

Subject: RE: Public Records Request (AZ-SEN-21-1010)
Date: Wednesday, August 11, 2021 at 3:58:33 PM Eastern Daylight Time
From: Chris Klemminich
To: AO Records
Attachments: Combined Files - American Oversight 7.23.21 PRR.pdf

EXTERNAL SENDER

To Whom It May Concern:

After a careful and thorough search of records, attached are all responsive documents for the July 23, 2021 request for records from Senator David Livingston and Senator Wendy Rogers, totaling five pages.

Thank you,

Chris Klemminich

Arizona State Senate | Rules Attorney
602-926-5721 | cklemminich@azleg.gov

From: AO Records <records@americanoversight.org>
Sent: Friday, July 23, 2021 8:52 AM
To: Chris Klemminich <CKlemminich@azleg.gov>
Subject: Public Records Request (AZ-SEN-21-1010)

Dear Public Records Officer:

Please find attached a request for records under Arizona's Public Records Law.

Sincerely,

--

Sarah Wishingrad
Pronouns: she/her
Paralegal
American Oversight
records@americanoversight.org
www.americanoversight.org | @weareoversight

PRR: AZ-SEN-21-1010

From: [David Livingston](#)
To: [WILLIAM BUCKINGHAM](#)
Cc: [David Livingston](#); [Barbara Phillips](#)
Subject: RE: Biden WON. Let's have Mr. Livingston show some class and acknowledge and Investigation Request
Date: Thursday, December 17, 2020 11:09:18 AM

Bill,

I was able to pull up your email using your email address. The following is the information recently sent to constituents.

Press Release

Arizona State Legislature
Senate President Karen Fann (R-1)
House Speaker Russell Bowers (R-25)
1700 West Washington Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2844

Friday, December 4, 2020
FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE

Legislative Leaders call for audit of Maricopa County election software and equipment

(Phoenix, State Capitol) --- Senate President Karen Fann and Speaker of the House Rusty Bowers today called for an independent audit of the Dominion software and equipment used by Maricopa County in the 2020 General Election. The two leaders, along with incoming Senate Government Chair Michelle Ugenti-Rita and House Majority Leader Warren Petersen, had numerous phone calls with members of the Maricopa County Board of Supervisors.

"As a longtime advocate for improving and modernizing our election system, I am pleased to learn that the Maricopa County Board of Supervisors is supportive of conducting an independent audit of their voting software and equipment," said Sen. Ugenti-Rita. "It is important we maintain all of the voting public's confidence in our elections and this is a positive first step in the right direction."

"A significant number of voters believe that fraud occurred and with the number of irregularities it is easy to understand why," said House Majority Leader Petersen. "Especially concerning are the allegations made surrounding the vendor Dominion. It is imperative that the County immediately do a forensic audit on the Dominion software and equipment to make sure the results were accurate."

Legislators also emphasized to the supervisors how important it is to move expeditiously on this matter.

###

Best wishes,
Barb

Barbara Phillips
Administrative Assistant to:
Senator David Livingston, LD22
602-926-4178
bphillips@azleg.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: WILLIAM BUCKINGHAM <[REDACTED]>

Sent: Thursday, December 10, 2020 4:12 PM

To: David Livingston <d Livingston@azleg.gov>

Subject: Fwd: Biden WON. Let's have Mr. Livingston show some class and acknowledge and Investigation Request

Sent from my iPhone

>

>

> On the federal level were some 10 congressional investigations on Benghazi where 4 Americans died. Today 3100 Americans died with over Americans dead, and over 15,000,000 Americans sickened of Covid. We have 4% of the world's population, and 23% of the Covid cases. Why?. In Trump's interviews with Bob Woodward, on tape it was clear he knew of the severity of Covid in January, and early February, before there was even one fatality, yet to the public Trump totally minimized the severity. Trump was also a reverse role model with disparaging mask wearing and social distancing, as frankly you have been.

>>

>> Even the last couple of weeks in October Trump minimized the danger of Covid saying that it would disappear after Nov. 3 Election Day. Each day since Election Day, there have been over 200,000 Covid diagnosis's.

>>

>> President Trump mismanagement of Covid has negatively impacted us in Arizona. There were investigations following Pearl Harbor, where less than 3000 died JFK's assassination, and 9-11. I recommend Senator Livingston introduce a bill to investigate what went wrong with the Trump administration Covid response.

>

> Please advise by January 8.

>>

>> Bill Buckingham

>> [REDACTED]

> Surprise, AZ. [REDACTED]

>> [REDACTED]

>>

>>

From: [David Livingston](#)
To: [saguarosunrise](#) [REDACTED]
Subject: Re: LD 22 NEEDS TO KNOW YOU ARE IN THE FIGHT
Date: Friday, December 4, 2020 11:17:44 AM

The house would need 9 Democrats and the Senate would need 4 Democrats and 100% of the Republicans. So now you understand our problem.

David

Sent from my Verizon, Samsung Galaxy smartphone
Get [Outlook for Android](#)

From: saguarosunrise [REDACTED] <saguarosunrise [REDACTED]>
Sent: Friday, December 4, 2020 11:15:22 AM
To: David Livingston <dlivingston@azleg.gov>
Subject: Re: LD 22 NEEDS TO KNOW YOU ARE IN THE FIGHT

Representative Livingston,
Thank you for your response.
I endorse every effort you can make to audit the machines
Can you tell me how many Legislators are needed to convene a “Special Committee” to do a forensic audit and how quickly that can happen?
Regards,
David L. Maurer

Sent from my iPhone

> On Dec 4, 2020, at 9:59 AM, David Livingston <dlivingston@azleg.gov> wrote:
>
>
> Thank you for contacting my office regarding the election outcome and the integrity of the voting process. We have received many inquiries and will endeavor to make every effort to ensure that the election results were properly and legally conducted. To address the requests made for legislative action I hope the following information is helpful. Please forgive this mass reply but I'd like to respond as quickly as possible to all of you.
>
> First and foremost, please understand that all states have different election laws and procedures so what may work in Pennsylvania may not be legally allowed in Arizona or other states.
>
> For those of you asking to not allow the certification to happen on Monday, November 30th, please be aware that President Trump's legal team cannot file their lawsuit until the election HAS BEEN Certified. Pennsylvania has already certified their election. Once the lawsuits have been filed, the Az House and Senate members can then see what issues are being cited which will give us a path to move forward.
>
> -Presidential Electors: the eleven electors were selected by a vote of you, the people, on November 3, 2020 as part of the vote for President of the United States. The Legislature cannot retroactively modify the current statutes on the selection of presidential electors. Additionally, the Legislature does not have the authority to prevent the Arizona Secretary of State from certifying the canvass. Please see below the legal explanation provided by Legislative Council.

>

> -For those of you asking us to convene a Special Session: there are only two ways a special session can be convened. One is the Governor calls us in for a special session for a specific issue. The second way is the legislators can call ourselves in with a 2/3 vote of all members with no specific agenda. Since we only have 31 R's and 29 D's in the House; 17 R's and 13 D's in the Senate, we would need the Democrats to vote to convene to receive the required 40 and 20 votes. We do not have the votes to call a special session and we do not have the votes to pass the election changes some are asking for.

>

> -Audit of vendor: the Legislature can convene a "special committee" that utilizes its investigatory powers to do a forensic audit by an independent expert to address issues related to the accuracy of the voting machines. We are investigating this option in coordination with the information we are being provided by the voters and the lawsuits being filed.

>

> In addition, moving forward, a comprehensive overview of our elections proceedings is crucial to make any necessary reforms in the hopes of restoring public confidence in the elections system. We have created Senate and House Government (and elections) Committee that will be introducing legislation to ensure the credibility of future elections. We sincerely understand the concerns raised and share in your frustration. The election results in Arizona and other battleground states have created a collective pursuit and call to action to ensure that all votes are legally counted. The results of court proceedings and other administrative remedies will most certainly impact the overall outcome of the presidential election.

>

> Again, thank you for reaching out and voicing your concerns. They are indeed heard. As the actions outlined above play out we will have a better understanding on the best course of action for Arizona and the integrity of the elections process.

>

> David

>

> Senator DAVID LIVINGSTON, LD22

> 602-926-4178

> Chairman – Transportation & Public Safety Committee

> Vice-Chairman – Finance Committee

> Member – Appropriations Committee

> Member – Commerce Committee

> Arizona State Senate

> -----Original Message-----

> From: saguarosunrise [REDACTED] <saguarosunrise [REDACTED]>

> Sent: Wednesday, December 2, 2020 12:52 PM

> To: Ben Toma <btoma@azleg.gov>; Frank Carroll <FCarroll@azleg.gov>

> Cc: David Livingston <dlivingston@azleg.gov>

> Subject: LD 22 NEEDS TO KNOW YOU ARE IN THE FIGHT

>

> Representatives,

>

> Did you see the hearings on election irregularities here in Arizona?

> In case you missed it, Real Americans came forth risking their livelihoods and reputations to testify to deeply concerning irregularities in the election in Arizona and beyond.

> In a reasonable world, their testimony should constitute more than sufficient probable cause to rescind the certification of this election.

> Walt Blackman and some of your other colleagues agree.

> Will you join them in forming a coalition of 16 or more legislators to call the Legislature back in session to address what may be the most important issue you will ever have to confront as a

representative of the people?

> Hopefully your commitment is, in fact, to We The People and not to some unspoken agenda that would put every Freedom Loving American at a disadvantage.

> Everyone I've spoken with here in LD 22 is counting on you and, trust me, they have long memories.

>

> Please do the right thing.

>

> Respectfully

>

> David L. Maurer

> LD 22

>

> Sent from my iPhone