

EPA-462

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:45 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full Doc\RTC old intro section\Introduction\_DBC.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction\_DBC.doc

EPA-463

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/21/2009 01:36 PM

To Lesley Jantarasami  
cc Ben DeAngelo  
bcc  
Subject Re: intro

Lesley:

Attached please find the draft intro with a few suggestions included. (b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

Please don't hesitate to stop by or call if there's anything I can clarify or if I can help out with any additional sections.

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction\_DBC.doc

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

---

Lesley Jantarasami Hey David, Here's the Introduction... 08/20/2009 11:14:51 AM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/20/2009 11:14 AM  
Subject: intro

Hey David,

Here's the Introduction draft I wrote, just to give you an idea of where we're starting from. Please let me know your ideas on what to add! (b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted] Would you have time next week to proofread?

Thanks so much!

Lesley

EPA-EF-000647

PS--when and where is the softball game tonight? maybe I'll stop by to cheer you guys on

[attachment "Introduction.doc" deleted by David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US]

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-464

"Mae Thomas"  
<Mae.Thomas@erg.com>  
08/21/2009 01:47 PM

To William Perkins  
cc "Mae Thomas", "Tracy Parham"  
bcc  
Subject Re: PDF list of the 100 comments

Hi Bill, attached is a list of parsed comments and where they ended up being located.

(b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Call if you would like to talk. 919-632-0581.

Thanks  
Mae

>>> <Perkins.William@epamail.epa.gov> 08/21/09 10:03 AM >>>  
Mae,

Thank you.

Cheers,

Bill

EPA-EF-000649

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) (b)(6)

From: "Mae Thomas" <Mae.Thomas@erg.com>  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "Tracy Parham" <Tracy.Parham@erg.com>  
Cc: "Mae Thomas" <Mae.Thomas@erg.com>  
Date: 08/21/2009 10:00 AM  
Subject: Re: PDF list of the 100 comments

Hi Bill, I don't think we have (b)(5) Deliberative

Thanks  
Mae

>>> <Perkins.William@epamail.epa.gov> 08/20/09 5:46 PM >>>

Tracy,

(b)(5) Deliberative

Thank you very much and I hope that all is well.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000650

(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) (b)(6)

(b)(5) Deliberative

Parsed 8-20-09.pdf

EPA-465

Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US

To Marcus Sarofim

08/21/2009 01:53 PM

cc

bcc

Subject Re: Comment/Response Estimate

Ok, thanks Marcus!!

(b)(5) Deliberative

Marcus Sarofim

Hi Ben, Estimated completion date:

08/21/2009 01:50:41 PM

From: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 01:50 PM  
Subject: Comment/Response Estimate

---

Hi Ben,

Estimated completion date:

(b)(5) Deliberative

-Marcus

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD  
phone: 202-343-9993  
fax: 202-343-2202  
1310 L Street 256C  
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow  
with the EPA Climate Division

EPA-EF-000652

EPA-466

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:45 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full Doc\RTC old intro section\Introduction BJD 082109.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction BJD 082109.doc

EPA-EF-000653



EPA-467

**Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/21/2009 04:17 PM

To Lesley Jantarasami  
cc Rona Birnbaum  
bcc

Subject working draft of intro for Response to Public Comment doc

Here's the working draft we worked on... (b)(5) Deliberative .

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction BJD 082109.doc

EPA-468

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/21/2009 05:18 PM

To Lesley Jantarasami  
cc  
bcc  
Subject Re: intro

[Redacted] (b)(6)  
:

Believe it or not we just got back into the building after an emergency evacuation. I hear there was a real fire in EPA East. We stood outside forever- then the thunderstorm came and we had to take shelter in the Reagan Building.

Bottom line- We are doing our best, but we may not be able to get the update to you until Monday morning.

I should be able to get rough real numbers by Monday afternoon but they'll change somewhat between now and when we go final so we'll need to remember to update them once more down the road.

Cheers,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

Lesley Jantarasami [Whoa, a fire, really? What happened?](#) (b)(5) Deliberative 08/21/2009 05:08:57 PM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 05:08 PM  
Subject: Re: intro

[Whoa, a fire, really? What happened?](#) [Redacted] (b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

Thanks,

Lesley

David Chalmers [Thanks Lesley, that's good news.](#) (b)(5) Deliberative 08/21/2009 05:02:18 PM

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 05:02 PM

EPA-EF-000655

Subject: Re: intro

---

Thanks Lesley, that's good news. (b)(5) Deliberative There was a fire EPA east that caused an evacuation so the docket office can't get me an updated spreadsheet until Monday but I could do a quick analysis then.

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

Lesley Jantarasami Hi David, (b)(5) Deliberative 08/21/2009 04:56:27 PM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 04:56 PM  
Subject: Re: intro

---

Hi David,

(b)(5) Deliberative

Thanks for collecting and summarizing the information about them!

Lesley

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

David Chalmers Lesley: Attached please find the draft intro with... 08/21/2009 01:36:03 PM

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 01:36 PM  
Subject: Re: intro

---

Lesley:

Attached please find the draft intro with a few suggestions included. (b)(5) Deliberative

EPA-EF-000656

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Please don't hesitate to stop by or call if there's anything I can clarify or if I can help out with any additional sections.

[attachment "Introduction\_DBC.doc" deleted by Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US]

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

Lesley Jantarasami

Hey David, Here's the Introduction draft I wrote,...

08/20/2009 11:14:51 AM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/20/2009 11:14 AM  
Subject: intro

Hey David,

Here's the Introduction draft I wrote, just to give you an idea of where we're starting from. Please let me know your ideas on what to add! (b)(5) Deliberative  
Would you have time next week to proofread?

Thanks so much!

Lesley

PS--when and where is the softball game tonight? maybe I'll stop by to cheer you guys on

[attachment "Introduction.doc" deleted by David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US]

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000657

EPA-469

Lesley  
Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
08/21/2009 05:33 PM

To: David Chalmers  
cc  
bcc  
Subject: Re: intro

David,

Sure thing, (b)(5) Deliberative

Thanks again,

Lesley

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction LCJ 082109.doc

David Chalmers

Thanks, Lesley, (b)(5) Deliberative

08/21/2009 05:05:38 PM

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 05:05 PM  
Subject: Re: intro

Thanks, Lesley, (b)(5) Deliberative

Thanks and have a great weekend.

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

Lesley Jantarasami

David, This is great - (b)(5) Deliberative

08/21/2009 04:50:34 PM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 04:50 PM  
Subject: Re: intro

David,

This is great - (b)(5) Deliberative

EPA-EF-000658

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Have a great weekend,

Lesley

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

David Chalmers

Lesley: Attached please find the draft intro with...

08/21/2009 01:36:03 PM

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/21/2009 01:36 PM  
Subject: Re: intro

Lesley:

Attached please find the draft intro with a few suggestions included. (b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Please don't hesitate to stop by or call if there's anything I can clarify or if I can help out with any additional sections.

[attachment "Introduction\_DBC.doc" deleted by Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US]

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division

EPA-EF-000659

202.343.9814

Lesley Jantarasami

Hey David, Here's the Introduction draft I wrote,...

08/20/2009 11:14:51 AM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/20/2009 11:14 AM  
Subject: intro

---

Hey David,

Here's the Introduction draft I wrote, just to give you an idea of where we're starting from. Please let me know your ideas on what to add! [REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative

[REDACTED] Would you have time next week to proofread?

Thanks so much!

Lesley

PS--when and where is the softball game tonight? maybe I'll stop by to cheer you guys on

[attachment "Introduction.doc" deleted by David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US]

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-470

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:45 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full Doc\RTC old intro section\Introduction LCJ 082109.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction LCJ 082109.doc

EPA-EF-000661



EPA-472

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:45 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full Doc\RTC old intro section\Introduction LCJ 082409.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction LCJ 082409.doc

EPA-474

**Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US** To Lesley Jantarasami  
08/24/2009 03:58 PM cc David Chalmers  
bcc  
Subject Re: latest draft Intro

Thanks Lesley! That works for me.

Lesley Jantarasami Hello Ben, Here is the latest draft of... 08/24/2009 03:52:56 PM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/24/2009 03:52 PM  
Subject: latest draft Intro

---

Hello Ben,

Here is the latest draft of the Introduction to the Response to Comments document. (b)(5) Deliberative

[REDACTED]. Does that work for everyone?

Thanks!

Lesley

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction LCJ 082409.doc

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000663

EPA-475

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:45 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full Doc\RTC old intro section\mass mail text update.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

mass mail text update.doc

EPA-476

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/24/2009 04:18 PM

To Lesley Jantasami  
cc Ben DeAngelo  
bcc  
Subject Re: latest draft Intro

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

mass mail text update.doc

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

Lesley Jantasami Hello Ben, Here is the latest draft of... 08/24/2009 03:52:56 PM

From: Lesley Jantasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/24/2009 03:52 PM  
Subject: latest draft Intro

Hello Ben,

Here is the latest draft of the Introduction to the Response to Comments document. (b)(5) Deliberative

Does that work for everyone?

Thanks!

Lesley

[attachment "Introduction LCJ 082409.doc" deleted by David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US]

Lesley Jantasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)

EPA-EF-000665

Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-477

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:43 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My  
Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full  
Doc\05\_Outline\CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082409.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082409.doc

EPA-EF-000667

EPA-478

Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US

To Ben DeAngelo

08/24/2009 06:15 PM

cc Anne Grambsch, Bryan Hubbell, Carey Jang, Chris Weaver, Darrell Winner, Doug Grano, Erika Sasser, Larry Wallace, Marcus Sarofim, Michael Kolian, Pat Dolwick, Phil Lorang, Rona Birnbaum, Sara Terry

bcc

Subject Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

Quick clarification..

(b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative

Ben DeAngelo

Thanks all for these responses. I think (b)(5) Deliberative

08/24/2009 03:44:41 PM

From: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/24/2009 03:44 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

Thanks all for these responses. I think (b)(5) Deliberative

Primarily for Darrell and Doug,

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative

I think by the end of this week I want to have a good sense of what our responses are to all major comments, and see if over the next two weeks major progress to updating the TSD can also be made.

Thanks!!

-Ben

Chris Weaver Thanks, Doug. A couple quick comments from m... 08/19/2009 05:22:56 PM

From: Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/19/2009 05:22 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

---

Thanks, Doug. A couple quick comments from me ...  
-Chris

(b)(5) Deliberative

Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 19b weaver comments.doc

-----  
Christopher P. Weaver, Ph.D.  
Global Change Research Program

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Center for Environmental Assessment

Tel: +1 703 347 8621  
Fax: +1 703 347 8694  
Email: weaver.chris@epa.gov

Mailing address:  
US EPA (8601-P)  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave.  
Washington, DC 20460

Doug Grano Here is a revised version based on comments to... 08/19/2009 12:11:15 PM

From: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/19/2009 12:11 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

---

Here is a revised version based on comments today from Pat and Erika/Beth.  
--Doug

[attachment "Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 19b.doc" deleted by Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-EF-000669



---

All--

I've accepted the changes from the 8-13 document and made a few new changes. The changes focus  
(b)(5) Deliberative

--Doug

Sara Terry

I've made some comments (b)(5) Deliberative

08/13/2009 12:40:00 PM

From: Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US  
To: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/13/2009 12:40 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

---

I've made some comments (b)(5) Deliberative . Here is our revision so far.  
(b)(5) Deliberative

[attachment "Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 13.doc" deleted by Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US]

Thanks,  
Sara

Doug Grano

Here's a start. Please review and send addition...

08/10/2009 05:09:01 PM

From: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/10/2009 05:09 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

---

Here's a start. Please review and send additions and edits.  
--Doug

[attachment "AQ responses dg8-10.doc" deleted by Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US]

EPA-479

**Ben DeAngelo**  
04/06/2010 04:56 PM

To  
cc  
bcc  
Subject UPGOAD C:\Documents and Settings\owner\My Documents\Endangerment\Response to Public Comments\Introduction LCJ 082409.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction LCJ 082409.doc

EPA-EF-000671

EPA-480

Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US To Marcus Sarofim  
08/25/2009 12:35 PM cc  
bcc  
Subject Re: wildfires

Marcus,  
Just to give you an idea, here is my approach to Forestry. (b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative

Forestry comment summary 8\_25\_09 merge.doc

Marcus Sarofim (b)(5) Deliberative 08/25/2009 12:00:24 PM

From: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/25/2009 12:00 PM  
Subject: Re: wildfires

(b)(5) Deliberative

-Marcus

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD  
phone: 202-343-9993  
fax: 202-343-2202  
1310 L Street 256C  
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow  
with the EPA Climate Division

Michael Kolian Excellent. (b)(5) Deliberative ... 08/25/2009 11:55:59 AM

From: Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/25/2009 11:55 AM  
Subject: Re: wildfires

Excellent. (b)(5) Deliberative

Marcus Sarofim (b)(5) Deliberative 08/25/2009 11:44:00 AM

From: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Mike Kolian <kolian.michael@epa.gov>  
Date: 08/25/2009 11:44 AM  
Subject: wildfires

(b)(5) Deliberative

EPA-EF-000672

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD  
phone: 202-343-9993  
fax: 202-343-2202  
1310 L Street 256C  
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow  
with the EPA Climate Division

EPA-481

**Rona  
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/25/2009 01:01 PM

To Ben DeAngelo, Jason Samenow, Marcus Sarofim, William  
Perkins  
cc  
bcc  
Subject Rvw Ref. Break-out

**Meeting**

Date 08/31/2009

Time 03:00:00 PM to 04:00:00 PM

Chair Rona Birnbaum

Invitees

Required Ben DeAngelo; Jason Samenow; Marcus Sarofim; William Perkins

Optional

FYI

Location

This Friday, Bill indicates that (b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

EPA-482

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:43 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My  
Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full  
Doc\05\_Outline\CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509.doc

EPA-EF-000675

EPA-483

**Lesley**  
**Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/25/2009 02:00 PM

To Ben DeAngelo  
cc  
bcc  
Subject Outline

(b)(5) Del berative

CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509.doc

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000676

EPA-484

**Doug Grano**

03/24/2010 11:34 AM

To

cc

bcc

Subject UPGLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\dgrano\My Documents\WP\Climate\Rulemaking\Endangerment\Comment-response\RTC-ICAP resp

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC-ICAP resp



EPA-485

**Doug Grano**

03/24/2010 11:34 AM

To

cc

bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\dgrano\My Documents\WP\Climate\Rulemaking\Endangerment\Comment-response\RTC-comments 8-10

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC-comments 8-10

EPA-EF-000678

EPA-486

**Ben DeAngelo**  
04/06/2010 04:56 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\owner\My  
Documents\Endangerment\Response to Public  
Comments\CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509 bjd.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509 bjd.doc

EPA-487

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:43 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My  
Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full  
Doc\05\_Outline\CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509  
bjd.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509 bjd.doc

EPA-EF-000680

EPA-488

**Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US**

08/25/2009 03:51 PM

To Rona Birnbaum, Carol Holmes, John Hannon

cc Lesley Jantarasami, Jason Samenow, Jeremy Martinich, Bill Perkins, Marcus Sarofim, Mike Kolian, David Chalmers

bcc

Subject Revised outline for Response to Public Comments doc

Team,

Lesley and I re-hashed another outline for this Doc.

(b)(5) Deliberative

Please have a close look.

May require a brief call to walk through and clarify some items.

(b)(5) Deliberative

Thanks!

-Ben and Lesley

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509 bjd.doc

Benjamin J. DeAngelo  
Climate Change Division, Office of Atmospheric Programs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW (6207J)  
Washington, DC 20460

Tel: +1 202-343-9107  
Fax: +1 202-343-2202  
deangelo.ben@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000681

EPA-489

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:45 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full Doc\RTC old intro section\mass mail text for intro.25aug09.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

mass mail text for intro.25aug09.doc

EPA-490

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/25/2009 04:58 PM

To Ben DeAngelo, Lesley Jantarasami  
cc Rona Birnbaum, Jeremy Martinich, William Perkins  
bcc  
Subject updated mass mail text

Ben and Lesley:

The docket office got back to me this afternoon with updated numbers on the mass mail campaigns. Attached please find a spreadsheet with the numbers broken down and revised text for the intro.

A couple of things to note:

- (b)(5) Deliberative [Redacted]
- [Redacted]
- [Redacted]
- [Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

MM breakdown\_25AUG09.xls mass mail text for intro.25aug09.doc

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-491

**Marcus Sarofim**  
04/01/2010 08:02 PM

To  
cc  
bcc  
Subject UPGLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\msarofim\My Documents\WorkFolder\Tsd\_Anpr\ResponseToComments\ResponseDraft.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

ResponseDraft.doc

EPA-492

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/25/2009 05:29 PM

To Ben DeAngelo, Lesley Jantarasami  
cc Marcus Sarofim  
bcc

Subject correction for MM analysis

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

MM breakdown\_25AUG09.xls mass mail text for intro.25aug09.doc

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-EF-000685



EPA-493

Rona  
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US  
08/25/2009 05:35 PM

To David Chalmers  
cc Ben DeAngelo, Jeremy Martinich, Lesley Jantarasami,  
William Perkins  
bcc  
Subject Re: updated mass mail text

(b)(5) Deliberative

Rona

David Chalmers Ben and Lesley: The docket office got... 08/25/2009 04:58:56 PM

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/25/2009 04:58 PM  
Subject: updated mass mail text

Ben and Lesley:

The docket office got back to me this afternoon with updated numbers on the mass mail campaigns. Attached please find a spreadsheet with the numbers broken down and revised text for the intro.

A couple of things to note:

- (b)(5) Deliberative

[attachment "MM breakdown\_25AUG09.xls" deleted by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US] [attachment "mass mail text for intro.25aug09.doc" deleted by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US]

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-EF-000686

EPA-494

**Rona  
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/25/2009 06:00 PM

To Dina Kruger  
cc  
bcc  
Subject Fw: EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171 -- Supplemental Chamber  
Filing in the Endangerment Docket

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 08/25/2009 06:00 PM -----

From: ghgendangerment  
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/25/2009 04:20 PM  
Subject: Fw: EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171 -- Supplemental Chamber Filing in the Endangerment Docket

---

FYI

----- Forwarded by David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US on 08/25/2009 04:17 PM -----

From: "Jeffrey Clark" <jclark@kirkland.com>  
To: GHG-Endangerment-Docket@EPA, GHG-Endangerment-Docket@epa.gov  
<GHG0xL129zEndangerment-Docket@epa.gov>, ghgendangerment@EPA  
Cc: Bercenia Johnson/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Akram  
Assem/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, "William Burgess" <wburgess@kirkland.com>  
Date: 08/25/2009 03:58 PM  
Subject: EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171 -- Supplemental Chamber Filing in the Endangerment Docket

---

Dear EPA Officials:

Attached is a supplement to the Chamber's petition for an on-the-record hearing.

Given the problem with the incorrect e-mail address as published in the Federal Register, out of an abundance of caution, we are e-mailing this to the three addresses above, as well as to you individually. This is the same process we pursued for the filing of the petition in June 2009.

Please confirm receipt and thereby confirm that this supplement will be placed into the docket for the proposed endangerment finding, 74 Fed. Reg. 18,886 (Apr. 24, 2009).

Thank you for your attention and consideration. If you have any questions, I would be happy to assist you by telephone or however you require.

-- Jeff Clark

Jeffrey Bossert Clark | Partner | Kirkland & Ellis LLP  
655 Fifteenth Street, N.W. | Washington, DC 20005  
Tel: 202-879-5960 | Mobile: 571-438-8317  
Firm's Fax: 202-879-5200 | Desk Computer Fax: 202-654-9470

\*\*\*\*\*  
The information contained in this communication is

EPA-EF-000687

confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of Kirkland & Ellis LLP or Kirkland & Ellis International LLP. Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [postmaster@kirkland.com](mailto:postmaster@kirkland.com), and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments.

\*\*\*\*\*



- USCOC Supplemental Petition on Endangerment.pdf

Available at  
[www.regulations.gov](http://www.regulations.gov)  
EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171

EPA-495

**Doug Grano**

03/24/2010 11:33 AM

To

cc

bcc

Subject UPGLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\dgrano\My Documents\WP\Climate\Rulemaking\Endangerment\Comment-response\Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 24.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 24.doc

EPA-EF-000689

EPA-496

**Doug Grano**

03/24/2010 11:34 AM

To

cc

bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\dgrano\My Documents\WP\Climate\Rulemaking\Endangerment\Comment-response\RTC AQ 8-25.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

██████████ RTC AQ 8-25.doc

EPA-497

**David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/26/2009 09:15 AM

To Jeremy Martinich  
cc Rona Birnbaum  
bcc  
Subject the mining comments

FYI, [REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] Assem will keep me posted.

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-498

**Akram Assem/DC/USEPA/US**

08/26/2009 10:47 AM

To Robert Johnston, Carolyn Scully, Dawn Roddy, Lorraine Reddick, David Chalmers, Isabel DeLuca, Jeremy Martinich, Jim Caldwell, David Dickinson, Carole Cook, Suzanne Kocchi, Peter Wendolkowski, Lee Carothers, Margaret Reidy, assem.akram, Carole Cook, Katherine Sibold, Spencer Clark, William Perkins, Jennifer.ONeil

cc

bcc

Subject Docket Center Activities Overview 8.26.2009.pdf

Good morning -  
Please find attached today's Overview.  
Thanks.  
Assem

-----  
Assem Akram  
USEPA Docket Center  
Records Information Manager IV  
ASRC Management Services-Contractor  
Phone: (202) 566-9555  
Email: assem.akram@epa.gov



(b)(5) Deliberative

Docket Center Activities Overview 8.26.2009.pdf

EPA-499

**William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/26/2009 11:55 AM

To Mae Thomas  
cc  
bcc

Subject Fw: OAR-2009-0171 Copyrighted files from comments received in August

Mae,

I think this should cover all of the copyrighted docs that have been received (perhaps with a bit of overlap from the last batch we sent). Please let me know if you guys find anything else by way of copyright docs that we have not sent. Thank you!

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) (b)(6)

----- Forwarded by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US on 08/26/2009 11:54 AM -----

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/26/2009 11:51 AM  
Subject: Fw: OAR-2009-0171 Copyrighted files from comments received in August

---

I believe this should cover everything since the last CD, perhaps with a bit of overlap. But if ERG comes upon anything we haven't yet sent to them, let me know.

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

----- Forwarded by David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US on 08/26/2009 11:50 AM -----

From: Akram Assem/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/26/2009 11:46 AM  
Subject: OAR-2009-0171 Copyrighted files from comments received in August

---

Hi , David,  
Attached are copyrighted files from comments received during August for OAR-2009-0171.  
Thanks.  
Assem

EPA-EF-000693



The message is ready to be sent with the following file or link attachments:







OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11519 comment by B. Allen, Green Bubbles Bursting, Alex Alexiev  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11526 comment by B. Allen The Top of the World  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11531 comment by B. Allen Global Cooling Earths Little-Known Threat  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11536 comment by B. Allen Pondering Problems with Computer Climate Models  
OAD-2009-0171 B. Allen Dr Leonard Weinstein  
OAD-2009-0171-draft-11528.1 L.Yarbrough 1  
OAD-2009-0171-draft-11528.3 L.Yarbrough 3  
OAD-2009-0171-draft-11528.4 L.Yarbrough 4  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11528.5 L. Yarbrough LATEST WRONG TROUSERS  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11534.1 B.Allen Bound to Burn  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11550.1 comment atch by Clean CEMP Engineering  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11538.1 B. Allen Wind Power  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-8214.2 D.T.Avery Unstoppable Global Warming  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-8215.1 M. Czerniak , Edwards Has the Challenge of PFCs Really Been Solved  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-3593.1 Escaling Ice Loss Found in Antarctica  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-9409.1 M Wilkinson-IPCC GRAPHS  
OAD-2009-0171-DRAFT-11581.1 E. Samsel

Note: To protect against computer viruses, e-mail programs may prevent sending or receiving certain types of file attachments. Check your e-mail security settings to determine how attachments are handled.

-----  
Assem Akram  
USEPA Docket Center  
Records Information Manager IV  
ASRC Management Services-Contractor  
Phone: (202) 566-9555  
Email: assem.akram@epa.gov



The responsive records include several copyrighted works. These are available for inspection at the EPA Docket Office under Docket ID# EPA-HQ-OAR-2009-0171.

-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11519 comment by B. Allen, Green Bubbles Bursting, Alex Alexiev.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11526 comment by B. Allen The Top of the World.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11531 comment by B. Allen Global Cooling Earths Little-Known Threat.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11536 comment by B. Allen Pondering Problems with Computer Climate Models.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171 B. Allen Dr Leonard Weinstein.pdf
-  - OAR-2009-0171-draft-11528.1 L.Yarbrough 1.pdf

- █ - OAR-2009-0171-draft-11528.3 L.Yarbrough 3.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-draft-11528.4 L.Yarbrough 4.txt
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11528.5 L. Yarbrough LATEST WRONG TROUSERS.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11534.1 B.Allen Bound to Burn.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11550.1 commt atch by Clean CEMP Engineering.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11538.1 B. Allen Wind Power.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-8214.2 D.T.Avery Unstoppable Global Warming.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-8215.1 M. Czerniak , Edwards Has the Challenge of PFCs Really Been Solved.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-3593.1 Escaling Ice Loss Found in Antarctica.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-9409.1 M Wilkinson-IPCC GRAPHS.pdf
- █ - OAR-2009-0171-DRAFT-11581.1 E. Samsel.pdf

EPA-500

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:45 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full Doc\RTC old intro section\mass mail text for intro.26aug09.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

mass mail text for intro.26aug09.doc

EPA-501

Lesley  
Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
08/26/2009 01:01 PM

To Ben DeAngelo  
cc David Chalmers  
bcc  
Subject Fw: final MM text

Hi Ben,

Are you still working on the draft of the Introduction, or is Rona reviewing it? David just sent an updated version of the mass mailers section (attached), so we should include this text in the version for Dina. I'm happy to make any other edits and changes based on comments from Rona, just let me know.

Thanks!

Lesley

----- Forwarded by Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US on 08/26/2009 12:50 PM -----

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/26/2009 12:14 PM  
Subject: final MM text

---

Hi Lesley,

I'm not sure how soon we plan on getting a draft intro to Rona or Dina (if we haven't already), but I wanted to pass along this final-for-now mass mail text with Marcus's suggestions incorporated. I understand from Bill that Dina tends to take an interest in the big-picture numbers so want to be sure that the numbers we pass along are fully accurate.

(b)(5) Deliberative

mass mail text for intro.26aug09.doc

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-EF-000697

EPA-502

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/26/2009 02:36 PM

To Jeremy Martinich  
cc  
bcc  
Subject water resources

Attached are draft responses. I've included several highlighted notes about potential changes to the TSD, areas for clarification etc.

I hope these are helpful and am happy to make any edits you have. Please let me know if there's anything I can clarify and/or that should be further fleshed out.

(b)(5) Deliberative

2.7.12--Water Resources.doc

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-EF-000698

EPA-503

**Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US** To Lesley Jantarasami  
08/26/2009 02:37 PM cc David Chalmers  
bcc  
Subject Re: Fw: final MM text

Hi, going through the intro now and will include this new text. Thanks!

Lesley Jantarasami Hi Ben, Are you still working on the... 08/26/2009 01:01:10 PM

From: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/26/2009 01:01 PM  
Subject: Fw: final MM text

Hi Ben,

Are you still working on the draft of the Introduction, or is Rona reviewing it? David just sent an updated version of the mass mailers section (attached), so we should include this text in the version for Dina. I'm happy to make any other edits and changes based on comments from Rona, just let me know.

Thanks!

Lesley

----- Forwarded by Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US on 08/26/2009 12:50 PM -----

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/26/2009 12:14 PM  
Subject: final MM text

Hi Lesley,

I'm not sure how soon we plan on getting a draft intro to Rona or Dina (if we haven't already), but I wanted to pass along this final-for-now mass mail text with Marcus's suggestions incorporated. I understand from Bill that Dina tends to take an interest in the big-picture numbers so want to be sure that the numbers we pass along are fully accurate.

[attachment "mass mail text for intro.26aug09.doc" deleted by Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US]

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-EF-000699

EPA-504

**Ben DeAngelo**  
04/06/2010 04:56 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGLOAD C:\Documents and Settings\owner\My Documents\Endangerment\Response to Public Comments\mass mail text for intro.26aug09.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

mass mail text for intro.26aug09.doc

EPA-505

William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US  
08/26/2009 02:59 PM

To Ben DeAngelo, Lesley Jantarasami  
cc  
bcc  
Subject Re: Revised outline for Response to Public Comments doc

Ben and Lesley,

From my perspective, [redacted] (b)(5) Deliberative  
[redacted] Thank you for putting this together  
for us.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) [redacted] (b)(6)

Ben DeAngelo Team, Lesley and I re-hashed another... 08/25/2009 03:51:26 PM

From: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Carol Holmes/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, John Hannon/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bill Perkins <perkins.william@epa.gov>, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Mike Kolian <kolian.michael@epa.gov>, David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/25/2009 03:51 PM  
Subject: Revised outline for Response to Public Comments doc

Team,

Lesley and I re-hashed another outline for this Doc. [redacted] (b)(5) Deliberative  
[redacted] Please have a close look.  
May require a brief call to walk through and clarify some items. [redacted] (b)(5) Deliberative  
[redacted]

Thanks!

-Ben and Lesley

[attachment "CommentResponseOutline\_LCJ 082509 bjd.doc" deleted by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US]

Benjamin J. DeAngelo  
Climate Change Division, Office of Atmospheric Programs

EPA-EF-000701



U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW (6207J)  
Washington, DC 20460

Tel: +1 202-343-9107  
Fax: +1 202-343-2202  
deangelo.ben@epa.gov

EPA-506

Jason  
Samenow/DC/USEPA/US  
08/26/2009 04:50 PM

To William Perkins  
cc  
bcc

Subject Fw: need some comments moved... (use this one)

(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

that is it... sorry for the late additions.

Thanks so much.

Jason

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 08/26/2009 04:44 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/26/2009 04:43 PM  
Subject: Fw: need some comments moved....

also (b)(5) Deliberative [Redacted]

----- Forwarded by Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US on 08/26/2009 04:43 PM -----

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/26/2009 04:42 PM  
Subject: need some comments moved....

Many of the comments under 9.5.3 -- (b)(5) Deliberative [Redacted]

Here are my recommendations:

(b)(5) Deliberative [Redacted]

EPA-EF-000703

[REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative [REDACTED]

Thanks..

Jason

EPA-507

**Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US**

08/26/2009 04:54 PM

To Darrell Winner

cc

bcc

Subject Response to comments on AQ for Endangerment proposal

Darrell--

Here's what I've got so far--for discussion tomorrow.

--Doug

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC AQ 8-26.doc

EPA-EF-000705

EPA-509

**Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/26/2009 07:24 PM

To Rona Birnbaum, Lesley Jantarasami  
cc David Chalmers  
bcc

Subject Revised draft Intro of Response to Public Comments doc

Rona,

Here's our revised draft. (b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

-Ben

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction Response LCJ BJD 082609.doc

EPA-510

**Lesley Jantarasami**  
04/01/2010 03:43 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\ljantara\My  
Documents\Endangerment\01\_Full  
Doc\05\_Outline\CommentResponseOutline\_082709 lcj.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_082709 lcj.doc

EPA-EF-000707

EPA-511

**Lesley**  
**Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/27/2009 12:35 PM

To Rona Birnbaum, Ben DeAngelo  
cc  
bcc

Subject Outline for RTC doc

Hello Rona and Ben,

I streamlined and made edits to the headings of the RTC doc outline. Please let me know if you'd like me to make any more changes prior to your meeting with Dina.

Thanks,

Lesley

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_082709 lcj.doc

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000708

EPA-515

**Lesley**  
**Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/27/2009 01:15 PM

To Rona Birnbaum, Ben DeAngelo  
cc  
bcc  
Subject draft Intro for RTC doc

Hi Rona and Ben:

Here is the draft Intro with Ben's changes accepted and a few other changes I made based on what was discussed in the meeting today. Please let me know if you have other edits you'd like to see in the version that goes to Dina this afternoon.

Thanks,

Lesley

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction Response 082709 lcj.doc

Lesley Jantarasami  
Climate Change Division  
Climate Science & Impacts Branch  
202.343.9929  
202.343.2202 (fax)  
Jantarasami.Lesley@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000709



EPA-516

**Ben DeAngelo**

04/06/2010 04:56 PM

To

cc

bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\owner\My Documents\Endangerment\Response to Public Comments\Introduction Response LCJ BJD 082609.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Introduction Response LCJ BJD 082609.doc

EPA-EF-000710

EPA-517

**Rona  
Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/27/2009 03:19 PM

To Lesley Jantarasami  
cc  
bcc

Subject Fw: schedules (examples)

just examples from MRR for how to approach schedules...internal.

(b)(5) Deliberative

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 08/27/2009 03:19 PM -----

From: Suzanne Kocchi/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/27/2009 02:04 PM  
Subject: schedules

---

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

summer schedule v2.xls rulemaking schedule.xls Schedule\_Finalv2.xls

EPA-EF-000711

EPA-518

**Rona**  
**Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/27/2009 03:20 PM

To Lesley Jantarasami  
cc  
bcc  
Subject to be revised

Lets talk later this afternoon...  
Thanks!!

(b)(5) Deliberative

Endangerment Timeline\_Draft.doc

EPA-EF-000712

EPA-519

**Rona  
Birnbau/DC/USEPA/US**

08/27/2009 03:21 PM

To Lesley Jantarasami

cc

bcc

Subject docket date

(b)(5) Deliberative

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbau/DC/USEPA/US on 08/27/2009 03:21 PM -----

From: Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Rona Birnbau/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Isabel DeLuca/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/17/2009 09:20 AM  
Subject: Fw: GHG Endangerment

FYI, (b)(5) Deliberative

\*\*\*\*\*

Jeremy Martinich  
USEPA, Climate Change Division  
202-343-9871

----- Forwarded by Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US on 08/17/2009 09:14 AM -----

From: Robert Johnston/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Carolyn Scully/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/17/2009 09:09 AM  
Subject: GHG Endangerment

Hey Jeremy,

(b)(5) Deliberative

Let me know if you have any questions,.

Robert

---

Robert Johnston, Team Leader  
EPA Docket Center & Federal Docket Management System  
Office of Environmental Information  
US Environmental Protection Agency

EPA-EF-000713

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW MC2822T  
Washington, DC 20460  
202-566-1637  
johnston.robert@epa.gov

EPA-520

**Ben DeAngelo**

04/06/2010 04:56 PM

To

cc

bcc

Subject UPGRADE C:\Documents and Settings\owner\My Documents\Endangerment\Response to Public Comments\CommentResponseOutline\_082709 lcj.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_082709 lcj.doc

EPA-EF-000715

EPA-522

**Bryan Bloomer**  
03/31/2010 05:18 PM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPLOADED C:\Documents and  
Settings\bloomer\Desktop\GHGEndangermentFinding\SLF  
Responsive\RTC AQ 8-26 daw 0827.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC AQ 8-26 daw 0827.doc

EPA-523

Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US

To John Dawson, Bryan Bloomer

08/27/2009 04:35 PM

cc

bcc

Subject draft responses to comments on TSD

Doug is working through all the comments to draft responses. Here is a partially set with a few edits from me -

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC.AQ 8-26 daw 0827.doc

If you have any time Fri or Mon, please start editing and expanding these replies. We will need to send out the full set next week.

thanks,

-darrell

---

Darrell Winner, Ph.D.  
Director, Applied Science Division  
National Center for Environmental Research  
winner.darrell@epa.gov  
phone 202-343-9748  
fax 202-233-0677

-----  
Regular mail:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD (8726F)  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20460-0001

-----  
FedEx/Courier:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD  
Room 3104  
1025 F St NW  
Washington, DC 20004

(Woodies Building / metro stop: Metro Center)

EPA-EF-000717



EPA-524

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/27/2009 05:45 PM

To Jason Samenow  
cc Ben DeAngelo, Jeremy Martinich, Lesley Jantarasami,  
Marcus Sarofim, Michael Kolian, Rona Birnbaum, William  
Perkins  
bcc  
Subject Summaries/responses for discussion

Team--

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

2.1.4, DBC, 082709.doc 2.4.2, DBC, 082709.doc

Thanks,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

EPA-EF-000718

EPA-526

Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US

To Darrell Winner, Doug Grano

08/27/2009 07:01 PM

cc Anne Grambsch, Bryan Hubbell, Carey Jang, Chris Weaver, Erika Sasser, Larry Wallace, Marcus Sarofim, Michael Kolian, Pat Dolwick, Phil Lorang, Rona Birnbaum, Sara Terry

bcc

Subject Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

Darrell,

This timing would be great. Thank you!

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Thanks!

-Ben

(b)(5) Deliberative

air quality endangerment comments 082709.doc

Darrell Winner

We now plan to have a draft response for all the...

08/27/2009 02:21:30 PM

From: Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/27/2009 02:21 PM
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

We now plan to have a draft response for all the comments to the group before the end of next week. Please reserve some time either right before or after the labor day weekend to review and edit these responses.

-darrell

Darrell Winner, Ph.D.
Director, Applied Science Division
National Center for Environmental Research
winner.darrell@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000719

phone 202-343-9748  
fax 202-233-0677

-----  
Regular mail:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD (8726F)  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20460-0001

-----  
FedEx/Courier:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD  
Room 3104  
1025 F St NW  
Washington, DC 20004

(Woodies Building / metro stop: Metro Center)

Darrell Winner

(b)(5) Deliberative

08/25/2009 04:04:13 PM

From: Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/25/2009 04:04 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

(b)(5) Deliberative

-darrell

-----  
Darrell Winner, Ph.D.  
Director, Applied Science Division  
National Center for Environmental Research  
winner.darrell@epa.gov  
phone 202-343-9748  
fax 202-233-0677

-----  
Regular mail:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD (8726F)  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20460-0001

-----  
FedEx/Courier:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD  
Room 3104  
1025 F St NW  
Washington, DC 20004

(Woodies Building / metro stop: Metro Center)

EPA-EF-000720

Ben DeAngelo

Quick clarification.. (b)(5) Deliberative

08/24/2009 06:15:28 PM

From: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US  
 To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
 Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
 Date: 08/24/2009 06:15 PM  
 Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

Quick clarification.. (b)(5) Deliberative

Also discussed with Doug that I'd like to (b)(5) Deliberative

Ben DeAngelo

Thanks all for these responses. I think (b)(5) Deliberative

08/24/2009 03:44:41 PM

From: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US  
 To: Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
 Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
 Date: 08/24/2009 03:44 PM  
 Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

Thanks all for these responses. I think (b)(5) Deliberative

Primarily for Darrell and Doug,

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

I think by the end of this week I want to have a good sense of what our responses are to all major comments, and see if over the next two weeks major progress to updating the TSD can also be made.

Thanks!!

-Ben

Chris Weaver      Thanks, Doug. A couple quick comments from m...      08/19/2009 05:22:56 PM

---

From: Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/19/2009 05:22 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

---

Thanks, Doug. A couple quick comments from me ...  
-Chris

[attachment "Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 19b weaver comments.doc" deleted by Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US]

-----  
Christopher P. Weaver, Ph.D.  
Global Change Research Program

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Research and Development  
National Center for Environmental Assessment

Tel: +1 703 347 8621  
Fax: +1 703 347 8694  
Email: weaver.chris@epa.gov

Mailing address:  
US EPA (8601-P)  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave.  
Washington, DC 20460

Doug Grano      Here is a revised version based on comments to...      08/19/2009 12:11:15 PM

---

From: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Wallace/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Lorang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Pat Dolwick/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Carey Jang/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Erika Sasser/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Hubbell/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/19/2009 12:11 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

---

Here is a revised version based on comments today from Pat and Erika/Beth.  
--Doug

[attachment "Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 19b.doc" deleted by Chris

Weaver/DC/USEPA/US]

All--

I've accepted the changes from the 8-13 document and made a few new changes. The changes focus

(b)(5) Deliberative

--Doug

Sara Terry

I've made some comments (b)(5) Deliberative

08/13/2009 12:40:00 PM

From: Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US  
To: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/13/2009 12:40 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

I've made some comments (b)(5) Deliberative . Here is our revision so far.  
(b)(5) Deliberative

[attachment "Endangerment Proposal RTC AQ responses 8 13.doc" deleted by Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US]

Thanks,  
Sara

Doug Grano

Here's a start. Please review and send addition...

08/10/2009 05:09:01 PM

From: Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Anne Grambsch/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Chris Weaver/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/10/2009 05:09 PM  
Subject: Re: Continued discussion on response to public comments re: TSD AQ

Here's a start. Please review and send additions and edits.  
--Doug

[attachment "AQ responses dg8-10.doc" deleted by Sara Terry/RTP/USEPA/US]

EPA-527

**Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/27/2009 07:08 PM

To Darrell Winner, Doug Grano  
cc  
bcc

Subject Draft outline of Response to Public Comments Doc and very  
draft Intro of this doc

Darrell, Doug,

This will hopefully provide some more context (b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative

Thanks again!!!!

Please don't share these for now.

-Ben

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

CommentResponseOutline\_082709 lcj.doc Introduction Response 082709 lcj.doc

Benjamin J. DeAngelo  
Climate Change Division, Office of Atmospheric Programs  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW (6207J)  
Washington, DC 20460

Tel: +1 202-343-9107  
Fax: +1 202-343-2202  
deangelo.ben@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000724

EPA-528

William  
Perkins/DC/USEPA/US  
08/28/2009 09:42 AM

To "Mae Thomas"  
cc  
bcc

Subject Re: Coding and Parsing Comments

Mae,

Thank you for sending [REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative

[REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) [REDACTED] (b)(6)

"Mae Thomas" Bill, attached is a list [REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative 08/27/2009 11:55:19 PM

From: "Mae Thomas" <Mae.Thomas@erg.com>  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: "Mae Thomas" <Mae.Thomas@erg.com>  
Date: 08/27/2009 11:55 PM  
Subject: Coding and Parsing Comments

Bill, attached is a list [REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative

[REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative

Thank you

Mae[attachment "Parsed 8\_20 to 8\_27\_09.pdf" deleted by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-EF-000725



EPA-529

William  
Perkins/DC/USEPA/US  
08/28/2009 09:46 AM

To Rona Birnbaum, Lesley Jantarasami, Jason Samenow, David  
Chalmers, Jeremy Martinich, Marcus Sarofim, Ben DeAngelo,  
Michael Kolian

cc

bcc

Subject Fw: Coding and Parsing Comments

All,

Enclosed is a .pdf list (b)(5) Deliberative

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns and thank you for your time and attention.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) (b)(6)

----- Forwarded by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US on 08/28/2009 09:44 AM -----

From: "Mae Thomas" <Mae.Thomas@erg.com>  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: "Mae Thomas" <Mae.Thomas@erg.com>  
Date: 08/27/2009 11:55 PM  
Subject: Coding and Parsing Comments

Bill, attached is a list (b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Thank you (b)(5) Deliberative

Mae Parsed 8\_20 to 8\_27\_09.pdf

EPA-EF-000726

EPA-530

John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US

To Darrell Winner

08/28/2009 10:57 AM

cc Bryan Bloomer

bcc

Subject Re: draft responses to comments on TSD

Darrell and Bryan,

Here are my comments, added on to Darrell's. They're pretty minimal.

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC AQ 8-26 daw jpd 0828.doc

John

---

John P. Dawson, Ph.D.

AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow

US EPA

Office of Research and Development (ORD/NCER) and Office of Air and Radiation (OAR/OPAR)

dawson.john@epa.gov

Phone: +1-202-343-9064

---

Darrell Winner

Doug is working through all the comme...

08/27/2009 04:35:47 PM

From: Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US

To: John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Bloomer/DC/USEPA/US@EPA

Date: 08/27/2009 04:35 PM

Subject: draft responses to comments on TSD

Doug is working through all the comments to draft responses. Here is a partially set with a few edits from me -

[attachment "RTC AQ 8-26 daw 0827.doc" deleted by John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US]

If you have any time Fri or Mon, please start editing and expanding these replies. We will need to send out the full set next week.

thanks,

-darrell

---

Darrell Winner, Ph.D.

Director, Applied Science Division

National Center for Environmental Research

winner.darrell@epa.gov

phone 202-343-9748

fax 202-233-0677

-----  
Regular mail:

USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD (8726F)

1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW

Washington, DC 20460-0001

EPA-EF-000727

-----  
FedEx/Courier:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD  
Room 3104  
1025 F St NW  
Washington, DC 20004

(Woodies Building / metro stop: Metro Center)

EPA-531

**Robert  
Johnston/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/28/2009 11:07 AM

To Carolyn Scully, Dawn Roddy, David Chalmers, Isabel DeLuca, Jeremy Martinich, Jim Caldwell, David Dickinson, Carole Cook, Suzanne Kocchi, Peter Wendolkowski, Lee Carothers, Margaret Reidy, asem.akram, Carole Cook, Katherine Sibold, Spencer Clark, William Perkins, Jennifer.O'Neil  
cc Joe Sierra, Carolyn Scully, Margaret Reidy, Akram Assem  
bcc  
Subject Final Edition of Docket Center Stats\_Overview

All -

(b)(5) Deliberative

Please let me know if you have any questions.  
Robert

(b)(5) Deliberative

Docket Center Activities Overview 8.28.2009.pdf

---

Robert Johnston, Team Leader  
EPA Docket Center & Federal Docket Management System  
Office of Environmental Information  
US Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW MC2822T  
Washington, DC 20460  
202-566-1637  
johnston.robert@epa.gov

EPA-EF-000729

EPA-532

**John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US** To: Bryan Bloomer, Darrell Winner  
08/28/2009 11:48 AM cc  
bcc  
Subject: Re: draft responses to comments on TSD

Darrell and Bryan,

After some more thought, I've gone back and made some more changes to the responses.

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC AQ 8-26 daw jpd 0828a.doc

John

---

John P. Dawson, Ph.D.  
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow  
US EPA  
Office of Research and Development (ORD/NCER) and Office of Air and Radiation (OAR/OPAR)  
dawson.john@epa.gov  
Phone: +1-202-343-9064

---

John Dawson Darrell and Bryan, Here are my comments, adde... 08/28/2009 10:57:39 AM

From: John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Bryan Bloomer/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/28/2009 10:57 AM  
Subject: Re: draft responses to comments on TSD

Darrell and Bryan,

Here are my comments, added on to Darrell's. They're pretty minimal.

[attachment "RTC AQ 8-26 daw jpd 0828.doc" deleted by John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US]

John

---

John P. Dawson, Ph.D.  
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow  
US EPA  
Office of Research and Development (ORD/NCER) and Office of Air and Radiation (OAR/OPAR)  
dawson.john@epa.gov  
Phone: +1-202-343-9064

---

Darrell Winner Doug is working through all the comments to dra... 08/27/2009 04:35:47 PM

From: Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US  
To: John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Bryan Bloomer/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/27/2009 04:35 PM

EPA-EF-000730

Subject: draft responses to comments on TSD

---

Doug is working through all the comments to draft responses. Here is a partially set with a few edits from me -

[attachment "RTC AQ 8-26 daw 0827.doc" deleted by John Dawson/DC/USEPA/US]

If you have any time Fri or Mon, please start editing and expanding these replies. We will need to send out the full set next week.

thanks,

-darrell

---

Darrell Winner, Ph.D.  
Director, Applied Science Division  
National Center for Environmental Research  
winner.darrell@epa.gov  
phone 202-343-9748  
fax 202-233-0677

-----  
Regular mail:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD (8726F)  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20460-0001

-----  
FedEx/Courier:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD  
Room 3104  
1025 F St NW  
Washington, DC 20004

(Woodies Building / metro stop: Metro Center)

EPA-533

**Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US** To Rona Birnbaum  
08/28/2009 12:19 PM cc Lesley Jantarasami  
bcc  
Subject Re: Fw: schedules

I will tentatively say that (b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Rona Birnbaum ben, Lesley and I sat down last evenin... 08/28/2009 12:12:36 PM

From: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/28/2009 12:12 PM  
Subject: Fw: schedules

ben, Lesley and I sat down last evening and revised this. Please have a look asap and let me know if you have any changes. (b)(5) Deliberative

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 08/28/2009 12:02 PM -----

From: Lesley Jantarasami <ljantarasami@gmail.com>  
To: Rona Birnbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/28/2009 11:22 AM  
Subject: schedules

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Endangerment Schedule\_External.doc Endangerment Schedule\_Internal.doc

EPA-EF-000732

EPA-534

Rona  
Birnbbaum/DC/USEPA/US  
08/28/2009 12:34 PM

To Ben DeAngelo  
cc Lesley Jantarasami  
bcc  
Subject Re: Fw: schedules

(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

Lets talk if you have further questions.  
thanks!!

Ben DeAngelo I will tentatively say that (b)(5) Deliberative 08/28/2009 12:19:57 PM

From: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Rona Birnbbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/28/2009 12:19 PM  
Subject: Re: Fw: schedules

I will tentatively say that (b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Rona Birnbbaum ben, Lesley and I sat down last evening and revi... 08/28/2009 12:12:36 PM

From: Rona Birnbbaum/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Lesley Jantarasami/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/28/2009 12:12 PM  
Subject: Fw: schedules

ben, Lesley and I sat down last evening and revised this. Please have a look asap and let me know if you have any changes. (b)(5) Deliberative

----- Forwarded by Rona Birnbbaum/DC/USEPA/US on 08/28/2009 12:02 PM -----

From: Lesley Jantarasami <ljantarasami@gmail.com>  
To: Rona Birnbbaum/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/28/2009 11:22 AM  
Subject: schedules

[attachment "Endangerment Schedule\_External.doc" deleted by Rona Birnbbaum/DC/USEPA/US] [attachment "Endangerment Schedule\_Internal.doc" deleted by Rona Birnbbaum/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-EF-000733



EPA-537

**Jeremy  
Martinich/DC/USEPA/US**  
08/31/2009 10:06 AM

To Jason Samenow  
cc  
bcc  
Subject Question on a comment, I'll stop by

Comment:

(b)(5) Deliberative

Response:

\*\*\*\*\*

Jeremy Martinich  
USEPA, Climate Change Division  
202-343-9871

EPA-538

Jeremy  
Martinich/DC/USEPA/US  
08/31/2009 11:09 AM

To Michael Kolian  
cc Bill Perkins  
bcc

Subject Re: comment redirect from from (b)(5) Deliberative?

Hey Mike,

(b)(5) Deliberative  
A couple of other folks made a similar comment.

No need to move it in the database at this point, as my summaries are in Word now.

Thanks,  
Jeremy

\*\*\*\*\*

Jeremy Martinich  
USEPA, Climate Change Division  
202-343-9871

Michael Kolian Bill and Jeremy (b)(5) Deliberative 08/31/2009 10:28:42 AM

From: Michael Kolian/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Bill Perkins <perkins.william@epa.gov>, Jeremy Martinich/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 10:28 AM  
Subject: comment redirect from from (b)(5) Deliberative?

Bill and Jeremy,

(b)(5) Deliberative

My current comment/response is:

(b)(5) Deliberative

Cheers,  
Mike

EPA-EF-000735

EPA-539

**Michael Kolian**  
05/12/2010 10:09 AM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPLoad C:\Documents and Settings\Owner\My  
Documents\Ccd\TSD comment period\Forestry comment  
summary 8\_25\_09 merge.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Forestry comment summary 8\_25\_09 merge.doc

EPA-540

David  
Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
08/31/2009 02:49 PM

To William Perkins  
cc  
bcc  
Subject Re: draft section 15 edits

De nada, el placer es mio. [REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative

saludos,

David Chalmers  
ORISE Fellow  
U.S. EPA, Climate Change Division  
202.343.9814

William Perkins David, Thank you very much; I will look at this as... 08/31/2009 02:45:37 PM

From: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US  
To: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 02:45 PM  
Subject: Re: draft section 15 edits

David,

Thank you very much; I will look at this as soon as I can. [REDACTED] (b)(5) Deliberative

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) [REDACTED] (b)(6)

David Chalmers [attachment "Section 15\_draft edits.doc" deleted... 08/31/2009 02:33:34 PM

From: David Chalmers/DC/USEPA/US  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 02:33 PM  
Subject: draft section 15 edits

[attachment "Section 15\_draft edits.doc" deleted by William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US]

EPA-EF-000737

EPA-541

**Doug Grano/RTP/USEPA/US**

To Darrell Winner

08/31/2009 04:33 PM

cc

bcc

Subject Response to AQ comments draft for Endangerment finding

Darrell--

Here is my current version. If you use track changes, I can continue to make changes as well. (b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

--Doug

(b)(5) Deliberative

[Redacted]

RTC AQ 8-31.doc

EPA-542

**Michael Kolian**  
05/12/2010 10:09 AM

To  
cc  
bcc

Subject UPGOAD C:\Documents and Settings\Owner\My Documents\Ccd\TSD comment period\Forestry comment summary 8\_31\_09 merge.doc

(b)(5) Deliberative

Forestry comment summary 8\_31\_09 merge.doc

EPA-545

**Darrell Winner/DC/USEPA/US**

09/01/2009 09:30 AM

To Bryan Bloomer, John Dawson

cc

bcc

Subject latest version of the replay to comments on the TSD

(b)(5) Deliberative

RTC.AQ 8-31 ncer edits.doc

This includes the changes

(b)(5) Deliberative

-darrell

---

Darrell Winner, Ph.D.  
Director, Applied Science Division  
National Center for Environmental Research  
winner.darrell@epa.gov  
phone 202-343-9748  
fax 202-233-0677

-----  
Regular mail:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD (8726F)  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20460-0001

-----  
FedEx/Courier:  
USEPA/ORD/NCER/ESRD  
Room 3104  
1025 F St NW  
Washington, DC 20004

(Woodies Building / metro stop: Metro Center)

EPA-EF-000740

EPA-546

William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US  
09/01/2009 10:25 AM

To Marcus Sarofim  
cc Ben DeAngelo, Jason Samenow  
bcc  
Subject Re: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

Jason and Marcus,

Thank you very much for putting these lists together! (b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

I will send these off to ERG after lunch in case anyone has any final thoughts.

Thank you for your time and attention.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) (b)(6)

Marcus Sarofim | I don't think that (b)(5) Deliberative | 08/31/2009 09:42:24 PM

From: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 09:42 PM  
Subject: Re: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

I don't think that (b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

to add to: (b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

EPA-EF-000741



(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

Other than that, (b)(5) Deliberative,

-Marcus

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD  
phone: 202-343-9993  
fax: 202-343-2202  
1310 L Street 256C  
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow  
with the EPA Climate Division

Jason Samenow (b)(5) Deliberative 08/31/2009 06:09:49 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 06:09 PM  
Subject: Re: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

Jason

William Perkins All, In accordance with our discussion t... 08/31/2009 04:21:42 PM

From: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 04:21 PM  
Subject: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

All,

In accordance with our discussion today, (b)(5) Deliberative  
[Redacted]

(b)(5) Deliberative At that time I will take your feedback and send to  
ERG. Thank you.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) (b)(6)

EPA-547

Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US  
09/01/2009 10:27 AM

To Marcus Sarofim  
cc Jason Samenow, William Perkins  
bcc

Subject Re: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

7955	1994			(b)(5) Deliberative	No
4886	1995			(b)(5) Deliberative	No
850	2001			(b)(5) Deliberative	No
9298	2008			(b)(5) Deliberative	No
9560	2009			(b)(5) Deliberative	No

Marcus Sarofim | I don't think that (b)(5) Deliberative | 08/31/2009 09:42:24 PM

From: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 09:42 PM  
Subject: Re: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

I don't think that (b)(5) Deliberative

to add to: (b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Other than that, (b)(5) Deliberative,

-Marcus

Marcus C. Sarofim, PhD  
phone: 202-343-9993  
fax: 202-343-2202  
1310 L Street 256C  
AAAS Science & Technology Policy Fellow  
with the EPA Climate Division

Jason Samenow (b)(5) Deliberative 08/31/2009 06:09:49 PM

From: Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US  
To: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Cc: Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 06:09 PM  
Subject: Re: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

(b)(5) Deliberative

Jason

William Perkins All, In accordance with our discussion t... 08/31/2009 04:21:42 PM

From: William Perkins/DC/USEPA/US  
To: Marcus Sarofim/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben DeAngelo/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, Jason Samenow/DC/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/31/2009 04:21 PM  
Subject: journals mis-categorized for peer-review status

All,

In accordance with our discussion today,

(b)(5) Deliberative

. At that time I will take your feedback and send to  
ERG. Thank you.

Cheers,

Bill

Bill Perkins  
Climate Change Adaptation Analyst  
Climate Science and Impacts Branch  
Climate Change Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
perkins.william@epa.gov  
(O) 202.343.9460  
(F) 202.343.2202  
(C) (b)(6)