

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-02527-APM**

BESSON v. UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF
COMMERCE
Assigned to: Judge Amit P. Mehta
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 10/22/2018
Date Terminated: 05/03/2021
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

DAVID H. BESSON

represented by **DAVID H. BESSON**
3701 Overland Avenue
Apartment 246
Los Angeles, CA 90034
(703) 203-0444
Email: dhbesson@gmail.com
PRO SE

V.

Defendant

**UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF
COMMERCE**

represented by **Marsha Wellknown Yee**
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE FOR THE
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
555 Fourth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 252-2539
Fax: (202) 252-2599
Email: marsha.yee@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Matthew Evan Kahn
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
Fraud Section
1400 New York Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 305-1648
Email: Matthew.Kahn2@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 09/27/2019

V.

Intervenor Defendant

LIGADO NETWORKS, LLC

represented by **Thomas R. Brugato**
COVINGTON & BURLING LLP
850 Tenth Street, NW
One City Center
Washington, DC 20001
(202) 662-5515
Email: tbrugato@cov.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
------------	---	-------------

10/22/2018	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Filing fee \$ 400, receipt number 4616095260) filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(jf) (Entered: 11/05/2018)
10/22/2018		SUMMONS Not Issued as to UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (jf) (Entered: 11/05/2018)
10/22/2018	<u>2</u>	MOTION to Compel by DAVID H. BESSON (jf) (Entered: 11/05/2018)
10/22/2018	<u>3</u>	MOTION for CM/ECF Password by DAVID H. BESSON (jf) (Entered: 11/05/2018)
11/05/2018		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>3</u> Motion for CM/ECF User Name and Password. Pro se Plaintiff may obtain a CM/ECF user name and password from the Clerk. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 11/05/2018. (lcapm1) (Entered: 11/05/2018)
11/05/2018		MINUTE ORDER denying <u>2</u> Plaintiff's Motion to Compel Preparation of a Vaughn Index as premature. Plaintiff may renew the Motion, if appropriate, at a later time. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 11/05/2018. (lcapm1) (Entered: 11/05/2018)
11/08/2018	<u>4</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 26OCT18 DOC letter denying FOIA appeal)(BESSION, DAVID) (Entered: 11/08/2018)
11/09/2018		SUMMONS (3) Issued as to UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (zmd) (Entered: 11/09/2018)
11/27/2018	<u>5</u>	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed on United States Attorney General. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney General 11/23/2018. (BESSION, DAVID) (Entered: 11/27/2018)
11/30/2018	<u>6</u>	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed as to the United States Attorney. Date of Service Upon United States Attorney on 11/23/2018. Answer due for ALL FEDERAL DEFENDANTS by 12/23/2018. (BESSION, DAVID) (Entered: 11/30/2018)
11/30/2018	<u>7</u>	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of Summons and Complaint Executed. UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE served on 11/23/2018 (BESSION, DAVID) (Entered: 11/30/2018)
12/21/2018	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Matthew Evan Kahn on behalf of UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/21/2018	<u>9</u>	ANSWER to <u>4</u> Amended Complaint by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE.(Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/21/2018	<u>10</u>	ORDER. Both a Complaint and an Answer are now before the court in this FOIA case. It is hereby ordered that the parties shall meet and confer and file a Joint Status Report on or before January 4, 2019. The Joint Status Report shall include (1) the status of Plaintiffs FOIA request; (2) the anticipated number of documents responsive to Plaintiffs FOIA request; (3) the anticipated date(s) for release of the documents requested by Plaintiff; (4) whether a motion for stay is likely under Open America v. Watergate Special Prosecution Force, 547 F.2d 605 (D.C. Cir. 1976); and (5) whether the parties anticipate summary judgment briefing and, if so, a proposed briefing schedule. Please see the attached Order for details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 12/21/2018. (lcapm2) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/21/2018		Set/Reset Deadlines: Joint Status Report due by 1/4/2019. (zjd) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
01/02/2019	<u>11</u>	Consent MOTION to Stay by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Kahn, Matthew). Added MOTION for Extension of Time on 1/4/2019 (znmw). (Entered: 01/02/2019)
01/03/2019	<u>12</u>	Second MOTION for Vaughn Index by DAVID H. BESSON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit NASCTN GPS Project Final Briefing, # <u>2</u> Exhibit June 2017 Briefing to PNT Advisory Board, # <u>3</u> Exhibit NASCTN Report 1 Impact of LTE on GPS (Introduction and Parts 1-2), # <u>4</u> Exhibit Measurement Data Request Form, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Revised Test Plan, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Draft Test Plan, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Adjudicated Comments)(BESSION, DAVID) (Entered: 01/03/2019)

01/07/2019		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>11</u> Defendant's Consent Motion for a Stay of Proceedings. This matter is hereby stayed. Within three business days of Department of Justice operations resuming, Defendant shall notify the court by when the parties will file their Joint Status Report. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 01/07/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 01/07/2019)
01/30/2019	<u>13</u>	Joint STATUS REPORT <i>and Proposed Briefing Schedule</i> by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 01/30/2019)
01/30/2019		MINUTE ORDER setting the following schedule for further proceedings in this matter: Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment shall be due by February 8, 2019; Defendant's Opposition and Cross Motion for Summary Judgment shall be due by March 1, 2019; Plaintiff's Reply and Opposition shall be due by March 15, 2019; and Defendant's Reply shall be due March 29, 2019. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 01/30/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 01/30/2019)
01/30/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment due by 2/8/2019. Defendant's Opposition and Cross Motion due by 3/1/2019. Plaintiff's Reply and Opposition due by 3/15/2019. Defendant's Reply due by 3/29/2019. (zjd) (Entered: 02/05/2019)
02/07/2019	<u>14</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by DAVID H. BESSON (BESSON, DAVID) (Entered: 02/07/2019)
02/08/2019	<u>15</u>	STRICKEN PURSUANT TO MINUTE ORDER FILED 2/12/2019.....ORDER advising Plaintiff to respond by March 1, 2019, to Defendant United States Department of Commerce's <u>14</u> Motion for Summary Judgment or risk summary judgment in Defendant's favor. See the attached Order for additional details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 02/08/2019. (lcapm1) Modified on 2/12/2019 (zjd). (Entered: 02/08/2019)
02/12/2019		MINUTE ORDER directing the clerk to strike and the parties to disregard the February 8, 2019 Order, ECF No. 15, as entered in error. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 02/12/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 02/12/2019)
03/01/2019	<u>16</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>14</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Table of Contents, # <u>2</u> Table of Authorities, # <u>3</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>4</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>5</u> Declaration, # <u>6</u> Exhibit A1, # <u>7</u> Exhibit A2, # <u>8</u> Exhibit A3, # <u>9</u> Exhibit A4, # <u>10</u> Exhibit A5, # <u>11</u> Exhibit A6, # <u>12</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>13</u> Certificate of Service)(Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 03/01/2019)
03/01/2019	17	Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (See Docket Entry <u>16</u> to view document) (jf) (Entered: 03/04/2019)
03/04/2019		NOTICE OF ERROR re <u>16</u> Memorandum in Opposition; emailed to matthew.kahn@usdoj.gov, cc'd 1 associated attorneys -- The PDF file you docketed contained errors: 1. Two-part docket entry, 2. DO NOT REFILE - Counsel is reminded to docket all parts of their pleading(s) (zjf,) (Entered: 03/04/2019)
03/04/2019	<u>18</u>	NOTICE of Pending Supreme Court Case by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE re 17 MOTION for Summary Judgment, <u>16</u> Memorandum in Opposition, (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 03/04/2019)
03/05/2019	<u>19</u>	ERRATA by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE <u>18</u> Notice (Other) filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Brief, # <u>2</u> Certificate of Service)(Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 03/05/2019)
03/06/2019	<u>20</u>	ORDER advising Plaintiff to respond by March 15, 2019, to Defendant United States Department of Commerce's 17 Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment or risk summary judgment in Defendant's favor. See the attached Order for additional details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 03/06/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 03/06/2019)
03/06/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Plaintiff's Response due by 3/15/2019. (zjd) (Entered: 03/10/2019)

03/15/2019	<u>21</u>	RESPONSE re 17 Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by DAVID H. BESSON (BESSON, DAVID) Modified event title and link on 3/18/2019 (znmw). (Entered: 03/15/2019)
03/15/2019	22	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>14</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (See Docket Entry <u>21</u> to view document). (znmw) (Entered: 03/18/2019)
03/29/2019	<u>23</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Reply</i> by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 03/29/2019)
04/01/2019		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>23</u> Defendant's Consent Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant shall file a Reply in Support of Defendant's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment on or before April 3, 2019. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 04/01/2019. (lcapm1) Modified on 4/1/2019 (lcapm1,). (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/01/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Reply to Cross Motion due by 4/3/2019. (kh) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/03/2019	<u>24</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>21</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Statement of Facts)(Kahn, Matthew) (Entered: 04/03/2019)
09/27/2019	<u>25</u>	NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Marsha Wellknown Yee on behalf of UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE Substituting for attorney Matthew Evan Kahn (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 09/27/2019)
10/09/2019	<u>26</u>	ORDER denying parties' cross-motions for summary judgment, ECF Nos. 14, 17. See attached order for additional details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 10/09/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 10/09/2019)
10/09/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Renewed Summary Judgment Motion due by 11/8/2019. (nbn) (Entered: 10/10/2019)
11/06/2019	<u>27</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Defendant's Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Certificate of Service)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 11/06/2019)
11/07/2019		MINUTE ORDER granting Defendant's <u>27</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant's Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment shall now be due by November 20, 2019. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 11/07/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 11/07/2019)
11/13/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendant's Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment due by 11/20/2019. (zjd) (Entered: 11/13/2019)
11/20/2019	<u>28</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>2</u> Fletcher Declaration and Exhibits, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 11/20/2019)
11/21/2019	<u>29</u>	ORDER advising Plaintiff to respond by December 20, 2019, to Defendant United States Department of Commerce's <u>28</u> Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment or risk summary judgment in Defendant's favor. Plaintiff shall also file any cross-motion for summary judgment by December 20, 2019. See the attached Order for additional details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 11/21/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 11/21/2019)
11/21/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Plaintiff's Response and Cross-Motion due by 12/20/2019. (zjd) (Entered: 11/22/2019)
12/19/2019	<u>30</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Defendant's Combined Reply and Opposition to Any Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 12/19/2019)

12/19/2019		MINUTE ORDER granting Defendant's <u>30</u> Consent Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant shall file its combined reply in further support of its renewed motion for summary judgment and opposition to any cross-motion for summary judgment by January 15, 2020. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 12/19/2019. (lcapm1) (Entered: 12/19/2019)
12/19/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendant's Reply and Opposition due by 1/15/2020. (zjd) (Entered: 12/20/2019)
12/20/2019	<u>31</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit FCC Ex Parte)(BESSON, DAVID) (Entered: 12/20/2019)
12/20/2019	<u>32</u>	Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by DAVID H. BESSON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit FCC Ex Parte)(BESSON, DAVID) (Entered: 12/20/2019)
01/15/2020	<u>33</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>32</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Defendant's Response to Plaintiff's Statement of Material Facts, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 01/15/2020)
01/15/2020	<u>34</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Defendant's Response to Plaintiff's Statement of Material Facts, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 01/15/2020)
05/01/2020	<u>35</u>	ENTERED IN ERROR.....RESPONSE re <u>34</u> Reply to opposition to Motion, filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit FCC Authorization 20-48, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Boston Globe Article)(BESSON, DAVID) Modified on 5/5/2020 (eg). (Entered: 05/01/2020)
05/05/2020		NOTICE OF CORRECTED DOCKET ENTRY: re <u>35</u> Response to Document was entered in error and will not be refiled. Leave of court must be granted to file a surreply. (eg) (Entered: 05/05/2020)
05/07/2020	<u>36</u>	MOTION for Leave to File <i>Surreply to Defendant's Response</i> by DAVID H. BESSON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit FCC Authorization, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Boston Globe Article)(BESSON, DAVID) (Entered: 05/07/2020)
05/26/2020		MINUTE ORDER granting as unopposed Plaintiff's <u>36</u> Motion for Leave to File Surreply. The clerk of court shall accept Plaintiff's Surreply for filing. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 5/26/2020. (lcapm1) (Entered: 05/26/2020)
05/26/2020	<u>37</u>	SURREPLY to re <u>28</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (Attachment: # <u>1</u> Exhibits)(eg) (Main Document 37 replaced on 5/29/2020) (zeg). (Entered: 05/29/2020)
08/05/2020	<u>38</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER granting in part and denying in part Defendant's <u>28</u> Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment, and granting in part and denying in part Plaintiff's <u>32</u> Renewed Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment. See the attached Memorandum Opinion and Order for additional details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 8/5/2020. (lcapm1) (Entered: 08/05/2020)
08/05/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment due by 9/4/2020. (zjd) (Entered: 08/06/2020)
09/04/2020	<u>39</u>	MOTION for Order <i>In Camera Review</i> by DAVID H. BESSON (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Updated CRADA, # <u>2</u> Exhibit DoC First Email Exchange, # <u>3</u> Exhibit DoC Second Email Exchange)(BESSON, DAVID) (Entered: 09/04/2020)
09/08/2020		MINUTE ORDER. In its Memorandum Opinion and Order dated August 5, 2020, ECF No. <u>38</u> , the court afforded Defendant the opportunity to renew its motion for summary judgment with respect to certain information contained in the Statement of Work that might be in the public domain by September 4, 2020, or to disclose that information, see id. at 10, 16. Defendant did not file a renewed motion by September 4, 2020, but on that date Plaintiff filed a Motion for In Camera Review, ECF No. <u>39</u> . To assist the court in understanding the present posture of the case, Defendant shall file a Status Report by September 15, 2020, setting forth (1) what actions it took following the court's summary judgment ruling, (2) whether it intends to move for summary

		judgment as to any remaining withholdings, and (3) by what date it intends to respond to Plaintiff's motion. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 9/8/2020. (lcapm1) (Entered: 09/08/2020)
09/08/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendant's Status Report due by 9/15/2020. (zjd) (Entered: 09/09/2020)
09/15/2020	<u>40</u>	STATUS REPORT by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 09/15/2020)
09/16/2020		MINUTE ORDER. Defendant shall file its renewed motion for summary judgment and its opposition to Plaintiff's motion for in camera review by October 6, 2020. Plaintiff shall file his combined opposition to Defendant's renewed motion and reply in support of his motion by October 27, 2020. Defendant shall file its reply in support of its renewed motion by November 17, 2020. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 9/16/2020. (lcapm1) (Entered: 09/16/2020)
09/16/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Renewed Motion for Summary Judgment Motion and Opposition due by 10/6/2020. Opposition and Reply due by 10/27/2020. Reply due by 11/17/2020. (zjd) (Entered: 09/17/2020)
10/06/2020	<u>41</u>	Third MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>2</u> Fletcher Decl. dated Oct. 6, 2020, # <u>3</u> Ligado Decl. dated Oct. 6, 2020, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 10/06/2020)
10/23/2020	<u>42</u>	MOTION to Intervene by Ligado Networks, LLC (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>2</u> Declaration, # <u>3</u> Rule 26.1 Statement, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>5</u> Proposed Answer)(Brugato, Thomas) (Entered: 10/23/2020)
10/26/2020		MINUTE ORDER. Plaintiff shall file any opposition to the Motion to Intervene by Ligado Networks, LLC, by October 30, 2020. Any reply shall be filed by November 5, 2020. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 10/26/2020. (lcapm1) (Entered: 10/26/2020)
10/26/2020		Set/Reset Deadlines: Opposition due by 10/30/2020. Reply due by 11/5/2020. (zjd) (Entered: 10/27/2020)
10/28/2020	<u>43</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>41</u> Third MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (BESSION, DAVID) Modified docket event/text on 10/30/2020 (eg). (Entered: 10/28/2020)
10/28/2020	44	Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by DAVID H. BESSON (View Docket Entry <u>43</u> to view Document). (eg) (Entered: 10/30/2020)
10/30/2020	<u>45</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>42</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by DAVID H. BESSON. (BESSION, DAVID) Modified docket event/text on 11/2/2020 (eg). (Entered: 10/30/2020)
11/02/2020		MINUTE ORDER granting Motion for Leave to Intervene by Ligado Networks, LLC, ECF No. <u>42</u> . A third party's "interest in 'preventing the disclosure of... confidential information is a well-established interest sufficient to justify intervention under Rule 24(a).'" Gov't Accountability Project v. FDA, 181 F. Supp. 3d 94, 96 (D.D.C. 2015) (quoting 100Reporters LLC v. Dep't of Justice, 307 F.R.D. 269, 275 (D.D.C. 2014)). Ligado therefore has the right to intervene to protect claimed confidential information. Plaintiff's assertion that the information at issue is no longer confidential is a merits issue and does not negate or undermine Ligado's right to intervene. Furthermore, Plaintiff will not be prejudiced by Ligado's entry as an intervenor. Ligado seeks only to file a reply brief on the same schedule presently entered, and Ligado has promised not to raise any new claims or challenge any prior rulings. To the extent Ligado raises any new or novel issues in its reply, the court will consider allowing Plaintiff to file a surreply. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 11/2/2020. (lcapm1) (Entered: 11/02/2020)
11/02/2020	<u>46</u>	ANSWER to <u>4</u> Amended Complaint by LIGADO NETWORKS, LLC.(eg) (Entered: 11/04/2020)
11/12/2020	<u>47</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>41</u> Third MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Fletcher

		Nov. 5, 2020, Decl., # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 11/12/2020)
11/12/2020	<u>48</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re 44 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Fletcher Nov. 5, 2020, Decl., # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Yee, Marsha) (Entered: 11/12/2020)
11/17/2020	<u>49</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>41</u> Third MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by LIGADO NETWORKS, LLC. (Brugato, Thomas) (Entered: 11/17/2020)
05/03/2021	<u>50</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION re: <u>39</u> Plaintiff's Motion for In Camera Review, <u>41</u> Defendant's Third Motion for Summary Judgment, 44 Plaintiff's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment. See the attached Memorandum Opinion for additional details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 5/3/2021. (lcapm1) (Entered: 05/03/2021)
05/03/2021	<u>51</u>	ORDER. For the reasons stated in the <u>38</u> Memorandum Opinion and Order and <u>50</u> Memorandum Opinion, the court enters judgment in favor of Defendant as to its Exemption 4 withholdings, except as to those portions of the CRADA already disclosed to Plaintiff, whether by court order or otherwise. Plaintiff's <u>39</u> Motion for In Camera Review and 44 Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment are denied. See the attached Order for additional details. Signed by Judge Amit P. Mehta on 5/3/2021. (lcapm1) (Entered: 05/03/2021)