

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:21-cv-07813-LGS**

Goodman v. Department of Homeland Security  
Assigned to: Judge Lorna G. Schofield  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 09/17/2021  
Date Terminated: 05/13/2022  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Ryan Goodman**  
*as Co-Editor-in-Chief of Just Security*

represented by **Michael Linhorst**  
352 Greene St.  
Ste Unit 3  
New Haven, CT 06511  
315-256-1602  
Email: [michaellinhorst@gmail.com](mailto:michaellinhorst@gmail.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**David A. Schulz**  
Ballard Spahr LLP (NYC)  
1675 Broadway, 19th Floor  
New York, NY 10019  
(212) 850-6103  
Fax: (212) 223-1942  
Email: [schulzd@ballardspahr.com](mailto:schulzd@ballardspahr.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**Department of Homeland Security**

represented by **Alexander James Hogan**  
United States Attorney's Office  
Southern District Of New York  
86 Chambers Street, Third Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2799  
Email: [alexander.hogan@usdoj.gov](mailto:alexander.hogan@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
09/17/2021	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Department of Homeland Security. (Filing Fee \$ 402.00, Receipt Number ANYSDC-25079651) Document filed by Ryan Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B).(Schulz, David) (Entered: 09/17/2021)
09/17/2021	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed..(Schulz, David) (Entered: 09/17/2021)
09/17/2021	<u>3</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – PDF ERROR</b> REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Ryan Goodman..(Schulz, David) Modified on 9/20/2021 (sj). (Entered: 09/17/2021)
09/20/2021		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING PARTY MODIFICATION. Notice to attorney David A. Schulz. The party information for the following party/parties has been modified: Ryan Goodman. The information for the party/parties has been modified for the following reason/reasons: party text was omitted. (sj)</b> (Entered: 09/20/2021)

09/20/2021		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Lorna G. Schofield. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="https://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/district–judges">https://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/district–judges</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="https://nysd.uscourts.gov/rules/ecf–related–instructions">https://nysd.uscourts.gov/rules/ecf–related–instructions</a> .(sj) (Entered: 09/20/2021)
09/20/2021		Magistrate Judge Stewart D. Aaron is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: <a href="https://nysd.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/2018–06/AO–3.pdf">https://nysd.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/2018–06/AO–3.pdf</a> . (sj) (Entered: 09/20/2021)
09/20/2021		Case Designated ECF. (sj) (Entered: 09/20/2021)
09/20/2021		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney David A. Schulz to RE–FILE Document No. <u>3</u> Request for Issuance of Summons. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): the PDF attached to the docket entry for the issuance of summons is not correct; Defendant as to whom the summons request is for must be listed first in the "TO" field. Re–file the document using the event type Request for Issuance of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF.</b> (sj) (Entered: 09/20/2021)
09/20/2021	<u>4</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Ryan Goodman..(Schulz, David) (Entered: 09/20/2021)
09/21/2021	<u>5</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Department of Homeland Security..(pc) (Entered: 09/21/2021)
09/29/2021	<u>6</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Michael Linhorst on behalf of Ryan Goodman..(Linhorst, Michael) (Entered: 09/29/2021)
09/29/2021	<u>7</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE (FOIA CASE) of Summons and Complaint served. Department of Homeland Security served on 9/22/2021, answer due 10/22/2021. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Ryan Goodman..(Linhorst, Michael) (Entered: 09/29/2021)
10/15/2021	<u>8</u>	ORDER: This case has been assigned to me for all purposes. It is hereby ORDERED that a telephonic conference will be held on December 2, 2021 at 10:50a.m The parties shall call 363–4749 and enter the access code 558–3333. The telephonic conference is public, and the time of the conference is approximate, but the parties shall be ready to proceed by that time. All pretrial conferences must be attended by the attorney who will serve as principal trial counsel. The parties shall ensure they are all dialed into the conference call by the appointed conference time. DATE AND TIME OF TELEPHONIC CONFERENCE: December 2, 2021 at 10:50a.m. IPTC MATERIALS DUE: November 24, 2021 at noon. (Telephone Conference set for 12/2/2021 at 10:50 AM before Judge Lorna G. Schofield. Initial Conference set for 12/2/2021 at 10:50 AM before Judge Lorna G. Schofield.) (Signed by Judge Lorna G. Schofield on 10/15/2021) (mml) (Entered: 10/15/2021)
10/19/2021	<u>9</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Order of October 15, 2021, ECF No. 8 served on Department of Homeland Security on 10/19/21. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Ryan Goodman..(Linhorst, Michael) (Entered: 10/19/2021)
10/25/2021	<u>10</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security..(Hogan, Alexander) (Entered: 10/25/2021)
11/17/2021	<u>11</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Lorna G. Schofield from Alexander J. Hogan dated November 17, 2021. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security..(Hogan, Alexander) (Entered: 11/17/2021)
11/18/2021	<u>12</u>	ORDER granting <u>11</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. Application GRANTED. The initial conference scheduled for December 2, 2021, is adjourned to January 5,

		2022, at 4:20 p.m. The parties shall file their joint letter and proposed case management plan by December 29, 2021, at noon. Initial Conference set for 1/5/2022 at 04:20 PM before Judge Lorna G. Schofield. Telephone Conference set for 1/5/2022 at 04:20 PM before Judge Lorna G. Schofield. (Signed by Judge Lorna G. Schofield on 11/18/2021) (mml) (Entered: 11/18/2021)
12/27/2021	<u>13</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Lorna G. Schofield from Michael Linhorst dated December 27, 2021. Document filed by Ryan Goodman..(Linhorst, Michael) (Entered: 12/27/2021)
12/28/2021	<u>14</u>	ORDER granting <u>13</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. Application GRANTED. The initial conference scheduled for January 5, 2022, is adjourned to January 26, 2022, at 4:20 p.m. The parties shall file their joint letter by January 19, 2022, at noon. The parties do not need to submit a proposed case management plan and instead shall propose interim and final production deadlines in the joint letter. No further extensions will be granted absent extraordinary circumstances. Initial Conference set for 1/26/2022 at 04:20 PM before Judge Lorna G. Schofield. (Signed by Judge Lorna G. Schofield on 12/28/2021) (rro) (Entered: 12/28/2021)
01/19/2022	<u>15</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Lorna G. Schofield from Michael Linhorst dated January 19, 2022 re: Initial Conference and Proposed Deadlines. Document filed by Ryan Goodman..(Linhorst, Michael) (Entered: 01/19/2022)
01/19/2022	<u>16</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>15</u> Letter filed by Ryan Goodman. ENDORSEMENT: The Initial Pretrial Conference scheduled for January 26, 2022, at 4:20 P.M. is canceled because there are no issues to discuss. Defendant shall communicate its decision as to producing the withheld material to Plaintiff by February 23, 2022. By March 1, 2022, Defendant shall file a pre-motion letter with respect to its anticipated summary judgment motion, if any, or file a joint letter providing an update on the status of this case. (Signed by Judge Lorna G. Schofield on 1/19/2022) (mml) (Entered: 01/19/2022)
03/01/2022	<u>17</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Lorna G. Schofield from Alexander J. Hogan dated March 1, 2022 re: status update. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security..(Hogan, Alexander) (Entered: 03/01/2022)
03/02/2022	<u>18</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>17</u> Letter filed by Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: Defendant shall provide the draft declaration to Plaintiff by March 9, 2022. The parties shall file a status letter by March 18, 2022, including any proposed date by which they will file summary judgment pre-motion letters, if any. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Lorna G. Schofield on 3/2/2022) (mml) (Entered: 03/02/2022)
03/18/2022	<u>19</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Lorna G. Schofield from Alexander J. Hogan dated March 18, 2022 re: status update. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security..(Hogan, Alexander) (Entered: 03/18/2022)
03/21/2022	<u>20</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>19</u> Letter filed by Department of Homeland Security. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. Plaintiff shall file a motion for attorney's fees, if any, by May 20, 2022. ( Motions due by 5/20/2022.) (Signed by Judge Lorna G. Schofield on 3/21/2022) (vfr) (Entered: 03/21/2022)
05/13/2022	<u>21</u>	PROPOSED STIPULATION AND ORDER. Document filed by Department of Homeland Security..(Hogan, Alexander) (Entered: 05/13/2022)
05/13/2022	<u>22</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT AND DISMISSAL: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the parties, as follows: This action is hereby dismissed with prejudice, and without costs or fees other than as provided in Paragraph 2 of this Stipulation and Order, provided that the Court shall retain jurisdiction for the purpose of enforcing this Stipulation and Order. After the Court has approved and docketed this Stipulation and Order, within a reasonable period of time, Defendant shall pay to Plaintiff the sum of \$5,300 (FIVE THOUSAND THREE HUNDRED DOLLARS) in attorneys' fees and litigation costs, pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E), which sum Plaintiff agrees to accept as full payment of any attorneys' fees and costs Plaintiff has incurred or will incur in this action. Counsel for Plaintiff will provide the necessary information to Defendant to effectuate payment. And as set forth herein. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Lorna G. Schofield on

5/13/2022) (ama) (Entered: 05/13/2022)