



U.S. Department of Justice

6X1

United States Attorney
Southern District of New York

The Silvio J. Mollo Building
One Saint Andrew's Plaza
New York, New York 10007

August 19, 2022

VIA EMAIL

Christine Delince, Esq.
The Law Offices of Onaodowan & Delince, PLLC
116 West 23rd Street, 5th Floor
New York, New York 10011

Karloff Commissiong, Esq.
Adams & Commissiong LLP
65 Broadway, Suite 1603
New York, New York 10006

Re: *United States v. Arwa Muthana*, 21 Cr. 277 (PAE)

Dear Counsel:

On the understandings specified below, the Office of the United States Attorney for the Southern District of New York ("this Office") will accept a guilty plea from Arwa Muthana ("the defendant"), to Count One of the above-referenced Indictment. Count One charges the defendant with attempting to provide material support or resources to a designated foreign terrorist organization, *i.e.*, the Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham ("ISIS"), in violation of Title 18, United States Code, Sections 2339B and 2. Count One carries a maximum term of imprisonment of 20 years; a maximum term of supervised release of life; a maximum fine, pursuant to Title 18, United States Code, Section 3571 of the greatest of \$250,000, twice the gross pecuniary gain derived from the offense, or twice the gross pecuniary loss to persons other than the defendant resulting from the offense; and a \$100 mandatory special assessment.

In consideration of the defendant's plea to the above offense, the defendant will not be further prosecuted criminally by this Office (except for criminal tax violations, if any, as to which this Office cannot, and does not, make any agreement) for attempting to provide material support or resources to a designated foreign terrorist organization, *i.e.*, ISIS, from in or about May 2020, up to and including in or about March 2021, as charged in Count One of the Indictment, it being understood that this agreement does not bar the use of such conduct as a predicate act or as the basis for a sentencing enhancement in a subsequent prosecution including, but not limited to, a prosecution pursuant to 18 U.S.C. §§ 1961 *et seq.* In addition, at the time of sentencing, the Government will move to dismiss any open Count(s) against the defendant. The defendant agrees that with respect to any and all dismissed charges she is not a "prevailing party" within the meaning of the "Hyde Amendment," Section 617, P.L. 105-119 (Nov. 26, 1997), and will not file any claim under that law.

The defendant hereby admits the forfeiture allegation with respect to Count One of the Indictment and agrees to forfeit to the United States, pursuant to Title 18, United States Code, Section 981(a)(1)(G) and Title 28, United States Code, Section 2461(c), all property, foreign and domestic, derived from, involved in, or used or intended to be used to commit or facilitate the terrorism offense charged in Count One. It is further understood that any forfeiture of the defendant's assets shall not be treated as satisfaction of any fine, restitution, cost of imprisonment, or any other penalty the Court may impose upon her in addition to forfeiture.

In consideration of the foregoing and pursuant to United States Sentencing Guidelines ("U.S.S.G." or "Guidelines") Section 6B1.4, the parties hereby stipulate to the following:

A. Offense Level

1. The applicable Guidelines manual is the manual in effect as of November 1, 2021.
2. The Guideline applicable to Count One is U.S.S.G. § 2M5.3.
3. Pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 2M5.3(a), the base offense level is 26.
4. Pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 2M5.3(b)(1)(E), because the offense charged in Count One involved the provision of material support or resources with the intent, knowledge, or reason to believe that the material support or resources were to be used to commit or assist in the commission of a violent act, two levels are added.
5. Pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 3A1.4(a), because Count One is a felony that involved, or was intended to promote, a federal crime of terrorism, 12 levels are added.
6. Assuming the defendant clearly demonstrates acceptance of responsibility, to the satisfaction of the Government, through her allocution and subsequent conduct prior to the imposition of sentence, a two-level reduction will be warranted, pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 3E1.1(a). Furthermore, assuming the defendant has accepted responsibility as described in the previous sentence, the Government will move at sentencing for an additional one-level reduction, pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 3E1.1(b), because the defendant gave timely notice of her intention to enter a plea of guilty, thereby permitting the Government to avoid preparing for trial and permitting the Court to allocate its resources efficiently.

In accordance with the above, the applicable Guidelines offense level is 37.

B. Criminal History Category

Based upon the information now available to this Office (including representations by the defense), the defendant has no criminal history points. However, pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 3A1.4(b), the defendant's Criminal History Category is VI.

C. Sentencing Range

Based upon the calculations set forth above, the defendant's applicable Guidelines range is 360 months' imprisonment to life imprisonment. However, because Section 2339B(a)(1) of Title 18 of the United States Code provides for a maximum sentence on Count One of 20 years' imprisonment, pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 5G1.1(a), the defendant's stipulated Guidelines range is 240 months' imprisonment (the "Stipulated Guidelines Sentence"). In addition, after determining the defendant's ability to pay, the Court may impose a fine pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 5E1.2. At Guidelines level 37, the applicable fine range is \$40,000 to \$400,000.

The parties agree that neither a downward nor an upward departure from the Stipulated Guidelines Sentence set forth above is warranted. Accordingly, neither party will seek any departure or adjustment pursuant to the Guidelines that is not set forth herein. Nor will either party in any way suggest that the Probation Office or the Court consider such a departure or adjustment under the Guidelines.

The parties agree that either party may seek a sentence different than the Stipulated Guidelines Sentence based upon the factors to be considered in imposing a sentence pursuant to Title 18, United States Code, Section 3553(a).

Except as provided in any written Proffer Agreement(s) that may have been entered into between this Office and the defendant, nothing in this Agreement limits the right of the parties (i) to present to the Probation Office or the Court any facts relevant to sentencing; (ii) to make any arguments regarding where within the Stipulated Guidelines Sentence (or such other range as the Court may determine) the defendant should be sentenced and regarding the factors to be considered in imposing a sentence pursuant to Title 18, United States Code, Section 3553(a); (iii) to seek an appropriately adjusted Guidelines range if it is determined based upon new information that the defendant's criminal history category is different from that set forth above; and (iv) to seek an appropriately adjusted Guidelines range or mandatory minimum term of imprisonment if it is subsequently determined that the defendant qualifies as a career offender under U.S.S.G. § 4B1.1. Nothing in this Agreement limits the right of the Government to seek denial of the adjustment for acceptance of responsibility, *see* U.S.S.G. § 3E1.1, regardless of any stipulation set forth above, if the defendant fails clearly to demonstrate acceptance of responsibility, to the satisfaction of the Government, through her allocution and subsequent conduct prior to the imposition of sentence. Similarly, nothing in this Agreement limits the right of the Government to seek an enhancement for obstruction of justice, *see* U.S.S.G. § 3C1.1, regardless of any stipulation set forth above, should it be determined that the defendant has either (i) engaged in conduct, unknown to the Government at the time of the signing of this Agreement, that constitutes obstruction of justice or (ii) committed another crime after signing this Agreement.

It is understood that pursuant to U.S.S.G. § 6B1.4(d), neither the Probation Office nor the Court is bound by the above Guidelines stipulation, either as to questions of fact or as to the

determination of the proper Guidelines to apply to the facts. In the event that the Probation Office or the Court contemplates any Guidelines adjustments, departures, or calculations different from those stipulated to above, or contemplates any sentence outside of the stipulated Guidelines range, the parties reserve the right to answer any inquiries and to make all appropriate arguments concerning the same.

It is understood that the sentence to be imposed upon the defendant is determined solely by the Court. It is further understood that the Guidelines are not binding on the Court. The defendant acknowledges that her entry of a guilty plea to the charged offense authorizes the sentencing court to impose any sentence, up to and including the statutory maximum sentence. This Office cannot, and does not, make any promise or representation as to what sentence the defendant will receive. Moreover, it is understood that the defendant will have no right to withdraw her plea of guilty should the sentence imposed by the Court be outside the Guidelines range set forth above.

It is agreed (i) that the defendant will not file a direct appeal; nor bring a collateral challenge, including but not limited to an application under Title 28, United States Code, Section 2255 and/or Section 2241, of any sentence at or below the Stipulated Guidelines Sentence of 240 months' imprisonment, and (ii) that the Government will not appeal a sentence at the Stipulated Guidelines Sentence. This provision is binding on the parties even if the Court employs a Guidelines analysis different from that stipulated to herein. Furthermore, it is agreed that any appeal as to the defendant's sentence that is not foreclosed by this provision will be limited to that portion of the sentencing calculation that is inconsistent with (or not addressed by) the above stipulation. The parties agree that this waiver applies regardless of whether the term of imprisonment is imposed to run consecutively to or concurrently with the undischarged portion of any other sentence of imprisonment that has been imposed on the defendant at the time of sentencing in this case. The defendant further agrees not to appeal or bring a collateral challenge of any term of supervised release that is less than or equal to the statutory maximum. The defendant also agrees not to appeal or bring a collateral challenge of any fine that is less than or equal to \$400,000, and the Government agrees not to appeal any fine that is greater than or equal to \$40,000. The defendant also agrees not to appeal or bring a collateral challenge of any special assessment that is less than or equal to \$100. Notwithstanding the foregoing, nothing in this paragraph shall be construed to be a waiver of whatever rights the defendant may have to assert claims of ineffective assistance of counsel, whether on direct appeal, collateral review, or otherwise. Rather, it is expressly agreed that the defendant reserves those rights.

The defendant hereby acknowledges that she has accepted this Agreement and decided to plead guilty because she is in fact guilty.

By entering this plea of guilty, the defendant waives any and all right to withdraw her plea or to attack her conviction or sentence, either on direct appeal or collaterally, on the ground that the Government has failed to produce any discovery material, *Jencks* Act material, material pursuant to *Brady v. Maryland*, 373 U.S. 83 (1963), other than information establishing the factual

innocence of the defendant, or impeachment material pursuant to *Giglio v. United States*, 405 U.S. 150 (1972), that has not already been produced as of the date of the signing of this Agreement.

The defendant recognizes that, if she is not a citizen of the United States, her guilty plea and conviction make it very likely that her removal from the United States is presumptively mandatory and that, at a minimum, she is at risk of being removed or suffering other adverse immigration consequences. If the defendant is a naturalized citizen of the United States, she recognizes that pleading guilty may have consequences with respect to the defendant's immigration status. Under federal law, an individual may be subject to denaturalization and removal if her naturalization was procured by concealment of a material fact or by willful misrepresentation, or otherwise illegally procured. The defendant acknowledges that she has discussed the possible immigration consequences (including removal or denaturalization) of her guilty plea and conviction with defense counsel. The defendant affirms that she wants to plead guilty regardless of any immigration or denaturalization consequences that may result from the guilty plea and conviction, even if those consequences include denaturalization and/or removal from the United States. The defendant understands that denaturalization and other immigration consequences are typically the subject of a separate proceeding, and the defendant understands that no one, including her attorney or the District Court, can predict with certainty the effect of the defendant's conviction on the defendant's immigration or naturalization status. It is agreed that the defendant will have no right to withdraw her guilty plea based on any actual or perceived adverse immigration consequences (including removal or denaturalization) resulting from the guilty plea and conviction. It is further agreed that the defendant will not challenge her conviction or sentence on direct appeal, or through litigation under Title 28, United States Code, Section 2255 and/or Section 2241, on the basis of any actual or perceived adverse immigration consequences (including removal or denaturalization) resulting from her guilty plea and conviction.

It is further agreed that should the conviction following the defendant's plea of guilty pursuant to this Agreement be vacated for any reason, then any prosecution that is not time-barred by the applicable statute of limitations on the date of the signing of this agreement (including any counts that the Government has agreed to dismiss at sentencing pursuant to this Agreement) may be commenced or reinstated against the defendant, notwithstanding the expiration of the statute of limitations between the signing of this Agreement and the commencement or reinstatement of such prosecution. It is the intent of this Agreement to waive all defenses based on the statute of limitations with respect to any prosecution that is not time-barred on the date that this Agreement is signed.

It is further understood that this Agreement does not bind any federal, state, or local prosecuting authority other than this Office.

Apart from any written Proffer Agreement(s) that may have been entered into between this Office and defendant, this Agreement supersedes any prior understandings, promises, or conditions between this Office and the defendant. No additional understandings, promises, or

