

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Sent:** Monday, March 25, 2013 1:49 PM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Subject:** RE: Cardiac Surgery

ok thanks Kam, I can try 2:30 pm tomorrow.

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

---

**From:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Sent:** March-25-13 1:32 PM  
**To:** RWong  
**Subject:** RE: Cardiac Surgery

Sorry, I am not in till about 1.30pm tomorrow. We could talk by phone sometime in the afternoon 604 218 0173.  
Kam

-----Original Message-----

**From:** RWong  
**Sent:** March 25, 2013 11:27 AM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Subject:** RE: Cardiac Surgery

Can I come find you at 10 am tomorrow?  
Thanks Kam!  
Roger

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

From: Rungta, Kamal  
Sent: March-25-13 11:15 AM  
To: RWong  
Subject: RE: Cardiac Surgery

Roger,  
Thanks for your kind words. This is a FTF or telephone discussion that we should have when you are back. I am here this Tuesday afternoon till about 3.20pm and again next Tuesday afternoon and then off for about 8 days to Toronto.  
kam

-----Original Message-----

From: RWong  
Sent: March 25, 2013 11:09 AM  
Cc: Rungta, Kamal  
Subject: RE: Cardiac Surgery

Hi Kam:  
I would like to thank you again for helping out with CS, from our very first conversation when we first heard about the issue, to overseeing the 2nd iteration for me. I am most grateful.  
This is a very challenging situation that we were led to get into. Do you have any other thoughts/observations that you would like to share with me?  
Best,  
Roger

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

---

From: RWong  
Sent: March-22-13 5:12 PM  
To: Snadden, David; Stuart, Gavin  
Cc: Rungta, Kamal; RWong  
Subject: RE: Cardiac Surgery

Hi Gavin:  
Dave's summary is accurate from the procedural point of view.  
CaRMS rules say that we are not supposed to remove program positions after 1st iteration and all unfilled spots must flow to 2nd iteration. This is why UBC has done what we have and so the procedures are defensible.

Roger

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP

Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

---

From: Snadden, David

Sent: March-22-13 4:45 PM

To: Stuart, Gavin; RWong

Cc: Rungta, Kamal

Subject: Re: Cardiac Surgery

Dave

David Snadden  
Executive Associate Dean Education  
UBC Faculty of Medicine

Tel: 604-875-4111 Ext 66726

Mailing address:  
11th Floor, Gordon and Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre  
2775 Laurel Street  
Vancouver, BC V5Z 1M9

From: <Stuart>, Gavin Stuart <gavin.stuart@ubc.ca<mailto:gavin.stuart@ubc.ca>>  
Date: Friday, March 22, 2013 4:30 PM  
To: Roger Wong <pgdean@postgrad.med.ubc.ca<mailto:pgdean@postgrad.med.ubc.ca>>  
Cc: "Rungta, Kamal" <kamal.rungta@ubc.ca<mailto:kamal.rungta@ubc.ca>>, David Snadden <david.snadden@ubc.ca<mailto:david.snadden@ubc.ca>>  
Subject: Cardiac Surgery

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Peets, Adam [PH] <APeets@providencehealth.bc.ca>  
**Sent:** Friday, March 15, 2013 11:09 PM  
**To:** Cook, Richard [VA]; Rungta, Kamal  
**Cc:** Campbell, Alayne (cw.bc.ca); MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Subject:** RE: proposed changes to carms description

Hi Richard and Andrew,

If you could please send it along to us that would be great.

I think your idea of sharing it with the REC members is a great one. The more everyone understands the process, and the more transparent this process is, the better.

Thanks again.

Adam.

---

**From:** Cook, Richard [VA]  
**Sent:** Friday, March 15, 2013 8:02 PM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Cc:** Peets, Adam [PH]; [PHSA] Campbell, Andrew; RWong  
**Subject:** Re: proposed changes to carms description

dear kam, adam,

did you want to see our screening process? is it appropriate to share that information with the rec members?

we had 96 applicants, and have invited 4 for interviews on tuesday evening.

thanks.

richard and andrew

On 2013-03-12, at 5:45 AM, Rungta, Kamal wrote:

> It seems okay to me.

> Kam

> Kam Rungta,

> Faculty of Medicine, UBC

> [Kamal.Rungta@ubc.ca](mailto:Kamal.Rungta@ubc.ca)

>

> ----- Original Message -----

> From: Cook, Richard [VA] <[Richard.Cook@vch.ca](mailto:Richard.Cook@vch.ca)>

> To: Rungta, Kamal; Peets, Adam [PH] <[APeets@providencehealth.bc.ca](mailto:APeets@providencehealth.bc.ca)>

> Cc: Campbell, Alayne; RWong

> Sent: Mon Mar 11 13:40:08 2013

> Subject: proposed changes to carms description

>

> dear kam, adam,

> below is our proposed change to the program description on the CaRMS website.

> please let us know if you think this is appropriate or if there are changes which you would recommend.

> thanks!

> richard and andrew

>

> Selection Criteria

>

> All applications are considered by the Co-Directors of the residency program. Only those applicants invited for an interview will be contacted. The selection committee consists of the Co-Directors, members of each teaching hospital, and one resident representative. Our program seeks individuals who have a demonstrated interest in cardiac surgery, with strong academic records, technical aptitude, a demonstrated research interest and a commitment to learn. Eligible applicants are graduates of medical schools in Canada, the United States of America, the United Kingdom and its Commonwealth countries, and the European Union, where English is the language of instruction and primary language of care. Candidates must demonstrate proof of English language competence as defined by CaRMS, and must be either Canadian citizens, landed immigrants, or have refugee status in Canada. Candidates must also provide documentation of successful completion of the MCEE exam.

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Abbassian Milani, Maryam  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 12, 2013 4:48 PM  
**To:** APeets@providencehealth.bc.ca; Rungta, Kamal; 'Abel,Dr.James [SPH]'; 'Bashir, Dr. Jamil [SPH]'; Campbell, Alayne (cw.bc.ca); 'Cheung,Dr.Anson [SPH]'; 'Cook, Dr. Richard [VGH]'; Karim, Dr. Shahzad [RCH]; Skarsgard, Dr.P [VGH]; 'Ye, Dr. Jian [SPH]'; 'Celia Magraw'; 'Charissa D'Cruze'; Emily Chan; 'Jackie Juan'; Joyce Cheng; 'Karen Romein'; Rebecca Miles; 'Rita Moore'; Yamashita, Dr. Michael  
**Subject:** Meeting re Second Iteration Interview & Ranking  
**Importance:** High

Please be informed that the meeting regarding the interview and ranking of CARMS second iteration applicants will be held as follows:

Date: Tuesday March 19<sup>th</sup>, 2013

Time: 1700 hours

Location: Conference room 443, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Burrard building, St. Paul's Hospital

Dinner will be served.

Thank you,

Maryam A. Milani

Senior Administrative Assistant

UBC Division of Cardiovascular Surgery

Phone: (604) 806-9307

Fax: (604) 806-9654

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Sent:** Friday, March 08, 2013 12:39 PM  
**To:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Subject:** cardiac surgery - meeting March 8, 2013

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

March 8, 2013 (0800-0900)

Attended by Richard Cook, Andrew Campbell, Kam Rungta, Adam Peets (audio bridge), RW

- Process – must be fair, transparent and consistently applied to all applicants.
- Guidance from Kam and Adam as the 2 PGME appointees to oversee the process and be resource people to the Program.
- Filters – PDs to determine selection criteria prior to the opening of 2nd iteration. Examples of possible filters include CMG academic transcripts (homogenous), standardized exam scores (MCCEE, MCCQE1, MCCQE2, NAC OSCE), English Language Proficiency requirement by CPSBC (TOEFL, IELTS).
- Confidentiality must be maintained at all times.
- Potential/actual conflicts of interest – members of the Resident Selection Committee must declare all potential or actual conflicts of interest.
- Shortlisting of applicants for interview can be done by the PDs.
- Interviews may be done by phone and/or Skype.
- ROL determination – to be done in a face to face meeting in the same room to maintain confidentiality of discussion.

**Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP**  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education  
Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine  
Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia





**Richard C. Cook, MD, MSc, FRCSC**  
**Adult Cardiac Surgery, Minimally Invasive Cardiac Surgery**  
**The University of British Columbia**  
**Division of Cardiovascular Surgery**

March 11, 2013

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education  
Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine  
Faculty of Medicine, University of British Columbia

Dear Roger,

Thank you for meeting with us last Friday. We appreciate your assistance with the process of the second match. As we have discussed on several occasions, it was never our intention to act in a manner which was in violation of the CaRMS match process.

We welcome the assistance and input from Dr. Kamal Rungta and Dr. Adam Peets, and their inclusion as non-voting members of the new selection committee for the second iteration of the CaRMS match. As per Dr. Rungta's recommendation, we have also invited Dr. Anson Cheung to be involved in the selection committee for the second iteration of the match.

Since our meeting, we have identified a date for interviewing the short-listed candidates by phone or by Skype. We now have confirmation from enough members of the new selection committee that we are confident that we will have a quorum on that date.

As Dr. Rungta advised us on Friday, Dr. Campbell and I will personally review all of the applications and screen them according to our screening criteria. We will be discussing those criteria with Dr. Rungta and Dr. Peets prior to our review of the applications. We will then create a short-list of candidates to be interviewed, and will distribute the applications of those candidates to the selection committee members prior to the meeting date.

We will also be creating a list of criteria to be used for inclusion and ranking of the candidates on the rank order list.

Thank you again for your assistance with this process. We are confident that the procedures taken will ensure that the second iteration of the CaRMS match will be entirely in accordance with the spirit and rules of the match.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'RC', written over a horizontal line.

Richard C. Cook, MD  
Andrew Campbell, MD  
Co-Directors, UBC Cardiac Surgery Resident Education

RC/kr

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 07, 2013 1:29 PM  
**To:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong; Amann, Rose  
**Cc:** 'rgoldner@tjclaw.com'; Moen, Lois; Snadden, David  
**Subject:** RE: cardiac surgery

Roger,  
Excellent letter!!

I just got off the phone with Sandy Banner from CaRMS and she said one option is that

13

Kam

---

**From:** RWong  
**Sent:** March 7, 2013 1:17 PM  
**To:** Amann, Rose  
**Cc:** [rgoldner@tjclaw.com](mailto:rgoldner@tjclaw.com); Moen, Lois; Snadden, David; Rungta, Kamal; RWong  
**Subject:** FW: cardiac surgery

Hi Rose:  
Would you please put the following on letterhead for me to sign?  
Thanks.  
Roger

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education  
Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine  
Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

March 7, 2013

Dr. Richard Cook

Co-Program Director, Cardiac Surgery  
UBC Faculty of Medicine

Dear Dr. Cook:

Further to our meeting at the Postgraduate Medical Education (PGME) Office on March 4, 2013, I am writing to confirm our discussion and set out the next steps as we proceed to the second iteration of the 2013 Canadian Resident Matching Service (CaRMS) Match for the two unfilled Cardiac Surgery Residency Program positions.

Our initial conversation on February 19, 2013, was prompted by the fact that the Program submitted only 1 candidate on the Rank Order List (ROL) for the two positions allocated to the first iteration of the 2013 CaRMS Match, thereby leaving one position in the first iteration to be unfilled and potentially saved for the second iteration without a bone fide attempt to fill the two allocated positions in the first iteration.

In that discussion you confirmed that the Program intended to leave a position unfilled so that it would become available to a candidate who was not eligible for the first iteration match but who had done an elective rotation with the Program and was the preferred candidate. I advised that the Program's actions were not compliant with the CaRMS rules and procedures and that this irregularity could be contested to CaRMS in the future by a candidate and/or a medical school. I advised that this is a serious situation that will be actively monitored by the PGME Office and the Faculty of Medicine.

As we discussed the CaRMS match process must follow the UBC PGME Resident Selection Policy (the Policy) which is available on the PGME website. I provided a print copy to you on March 4, 2013. The above-mentioned irregularity in the Cardiac Surgery Program is not consistent with the Policy.

To address this issue the PGME Office will assist the Cardiac Surgery Program to fully implement the spirit and substance of the Policy and to ensure that the selection process is fair, transparent and provides equitable access to all candidates who apply. In this second iteration of CaRMS we must ensure that no candidates is unfairly advantaged in the process. This is a competitive process and all candidates must be given full and fair consideration.

The actions of the Program and the irregularity that occurred during the first iteration has introduced a reasonable apprehension of bias in the Resident Selection Committee which could have a negative effect on the second iteration process. To ensure there is no taint on the process in the second iteration match, a different Resident Selection Committee must be convened. In addition the PGME Office is appointing 2 members to represent the PGME Office at the new Resident Selection Committee. These members will provide oversight of the entire second iteration match process (including but not limited to file review, invitation to interview, interview process, and deliberation to generate the second iteration ROL, etc.)

I am pleased that Dr. Kamal Rungta, Senior Advisor to the Dean and Past Executive Associate Dean, Education, and Dr. Adam Peets, Associate Head, Department of Medicine have agreed to represent the PGME Office at the new Resident Selection Committee.

I would like to reiterate that the Program Directors of the Cardiac Surgery Program have access to the PGME Office any time for support including during the CaRMS match process.

Thank you for your kind attention in this important matter.

Sincerely,

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean, Postgraduate Medical Education  
Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine  
Faculty of Medicine, University of British Columbia

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Moen, Lois  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 07, 2013 11:28 AM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Subject:** RE: cardiac surgery - meeting with PD March 4, 2013

Here is the link to the 2<sup>nd</sup> iteration time table

[http://www.carms.ca/eng/faculty\\_timetableR1\\_2nd\\_e.shtml](http://www.carms.ca/eng/faculty_timetableR1_2nd_e.shtml)

Lois Moen  
Director, Administration  
Postgraduate Medical Education

Phone: 604-875-4834 Fax: 604-875-4847  
<http://www.med.ubc.ca/postgrad>

**DO NOT FORWARD THIS EMAIL OR ADD RECIPIENTS TO YOUR REPLY WITHOUT MY PERMISSION.** *This material is intended for the use of the individual to which it is addressed and may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you are not the intended recipient or the person responsible for delivering the material to the intended recipient, you are notified that any dissemination, distribution or copy of this communication is prohibited. If you have received this communication by error, please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail*

---

**From:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 07, 2013 11:19 AM  
**To:** Moen, Lois  
**Subject:** RE: cardiac surgery - meeting with PD March 4, 2013

Thanks Lois,  
What are the timelines for the second iteration for programs to submit rank order lists etc.?  
Kam

---

**From:** Moen, Lois  
**Sent:** March 7, 2013 9:15 AM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Subject:** FW: cardiac surgery - meeting with PD March 4, 2013

Hi Kam,

The selection committee members are highlighted below.

Richard Cook/Adam Campbell – co Program directors  
Shahzad Karim – Former Program director RCH/SPH  
James Abel – Cardiac - SPH  
J. Ye - Cardiac – SPH  
P. Skarsgaard – Former UBC resident. Cardiac  
Jamil Bashir – Cardiac – SPH  
Michael Yamashita – Current PGY6 Cardiac Resident

22

were the first residents to complete the UBC Cardiac program when it became accredited.

We will get you the members of the RTC and forward to you.

Lois Moen  
Director, Administration  
Postgraduate Medical Education

Phone: 604-875-4834 Fax: 604-875-4847  
<http://www.med.ubc.ca/postgrad>

**DO NOT FORWARD THIS EMAIL OR ADD RECIPIENTS TO YOUR REPLY WITHOUT MY PERMISSION.** *This material is intended for the use of the individual to which it is addressed and may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you are not the intended recipient or the person responsible for delivering the material to the intended recipient, you are notified that any dissemination, distribution or copy of this communication is prohibited. If you have received this communication by error, please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail*

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Moen, Lois  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 07, 2013 10:42 AM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Cc:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Subject:** FW: RTC Members - Cardiac Surgery

**Importance:** High

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

Hi Kam,

Below is the RTC membership which appears to be the same as the selection committee, with the addition of Anson Cheung.

Lois Moen  
Director, Administration  
Postgraduate Medical Education

Phone: 604-875-4834 Fax: 604-875-4847  
<http://www.med.ubc.ca/postgrad>

**DO NOT FORWARD THIS EMAIL OR ADD RECIPIENTS TO YOUR REPLY WITHOUT MY PERMISSION.** *This material is intended for the use of the individual to which it is addressed and may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you are not the intended recipient or the person responsible for delivering the material to the intended recipient, you are notified that any dissemination, distribution or copy of this communication is prohibited. If you have received this communication by error, please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail*

---

**From:** Abbassian Milani, Maryam [<mailto:mmilani@mail.ubc.ca>]  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 07, 2013 10:17 AM  
**To:** Moen, Lois  
**Subject:** RE: RTC Members - Cardiac Surgery  
**Importance:** High

Dear Lois,

Here is the list of REC members:

Drs. Cook & Campbell (Program Directors)  
Drs. Shahzad Karim, James Abel, Anson Cheung, Peter Skarsgard, Jamil Bashir, Jian Ye + Chief resident (Michael Yamashita at this present time)

Thank you,

Maryam Milani  
Senior Administrative Assistant  
Division of Cardiovascular Surgery  
University of British Columbia

Ph: 604-806-9307

Fax: 604-806-9654

---

**From:** Moen, Lois [loismoen@postgrad.med.ubc.ca]

**Sent:** March-07-13 9:20 AM

**To:** Abbassian Milani, Maryam

**Subject:** RTC Members - Cardiac Surgery

Hi Maryam,

Could you please send us the names of the members of your program's Residency Training Committee?

Thank you.

Lois Moen

Director, Administration

Postgraduate Medical Education

Phone: 604-875-4834 Fax: 604-875-4847

<http://www.med.ubc.ca/postgrad>

**DO NOT FORWARD THIS EMAIL OR ADD RECIPIENTS TO YOUR REPLY WITHOUT MY PERMISSION.** *This material is intended for the use of the individual to which it is addressed and may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you are not the intended recipient or the person responsible for delivering the material to the intended recipient, you are notified that any dissemination, distribution or copy of this communication is prohibited. If you have received this communication by error, please notify the sender immediately and delete this e-mail*





a place of mind  
THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

Faculty of Medicine  
Dean's Office, Postgraduate Education  
Gordon & Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre  
11th floor, 2775 Laurel Street  
Vancouver, BC Canada V5Z 1M9

Phone 604 875 4834  
Fax 604 875 4847  
postgrad@postgrad.med.ubc.ca  
www.med.ubc.ca/postgrad

March 7, 2013

Dr. Richard Cook  
Co-Program Director  
Cardiac Surgery  
UBC Faculty of Medicine

Dear Dr. Cook:

Further to our meeting at the Postgraduate Medical Education (PGME) Office on March 4, 2013, I am writing to confirm our discussion and to set out the next steps as we proceed to the second iteration of the 2013 Canadian Resident Matching Service (CaRMS) Match for the two unfilled Cardiac Surgery Residency Program positions.

Our initial conversation on February 19, 2013 was prompted by the fact that the Program submitted only one candidate on the Rank Order List (ROL) for the two positions allocated to the first iteration of the 2013 CaRMS Match, thereby leaving one position in the first iteration to be unfilled and potentially saved for the second iteration without a bona fide attempt to fill the two allocated positions in the first iteration.

In that discussion you confirmed that the Program intended to leave a position unfilled so that it would become available to a candidate who was not eligible for the first iteration match but who had done an elective rotation with the Program and was the preferred candidate. I advised that the Program's actions were not compliant with the CaRMS rules and procedures and that this irregularity could be contested to CaRMS in the future by a candidate and/or a medical school. I advised that this is a serious situation that will be actively monitored by the PGME Office and the Faculty of Medicine.

As we discussed, the CaRMS match process must follow the UBC PGME Resident Selection Policy (the Policy) which is available on the PGME website. I provided a print copy to you on March 4, 2013. The above-mentioned irregularity in the Cardiac Surgery Program is not consistent with the Policy.

To address this issue, the PGME Office will assist the Cardiac Surgery Program to fully implement the spirit and substance of the Policy and to ensure that the selection process is fair, transparent and provides equitable access to all candidates who apply. In this second iteration of CaRMS we must ensure that no candidate is unfairly advantaged in the process. This is a competitive process and all candidates must be given full and fair consideration.

000037

The actions of the Program and the irregularity that occurred during the first iteration has introduced a reasonable apprehension of bias in the Resident Selection Committee which could have a negative effect on the second iteration process. To ensure there is no taint on the process in the second iteration match, a different Resident Selection Committee must be convened. In addition, the PGME Office is appointing two members to represent the PGME Office at the new Resident Selection Committee. These members will provide oversight of the entire second iteration match process (including but not limited to file review, invitation to interview, interview process, and deliberation to generate the second iteration ROL, etc.)

I am pleased that Dr. Kamal Rungta, Senior Advisor to the Dean and Past Executive Associate Dean, Education, and Dr. Adam Peets, Associate Head, Department of Medicine have agreed to represent the PGME Office at the new Resident Selection Committee.

I would like to reiterate that the Program Directors of the Cardiac Surgery Program have access to the PGME Office any time for support including during the CaRMS match process.

Thank you for your kind attention in this important matter.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Roger Wong', with a large, stylized initial 'R'.

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean, Postgraduate Medical Education  
Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine  
Faculty of Medicine, University of British Columbia

/ra

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Amann, Rose  
**Sent:** Thursday, March 07, 2013 8:37 AM  
**To:** Peets, Adam [PH]; Rungta, Kamal  
**Cc:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Subject:** RE: urgent meeting confirmed for Fri. March 8 at 8am at Postgrad office

Dr. Peets,

Please dial-in to the meeting as follows:

Toll free: 1-866-792-1316  
or Local: (604) 678-9970  
Participant ID: 1590002  
Moderator: Dr. Wong will be the moderator (1640)

Thank you.

Rose Amann  
Secretary to the Deans  
UBC Faculty of Medicine  
Dean's Office, Postgraduate Education  
Gordon & Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre 11th Floor - 2775 Laurel Street Vancouver, B.C. V5Z 1M9

Phone: (604) 875-4834  
Fax: (604) 875-4847  
e:mail: rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca

This e-mail message and any attachments thereto are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom it is addressed and contains information that is confidential and may be privileged and exempt from disclosure. Any distribution, copying or disclosure is strictly prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender immediately by return email and delete the message unread without making any copies. Thank you.

-----Original Message-----

From: RWong  
Sent: Wednesday, March 06, 2013 10:35 PM  
To: Peets, Adam [PH]; Rungta, Kamal

Cc: Amann, Rose  
Subject: RE: urgent meeting confirmed for Fri. March 8 at 8am at Postgrad office

Yes - Rose can you book 11116 and set up teleconference line?

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

---

From: Peets, Adam [PH] [APeets@providencehealth.bc.ca]  
Sent: March-06-13 9:14 PM  
To: RWong; Rungta, Kamal  
Cc: Amann, Rose  
Subject: RE: urgent meeting confirmed for Fri. March 8 at 8am at Postgrad office

Hi Roger,  
Would it be possible for me to do it via teleconference?  
Adam.

---

From: RWong [pgdean@postgrad.med.ubc.ca]  
Sent: Wednesday, March 06, 2013 7:17 PM  
To: Rungta, Kamal; Peets, Adam [PH]  
Cc: RWong; Amann, Rose  
Subject: FW: urgent meeting confirmed for Fri. March 8 at 8am at Postgrad office

Hi Kam and Adam:

Thank you again for kindly agreeing to represent the PGME office in providing oversight and support for the Cardiac Surgery Program as they proceed with 2nd iteration match.

I would like to invite you to join me at my meeting with the co-PDs this Friday March 8 at 8 am in my office. Please let me know if you would be able to join us. My intention is to go over the selection process and expectations with the co-PDs.

Many thanks in advance for considering and with best regards,

Roger

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP

Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

-----Original Message-----

From: Amann, Rose

Sent: Wednesday, March 06, 2013 12:39 PM

To: Campbell, Alayne; [VCH] Cook, Richard [VA]

Cc: Milani, Maryam; Magraw, Celia

Subject: Re: urgent meeting confirmed for Fri. March 8 at 8am at Postgrad office

Dear Drs Cook and Campbell,

Thank you for your quick responses.

The meeting with Dr. Roger Wong is confirmed for this Friday, March 8 at 8:00am in person at our Postgrad office.

If anything comes up and you are unable to attend in person, please let us know so we can provide a dial-in number for you.

Once again - many thanks for making yourselves available on such short notice!

Rose Amann

Secretary to the Deans

UBC Faculty of Medicine

Dean's Office, Postgraduate Education

Gordon & Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre 11th Floor - 2775 Laurel Street Vancouver, B.C. V5Z 1M9

Phone: (604) 875-4834

Fax: (604) 875-4847

e:mail: [rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca](mailto:rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca)<<mailto:rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca>>

\*\*\*\*\*

-----Original Message-----

From: Campbell, Andrew [<mailto:acampbell@cw.bc.ca>]

Sent: Wednesday, March 06, 2013 12:08 PM

To: [VCH] Cook, Richard [VA]; Amann, Rose

Cc: Milani, Maryam; Magraw, Celia

Subject: RE: urgent meeting with the cardiac surgery PDs

Friday at 8 would work best for me.

A

-----Original Message-----

From: [VCH] Cook, Richard [VA]

Sent: Wednesday, March 06, 2013 9:16 AM

To: Amann, Rose; Campbell, Andrew

Cc: Milani, Maryam; Magraw, Celia

Subject: RE: urgent meeting with the cardiac surgery PDs

hi,

if we need to meet this week, i can meet on thursday afternoon at 1. otherwise, friday am early (ie. 7:30 or 8) as i'm operating that day.

i'm in the o.r. all day today.

thx

richard

---

From: Amann, Rose [rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca]

Sent: March 6, 2013 9:09 AM

To: Cook, Richard [VA]; [PHSA] Campbell, Andrew

Cc: Milani, Maryam; [PHSA] Magraw, Celia

Subject: Re: urgent meeting with the cardiac surgery PDs

Dear Drs Cook and Campbell,

As per the attached email from Dr. Roger Wong requesting an urgent meeting this week, would both of you be available in person or by phone for a 30 minute meeting re: 2nd iteration CaRMS on the following dates:

Today - Wed. March 6 (1:00-2:30pm) or (3:30-4:30pm) Fri. March 8 (between 9:00am - 1:00pm)

Please note that this meeting needs to be this week.

Thank you.

Rose Amann

Secretary to the Deans

UBC Faculty of Medicine

Dean's Office, Postgraduate Education



Gordon & Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre 11th Floor - 2775 Laurel Street Vancouver, B.C. V5Z 1M9

Phone: (604) 875-4834

Fax: (604) 875-4847

e:mail: [rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca](mailto:rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca)<mailto:rose.amann@postgrad.med.ubc.ca>

\*\*\*\*\*

-----Original Message-----

From: RWong

Sent: Wednesday, March 06, 2013 8:00 AM

To: Amann, Rose

Subject: urgent meeting with the cardaic surgery PDs

Hi Rose:

Would you please arrange an urgent 30-minute meeting with Richard Cook and Andrew Campbell with myself this week?

This is to discuss 2nd iteration CaRMS.

Thanks.

Roger

Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP

Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Snadden, David  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 05, 2013 5:11 PM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Subject:** Re: Away this summer

CS is worrying, but all we can do is make sure the process is squeaky clean in order to be fair to all including all candidates.

13

I am thinking of being away 10-17 August – though have not firmed anything up yet, Oscar is away in August for three weeks but around the rest of the time,

I am going to ask Oscar to back me up for a week this month, but I will be in phone and e-mail contact which will give us lots of options this summer!

Dave

David Snadden  
Executive Associate Dean Education

UBC Faculty of Medicine

Tel: 604-875-4111 Ext 66726

Mailing address:

11th Floor, Gordon and Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre

2775 Laurel Street

Vancouver, BC V5Z 1M9

**From:** <Rungta>, Kamal <kamal.rungta@ubc.ca>  
**Date:** Tuesday, March 5, 2013 3:22 PM  
**To:** David Snadden <david.snadden@ubc.ca>  
**Subject:** RE: Away this summer

Dave,  
I have not confirmed my holidays. Planning on being away roughly one week a month June, July and August. I should know over the next couple of weeks and am also flexible should that conflict with providing coverage for you.  
Will let you know. Also my calendar available through Holly/Vanessa has all the work related travel for meetings/conferences identified. Spoke to Roger earlier regarding CaRMS, mostly good news. Disturbing regarding Cardiac Surgery and that Roger has confirmed that one of the IMG is the son of the Head of cardiac Surgery. I think [REDACTED] 13 [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]

Kam

**From:** Snadden, David  
**Sent:** March 4, 2013 12:42 PM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Subject:** Away this summer

Hi Kam,  
Can you let me know when you are planning to be away this summer?  
I haven't figured out when I will be away but am flexible

Dave

David Snadden  
Executive Associate Dean Education  
UBC Faculty of Medicine

Tel: 604-875-4111 Ext 66726

Mailing address:  
11th Floor, Gordon and Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre  
2775 Laurel Street  
Vancouver, BC V5Z 1M9

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** Snadden, David  
**Sent:** Monday, February 25, 2013 1:27 PM  
**To:** Rungta, Kamal  
**Subject:** Re: Welcome back

Thanks, I do seem t be back to back all day, If I get a chance I will call to-day or more likely tomorrow,  
Thank you for stick handling the chaos Thursday Friday. I knew about cardiac surgery justt before I left, but at that stage we had no details, I advised

13

Dave

David Snadden  
Executive Associate Dean Education

UBC Faculty of Medicine

Tel: 604-875-4111 Ext 66726

Mailing address:

11th Floor, Gordon and Leslie Diamond Health Care Centre

2775 Laurel Street

Vancouver, BC V5Z 1M9

---

**From:** <Rungta>, "Rungta, Kamal" <[kamal.rungta@ubc.ca](mailto:kamal.rungta@ubc.ca)>

**Date:** Monday, 25 February, 2013 11:58 AM

**To:** David Snadden <[david.snadden@ubc.ca](mailto:david.snadden@ubc.ca)>

**Subject:** Welcome back

Dear Dave,

Hope your week in the wilderness was a refreshing break. You have likely heard that all was not quiet in your absence. However, there are very capable people working in the faculty who came through to carefully manage the situations that came to my attention.

Briefly, there was a situation last week in PG where the Cardiac Surgery program was misbehaving and Roger was on top of it although mildly bruised by the experience.

There is a situation in Admissions that Bruce brought to our attention regarding a backdoor method of getting proof of Aboriginality.

The NMP Family Grad number controversy seemed to generate a lot of activity and helped focus me on some of our vulnerabilities.

I understand you are busy with meetings etc. I am available on my mobile 604 218 0173 if you want to chat. Leave a number and best time to call if you get my voicemail.

Kam

## Med Education EADE Assist

---

**From:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 20, 2013 11:52 AM  
**To:** MED Postgraduate Education RWong  
**Subject:** cardiac surgery

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up  
**Flag Status:** Flagged

February 19, 2013 (0730 hours)

Telephone conversation with Dr. Richard Cook, PD cardiac surgery

Discussed number of 1st iteration PGY1 CaRMS CMG positions – approximate quota granted for 2013 = 2 based on request of cardiac surgery on grounds of HHR needs for BC; however there was only 1 candidate on ROL submitted to PGME office.

Dr. Cook explained there were 10 candidates who applied, 4 were shortlisted by the selection committee, and 1 was ranked on ROL.

Dr. Cook further stated the program would like to leave 1 position unfilled in 1st iteration and go into 2nd iteration match so that they could consider candidates who are not eligible for the 1st iteration match.

I asked for clarity, and Dr Cook stated they had a candidate in mind who is a Canadian studied medicine abroad and did an elective rotation with them, this candidate would not be eligible for 1st iteration but would be eligible for 2nd iteration.

I responded that this would not be fair or transparent or equitable for the other CaRMS candidates, whether CMG or IMG – this would not follow the spirit of the CaRMS match – positions in 1st iteration cannot be held back and saved for 2nd iteration without a bone fide attempt to fill all positions in 1st iteration first.

I indicated unless there is an increase in the ROL to at least 2 names to fill the 2 positions, PGME would remove 1 quota position from cardiac surgery. This is well within the responsibility and obligation of the PGME office.

Dr Cook understood. By approx. 0830 hours he sent an email/SMS message/phone call to submit a second name to be added to the cardiac surgery ROL. This was followed by a separate email to Lois Moen with the name and CaRMS candidate number of this candidate.

The finalized ROL was subsequently approved and submitted to CaRMS prior to deadline of submitting finalized ROL.

**Roger Y.M. Wong, BMSc, MD, FRCPC, FACP**  
Associate Dean Postgraduate Medical Education  
Clinical Professor of Geriatric Medicine  
Faculty of Medicine | University of British Columbia

# UBC Faculty of Medicine Postgraduate Match 2013

## Overall Key Messages

The UBC Faculty of Medicine is committed to admitting applicants who are best prepared and qualified to meet the health needs of all British Columbians.

The process of matching doctors to residencies is a shared one. Divisions request residency positions, which are reviewed by UBC and approved for funding by the Ministry. Divisions set criteria for selection. They use the national Canadian Residency Matching Service to find candidates through two rounds of matching. The division interviews and selects the candidates in a process overseen by the UBC Faculty of Medicine Postgraduate Medical Education Office (PMGE)

The PGME seeks to ensure that the resident selection process is fair and equitable, and that national standards that safeguard the integrity of the process are maintained. UBC monitors the ranking and selection of candidates, and intervenes when necessary to ensure fair process.

## SHORT STATEMENT IF ASKED SPECIFICALLY ABOUT CARDIAC SURGERY PROCESS

In its facilitative and monitoring role, it is not uncommon for the PGME to identify and review specific matching situations.

After the first round of the 2013 Canadian Residency Matching Service, which pairs postgraduate applicants with programs, the UBC Cardiac Surgery Postgraduate Program had not filled either of the two approved residency positions.

Following the established protocol, the Faculty of Medicine PGME Office reviewed the case and to ensure that all policies were followed in the second round of the CaRMS match. The UBC Faculty of Medicine PGME Office convened a new selection committee, and appointed two independent faculty members to provide oversight of the file review, interview and final rank process. This was implemented fully in March 2013. The process and policy was followed in the 2<sup>nd</sup> iteration and the position filled.

UBC is confident that it followed established guidelines and exercised its oversight role with due diligence. UBC and its Faculty of Medicine take extremely seriously the integrity of the admissions process. Any suspicion or indeed proof of preferential treatment would be damaging. We go to great lengths, as we did in this case, to ensure that appropriate action is taken on our part.

---

## Possible Questions and Answers

Q - What happened exactly - how did this case come to light?

A - Privacy and confidentiality laws prevent UBC from discussing the exact composition of the committees, the files concerned, or the names of the applicants. However, we can confirm the following:



In February 2013, the UBC Faculty of Medicine noticed the Cardiac Surgery Residency Program had not filled its two residency positions during the First Iteration of the Canadian Residency Matching Service (CaRMS) match. As per our protocols, the Faculty intervened in the process to ensure fairness in the selection process. All of our admissions rules and regulations for residency training (post graduate medical education) are public and available on the faculty's post graduate education website.

Following the established protocol, the Faculty of Medicine PGME Office reviewed the case and took action to ensure that the UBC PGME Resident Selection Policy would be followed.

Q - What action did the Faculty take?

A - To ensure that all policies were followed in the Second Iteration of the CaRMS match, UBC Faculty of Medicine PGME Office convened a new selection committee, and appointed two independent faculty members to provide oversight of the file review, interview and final rank process. This was implemented fully in March 2013.

Q - How is it then that this person - the son of a cabinet minister and of the head of that department of cardiac surgery - ended up being selected?

A - The second match committee and the two members appointed by the Post Graduate Dean of the Faculty of Medicine put the candidates through a rigorous interview process. Candidates had to satisfy a number of criteria, for example.

The successful candidates for the Residency positions were selected in late March. The match results were announced on April 11th. UBC cannot go into the details of the file for reasons of privacy, but UBC is satisfied that the action taken supports a fair process.

Q - The fact that the winning candidate is so well connected would seem to indicate that your processes are actually impotent when it comes to real connections. Doesn't this case prove there is nepotism in play here?

A - While we cannot speak to specific individuals, in the case of Cardiac Surgery Faculty guidelines and processes were followed.

UBC has to ensure that the reasons for selection, or rejection, have nothing to do with a person's personal connections or other equally irrelevant factors in terms of fitness to take on a Residency position. UBC is confident that rigorous process was followed for the second iteration and important oversight was exercised by two appointees of the Post Graduate Dean of the Faculty.

Q - Selection criteria can be 'gamed' - it is easy enough to ensure qualifications and experience match the person you want to get the job. How is UBC ensuring this indeed in NOT what took place here?

A - Programs such as Cardiac Surgery have a great deal of autonomy in the selection of their Residents - and that is as it should be since those working in these areas of specialization and in distinct workplaces are best equipped to know what it takes to succeed in a Residency. Setting selection criteria is serious business and is not done lightly. All of the criteria included in this particular recruitment process were sound and warranted.

Q - What do you say to the public that sees this case confirming their worst suspicions: That connections really matter, especially when it comes to admission to medicine and beyond, to a precious residency spot. After all, this person doesn't even have a Canadian or US medical undergrad degree!

A: Sons and daughters of physicians have one advantage: they have parents who know exactly what it takes to succeed in medical school. And this is not a trivial advantage. But our admissions processes, both at the graduate and post

graduate level, are rigorous and fair - and in some cases they are designed to 'blind' the committee to the identity of the applicants.

This process is not possible for selection to a Residency position. But UBC is satisfied that its rules and processes do take into account the need to intervene in certain cases. Irregularities are flagged and action is taken, following established protocols.

UBC and its Faculty of Medicine take extremely seriously the integrity of the admissions process. Any suspicion or indeed proof of preferential treatment would be extremely damaging. We go to great lengths, as we did in this case, to ensure that appropriate action is taken to ensure selection is fair.