 646-745-8500

Email: stephanie.krent@knightcolumbia.org

ATTORNÊY TO BE NOTICED

V.

# **Defendant**

**Federal Bureau of Prisons** 

### represented by Anthony Jan-Huan Sun

U.S. Attorney Office SDNY 86 Chambers Street New York, NY 10007

212-637-2810 Fax: 212-637-2786

Email: anthony.sun@usdoj.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#### **Defendant**

**U.S. Department of Justice** 

represented by Anthony Jan-Huan Sun

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/04/2021	1	COMPLAINT against Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice. (Filing Fee \$ 402.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC–24886073)Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B).(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/04/2021)
08/04/2021	2	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/04/2021)
08/04/2021	<u>3</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Federal Bureau of Prisons, re: 1 Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/04/2021)
08/04/2021	4	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Justice, re: 1 Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/04/2021)
08/04/2021	<u>5</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Alexander Abraham Abdo on behalf of Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 08/04/2021)
08/05/2021		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING PARTY MODIFICATION. Notice to attorney Stephanie Krent. The party information for the following party/parties has been modified: United States Department of Justice. The information for the party/parties has been modified for the following reason/reasons: party name entered incorrectly. (vf) (Entered: 08/05/2021)
08/05/2021		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Jesse M. Furman. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="https://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/district-judges">https://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/district-judges</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="https://nysd.uscourts.gov/rules/ecf-related-instructions">https://nysd.uscourts.gov/rules/ecf-related-instructions</a> (vf) (Entered: 08/05/2021)
08/05/2021		Magistrate Judge Sarah Netburn is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="https://nysd.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/2018–06/AO-3.pdf">https://nysd.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/2018–06/AO-3.pdf</a> . (vf) (Entered: 08/05/2021)
08/05/2021		Case Designated ECF. (vf) (Entered: 08/05/2021)
08/05/2021	<u>6</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Federal Bureau of Prisons. (vf) (Entered: 08/05/2021)
08/05/2021	7	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of Justice. (vf) (Entered: 08/05/2021)
08/05/2021	8	ORDER: This case arises under the Freedom of Information Act, Title 5, United State Code, Section 552. The parties are hereby ORDERED to submit a joint letter, no later than two weeks from the date of this order and not to exceed two pages, indicating whether there is any need for discovery or an initial conference in this case. If there is no such need, the parties should include in their letter a proposed briefing schedule for any motions, including motions for summary judgment. If Defendants have not yet entered a notice of appearance, Plaintiff shall promptly serve a copy of this Order on Defendants and file proof of such service. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 8/5/2021) (ate) (Entered: 08/05/2021)
08/13/2021	9	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. Federal Bureau of Prisons served on 8/10/2021, answer due 8/31/2021. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/13/2021)
08/13/2021	<u>10</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED. U.S. Department of Justice served on 8/10/2021, answer due 8/31/2021. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie)

		(Entered: 08/13/2021)
08/13/2021	11	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED (FOIA CASE). Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/13/2021)
08/13/2021	<u>12</u>	SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED (FOIA CASE). Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/13/2021)
08/13/2021	<u>13</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Court's Order (8/5/2021) served on Federal Bureau of Prisons on 8/12/2021. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/13/2021)
08/13/2021	14	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Court's Order (8/5/2021) served on U.S. Department of Justice on 8/12/2021. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 08/13/2021)
08/19/2021	<u>15</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Anthony Jan–Huan Sun on behalf of Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 08/19/2021)
08/19/2021	<u>16</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from counsel for the parties dated 8/19/2021 re: any need for discovery or an initial conference in this case. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 08/19/2021)
08/19/2021	<u>17</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re: 1 Complaint, addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 8/19/2021. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 08/19/2021)
08/20/2021	<u>18</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>16</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. The parties shall submit a joint status report on September 17, 2021. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 8/19/2021) (va) Modified on 9/2/2021 (va). (Entered: 08/20/2021)
08/20/2021	19	ORDER granting 17 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer re 17 CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re: 1 Complaint, addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 8/19/2021., 1 Complaint. Application GRANTED. Defendants' deadline to respond to the Complaint is extended to September 17, 2021. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate ECF No. 17. SO ORDERED. Federal Bureau of Prisons answer due 9/17/2021; U.S. Department of Justice answer due 9/17/2021. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 8/19/2021) (ate) (Entered: 08/20/2021)
09/17/2021	<u>20</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Report</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 09/17/2021)
09/17/2021	<u>21</u>	ANSWER to 1 Complaint,. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 09/17/2021)
09/20/2021	22	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>20</u> Status Report filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. On September 24, 2021, the Parties shall submit a joint status letter updating the Court on the parties' progress. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 9/20/21) (yv) (Entered: 09/20/2021)
09/24/2021	<u>23</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from counsel for the parties dated 9/24/2021 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 09/24/2021)
09/27/2021	24	ORDER re: 23 Joint Status Letter: The Court will hold a telephone conference on September 30, 2021, at 4:00 p.m., to address how to proceed. To access the conference, counsel should call 888–363–4749 and use access code 5421540#. Members of the press and public may call the same number, but will not be permitted

		to speak during the conference. The parties are reminded to follow the procedures for teleconferences described in the Court's Individual Rules and Practices, which are available at https://nysd.uscourts.gov/hon–jesse–m–furman. Among other things, those procedures require counsel to provide advance notice of who will participate in the conference and the telephone numbers they will use to participate. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman) (Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 09/27/2021)
09/27/2021	<u>25</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 9/27/2021. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 09/27/2021)
09/29/2021	<u>26</u>	MOTION to Permit Alyssa Morones to Appear at the Upcoming Hearing on Behalf of Plaintiff . Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Abdo, Alexander) (Entered: 09/29/2021)
09/29/2021	27	ORDER granting <u>25</u> CONSENT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference and <u>26</u> MOTION to Permit Alyssa Morones to Appear at the Upcoming Hearing on Behalf of Plaintiff: The teleconference scheduled for September 30th is hereby ADJOURNED to October 1, 2021, at 3:30 p.m.; the call—in information remains the same. Plaintiff's Motion to permit Alyssa Morones to appear at the upcoming conference is hereby GRANTED; Ms. Morones may appear, with supervision. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 09/29/2021)
10/01/2021	28	ORDER: With apologies for the late notice, the time of the conference today is hereby CHANGED to 4:15 p.m. The call–in information remains the same. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman) (Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 10/01/2021)
10/01/2021		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Conference held via teleconference on 10/1/2021. Alyssa Morones and Alex Abdo present for Plaintiff. Anthony J. Sun present for Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 10/06/2021)
10/04/2021	<u>29</u>	ORDER. The Court orders as follows: The BOP shall review the responsive records that have already been identified, and shall produce all responsive, non–exempt records, other than those requiring consultation pursuant to 28 C.F.R. § 16.7, by October 29, 2021. The BOP shall produce the remainder of the responsive, non–exempt records that have already been identified i.e. those requiring consultation by November 29, 2021. Thereafter, the BOP shall produce any additional responsive, non–exempt records that are identified at a rate of 700 pages per month. Finally, by November 15, 2021, the parties shall confer and file a joint letter on the docket updating the Court regarding the number of additional responsive records that have been identified and whether the 700 pages per month processing rate warrants modification. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 10/1/21) (yv) (Entered: 10/04/2021)
11/15/2021	<u>30</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from counsel for the parties dated 11/15/2021 re: number of additional potentially responsive records and processing rate. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 11/15/2021)
11/16/2021	<u>31</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 30 Letter, filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. By December 23, 2021, the parties shall file a joint letter on the docket updating the Court. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/16/2021) (ks) (Entered: 11/16/2021)
12/23/2021	<u>32</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 12/23/2021 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 12/23/2021)
01/03/2022	<u>33</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 32 Letter filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 1/3/2022) (ks) (Entered: 01/03/2022)

01/24/2022	<u>34</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 1/24/2022 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 01/24/2022)
01/25/2022	<u>35</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>34</u> Letter status update filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 1/25/22) (yv) (Entered: 01/25/2022)
02/18/2022	<u>36</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 2/18/2022 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 02/18/2022)
02/22/2022	<u>37</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>36</u> Letter status update filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/22/22) (yv) (Entered: 02/22/2022)
03/07/2022	<u>38</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 3/7/2022 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 03/07/2022)
03/07/2022	<u>39</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>38</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/7/2022) (kv) (Entered: 03/07/2022)
03/25/2022	<u>40</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 3/25/2022 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 03/25/2022)
03/28/2022	<u>41</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>40</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/28/2022) (ks) (Entered: 03/28/2022)
04/08/2022	<u>42</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from counsel for the parties dated April 8, 2022 re: status update. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 04/08/2022)
04/08/2022	<u>43</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>42</u> Letter filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 4/8/2022) (rro) (Entered: 04/08/2022)
05/03/2022	<u>44</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from all parties dated May 3, 2022 re: status update. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Krent, Stephanie) (Entered: 05/03/2022)
05/04/2022	<u>45</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>44</u> Letter status update filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 5/3/22) (yv) (Entered: 05/04/2022)
05/19/2022	<u>46</u>	MOTION for Alyssa Sarah Morones to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC–26173042. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit Affidavit (notarized), # 2 Supplement Certificate of Good Standing, # 3 Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order).(Morones, Alyssa) (Entered: 05/19/2022)
05/20/2022		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 46 MOTION for Alyssa Sarah Morones to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-26173042. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (aea) (Entered: 05/20/2022)
05/20/2022	47	ORDER granting <u>46</u> Motion for Alyssa Sarah Morones to Appear Pro Hac Vice (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 05/20/2022)

05/20/2022	<u>48</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from all parties dated May 20, 2022 re: status update. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Morones, Alyssa) (Entered: 05/20/2022)
05/20/2022	<u>49</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 48 Letter status update filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 5/20/22) (yv) (Entered: 05/20/2022)
06/10/2022	<u>50</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 6/10/2022 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 06/10/2022)
06/13/2022	<u>51</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>50</u> Letter status update filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/13/22) (yv) (Entered: 06/13/2022)
07/08/2022	<u>52</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from counsel for the parties dated 7/8/2022 re: status update. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 07/08/2022)
07/08/2022	<u>53</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>52</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of Justice, Federal Bureau of Prisons. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 7/8/2022) (rro) (Entered: 07/08/2022)
07/22/2022	<u>54</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from all parties dated 07/22/2022 re: status update. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University(Morones, Alyssa) (Entered: 07/22/2022)
07/25/2022	<u>55</u>	ORDER OF DISMISSAL It is ORDERED that the above–entitled action be and is hereby DISMISSED and discontinued without costs, and without prejudice to the right to reopen the action within sixty days of the date of this Order if the settlement is not consummated. To be clear, any application to reopen must be filed by the aforementioned deadline; any application to reopen filed thereafter may be denied solely on that basis. Further, requests to extend the deadline to reopen are unlikely to be granted. If the parties wish for the Court to retain jurisdiction for the purposes of enforcing any settlement agreement, they must submit the settlement agreement to the Court by the deadline to reopen to be "so ordered" by the Court. Per Paragraph 4(B) of the Court's Individual Rules and Practices for Civil Cases, unless the Court orders otherwise, the Court will not retain jurisdiction to enforce a settlement agreement unless it is made part of the public record. Any pending motions are moot. All conferences are canceled. The Clerk of Court is directed to close the case. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 7/25/22) (yv) (Entered: 07/25/2022)
07/28/2022	<u>56</u>	PROPOSED STIPULATION AND ORDER. Document filed by Federal Bureau of Prisons, U.S. Department of Justice(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 07/28/2022)
07/28/2022	<u>57</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT AND DISMISSAL: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the parties, as follows: Plaintiff hereby releases and discharges BOP, DOJ, and the United States of America, including its agencies, departments, officers, employees, servants, and agents, from any and all claims and causes of action that Plaintiff asserted, or could have asserted, in this litigation arising out of the FOIA request. BOP shall pay to Plaintiff the sum of FIFTEEN THOUSAND FOUR HUNDRED TWENTY-TWO DOLLARS AND ZERO CENTS (\$15,422.00) in attorneys' fees and litigation costs, pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E), which sum Plaintiff agrees to accept as full payment of any attorneys' fees and costs Plaintiff has incurred or will incur in this action for services performed up to the date of this Stipulation and Order. This action is hereby dismissed with prejudice and without costs or fees other than as provided in paragraph 2 of this Stipulation and Order, provided that the Court shall retain jurisdiction over any issues that may arise relating to this Stipulation and Order. And as set forth herein. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 7/28/2022) (ama) (Entered: 07/28/2022)