

**U.S. District Court  
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:99-cv-00131-EGS**

SANGS v. U.S. POSTAL SERVICE  
Assigned to: Judge Emmet G. Sullivan  
Demand: \$0  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 01/15/1999  
Date Terminated: 03/04/2002  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 550 Prisoner Petition:  
Civil Rights (Other)  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**BERNARD SANGS**

represented by **BERNARD SANGS**  
R10671-042  
LOMPOC UNITED STATES  
PENITENTIARY  
3901 Klein Boulevard  
Lompoc, CA 93436  
PRO SE

V.

**Defendant**

**U.S. POSTAL SERVICE**represented by **Brian J. Sonfield**

US DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY  
 Office of the General Counsel  
 1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
 Washington, DC 20220  
 (202) 622-0450  
 Email: brian.sonfield@treasury.gov  
*(Inactive)*  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**David T. Smorodin**  
 AMERICAN CHEMICAL SOCIETY  
 Office of the Secretary & General  
 Counsel  
 1155 16th Street, NW  
 Washington, DC 20036  
 (202) 872-4510  
 Fax: (202) 872-6338  
 Email: d\_smorodin@acs.org  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Mark E. Nagle**  
 MARRIOTT VACATIONS  
 WORLDWIDE CORPORATION  
 Vice Presidents & Assistant General  
 Counsel  
 6649 Westwood Boulevard  
 Orlando, FL 32821  
 (407) 529-2587  
 Fax: (407) 206-6420  
 Email: mark.nagle@mvmc.com  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

<b>Date Filed</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>Docket Text</b>
01/15/1999	1	COMPLAINT filed by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS; exhibits (pt) Modified on 01/20/1999 (Entered: 01/19/1999)
01/15/1999		SUMMONS NOT ISSUED. (pt) (Entered: 01/19/1999)
01/15/1999	2	APPLICATION by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS to proceed in forma pauperis (pt) Modified on 01/20/1999 (Entered: 01/19/1999)
01/15/1999	3	ORDER by Judge Aubrey E. Robinson : directing prisoner plaintiff to provide a trust fund statement to the court by 2/11/99 for BERNARD SANGS . (N) (pt) Modified on 01/20/1999 (Entered: 01/19/1999)
02/24/1999	4	TRUST FUND ACCOUNT filed by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS pursuant to order [3-2] . (pt) (Entered: 02/24/1999)
02/24/1999	5	ORDER by Judge Aubrey E. Robinson : granting motion to proceed in forma pauperis [2-1] by BERNARD SANGS directing that monthly payments be made from the prisoner account of BERNARD SANGS . (N) (pt) (Entered: 02/24/1999)

02/24/1999		CASE REASSIGNED to Judge Emmet G. Sullivan (tw) (Entered: 02/25/1999)
03/03/1999	6	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney on 2/25/99 (tw) (Entered: 03/04/1999)
03/03/1999	7	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed upon U.S. Attorney General on 2/26/99 (tw) (Entered: 03/04/1999)
03/03/1999	8	RETURN OF SERVICE/AFFIDAVIT of summons and complaint executed on 2/26/99 upon federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (tw) (Entered: 03/04/1999)
03/29/1999	9	ANSWER TO COMPLAINT [1-1] by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE . (bjsp) (Entered: 03/31/1999)
04/19/1999	10	RESPONSE by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS to defendant's answer to the complaint [9-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE ; exhibits (6) (bjsp) (Entered: 04/20/1999)
08/18/1999	11	MOTION filed by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS for Vaughn Index (tw) (Entered: 08/20/1999)
08/20/1999	12	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to extend time to 10/29/99 to respond to plaintiff's request for a vaughn index and plaintiff's request for discovery (st) (Entered: 08/23/1999)
08/31/1999	13	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion to extend time to 10/29/99 to respond to plaintiff's request for a vaughn index and plaintiff's request for discovery [12-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (N) (clv) (Entered: 08/31/1999)
10/28/1999	14	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to extend time to 11/5/99 within which to respond to plaintiff's request for a Vaughn Index and plaintiff's request for discovery. (tw) (Entered: 10/29/1999)
11/02/1999	15	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion to extend time to 11/5/99 within which to respond to plaintiff's request for a Vaughn Index and plaintiff's request for discovery. [14-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (N) (clv) (Entered: 11/02/1999)
11/04/1999	18	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to extend time to 11/12/99 to file a response to plaintiff's request for a Vaughn Index and plaintiff's request for discovery (bjsp) (Entered: 11/18/1999)
11/10/1999	16	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting defendant's motion for extension of time to file response to plaintiff's motion for Vaughn Index to 11/12/99; (N) (clv) (Entered: 11/10/1999)
11/12/1999	17	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE for summary judgment (st) (Entered: 11/15/1999)

11/23/1999	<a href="#">19</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan: that plaintiff shall respond to defendant's motion for summary judgment on or before 12/20/99. If the plaintiff does not respond by that date, the Court may treat the motion as conceded and enter judgment in favor of the defendant. (N) (dam) (Entered: 11/24/1999)
11/26/1999	20	MOTION filed by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS to extend time to sixty days to respond to defendant's motion for summary judgment (st) (Entered: 11/29/1999)
01/11/2000	21	RESPONSE by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS in opposition to motion for summary judgment [17-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE; declarations (1) . (jf) (Entered: 01/12/2000)
01/11/2000	22	CROSS MOTIONS by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS for summary judgment (jf) (Entered: 01/12/2000)
01/12/2000	23	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to extend time to 2/15/00 within which to file its response to plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment. (tw) (Entered: 01/13/2000)
01/18/2000	24	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion to extend time to 2/15/00 within which to file its response to plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment. [23-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE response to motion for summary judgment due 2/15/00 ; (N) (clv) (Entered: 01/18/2000)
02/07/2000	25	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : denying motion for Vaughn Index [11-1] by BERNARD SANGS (N) (clv) (Entered: 02/07/2000)
02/11/2000	26	MEMORANDUM by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE in opposition to plaintiff's cross motion for summary judgment [22-1]; declaration (1) (tw) (Entered: 02/14/2000)
02/11/2000	27	MEMORANDUM by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE in support of motion for summary judgment [17-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (tw) (Entered: 02/14/2000)
02/24/2000	28	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by BERNARD SANGS representing plaintiff BERNARD SANGS . New address: United States Prison Lompoc 3901 Klein Blvd. Lompoc, California 93436 . (tw) (Entered: 02/29/2000)
04/03/2000	29	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE for protective order pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), staying all discovery in the case until further order of this Court. (tw) (Entered: 04/04/2000)
04/24/2000	30	RESPONSE by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS in opposition to defendants motion for protective order [29-1]. (tw) (Entered: 04/25/2000)
04/27/2000	31	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to extend time to 5/11/00 within which to respond to plaintiff's opposition to defendants motion for a protective order. (tw) (Entered: 04/28/2000)
05/02/2000	<a href="#">32</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion to extend time to 5/11/00 within which to respond to plaintiff's opposition to defendants motion for a protective order. [31-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (N) (clv) (Entered: 05/02/2000)

05/02/2000	<a href="#">33</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion for protective order pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), staying all discovery in the case until further order of this Court. [29-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (N) (clv) (Entered: 05/02/2000)
05/11/2000	34	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE for stay of proceedings to allow defendant to process additional documents in response to plaintiff's FOIA requests ; Attachment (1) (tth) (Entered: 05/12/2000)
05/25/2000	35	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion for stay of proceedings to allow defendant to process additional documents in response to plaintiff's FOIA requests [34-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE; supplemental Vaughn Index and supplemental memo in support of the motion for summary judgment due by 6/26/00; (N) (clv) (Entered: 05/25/2000)
06/23/2000	36	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE in further support of motion for summary judgment [17-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE.; attachments (1) (dam) (Entered: 06/26/2000)
07/10/2000	37	RESPONSE (OPPOSITIONS) by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS to defendant's supplemental memorandum [36-1]. (tw) (Entered: 07/11/2000)
07/14/2000	38	REPLY by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to plaintiff's response to defendant's supplemental memorandum [36-1]. (td) (Entered: 07/17/2000)
09/27/2000	<a href="#">39</a>	MEMORANDUM OPINION by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan (N) (ks) (Entered: 09/28/2000)
09/27/2000	<a href="#">40</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : denying cross motion for summary judgment [22-1] by BERNARD SANGS, denying motion for summary judgment [17-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE; and that defendant may file a renewed motion for summary judgment as described in the accompanying Memorandum Opinion within 30 days of the date of this Order. (N) (ks) (Entered: 09/28/2000)
10/26/2000	41	MOTION (RENEWED) filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE for summary judgment ; Declarations (2); Exhibits (1) (ag) (Entered: 10/27/2000)
11/06/2000	<a href="#">42</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan: plaintiff shall respond to defendants renewed motion for summary judgment . If plaintiff does not respond by the date indicated, the Court may treat the motion as conceded and enter judgment in favor of the defendant. response to motion for summary judgment due 12/15/00 (N) (dam) (Entered: 11/07/2000)
11/20/2000	43	RESPONSE by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS in opposition to motion for summary judgment [41-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE . (aet) (Entered: 11/21/2000)
11/28/2000	44	MEMORANDUM by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE in opposition to motion for summary judgment [41-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (aet) (Entered: 12/12/2000)

04/16/2001	45	MOTION FOR VAUGHN INDEX by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS (aet) (Entered: 04/17/2001)
04/24/2001	46	MOTION filed by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to extend time to 5/25/01 to respond to plaintiff's motion for Vaughn Index (cdw) (Entered: 04/25/2001)
04/27/2001	<a href="#">47</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion to extend time to 5/25/01 to respond to plaintiff's motion for Vaughn Index [46-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (N) (clv) (Entered: 04/27/2001)
05/07/2001	48	RESPONSE by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE in opposition to plaintiff's motion to compel discovery.; exhibit (1) (aet) (Entered: 05/08/2001)
05/16/2001	<a href="#">49</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan: denying plaintiff's motion to compel discovery. (N) (dam) (Entered: 05/16/2001)
05/25/2001	50	MEMORANDUM by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE in support of motion for summary judgment [41-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE (aet) (Entered: 05/31/2001)
05/25/2001	51	RESPONSE (OPPOSITIONS) by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE Vaughn Index [45-1] by BERNARD SANGS; declaration (2); exhibits (A) (aet) Modified on 05/31/2001 (Entered: 05/31/2001)
06/18/2001	<a href="#">52</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan :directing that plaintiff shall respond to the defendant's supplemental memorandum in support of the renewed motion for summary judgment by 7/9/01; (N) (clv) (Entered: 06/18/2001)
07/02/2001	53	RESPONSE by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS to memorandum in support [50-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE; declarations (3) exhibits (2) (aet) (Entered: 07/05/2001)
07/09/2001	54	REPLY by federal defendant U.S. POSTAL SERVICE to response to defendant's supplemental memorandum in support of defendant's renewed motion for summary judgment [53-1] by BERNARD SANGS . (aet) (Entered: 07/10/2001)
03/05/2002	<a href="#">55</a>	MEMORANDUM OPINION by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan (N) (clv) (Entered: 03/05/2002)
03/05/2002	<a href="#">56</a>	ORDER by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan : granting motion for summary judgment [41-1] by U.S. POSTAL SERVICE; plaintiff's renewed motion for summary judgment is denied; plaintiff's motion for a Vaughn Index is denied; this action is dismissed with prejudice; this is a final appealable order; (N) (clv) (Entered: 03/05/2002)
03/26/2002	57	NOTICE OF APPEAL by plaintiff BERNARD SANGS from order [56-1], entered on: 3/5/02; IFP no fees; copy mailed to parties. (td) (Entered: 03/27/2002)
03/27/2002		TRANSMITTED PRELIMINARY RECORD on appeal [57-1] by BERNARD SANGS to U.S. Court of Appeals (td) (Entered: 03/27/2002)
04/01/2002		USCA # 02 5108 assigned for appeal [57-1] by BERNARD SANGS (bjsp) (Entered: 04/02/2002)

07/24/2002	58	COPY of Order filed in USCA dated 7/23/02, referencing appeal [57-1] , directing the appellant's custodian to pay the partial filing fee of \$2.40. USCA # 02-5108 (cp) (Entered: 07/24/2002)
10/03/2002	59	CERTIFIED COPY of judgment filed in USCA dated 8/6/2, on appeal [57-1] , affirming the judgment of USDC . USCA # 02-5108 (cjp) (Entered: 10/08/2002)