Resolution

Distribution

Stark County Commissioners

Journal
File
Board of Elections

Adouted

March 10, 2021

Subject

A Resolution Regarding the Recommendation of the Stark County Board of Elections to Purchase a New Voting System for Stark County from Dominion Voting Systems.

Commissioner Creighton moved for the adoption of the following Resolution which was seconded by Commissioner Regula:

Whereas, in 2018, the 132nd Ohio General Assembly passed Amended Substitute Senate Bill 135 making available to all 88 Ohio counties certain funds to subsidize the purchase of new electronic voting systems throughout Ohio; and

Whereas, under the announced funding formula, the State of Ohio will provide to Stark County up to \$3,268,344.74 for the purchase of one of the new electronic voting systems certified by the State of Ohio (see, https://www.ohiosos.gov/globalassets/elections/bvme/systems.pdf), with any balance of the purchase price to be funded by Stark County taxpayers; and

Whereas, over the last several years, the Board of Commissioners has planned for this large expected purchase to replace the County's aging Diebold TSX voting system, and has reserved the funds necessary for the purchase of a new voting system for the County; and

Whereas, as part of implementing the General Assembly's action, the Ohio Secretary of State issued Advisory 2018-04 to Ohio's 88 county boards of election, stating, in part that, "A county board of elections is encouraged to work with its board of county commissioners in selecting the county's voting system."; and

Whereas, in September 2018, as part of the vetting process for vendors of Ohiocertified electronic voting systems, the Stark County Board of Elections (hereinafter BOE) invited the Board of County Commissioners (hereinafter Board) to attend demonstrations of various voting systems to be considered for purchase for use by Stark County voters; and

Whereas, on September 12th and September 24th of 2018, the Board attended demonstrations by two different voting system vendors--Dominion Voting Systems (hereinafter Dominion), and Elections Systems and Software (hereinafter ES&S)--held at the BOE's offices; and

Whereas, following the vendor demonstrations in September of 2018, apart from the BOE's annual placeholder budget requests of \$7,600,000 indicating a future need for an electronic voting system, and a brief discussion during the BOE's February 11, 2019 Capital Budget Hearing, no further communication was received from the BOE regarding the selection process; and

Whereas, the next formal communication to the Board regarding what had started out to be a joint process of review and selection for new electronic voting equipment occurred on December 9, 2020, more than 2 years later; and

Whereas, on December 9, 2020, both Commissioner Creighton and the County Administrator received a telephone call from the Director of the BOE, informing each of them that the BOE would be voting later that afternoon to recommend that the Board of Commissioners purchase a new voting system for the citizens of Stark County, and that the recommended vendor would be Dominion Voting Systems, Inc.

Whereas, during the same phone call, it was indicated that the Board would need to act quickly on the recommendation and make the purchase by January 15, 2021 for deployment in the May 2021 Primary election; and

Whereas, in contravention of Ohio Secretary of State Advisory 2018-04 which encouraged the Board of Elections to "...work with its board of county commissioners in selecting the county's voting system", and without any further communication to, or collaboration with, the Board, the BOE did vote to recommend the purchase from Dominion, on December 9th (as reported by the Canton Repository on December 10th); and

Whereas, the BOE did not send its official recommendation to the Board until January 13, 2021; and

Whereas, in order to seek full information concerning the recommended multimillion-dollar purchase, the Board scheduled and held a public work session on February 2, 2021 and requested the attendance by the BOE and a presentation of its selection process and its reasoning leading to its recommendation of Dominion, as the preferred vendor for a new voting system for Stark County; and

Whereas, at the February 2, 2021 work session (with only two of the four BOE members present), the Board heard from the BOE Director, who represented to the Board via PowerPoint slide that, as between the two competing vendors the BOE considered, Stark County would have to pay \$2,019,932.90 more (out of pocket) if Dominion was not selected (BOE PowerPoint slide attached hereto as Exhibit A); and

Whereas, at the February 2, 2021 hearing, in response to a question regarding the trade-in credit amount offered by Dominion, the BOE Director replied to the

Board that "I was disappointed that the other vendors would not budge...they just would not budge"; and

Whereas, later during the same work session, Commissioner Regula asked the Director, "the trade-in value...do you negotiate that back and forth?" And Director Matthews replied, "I wouldn't call it a negotiation. We gave them parameters of equipment and we asked them to take the prices from their quotes to DAS and apply them to what we are looking at and requesting."; and

Whereas, in response to a question during the work session from Commissioner Smith to Dominion Regional Sales Manager, Mark Beckstrand, Mr. Beckstrand answered that he could provide a source list of Dominion Voting System parts and components. Commissioner Smith responded by stating that he wanted to see that list. To date, the list has not been provided to Commissioner Smith or to the Commissioners' office; and

Whereas, subsequent to the February 2, 2021 work session, Commissioner Regula requested, and received from the BOE both the April 2019 price quote solicited by the BOE from elections systems vendor ES&S as well as the November 2020 refreshed quote solicited by BOE from ES&S; and

Whereas, subsequent to the February 2, 2021 work session, during an in-depth financial analysis and comparison of the Dominion and ES&S pricing quotes, by the County's Director of Management and Budget, questions arose concerning what calculations were being used by the BOE when it represented to the Board and the public that the ES&S System was \$2,019,932.90 higher in price than the Dominion System, and

Whereas, when the Director of Management and Budget posed the question about the discrepancy to BOE staff, BOE staff replied that certain things had been included that shouldn't have been, and revised the cost difference separating Dominion and ES&S downward by more than \$440,000.00, from \$2,019,932.90 to \$1,579,067.80; (Revised BOE PowerPoint slide attached hereto as Exhibit B); and

Whereas, upon further review of the quotes of the two vendors, it was ascertained that the contract proposed by the BOE for approval is a 10-year contract that includes ongoing license, software maintenance and support costs over a 10-year period of time, and that the BOE cost comparison only accounted for the 1st year of the 10-year contract; and

Whereas, when the proposals from Dominion and ES&S are evaluated side-by-side as a complete 10-year contract, as opposed to solely first-year costs, the difference between Dominion and ES&S shrinks further from \$1,579,067.80 to \$399,402.80 (plus shipping costs) over the 10 years of the contract, an additional reduction of \$1,179,665.00 (See attached Exhibit C); and

Whereas, in light of the new information revealed during the 10-year contract-pricing comparison (information omitted from the BOE statements and PowerPoint presentation), the President of the Board Commissioners, and Board of Commissioners staff independently contacted ES&S to clarify exactly what its November 2020 pricing proposal to Stark County entailed; what the process had been like; and without disclosing Dominion's pricing proposal to Stark County, to inquire as to whether there were any further adjustments, revisions or clarifications that ES&S wished to make to its proposal to Stark County; and

Whereas, on February 18, 2021, ES&S submitted an updated pricing proposal to Stark County (Attached hereto as Exhibit D) that:

- (1) Increased Stark County's Credit for Table B contract items (this includes ongoing maintenance and support costs) from \$250,000 to \$750,000;
- (2) Extended the timeframe the Credit could be utilized from two years to the full 10-year term of the contract, thus allowing the County to take advantage of the full amount of the Credit;
- (3) Increased the number of days ES&S would require for project management from 5 to 25 days and also increased its election on-site support personnel availability (the day before, of, and after each election) from one (1) employee to four (4) employees;
- (4) Clarified that the exact cost of the Shipping & Handling would be \$41,250.00 (as this had not been included in the November 2020 proposal); and
- (5) Due to current stock issues, indicated that the two (2) DS850 Scanners would be refurbished, but fully warrantied (as opposed to new in the November 2020 Proposal); and

Whereas, the 10-year contract cost comparison between Dominion and ES&S was updated by the Director of Management & Budget applying the terms of the February 18, 2021 ES&S revised proposal revealing that the ES&S's proposal was now \$143,262 less than the Dominion pricing proposal, over the full 10-year life of the contract (Attached hereto as Exhibit E); and

Whereas, this Board is obliged, in the totality of the circumstances, to exercise sound discretion on behalf of the citizens of Stark County to conduct the business of the county with due diligence when spending their hard-earned money, without rubber-stamping recommendations that come before it, and to seriously investigate the cost, trustworthiness, long-term viability, and other aspects of any voting system to be purchased to ensure Stark County is obtaining the best value; and

Whereas, whenever there exists a potential cloud (as acknowledged by the Dominion representative at the February 2, 2021 work session), or public perception or concern regarding a vendor's long-term viability, regardless of the cause or reason, the County must take a vendor's long-term viability into

account, as one the many factors it considers, when making a long-term multi-million-dollar taxpayer-funded purchase.

NOW, THEREFORE, being fully advised in the premises and notwithstanding the same, **BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED THAT**:

- 1. This Board hereby approves the recommendation of the Stark County Board of Elections to acquire the electronic voting system provided by Dominion Voting Systems, Inc., a Delaware corporation for profit, licensed to do business in the state of Ohio.
- 2. This Board be, and is hereby, further authorized to adopt such further legislation, and undertake such steps to enter into contracts and financing and all other actions necessary to complete the transaction.

Upon roll call the vote resulted as follows:

Mr. Regula - NO

Mrs. Creighton - NO

Mr. Smith - NO

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I, the County Administrator and an Assistant Clerk of the Board, hereby certify the foregoing to be a true and correct record of the Resolution adopted by the Board.

EXHIBIT A

(BOE Original PowerPoint from 2/2/2021)

Cost Comparison for DRE Voting Systems

Company	Voting System	Total Cost	State Trade-Contribution Credit	Trade-In / Credit	Stark Contribution
Dominion	ICX - DRE	\$6,448,200	\$3,268,344.74 \$1,704,119.80	\$1,704,119.80	\$1,475,735.46
ES&S	Express Vote – DRE	ess Vote - \$7,039,513	\$3,268,344.74	\$275,500.00	\$3,495,668.26

EXHIBIT B

(Revised BOE PowerPoint Received 2/12/2021)

Company	Voting System	Total Cost	State Contribution	Trade-In / Credit	Stark Contribution
Dominion	ICX - DRE	\$6,448,200	\$3,268,344.74 \$1,704,119.80	\$1,704,119.80	\$1,475,735.46
ES&S	Express Vote – DRE	\$6,598,648	\$3,268,344.74 \$275,500.00	\$275,500.00	\$3,054,803.26

EXHIBIT C

10-Year Contract Comparison - 4/16/19 Dominion Voting Systems vs 11/17/20 ES&S Proposal

Dominion Voting	Year 1	7	Year 2		Year 3	*	Year 4	Yes	Year 5	>	Year 6 Year 7		Year 7		Year 8	Year	6	Year 10	Year 8 Year 9 Year 10 10-Yr Total
Base Purchase \$ 6,171,985	\$ 6,171,985																		\$ 6,171,985
Non-State Funded Funded Items - Ex. C \$ 276,215	\$ 276,215																		\$ 276,215
Annual Licenses		69	195,050	69	195,050	69	195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$	\$ 19	5,050	69	95,050	69	195,050	69	195,050	\$ 195,0)50	\$ 195,05	195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 1,755,450
Annual Warranty & Maintenance		69	136,500	69	136,500	69	136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$	\$ 13	3,500	69	36,500	69	136,500	69	136,500	\$ 136,5	000	\$ 136,50	136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 1,228,500
Trade-in Allowance \$(1,704,120)	\$(1,704,120)																		\$(1,704,
Dominion Total \$ 4,744,080 \$ 331,550	\$ 4,744,080	S	331,550	43	331,550	45	331,550	\$ 33	1,550	*	131,550	43	331,550	43	331,550	\$ 331,5	220	\$ 331,55	331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 3,728,030
State Funding \$(3,268,345)	\$(3,268,345)																		\$(3,268,
Net Stark County Expense \$ 1,475,735 \$ 331,550	\$ 1,475,735	S	331,550	4	331,550	45	331,550	\$ 33	1,550	45	131,550	43	331,550	5	331,550	\$ 331,5	920	\$ 331,55	331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 4,459,685

Base Purchase \$ 6,298,073	ES&S	Year 1	Yea	Year 2 Year 3	ž	ear 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	9	Year 7	۶	ear 8	Year 9	Year 10	Year 8 Year 9 Year 10 10-Yr Total	
\$ 275,500 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,	Base Purchase \$	6,298,073								****						\$ 6,298,073	
\$ 25,075 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981	on-State Funded Funded Hardware \$	375,500														\$ 275,500	
\$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 1,945,845 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 8,268,993 \$ (3,268,345) \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981	Non-State Funded Funded Services \$	3 25,075														\$ 25,075	
\$ 6,323,148 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ \$ 1,945,845 \$ \$ 8,268,993 \$ \$ 6,323,148 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 3,029,728 \$. \$ 116,485 \$ 116,	unt for Non-State Funded Hardware \$	(275,500)														\$ (275,500)	
\$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 8,268,993 \$ \$ (3,268,345) \$ \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,	Annual Software/Firmware Lic. & Support		\$ 11	6,485	69	-	\$ 116,485	\$ 116,48	15 \$ 295,	981	\$ 295,981	69	295,981	\$ 295,98	\$ 295,981	_	
\$ (3,268,345) \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 5,000,648 \$ \$ (116,485) \$ (116,485) \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 29	ES&S Total \$	6,323,148	\$ 11	6,485	S	-	\$ 116,485	\$ 116,48	15 \$ 295,	981	\$ 295,981	49	295,981	\$ 295,98	\$ 295,981		
\$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 5,000,648 \$ (116,485) \$ (141,560) \$ (141,560) \$ \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 4,859,088	State Funding \$	3(3,268,345)														\$(3,268,345)	
\$ (116,485) \$. \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 4,859,088	Net Stark County Expense	3,054,803	\$ 11	6,485	5	16,485	\$ 116,485	\$ 116,48	15 \$ 295,	981	\$ 295,981	\$	295,981	\$ 295,98	\$ 295,981	\$ 5,000,648	\$108,440
\$. \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 4,859,088	0.000 Credit for Table B. Inc. Maint.	(25,075)	\$ (11	6,485)												\$ (141,560)	Credit Unused
	NAL - Net Stark County Expense	3,029,728	S		5	16,485	\$ 116,485	\$ 116,48	15 \$ 295,	981	\$ 295,981	\$	295,981	\$ 295,98	\$ 295,981		at 12/31/22

Compan	Dominion
ORIGINAL BOE	Presentation 2/2/21

ప	Domi	ES&S
REVISED BOE	Calculations Received	2/12/21

	Company	Voting System 10tal COSt Contribution Credit Contribution	Total Cost	Contribution	Credit	Contribution	
_	Dominion	ICX-DRE	\$6,448,200	\$3,268,345	\$1,704,120	\$ 1,475,735	\$6,448,200 \$3,268,345 \$1,704,120 \$ 1,475,735 \$(2,019,933) Cost difference of Dominion vs. ES&S
	ES&S	Express Vote – DRE	\$7,039,513	\$3,268,345	\$ 275,500	\$7,039,513 \$3,268,345 \$ 275,500 \$ 3,495,668	
	Company	Voting System	Total Cost	State Contribution	E N. BONNEY	Trade-In / Stark Credit Contribution	
ed	Dominion	ICX - DRE	\$6,448,200	\$3,268,345	\$1,704,120	\$ 1,475,735	\$6,448,200 \$3,268,345 \$1,704,120 \$ 1,475,735 \$ (1,579,068) Cost difference of Dominion vs. ES&S
	ES&S	Express Vote - DRE	\$6,598,648	\$3,268,345	\$ 275,500	\$ 3,054,803	\$6.598.648 \$3.268.345 \$ 275.500 \$ 3.054.803 *Usage of \$250,000 Credit Not Reflected















Stark County, Ohio Purchase Proposal Quote Submitted by Election Systems & Software

antity	Item Description	Unit Price	Extended Price
	State-Funded Hardware Items		
	ExpressVale Tabulator with Hub and Reports Printer:		
175	ExpressVote Tabulatar Version 2.1 (includes Tabulator Terminal, Internal Backup Battery, Rolling Klosk with Card Bin, Hub with Reports Printer, Paper Roll, ADA Keypad, Headphones, One (1) Standard 4GB Memory Device, and five (5) Year Extended Hardware Warranty)	\$4,423.00	\$774.025.00
,275	Express' de Tabulator WITHOUT Hub or Reports Printer: Express' de Tabulator Version 2.1 (Includes Tabulator Terminal, Internal Backup Battery, Rolling Klosk with Card Blin, ADA Keypad, Headphones, One (1) Standard 4GB Memory Device, and Rive (5) Year Extended Hardware Warranty)	\$3,955.00	\$5,042,625.00
100	Standard 4GB Memory Device (Additional)	\$105.00	\$10,500.00
10	Standard 8GB Memory Device (Additional)	\$210.00	\$2,100.00
	Ballot On Demand:	40 705 00	tu en a
3	C711 OkiData Compact Printer with Rive (5) Year Hardware Warranty	\$3,795.00	\$11,385.00
2	Ballot On Demand Laptop Computer	\$1,320,00	\$2,640.00
	State-Funded Software and Third Party EMS		
1	ElectionWare Software - EVS 6xxx PYO Standard (Base Package with English Language Synthesized	\$15.395.00	\$15,395.00
2	Voice Ries) Balot or Software with MRS and SRS Capability (One (1) License Required Per Ballot On Demand Laptop)	\$2.845.00	\$5,690.00
	Third Party Froducts		A1 4 000 000
1	EMS Third Party Hardware		\$14,998.00
	State-Funded Election Services		
×	Equipment and Software Installation		\$202,175.00
×	1 Year Firmware and Software Warranty		Included
	Shipping & Other		
×	Shipping and Handling		\$41,250.00
	Total State-Funded Implementation Price		\$6,122,783.00
	Funds Allocated to Stark County, Ohio by the Secretary of State's Office		\$3,268,344.74
	Remaining State-Funded Items balance to be paid by Stark County, Ohio		\$2,854,438.26
	Non-State-Funded Hardware Model DS850 High Speed Digital Image Scanner:		
2	REFURBISHED Model DS850 Version 1.0 (Includes Scanner, Steel Table/Cart, Start-up Kit, Dust Cover, Reports Printer, Audit Printer, Backup, Two (2) USB Cables, Three (3) Standard 8GB Memory Devices, and Rive (5) Year Hardware Warranty)	\$96,520.00	\$193,040.00
2	DS850 Intitial Annual Ucense Fee	Induded	Include
380	ExpressVale: ExpressVale Printer (For Printing of ExpressVale Activation Cards)	\$725.00	\$275,500.00
	Man State Funded Floation Services		
25	Non-State-Funded Election Services Project Management	\$1,700.00 Per Day	\$42,500.00
2	Equipment Operations Training	\$1,700.00 Per Day	\$3,400.00
5	Software Training	\$1,700.00 Per Day	\$8,500.00
4	Election On-Site Support (One Event includes a person on-site the day before, day of, and day after election)	\$4,675.00 Per Event	\$18,700.00
×	Discount for Non-tate-Funded Hardware		(\$275,500.0
	Total Non-State-Funded Implementation Price		\$266,140.00
	Remaining State-Funded Items balance to be paid by Stark County, Ohio		\$2,854,438.26
	Remaining State-Funded Items balance to be paid by Stark County, Ohio Total Purchase Solution Price Owed by Stark County, Ohio		\$2,854,438.2 \$3,120,578.2















Stark County, Ohio **Purchase Proposal Quote**

Submitted by Election Systems & Software

	Purchase Solution Includes:		
Quantity	Item Description	<u>Unit Price</u>	Extended Price
	Non-State-Funded Ballot On Demand Proce	essing Fees	
Ballot Processing Fee	for each Black & White Ballot Sheef Printed:		\$0.35 Per Sheet

Ballot Processing Fee for each Ballot Sheet Frinted with Coloc.

\$0.45 Per Sheet

Ballot Processing Fees include The Following Consumables:

Black Toner

Waste Toner Boxes

Black Image Drums

Color Tones

Calar Drums

Transfer Bells

Fusers

Shipping & Handling for Consumables listed above

Blank Ballot Stock

\$0.10 Per Sheet Plus Shipping & Handling

Pre-Bection Setup for Ballot On Demand System

If Off-Site setup is chosen by Customer:

\$350.00 per election set-up + \$1.00 per unique pdf (up to 4 computers) plus \$40.00 per computer over 4 units

Rework of set up due to customer changes after initial set up is complete:

- -\$175.00 per change event
- -\$40.00 per computer over 4 units

If Off-Site setup is not chosen by Customer:

- On-Site Setup fee charged of \$1,700.00 per person, per day

	Annual Software and Firmware Licensing and Support for Years 2	-5	
	Firmware License and Support Fees:		
2	Rimware License - DS850	\$1,575.00	\$3,150.00
1,450	Firmware License - ExpressVate Tabulator	\$65.00	\$94,250.00
	Software License and Support Fees:		
ı	BectionWare Software - EVS 6.x.xx PYO Standard (Base Package with English Language	\$15,395.00	\$15,395.00
	Synthesized Voice Files)		
2	Balotar Saftware with MRS and SRS Capability	\$1,845.00	\$3,690.00
	Annual Software and Firmware Licensing and Support Fees (Starting in Year 2)		\$116,485.00
	Annual Post-Warranty License and Maintenance and Support Fees for Y	ears 6-10	
	Annual Post-Warranty Hardware Maintenance and Support Fees:		
2	HMA DS850 - Extended Warranty with Biennial Maintenance	\$2.803.00	\$5,606.00
1,450	HMA ExpressVote Tabulator - Extended Warranty	\$111.00	\$160,950.00
	Annual Post-Warranty Firmware License and Maintenance and Support Fees:		
2	Rimware License - DS850	\$1,748.00	\$3,496.00
1,450	Rimware License - ExpressVate Tabulator	\$72.00	\$104,400.00
	Annual Post-Warranty Software License and Maintenance and Support Fees:		
1	BectlonWare Software - EVS 6.x.x.x PYO Standard (Base Package with English Language	\$19,225,00	\$19,225.00
	Synthesized Voice Files and Digital Adjudication)	40 20400	\$2.204.00
1	Balatar Software with MRS and SRS Capability	\$2,304.00	\$2,304.00
	Total Annual Post-Warranty License and Maintenance and Support Fees for Years 6-10		\$295,981.00

Footnotes:

- 1. This quote is an estimate and is subject to final review and approval by both ES&S and the Customer.
- 2. Rates valid for 30 days and thereafter may change.
- 3. Any applicable (City & State) sales taxes have not been included in pricing and are the responsibility of the customer.
- 4. ES&S will provide Stark County with a \$750,000 credit on account that may be used towards the cost of non-Table A products/services for a period of 10 years from the effective date of the contract.

EXHIBIT E

10-Year Contract Comparison - 4/16/19 Dominion Voting Systems vs 2/18/21 ES&S Proposal

Dominion Voting	Year 1	Y	Year 2	Ye	ar 3	Year	4	Year 5		ear 3 Year 4 Year 5 Year 6 Year 7		fear 7	٨	ear 8	Yea	6.1	Year	. 10	Year 8 Year 9 Year 10 10-Yr Total
Base Purchase \$ 6,171,985	\$ 6,171,985																		\$ 6,171,985
Non-State Funded Funded Items - Exhibit C \$ 276,215	\$ 276,215																		\$ 276,215
Annual Licenses		69	195,050 \$	-	35,050	\$ 195,1	050	\$ 195,05	9	195,050	69	195,050	69	195,050	\$ 19	5,050	\$ 19	5,050	195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050 \$ 195,050
Annual Warranty & Maintenance		69	136,500 \$		36,500	\$ 136,	200	\$ 136,50	00	136,500	69	136,500	69	136,500	\$ 13	3,500	\$ 13	3,500	136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 136,500 \$ 1,228,500
Trade-in Allowance \$(1,704,120)	\$(1,704,120)																		\$(1,704,120)
Dominion Total \$ 4,744,080 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550	\$ 4,744,080	43	331,550	\$	31,550	\$ 331,	220	\$ 331,55	9	331,550	49	331,550	\$	331,550	\$ 33	1,550	\$ 33	1,550	\$ 7,728,030
State Funding \$	\$(3,268,345)																		\$(3,268,345)
Net Stark County Expense \$ 1,475,735 \$ 331,550 \$ 3	\$ 1,475,735	45	331,550	\$ 3	31,550	\$ 331,	250	\$ 331,55	\$ 00	331,550	S	331,550	S	331,550	\$ 33	1,550	\$ 33	1,550	331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 4,459,685
	-		-		The same of the sa														

ES&S	Year 1	Year 2		Year 3		Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	9	Year		Year 8	8	Year 9	Year 10	10-Yr Total
Base Purchase \$ 6,081,533	\$ 6,081,533										-					\$ 6,081,533
Shipping & Handling \$ 41,250	\$ 41,250															\$ 41,250
Non-State Funded Funded Hardware \$	\$ 468,540															\$ 468,540
Non-State Funded Funded Services \$ 73,100	\$ 73,100															\$ 73,100
Discount for Non-State Funded Hardware \$ (275,500)	\$ (275,500)															\$ (275,500)
Discount for Non-Table A Products & Services \$ (266,140) \$ (116,485) \$ (116,485) \$ (116,485) \$ (116,485) \$ (17,920)	\$ (266,140)	\$ (116,	185) \$	(116,48	\$	(116,485)	\$ (116,48)	(17) \$ (5	920)							\$ (750,000)
Annual Software/Firmware Licensing & Support		\$ 116,485 \$	185		89	116,485	\$ 116,485	5 \$ 295,	981	\$ 295,	981	3 295,	981	\$ 295,981	\$ 295,981	116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 116,485 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 1,945,845
ES&S Total	ES&S Total \$ 6,122,783 \$	ss.	,		4/3		•	\$ 278,061 \$	190		295,981 \$		981	\$ 295,981	295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981	\$ 7,584,768
State Funding \$(3,268,345)	\$(3,268,345)				-											\$(3,268,345)
Net Stark County Expense \$ 2,854,438	\$ 2,854,438	s			49		. \$	\$ 278,061 \$	190		981	295	981	\$ 295,981	\$ 295,981	295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 295,981 \$ 4,316,423
Cashflow Summary	Year 1	Year 2	C	Year 3		Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	9	Year 7	7	Year 8	00	Year 9	Year 10	Year 9 Year 10 10-Yr Total
Dominion vs ES&S Annual \$(1,378,703) \$ 331,550 \$	\$(1,378,703)	\$ 331,	550	100	\$	331,550	331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 331,550 \$ 53,489 \$	3 \$ 53,	489		35,569 \$		569	\$ 35,569	35,569 \$ 35,569 \$ 35,569	\$ 143,262
Cummulative - Dominion vs ES&S \$(1,378,703) \$(1,047,153)	\$(1,378,703)	\$(1,047,	153)	715,600	3) \$	(384,053)	715,603) \$ (384,053) \$ (52,503) \$		\$ 986		555	3 72	124	\$ 107,693	36,555 \$ 72,124 \$ 107,693 \$ 143,262	

ORIGINAL BO
Ol S

Contribution Credit Contribution	\$6,448,200 \$3,268,345 \$1,704,120 \$ 1,475,735 \$ (2,019,933) Cost difference of Domini	268,345 \$ 275,500 \$ 3,495,668
Total Cost Col	\$6,448,200 \$3	\$7,039,513 \$3,268,345 \$
Voting System	ICX - DRE	Express Vote - DRE
Company	Dominion	ES&S

REVISED BOE Calculations Received 2/12/21

Company	Voting System	Total Cost	State Contribution	Trade-In / Credit	Stark Contribution
Dominion	ICX - DRE	\$6,448,200	\$6,448,200 \$3,268,345 \$1,704,120 \$ 1,475,73	\$1,704,120	\$ 1,475,735
ES&S	Express Vote – DRE	\$6,598,648	\$6,598,648 \$3,268,345 \$ 275,500	\$ 275,500	0 \$ 3,054,803

\$ (1,579,068) Cost difference of Dominion vs. ES&S