Human Trafficking: A Brief Overview

Introduction

Millions of men, women and children are victims of human trafficking for sexual, forced labor and other forms of exploitation worldwide. The human and economic costs of this take an immense toll on individuals and communities. By conservative estimates, the cost of trafficking in terms of underpayment of wages and recruiting fees is over $20 billion.[1] The costs to human capital are probably impossible to quantify. The problem of trafficking cuts across a range of development issues, from poverty to social inclusion, to justice and rule of law issues, and thus has relevance for practitioners throughout the development community.

This note provides a brief overview on the issues of human trafficking, which can be used as a quick reference for the task team leaders, sector managers, directors, and their clients at the World Bank Group. This note will first provide a definition of human trafficking and the scope of the problem, then summarize the regional trends of trafficking patterns. This is followed by a discussion of the key actors in the anti-trafficking movement and the role played by development partners in preventing human trafficking. The final section offers some potential orientations for the World Bank Group to further engage this issue in its operations.

What is Human Trafficking?

Human trafficking is a process of people being recruited in their community and country of origin and transported to the destination where they are being exploited for purposes of forced labor, prostitution, domestic servitude, and other forms of exploitation. The internationally recognized definition of trafficking is set forth in *the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children*[2] (the Palermo Protocol), which supplements *the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime.*[3]

(a) *'Trafficking in persons' shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;*

(b) *The consent of the victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in the subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used;*

(c) *The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring, or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered 'trafficking in persons' even if this does not involve any of the means set forth; and*

(d) Child means any person under the age of 18.

The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) as the secretariat of the Conference of the Parties to *the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime* and its protocols, defines three basic elements of trafficking: first, the process; second, the means; and third, the purpose (see Table 1). **UNODC explains that "the crime of trafficking be defined through a combination of the three constituent elements and not the individual components, though in some cases threes individual elements will constitute criminal offences independently."[4]** The individual elements, such as sexual exploitation, forced labor, slavery-like practice, are not further defined in the Protocol, and signatory states are obligated to further define these terms under their domestic legislation.[5]

The Palermo Protocol represents a broad international consensus on the definition of human trafficking; however there is controversy surrounding some of its elements. The definition is broad and unclear, therefore it leaves interpretation to each State and generates various debates surrounding the definition. The International Labour Organization (ILO) notes that for example, there has been a debate as to whether trafficking must involve some movement of the trafficked victims either within or across national borders together with the process of recruitment, or whether the focus should be only on the exploitation that occurs at the end[6]. A further issue

has been whether trafficking for the purpose of exploitation necessarily involved coercion.

The Palermo Protocol Articles 3(b) and (c) addresses the question of consent.[7] **The consent of the trafficked persons becomes irrelevant where any of the means (i.e. force or coercion) described in the Palermo Protocol are present. In the case of child victims of trafficking, the consent is irrelevant regardless of the means used.** The Trafficking in Persons Report (TIP Report) 2009 published by the United States Department of State illustrates misconceptions held by some authorities regarding the consent of the victims and strongly expresses that even though a person may willingly agree to migrate legally or illegally or willingly take a job, "once a person's work is recruited or compelled by the use or threat of physical violence or the abuse or threatened abuse of the legal process, the person's previous consent or effort to obtain employment with the trafficker becomes irrelevant."[8]

Traffickers use a variety of methods to create a vulnerable condition for the victims so that the victims do not have any other choice but obey the traffickers. One of the common methods used by traffickers is debt-bondage in which the traffickers tell their victims that they owe money relating to their travel and living expenses and that they will not be released until the debt has been repaid. Traffickers also use other methods including starvation, imprisonment, physical abuse (beatings and rape), verbal abuse, removal of victims'

Table 1: Identification of Human Trafficking (Process, Means, Purpose)

Process	Means	Purpose
• Recruitment • Transportation • Transfer • Harbouring • Receipt of persons	• Threat • Force • Coercion • Abduction • Fraud • Deception • Abuse of power • Abuse of vulnerability • Giving and receiving of payments	• Exploitation which includes: a) Prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation b) Forced labor and services c) Slavery and similar practices d) Involuntary servitude e) Removal of organs

Source: UNODC (This table was shown in the PowerPoint presentation given at the Global Report on Trafficking in Persons launch event at Foreign Correspondents' Club of Thailand on February 13, 2009. http://www.unodc.un.or.th/2009/02/ht-report/PPT%20TIP%205%20GB%20gl%20(13%20Feb%2009).pdf)

identification documents (e.g. passport), threats of violence to the victims and the victims' families, and forced drug use. Especially in the case of cross-border trafficking, victims often do not speak the local language or do not have any social network to assist them so that they are depending on members of their own ethnic group receiving them in the destination country. Furthermore, victims' illegal status makes it difficult for them to seek help from law enforcement, the healthcare system and/or other public services.

Differences Between Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling

"Smuggling of migrants" shall mean the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or permanent resident.

The Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea, and Air, Article 3(a)[9]

Human trafficking and migrant smuggling are often confused with each other. These differ in three key elements: movement across borders, consent, and the purpose of exploitation.[10] One of the main differences is that migrant smuggling necessarily involves the crossing of international borders. Human trafficking may involve the crossing of international borders but can also occur within the borders of one country as internal human trafficking. Second, migrant smuggling occurs with the consent of the person(s) being smuggled. The persons agree to cross the border illegally and often pay large sums of money to smugglers for the service. Upon arrival at their destination, they are free to go. In contrast, victims of human trafficking may have agreed to migrate and work initially out of their own choice, but are prevented from leaving, often by physical or psychological coercion as well as legal and financial constraints. Whatever initial consent may have existed becomes irrelevant when any of the means (threat, force, coercion, fraud, etc.) are used to enslave the trafficked persons during the trafficking process. Finally, a key difference between smuggling and trafficking is the purpose for which a person is recruited. Migrant smuggling involves illegal entry of a person into a country for financial or other material benefit only, whereas trafficking occurs in order for sexual or other labor exploitation, or the removal of organs.

Table 2: Key Differences between Human Trafficking and Migrant Smuggling

	Human Trafficking	Migrant Smuggling
Action(s)	• Recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a person by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits	• Procurement of illegal entry of a person into a country of which the person is not a national or permanent resident
Transnationality	• Not required	• Required
Consent of the trafficked or smuggled person	• Irrelevant once the means are established • For children, the consent is irrelevant regardless of the means	• The smuggled person consents to the smuggling

Purpose	• Exploitation which includes:
	  a) Prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation
	  b) Forced labor and services
	  c) Slavery and similar practices
	  d) Involuntary servitude
	  e) Removal of organs
		• For financial or other material benefit

Source: UNODC (2009), Anti-Human Trafficking Manual for Criminal Justice Practitioners

The Scope of Human Trafficking

1.   Number of Trafficking Victims

It is impossible to calculate the actual number of trafficking victims. Differences in definition and methodology, together with a general lack of reliable data, result in an immense variation in global estimates of the number of trafficked victims.   The United States Government Accountability Office (GAO) reports that there is a considerable discrepancy between the numbers of estimated victims of human trafficking across various agencies (see Table 3)[11] because each organization uses its own methodology to collect data[12] and analyzes the problem based on its own mandate. The global estimates given by the US government are focused on transnational human trafficking, thus do not include the number of victims who are internally trafficked.   The ILO estimates at least 2.45 million people were trafficked both internationally and internally during 1995 to 2004. UNODC monitors national and regional patterns of human trafficking but does not provide a global estimate of the number of victims.   The International Organization for

Migration (IOM) only records the number of trafficking victims whom they have actually assisted so that it is hard to derive a global estimate from the figure.

Even though the estimates vary widely, some common traits have emerged from these databases. The largest percentage of estimated victims is trafficked for sexual exploitation, thus women constitute the majority of estimated victims. Because some countries only have legislation criminalizing trafficking for sexual exploitation or trafficking in women, trafficking in men and boys might have been largely under-reported because it is not properly recorded.[13]

Efforts to obtain more accurate and consistent global estimates on human trafficking victims are undermined because of the lack of country level data and the lack of a standardized methodology to collect and analyze data. According to the ILO, several initiatives led by the ILO, IOM, and the European Union (EU) are underway to develop common standards and approaches for collecting data, particularly in Europe. [14]

Table 3: Victim Profiles in US Government, ILO, UNODC and IOM databases

	US Government	ILO	UNODC	IOM
Main Focus	Global estimate of victims	Global estimate of victims	Country and regional patterns of international trafficking	Actual victims assisted by IOM in 26 countries
Number of Victims	Some 600,000-800,000 people trafficked across borders in 2003 (est.)	At least 2.45 million people trafficked internationally and internally during 1995 to 2004 (est.)	Not Available	7,711 victims assisted from 1999 to 2005
Type of Exploitation (%) 1. Commercial sex 2. Economic or forced labor 3. Mixed and other	66% 34% N/A	43% 32% 25%	87% 28% N/A	81% 14% 5%
Gender and Age of Victims (%)	80% female 50% minors	80% female 40% minors	77% female 9% male 33% children	83% female 15% male 2% not identified 13% minors
Definition of Trafficking Used	Trafficking Victims Protection Act 2000	U.N. Protocol (Palermo Protocol)	U.N. Protocol (Palermo Protocol)	U.N. Protocol (Palermo Protocol)
Criteria for Data Collection	Transnational trafficking	Internal and transnational trafficking	Transnational trafficking	Internal and transnational trafficking

Source: GAO (2006)

Table 4: Annual Profits from All Trafficked Forced Laborers

	Profits per Forced Laborer in Commercial Sexual Exploitation (US$)	Profits per Forced Laborer in Other Economic Exploitation (US$)	Total Profits (US$ million)
Industrialized Economies	67,200	30,154	15,513
Transition Economies	23,500	2,353	3,422
Asia and the Pacific	10,000	412	9,704
Latin America & Caribbean	18,200	3,570	1,348
Sub-Saharan Africa	10,000	360	159
Middle East & North Africa	45,000	2,340	1,508
GLOBAL PROFITS			31,654

Source: ILO (2005) (See the regional breakdown according ILO's Key Indicator of the Labour Market, in the following document: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_081913.pdf)

2. *Profits and Costs of Human Trafficking*

Human trafficking is a high-profit and relatively low-risk business with ample supply and growing demand.[15] Even where human trafficking is criminalized, most of the investigations do not result in convictions of traffickers. Economic exploitation is probably the biggest motivation behind the most cases of human trafficking; nonetheless there is not enough attention given to human trafficking from an economic perspective.

The ILO's Global Report, *A Global Alliance Against Forced Labor* (2005), estimated the global annual profits generated by human trafficking to be around US$31.6 billion[16] (see Table 4). This figure represents an average of approximately US$13,000 per year or US$1,100 per month per trafficking victim. Half of this profit is made in industrialized countries (US$15.5 billion). The Asia and the Pacific region generates the highest profits (US$9.7 billion), which represent one-third of the global profits, followed by transition countries (US$3.4 billion), Middle East and North Africa (US$1.5 billion).[17]

In the most recent Global Report, *The Cost of Coercion* (2009), the ILO estimated that the total financial cost of coercion experienced by forced labor workers, including trafficked victims, would be over US$20 billion[18] (see Table 5). However,

Table 5: Estimate of the Total Cost of Coercion (in US$)

	# of Victims in Forced Labor	# of Victims Trafficked	Total Under-payment Wages	Total Recruiting Fees	Total cost of coercion
Industrialized Economies	113,000	74,133	2,508,368,218	400,270,777	2,908,638,995
Transition Economies	61,500	59,096	648,682,323	42,675,823	691,358,145
Asia & the Pacific	6,181,000	408,969	8,897,581,909	142,855,489	9,040,437,398
Latin America & Caribbean	995,500	217,470	3,390,199,770	212,396,124	3,602,595,894
Sub-Saharan Africa	537,500	112,444	1,494,276,640	16,994,438	1,511,271,079
Middle East & North Africa	229,000	203,029	2,658,911,483	551,719,286	3,210,630,769
TOTAL	8,117,500	1,075,141	19,598,020,343	1,366,911,936	20,964,932,279

Source: ILO(2009), The Cost of Coercion, p.13-14.

this figure does not include the victims of forced commercial sexual exploitation. The total cost of coercion includes the "opportunity cost" of being in forced labor and human trafficking, in the form of lost income due to unpaid wages, plus recruiting fees paid by victims. Underpayment of wages includes excessive overtime and other work that is either unpaid or inadequately remunerated. Recruitment fees particularly applied to trafficking victims include the fees paid to agents, inflated travel costs, and other charges incurred.

Purposes of Human Trafficking

Throughout the process of human trafficking (recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring, or/and receipt of persons), traffickers play particular roles.[19] Traffickers in this note indicate "recruiters, transporters, those who exercise control over trafficked persons, those who transfer and/or maintain trafficked persons in exploitative situations, those involved in related crimes, those who profit either directly or indirectly from trafficking, its component acts and related offences."[20] Each trafficker contributes at different stages in the human trafficking process for the purpose of exploiting the victims for economic or other gain. Traffickers may take on one task or multiple tasks such as recruitment, document forgery, transportation, escorts of victims, bribing public officials, facilitating the transportation and transferring, information gathering, and receiving victims in the destination.[21]

1. *Sexual Exploitation*

While trafficking for forced labor is recently gaining more recognition on its severity, trafficking for sexual exploitation is still the most common form of human trafficking. This primarily impacts women and children. There are several identified common patterns for recruiting victims into sex trafficking,[22] which include but are not limited to 1) a promise of a good job in another country; 2) a false marriage proposal turned into a bondage situation; 3) being sold into the sex industry by parents, husbands or boyfriends, and 4) being kidnapped by traffickers. Recruiters are often very familiar persons to the victims, such as neighbor, friend, a friend of a friend, boyfriend, acquaintance, and family friend.[23]

2. *Forced Labor and Other Forms*

Trafficking for forced labor is less frequently discovered and reported than trafficking for sexual exploitation. It is difficult to distinguish victims trafficked for forced labor from migrant laborers. These victims often work in hidden locations, such as agricultural fields in rural areas, mining camps, factories and the private houses in the case of domestic servitude. As a consequence, the trafficking victims of forced labor are less likely to be identified than the trafficking victims of sexual exploitation.[24] Along with women and girls, both adult men and boys are also the victims of trafficking for forced labor but the trafficking cases of men are extremely underreported.

Victims of forced labor trafficking are often recruited with a promise of work, generally through personal contacts and also through job advertisements on newspapers, television, billboards and the Internet. Some victims enter the country legally on work visas while others enter illegally. The IOM reported in the case of labor trafficking of men in Belarus and Ukraine that recruitment generally mimicked legal migration.[25] These male victims often made what they thought were legally binding agreements with reliable companies, employment agencies and recruiters. Confusion between trafficking in persons and smuggling of migrants prevents victims from receiving protection and support as their fundamental right.

Box 1: Common Sector and Forms of Trafficking for Forced Labor

- Agriculture
- Mining
- Logging
- Construction
- Fishery
- Sweatshop factory (e.g. garments, packaging, food processing)
- Domestic Servitude
- Begging
- Drug dealing
- Janitorial
- Food services
- Other service industry, etc.

3. Trafficking of Children

Global estimates indicate that 30 to 50% of *all* trafficking victims are children under 18 years of age.[26] Not only are children often sexually exploited in the sex industry targeted for child pornography and pedophiles, but children are also trafficked to work on untangling fishing nets, sewing goods in sweatshops, picking cocoa, and begging. Traffickers may lure children and/or their parents into leaving home with the promise of a better life. On some occasions desperate parents will sell their children to a trafficker so that they have fewer mouths to feed.

Forced conscription of children into armed conflict is another form of trafficking which enslaves children in war zones and removes their freedom. The Coalition to Stop the Use of Child Soldiers estimates that there are still tens of thousands of children who are used as combatants and/or sexually exploited in armed forces and groups in 19 countries and territories worldwide.[27]

Regional Trends of Human Trafficking

Information provided in this section is taken from both the UNODC Global Report on Trafficking in Persons[28] and the US Department of State TIP Report 2009.[29] Based on data gathered from 155 countries in 2007 and 2008, the UNODC Global Report offers a global assessment of the scope of human trafficking and provides an overview of trafficking patterns in different regions. The US Department of State TIP Report covers updated information on global trafficking trends during the period of April 2008 through March 2009 and provides an assessment of each government's actions to combat trafficking in persons.

1. Middle East and North Africa

According to UNODC, there is not enough data available in this region to indicate a clear trend or pattern of human trafficking in Middle East and North Africa. Israel, Qatar and the United Arab Emirates are categorized as destination countries for victims who were trafficked from the Eastern Europe and Central Asia region. Victims of human trafficking in the Middle East are also from South and East Asia as well as Africa. The

US TIP Report indicates that many of the victims in this region migrated voluntarily and found themselves in involuntarily servitude or in debt bondage, and women and children are also trafficked by the family members to escape desperate economic circumstances.

Most of the victims identified by the state authorities in Middle East and North Africa are women and children. The most common form of human trafficking in this region is sexual exploitation and domestic servitude. Children are exploited in prostitution (including child sex tourism), forced marriage, domestic servitude, and street begging and vending.

2. Sub-Saharan Africa

UNODC finds that there is significant intra-regional trafficking in West, Central and South Africa. Victims of the West and Central Africa region are trafficked to other neighboring countries such as Benin, Cote d'Ivoire, Gabon, Ghana, Nigeria, Liberia and Togo but also internally trafficked within the border. In Southern Africa, the victims identified by the state authorizes are from Mozambique, Malawi, the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), Zambia and Zimbabwe as well as from East, South-East and South Asia.

Most of the trafficking victims reported are children in West and Central Africa[30] and adult women and children in Southern Africa. In West and Central Africa, children are trafficked for forced labor, such as slavery, domestic servitude, street begging and as camel jockeys. In Southern Africa, human trafficking forms include sexual exploitation, forced labor, slavery and domestic servitude. According to the TIP report, women, girls and boys are trafficked for sexual exploitation in many countries, and child sex tourism exists in the Gambia, Ghana, Kenya, Madagascar, Senegal and South Africa. Men and boys are often trafficked into the manual labor sectors, including agriculture, mines and quarries, and fisheries. The recruitment of children as soldiers has been reported in Burundi, the Central African Republic, Chad, the DRC, and Sudan.

3. Europe and Central Asia

Intra-regional trafficking is the major pattern reported for human trafficking in Europe and Central Asia. UNODC found that almost all of the countries in this region are both origin and destination countries for intra-regional trafficking, except Tajikistan and Turkmenistan which are exclusively countries of origin for trafficking victims. The Eastern Europe and Central Asia region is not a major trans-regional destination, however, victims originating from this region are identified in Western and Central Europe as well as neighboring Asian countries.

The majority of trafficking victims in Europe and Central Asia are adult women, and sexual exploitation is the most common form of human trafficking in this region. However, trafficking for forced labor accounts for over one third of the total number of victims identified by state authorities in Western and Central Europe as well as in Central Asia. Women and men are also exploited in domestic servitude and forced labor in agriculture, construction, fishery, manufacturing, and textile industries. Children are trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation, forced marriage and forced begging.

4. South Asia

UNODC's global report indicates that intra-regional trafficking affects Nepal and Bangladesh as origins of trafficking victims and India as a destination country. The United States Department of State reports that Bangladeshi men and women willingly migrate to Middle Eastern and South Asian countries for work through recruiting agencies, and the recruitment fees contribute to the placement of workers in debt bondage or forced labor once overseas. Bangladesh and India also experience domestic trafficking.

Victims of trafficking in South Asian are mainly adult women and children of both sexes. Trafficking for sexual exploitation is again the most common form of trafficking reported, yet trafficking for domestic servitude and forced labor are equally prominent in the region. A significant number of forced labor cases in brick

kilns, rice mills, agriculture, and embroidery factories are reported in India. Children are often trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation, forced marriage, forced begging, and forced labor in brick kilns, carpet-making factories, and domestic service. According to the US TIP Report, Afghan boys are promised enrollment in Islamic schools in Pakistan, but instead are trafficked to paramilitary training camps by extremist groups. In Nepal and Pakistan, one of the major forms of human trafficking is bonded labor.

5. East Asia and the Pacific

UNODC reports that East Asian countries exhibit the most complex human trafficking flows as this region has the widest range of trans-regional trafficking between countries of origin and the destination of victims. For example, Thai victims are found in Southern Africa, Europe and the Middle East while Chinese victims are identified in Europe, the Middle East, the Americas and Africa. Intra-regional trafficking is also a major issue as victims from the East Asian countries are largely trafficked to Australia, Japan and Malaysia. Many countries within the East Asia region are countries of origin for trafficking victims.

Women and girls are the primary victims of trafficking in this region, particularly for the purpose of sexual exploitation[31] and forced marriage. Men are also victims of trafficking. They willingly migrate for work in the region and are subsequently subjected to conditions of forced labor in the agriculture, construction, finishing, manufacturing, plantation, and service (hotels, restaurants, and bars) sectors. Children in this region are often trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation, domestic servitude, and forced begging.

6. Latin America and Caribbean

In Latin America and Caribbean, intra-regional, trans-regional and domestic trafficking patterns are reported. At the regional level, Bolivia, the Dominican Republic, Ecuador, Nicaragua and Paraguay appear to be the countries of origin for trafficking victims while Chile, Guatemala, and

the East Caribbean countries are mainly destination countries. Regarding trans-regional trafficking, Latin American and Caribbean victims are often found in Europe and North America and, to a lesser extent, in East Asia and the Middle East. Domestic trafficking is also reported.

Victims of human trafficking in Latin America and the Caribbean are predominantly girls and adult women who are trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation and domestic servitude. Both adult men and boys are less frequently reported as trafficking victims; however an increasing number men and boy trafficking victims have been reported. Women, men and children in this region are also trafficked for forced begging and forced labor in agriculture, factories, logging, mining, and sweatshops. Child sex tourism is identified as a problem in Brazil, Colombia, Costa Rica, the Dominican Republic, Guatemala, Honduras, Jamaica, Mexico, and Nicaragua. The US Department of State reports that in Caribbean countries, poor families often push their young daughters to provide sexual favors to wealthy older men in exchange for school fees, money, and gifts. In Colombia, children are also forcibly recruited as combatants by guerillas and paramilitary groups.

National and International Actors

Human trafficking undermines the safety and security of all nations it involves. Responding to human trafficking requires various stakeholders, which include national governments, national government agencies (e.g. law enforcement, immigration, and judiciary departments), health and public services, international organizations (e.g. United Nations agencies, such as UNODC, IOM, and ILO), Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and Civil Society Organizations (CSOs), the media, corporations/businesses, academics, and individuals.

1. *National Actors*
- *Governments*: Efforts undertaken by the government to combat human trafficking vary in each country. Some governments acknowledge the problem of human trafficking by ratifying the Palermo Protocol and adapting laws to criminalize human trafficking activities. Governments can develop a national strategy responding to internal, regional and international human trafficking as well as create a system to coordinate the efforts of government agencies and NGOs.

- *Government agencies (law enforcement, judiciary, and immigration offices)*: Combating the crime of human trafficking requires collaboration among all of the stakeholders, particularly law enforcement, immigration and judiciary agencies. The primary responders to human trafficking are often law enforcement agencies, which then coordinate with the judiciary office to prosecute traffickers. If the victims of human trafficking are from other countries, they work with the immigration office to provide the temporary visa to stay in the country or repatriate the victims to their own country.

- *Health and public services*: Once human trafficking victims are rescued from traffickers, victims need access to basic services, such as shelter, legal assistance, transportation, medical exams, and psychological counseling.

- *NGOs and CSOs*: NGOs and CSOs have long been active in the anti-human trafficking movement before governments and international community start realizing the severity of this issue. NGOs and CSOs mainly focus on carrying out awareness-raising campaigns, conducting research, helping law enforcement on victim identification, and providing basic services to victims of human trafficking.

- *Media*: The media plays an indispensable role in educating the public about the reality of human trafficking and illuminating the problems via films, theatre, photographs, newspapers, magazine articles and so on. The media is used as one of the most effective ways to inform communities around the world about different aspects of human trafficking.

- *Private Sector*: The private sector can also play a very important role to further prevent human trafficking. Corporations and businesses can create job opportunities for trafficking victims and financially support the other organizations' activities to protect victims. Many businesses have started adapting codes of conduct that would implement measures to prevent labor exploitation and human trafficking.

2. *International Actors*
- *UN System and agencies*: Since the Palermo Protocol entered into force in December 2003, 117 countries have signed the Protocol. Led by UNODC, the United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN.GIFT) was created to promote the global efforts to fight against human trafficking and managed in cooperation with ILO, IOM, (UNICEF), the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) (See Box 2: International Coordination Initiative - UN.GIFT).
- *Multilateral Development Banks:*[32] The Asia Development Bank (ADB) and the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) are most active at working on human trafficking issues in their loan and grant projects as well as regional and country-specific technical assistance projects. ADB focuses on preventive measures of human trafficking and monitoring of impacts, especially those related to cross-border road corridors and regional economic integration activities. IDB has established an inter-institutional framework to define a plan of action and support Latin American governments in fighting against human trafficking. Even though other Multilateral Development Banks may work on this issue, project information on human trafficking and its related issues is not available on their websites.
- *INTERPOL*: INTERPOL works with governments to help them strengthen their capacity to fight against global human trafficking. In February 2009, INTERPOL signed an agreement between Nigeria and Italy, coordinating the efforts of both countries and providing tools and resources

---

Box 2: International Coordination Initiative - UN.GIFT

The United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN.GIFT) was established in March 2007 by UNODC with a grant made on behalf of the United Arab Emirates. Its strategy includes three goals: 1) building awareness; 2) broadening the knowledge base of data, facts and statistics of global human trafficking; 3) providing technical assistance.

The UN.GIFT Steering Committee coordinates the efforts of its members and their respective networks and alliances. The Steering Committee consists of representatives from the following six founding organizations and the main donor, HRH the Crown Prince of Abu Dhabi:

- **ILO**: ILO focuses on forced labor, child labor and migrant workers of human trafficking.
  http://www.ilo.org/global/Themes/Forced_Labour/lang--en/index.htm
- **IOM**: IOM works on preventing human trafficking, protecting the victims through targeted assistance, and empowering governments and other agencies to combat the crime more effectively.
  http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/op/edit/pid/748
- **OHCHR**: OHCHR's trafficking program integrates human rights into anti-trafficking initiatives at the legal, political and program levels.
  http://www2.ohchr.org/english/issues/trafficking/
- OSCE: OSCE works closely with its 56 participating States to ensure coordination among member States and to emphasize the importance of combating all forms of trafficking in human beings - in countries of origin, transit and destination - at the highest political levels. http://www.osce.org/cthb
- **UNICEF**: UNICEF works with many partners in all areas - from the grassroots to the highest political levels - to create a protective environment for children from human trafficking and other forms of exploitation.
  http://www.unicef.org/protection/index.html
- **UNODC**: UNODC provides the legal and conceptual framework and focuses on the criminal justice system response to human trafficking, but includes provisions on victim protection and preventive measures.
  https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/index.html

Source: UN.GIFT (http://www.ungift.org/ungift/index.html)

to national law enforcements to target organizations behind illegal immigration and human trafficking.[33]

- *Bilateral/multilateral and regional initiatives*: A number of governments are participating in multilateral, regional and sub-regional initiatives (e.g. Colombo Process[34]) to protect migrant workers from forced labor trafficking.

- *International NGOs*: International organizations, such as Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, and the Global Alliance against Traffic in Women (GATW) have been leading the global anti-human trafficking movement. NGOs have been successful in bringing public and government attention to this issue.

- *Academic and Research Institutions:* Academic and research institutions around the world conduct useful research on the various aspects of human trafficking and provide recommendations to policymakers and service providers.

The Development Dimensions of Human Trafficking[35]

Human trafficking is a development issue. Common development dimensions, such as poverty, gender inequality, unemployment, a lack of education, weak rule of law, and poor governance accompanied by socio-economic factors are strongly linked to vulnerability to trafficking.

Poverty is one of the primary risk factors to create vulnerability to trafficking; however, poverty alone would not push people into human trafficking. There are many risk factors that make potential victims vulnerable to trafficking. In the training manual to fight child trafficking, ILO and UNICEF explain the risk and vulnerability of human trafficking: "Often children experience several risk factors at the same time, and one of them may act as a trigger that sets the trafficking event in motion. This is sometimes called '**poverty plus**,' a situation in which poverty does not by itself lead to a person being trafficked, but

where a 'plus' factor such as illness combines with poverty to increase vulnerability."[36]

Box 3: Risk Factors of Human Trafficking

- Poverty
- Gender
- Age
- Limited economic and educational opportunity
- Poor governance
- Lack of rule of law
- Political conflict and war
- Violence
- Social exclusion
- Social and cultural structures (power, hierarchy and social order)
- Marginalization and discrimination based on ethnicity, race, disability, and religion
- Community's tradition of movement and other social practices
- Climate change and natural disaster
- Individual's drug and alcohol addiction and mental health

Among those who live in poverty, women and children are particularly vulnerable to trafficking. Women often do not have equal employment and educational opportunities, and legal or political rights. Women also face many forms of gender-based violations, such as domestic violence, sexual violence and genital mutilation; which are linked to social and cultural structures that contribute to the vulnerability of women to human trafficking.[37] Children are also vulnerable to trafficking in persons due to their parents and families' socio-economic situation. Girls are particularly vulnerable to trafficking because in many societies, parents often choose to send girls to work because they believe that education is not as important to girls who will one day marry and leave the parents.[38]

Other 'plus' factors of human trafficking include poor governance, weakened rule of law in transition and post-conflict countries, and economic disruption affected by climate change and natural disasters. The lack of rule of law facilitates criminal activities and creates an environment where human trafficking can thrive. This is particularly apparent in a post-conflict environment, where the lack of law and order pushes the already vulnerable populations, such

as women, children, internally displaced peoples, and war refugees, into situations where they are even more at risk of becoming victims of human trafficking.[39]

As Clert et al (2005) noted, human trafficking is a community and social inclusion issue and it is necessary to address the spatial, economic and social exclusion processes that make particular social groups and regions vulnerable to the phenomenon. "The causes of trafficking are not only at the individual level, but also at the household, community, regional, institutional, and systematic levels that give rise to trafficking and allow it to flourish in specific localities and among specific groups…"[40]

A Development Approach to Human Trafficking – Focusing on Prevention

Responding to human trafficking problems requires multi-dimensional approaches. In order to better understand the complexity of human trafficking and to identify entry points, more systematic research, mapping and surveys are often required to understand the organizational patterns and mechanisms of recruitment, the routes, and the placement of human trafficking victims. The vulnerable groups that are most likely to become victims of human trafficking are often the most difficult to reach and access due to their remote location and their marginalized position in society. Therefore understanding their characteristics, their location and the nature of their vulnerability is essential to effective anti-trafficking policies.

Reinforcing delivery of basic services in areas with high levels of victimization is an indirect but effective way to prevent trafficking; education, employment, health, social protection, violence prevention and child protection are all very important. However, the following specific actions are the key to preventing human trafficking.[41]

Box 4: The World Bank's Prevention Project in Senegal

The World Bank conducts a project to put a stop to child trafficking for the purpose of forced begging in Senegal. Senegal faces a problem of thousands of children begging for money on the street in Dakar. These street children are taken in by traffickers posing as Quranic (Islamic) teachers who promise parents that children will study fundamental Muslim values. These Quranic teachers exploit religious practices to facilitate forced begging.

This World Bank's project includes the following four components to prevent child trafficking for forced begging in Senegal.

1) *Community-based interventions to prevent child begging*
   Activities aiming to prevent parents from sending their children away to false Quranic teachers are carried out in about 200 rural communities where most of the identified street children are from. Activities include direct communication/sensitization conducted by NGOs, local leaders and opinion makers at the community level, and innovative media products to be broadcasted via local radio stations.

2) *Improvement and regulation of* Quranic *schools*
   Activities include a census of Quranic schools, curriculum development, quality standard assessment of Quranic schools, and sensitization of Quranic teachers on child begging. Considering the sensitivity of this matter, pilot activities to improve and regulate Quranic schooling are implemented in a restricted area only.

3) *Dissemination of the law against human trafficking*
   A national media campaign will be launched to raise awareness about a law against human trafficking, which also prohibits the exploitation of begging, adopted by the Senegalese parliament in 2005. This campaign mainly uses community radio and local newspapers to inform citizens about the plight of child begging and the provisions of the law.

4) *Capacity building for civil society organizations fighting child begging*
   This component supports a number of small civil society organizations (CSOs) providing basic services to rescue street children. The association, called PARRER (Partenariat pour le retrait et la reinsertion des enfants de la rue/Partnership to get children off the street and reintegrate them), oversees components 1-3 and supports the other CSOs by developing a capacity building program for member organizations, setting up a computerized information management system, and managing fiduciary tasks.

Source: The World Bank Group (The Information is taken from the Japan Social Development Fund Grant Proposal on "Fighting Child Begging in Senegal," which was prepared by Maurizia Tovo, Social Protection Specialist at the World Bank)

- Social protection: Enhancing a safety net system to target those who are vulnerable to trafficking in the project area.
- Employment: Providing job training and creating more jobs in the community at risk of trafficking so that vulnerable populations do not necessarily need to go to the city or abroad to obtain a job.
- Labor safeguards: Ensuring labor safeguards that include an anti-trafficking component in development projects for the following sectors that are particularly common for labor

trafficking – mining, fisheries, agriculture, logging, and construction.
- Education: Incorporating information on human trafficking, child labor, migration, and skill development into school curricula and training programs to educate children and young adults about the danger of human trafficking and their human/labor rights, and also to develop useful skills to have sustainable employment.
- Health: Improving access to healthcare for vulnerable groups of human trafficking (such as

---

Box 5: Incorporating Human Trafficking Prevention in the Transport Sector Project at the Asia Development Bank

ADB has been supporting a range of anti-trafficking awareness raising and vulnerability reduction components in their projects. Many transport sector projects includes the HIV/AIDS prevention and anti-human trafficking component.

The Road Connectivity Sector Project in Nepal
The Roads Connectivity Sector Project in Nepal, which was approved in August 2006, aimed to improve rural transport connectivity to major towns and cities and to stimulate economic growth and reduce poverty in northern Nepal. The expected expansion in economic activities, trade, involvement of people in the construction phase, travel and night halts along the road and the behaviors engaged in during mobility or migration have been identified as having the potential to increase opportunities for casual sex and the risk of HIV/AIDS and human trafficking. During the project preparation phase, the social assessment identified girls and women of the age groups 11-25 years old and boys of 6-12 years old as groups at risk to human trafficking as children from poor families were sent to work as 'domestic help' with the potential to be either trafficked or lured to work as sex workers.

HIV/AIDS and Human Trafficking Prevention Component
An HIV/AIDS and anti-trafficking component was prepared during the project design phase with the objective of providing anti-trafficking information to 90% of road construction workers, transport operators, female sex workers, labor migrants, populations living along the road corridors, and to the identified groups at risk that include girls and women of the age groups 11-25 years and boys of 6-12 years. Department of Roads (DOR) as an executive agency of the project were sensitized and trained on HIV/AIDS and anti-trafficking issues in order to improve its collaboration with other stakeholders to attain better results in the areas affected by the project. Key activities under the HIV/AIDS and anti-trafficking component include:

1. Partnering with NGOs to identify risk groups for HIV/AIDS and human trafficking, and to map geo-locations of sexual networks and intervention sites along the road corridors
2. Providing orientation and sensitization on HIV/AIDS and anti-trafficking to Project personnel
3. Requiring HIV/AIDS awareness raising workshops for contractors and construction workers
4. Conducting public awareness campaign for behavioral change of high-risk groups
5. Promoting condom use and disseminating information about the nearest available services for testing, counseling and treatment
6. Sensitizing and capacity building of Project personnel, including public awareness raising on trafficking concerns

A Social Development Specialist with expertise in HIV/AIDS and anti-trafficking issues provided the support to DOR for overall implementation and monitoring of the HIV/AIDS and anti-trafficking component. Gender sensitization trainings were provided to the DOR and NGOs with a particular focus on the issues of the transport sector. Building on lessons learned from this project, it is expected that HIV/AIDS and anti-trafficking issues will be integrated in future road projects in Nepal.

Source: The Asia Development Bank (http://www.adb.org/gender/practices/infrastructure/nep001.asp)

sex workers and illegal migrant workers) and educating on HIV/AIDS and sexually transmitted diseases.

- Migration: Raising awareness about human trafficking and informing about the risks and consequences of work abroad and their labor rights.

- Access to law and justice: The Access to Justice for the Poor strategies empowers the vulnerable people to assert, enforce and access their individual and property rights.[42] Most trafficking victims are not aware of their rights, and even if they know their rights, they are afraid of testifying against traffickers who might threaten and harass them and their family. The Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) points out two important components of access to justice for trafficked victims: the right to information and victim protection.[43] Trafficked persons should be well informed about their legal rights, options and services so that they can make informed decisions about their future. Victim protection measures need to be strengthened so that the victims and their families in trafficking cases feel safe to testify against traffickers.

The World Bank Contribution to Fighting Human Trafficking

Even though tremendous efforts have already been made at both national and international levels, the response systems to combat human trafficking are still not adequate for various reasons. Many challenges still remain to be addressed in order to close existing gaps and loopholes, such as data collection, legislation, training and capacity building among law enforcement authorities, and better prevention and protection of vulnerable groups at risk of human trafficking. The World Bank Group could contribute to the fight against human trafficking by scaling up its interventions in the following areas.

- *Monitoring and improving analyses*: Despite the general awareness about human trafficking, there have been only few extensive studies to analyze the patterns and causes of human trafficking in sending and destination countries. It is necessary to make more

systematic efforts to investigate and document human trafficking activities in each region so that we can closely monitor the trafficking situation and provide assistance and service to more targeted groups that are vulnerable to human trafficking at community level. Poverty assessments can be a critical tool to help identify and monitor the regions and social groups that are vulnerable to human trafficking. Social analyses and gender assessments can be also useful to address and identify issues and vulnerable groups and to recommend actions.

- *Advocacy during the policy dialogue:* The World Bank Group can play an important role in human trafficking by advocating for prevention during the policy dialogue with governments. Many times, prevention has to do with poverty reduction, improving social safety net, and strong outreach for groups at risk. There is much room to discuss trafficking prevention measures as a part of poverty and vulnerability reduction strategies in the World Bank's overall dialogue with governments.

- *Integrating an anti-human trafficking component into the World Bank's programs:* As a part of human trafficking prevention measures, it is important to enhance social protection and economic development programs for vulnerable groups. An anti-trafficking component could be incorporated in various programs, particularly Social and Human Development Sector programs in the World Bank, which deals with employment, education, health, labor, and migration.

- *Strengthening regional work on migration, labor, trade and transport:* Human trafficking undermines development efforts and economical growth. Targeted action against human trafficking should be taken and aligned with poverty reduction strategies and development programs. Considering the nature of human trafficking, the World Bank could adopt the anti-trafficking lens in their regional work particularly on migration, trade, and transport.

Recommended Readings:

- Ahluwalia, Sheela (2009). *Human Trafficking and Gender in Sub-Saharan Africa*. Internal Draft. Washington, DC: The World Bank.

- Clert, Carine, Elizabeth Gomart with Ivana Aleksic and Natalia Otel (2005). "Human Trafficking in South Eastern Europe: Beyond Crime Control, an Agenda for Social Inclusion and Development." *Social Development Papers – Conflict Prevention and Reconstruction Occasional Paper*. Washington, DC. The World Bank.

- International Labour Organization (ILO) (2009). *The Cost of Coercion*. Geneva: ILO. http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---relconf/documents/meetingdocument/wcms_106230.pdf

- ILO (2005). *A Global Alliance against Forced Labor*. Geneva: ILO. http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/relm/ilc/ilc93/pdf/rep-i-b.pdf

- ILO and the United Nations Children's Fund (2009). *Training Manual to Fight Trafficking in Children for Labour, Sexual and Other Forms of Exploitation*. Geneva: ILO. http://www.ilo.org/ipec/areas/Traffickingofchildren/lang--en/WCMS_111537/index.htm

- Koettl, Johannes (2009). "Human Trafficking, Modern Day Slavery, and Economic Exploitation." *Social Protection Discussion Paper*. Washington, DC. The World Bank. http://go.worldbank.org/3G952TICB0

- Perez Solla, M. Fernanda (2009). "Slavery and human trafficking international law and the role of the World Bank." *Social Protection Discussion Paper*. Washington, DC. The World Bank. http://go.worldbank.org/RLT3SQR7H0

- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) (2008). *Human Trafficking: An Overview*. Vienna, Austria. UNODC. http://www.ungift.org/docs/ungift/pdf/knowledge/ebook.pdf

- UNODC (2009). *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*. Vienna: UNODC. http://www.unodc.org/documents/Global_Report_on_TIP.pdf

- UNODC (2009). *Anti-human Trafficking Manual for Criminal Justice Practitioners*. Vienna: UNODC. http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/anti-human-trafficking-manual.html

- The United States Department of State (2009). *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009*. Washington, DC. The United States Department of State. http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2009/

- The United States Government Accountability Office (GAO) (2006). *Human Trafficking. Better Data, Strategy, and Reporting Needed to Enhance U.S. Antitrafficking Efforts Abroad*. Washington, DC: GAO. http://www.gao.gov/new.items/d06825.pdf

Recommended Websites:

- The Asian Development Bank: http://www.adb.org/Human-Trafficking/default.asp

- The International Labour Organization: http://www.ilo.org/global/Themes/Forced_Labour/lang--en/index.htm

- The International Organization for Migration: http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/op/edit/pid/748

- The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR): http://www2.ohchr.org/english/issues/trafficking/

- The Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, the United States Department of State: http://www.state.gov/g/tip/

- The Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe: http://www.osce.org/cthb

- The United Nations Children's Fund: http://www.unicef.org/protection/index.html

- The United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking: http://www.ungift.org/ungift/index.html

- The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime: https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/index.html

[1] See ILO (2009), The Cost of Coercion.

[2] Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, General Assembly resolution 55/25, annex II, p.32. http://www.unodc.org/pdf/crime/a_res_55/res5525e.pdf. Since December 25, 2003 when the Protocol entered into force, 117 countries have signed and 132 countries have ratified the Protocol as of September 10, 2009.

[3] The United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, General Assembly resolution 55/25. http://www.unodc.org/pdf/crime/a_res_55/res5525e.pdf

[4] See UNODC (2009), *Anti-Human Trafficking Manual for Criminal Justice Practitioners*, Module 1, p.4.

[5] See Perez Solla, M. Fernanda (2009).

[6] See ILO (2009), *The Cost of Coercion*.

[7] More information on the question of consent, see Perez Solla, M. Fernanda (2009) and Koettl, Johannes (2009).

[8] See the United States Department of State (2009), p. 13.

[9] The Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, General Assembly resolution 55/25, annex III, p.41. http://www.unodc.org/pdf/crime/a_res_55/res5525e.pdf

[10] See UNODC (2009), *Anti-Human Trafficking Manual for Criminal Justice Practitioners*, Module 1.

[11] See GAO (2006), p.12.

[12] For a detailed discussion on methodologies used by four organizations to collect data on human trafficking, see GAO (2006), p.44-45.

[13] See UNODC (2009), *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*.

[14] See ILO (2009), *The Cost of Coercion*, p.13-14.

[15] See UNODC (2008).

[16] See ILO (2005), p.55.

[17] See the regional breakdown according ILO's Key Indicator of the Labour Market, p.38-40. http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_081913.pdf

[18] See ILO (2009), *The Cost of Coercion*, p.13-14.

[19] For a detailed discussion on trafficker profiles, see ILO and UNICEF (2009).

[20] The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (2002). *Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking*, E/2002/68/Add.1. http://www.unhchr.ch/huridocda/huridoca.nsf/e06a5300f90fa0238025668700518ca4/caf3deb2b05d4f35c1256bf30051a003/$FILE/N0240168.pdf

[21] http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/about-migration/managing-migration/cache/offonce/pid/676

[22] http://www.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/fact_sex.pdf

[23] See Clert, Carine, Elizabeth Gomart with Ivana Aleksic and Natalia Otel (2005).

[24] UNODC (2009), *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*, p.51.

[25] http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/cache/offonce/pid/1674?entryId=20571

[26] See Table 3 on this note.

[27] The Child Soldiers Global Report 2008. http://www.childsoldiersglobalreport.org/ These 19 countries include: Afghanistan, Burundi, Central African Republic, Chad, Colombia, Côte d'Ivoire, the DRC, India, Indonesia, Iraq, Israel and the Occupied Palestinian Territory, Myanmar, Nepal, Philippines, Somalia, Sri Lanka, Sudan, Thailand and Uganda.

[28] See UNODC (2009), *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons*.

[29] See the United States Department of State (2009), p.13.

[30] This can be explained by the legislative provisions in many countries, which only cover child trafficking.

[31] During 2003-2007, most countries in East Asia and the Pacific only had legislation criminalizing trafficking for sexual exploitation or trafficking in women so that trafficking in men and boys might have been largely under-reported.

[32] Multilateral Development Banks refers to the World Bank Groups and four Regional Development Banks that include the African Development Bank, the Asian Development Bank, the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, and the Inter-American Development Bank Group.

[33] http://www.interpol.int/Public/ICPO/PressReleases/PR2009/PR200909.asp

[34] http://www.colomboprocess.org/

[35] There are other 'plus' risk factors that affect vulnerability of people to human trafficking, which are not covered in this note.

[36] See ILO and UNICEF (2009), Textbook 1, p23.

[37] See UNODC (2008).

[38] See ILO and UNICEF (2009), Textbook 1.

[39] Nelson, Sue, Jeannine Guthrie and Pamela Sumner Coffey (2004). *Literature Review and Analysis Related to Human Trafficking in Post-Conflict Situations*. Washington, DC. United States Agency for International Development. http://www.usaid.gov/our_work/cross-cutting_programs/wid/pubs/trafficking_dai_lit_review.pdf

[40] See Clert, Carine, Elizabeth Gomart with Ivana Aleksic and Natalia Otel (2005), p.27.

[41] See Ahluwalia, Sheela (2009).

[42] http://go.worldbank.org/MHG1Y94BM0

[43] http://www.gaatw.org/atj/